



**TOWN OF LOS GATOS
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMITTEE REPORT**

**MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING
FEBRUARY 23, 2022**

The Historic Preservation Committee of the Town of Los Gatos conducted a Regular Meeting on February 23, 2022 at 4:00 p.m.

This meeting This meeting is being conducted utilizing teleconferencing and electronic means consistent with Town Council Policy 2-01 entitled Town Agenda Format and Rules and Town Resolution. In accordance with Town Policy and Resolution, the public may only view the meeting online and not in the Council Chamber.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 4:00 PM

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Timothy Lundell, Vice Chair Barry Cheskin, Planning Commissioner Kylie Clark, Planning Commissioner Steve Raspe

Absent: None

VERBAL COMMUNICATIONS

Susan Burnett, General Plan and Housing Element Advisory Committee member and former Historical Preservation Committee Member.

- Concerned about HPC and PC. Seeing a lot of requests for demolition and changing of historic homes that would not have been approved by past Historic Preservation Committees. Started with 1300 historic homes. But now only 270 left. Guidelines have gotten easier. Purpose was to save the past for future generations. Can we tighten things up? In my Glenridge district a Garage was added next to the home. Instead of as a separate unit. Guidelines are subjective. Because of SB 9, the Committees needs to be much more mindful and protective.

CONSENT ITEMS (TO BE ACTED UPON BY A SINGLE MOTION)

1. Approval of Minutes – January 26, 2022

MOTION: **Motion by Vice Chair Cheskin to approve the Consent Calendar.
Seconded by Chair Lundell.**

VOTE: **Motion passed unanimously.**

PUBLIC HEARINGS

2. 40 Hernandez Avenue

Forward a Recommendation to the Director on a Request for Construction of Exterior Alterations and an Addition to an Existing Presumptive Historic Single-Family Residence (Pre-1941) on Property Zoned R-1:8. APN 510-19-027.

PROPERTY OWNER: Stan and Pamela Atwood

APPLICANT: Eric Beckstrom, Beckstrom Architecture

PROJECT PLANNER: Sean Mullin

Vice Chair Cheskin recused himself from Item 2, as his residence is located within 1,000 feet of the subject property.

Sean Mullin, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Opened Public Comment.

Applicant presented the project.

Eric Beckstrom, Architect

- In 2006, the structure basically became a brand new house behind the façade. They will be building an addition to make the house more symmetrical.
- They are supportive of preserving the front façade and porch area.

Susan Burnett

- Agrees that the front façade of the house is what makes it so spectacular and a contributing house. Stick to the 2006 remodel percentage. Looking at the plans, it is more than a little box.

Eric Beckstrom, Architect

- Will be matching the wall and windows. The build will be complementary. The end results will look like the home as originally built in 1912 not 1920.

Closed Public Comment.

Committee members discussed the matter.

- Aesthetically pleasing. Like and support the project.
- Design adds symmetry.
- Addition is largely imperceptible.
- Recommend that the percentage of demo mimic that of the 2006 condition of approval.
- Maintain the elements that currently exist.

MOTION: **Motion by Planning Commissioner Raspe** to Forward a Recommendation to the Director on a Request for Construction of Exterior Alterations and an Addition to an Existing Presumptive Historic Single-Family Residence (Pre-1941) on Property Zoned R-1:8. Subject to a condition of demolition that would result in similar percentages as existed in 2006. **Seconded by Planning Commissioner Clark.**

VOTE: **Motion passed unanimously.**

Appeal rights were recited.

Vice Chair Cheskin rejoined.

3. 45 Montgomery Street

Consider a Request to Remove a Presumptive Historic Property (Pre-1941) from the Historic Resources Inventory for Property Zoned R-1D. APN 410-17-004.
PROPERTY OWNER/APPLICANT: Mark and Cathleen Petersen.
PROJECT PLANNERS: Savannah Van Akin/Sean Mullin

Savannah Van Akin, Assistant Planner, presented the staff report.

Opened and Closed Public Comment.

Committee members discussed the matter.

- Town's recommendation seems straightforward as a clean-up item from 1991.

MOTION: **Motion by Planning Commissioner Clark** to Recommend Approval to the Director for Removal of a Presumptive Historic Property (Pre-1941) from the Historic Resources Inventory for Property Zoned R-1D. **Seconded by Vice Chair Cheskin.**

VOTE: **Motion passed unanimously.**

Appeal rights were recited.

4. 33 Walnut Avenue

Consider a Request to Remove a Presumptive Historic Property (Pre-1941) from the Historic Resources Inventory for Property Zoned R-1:8. APN 510-41-007.

Property Owner/Applicant: Jeffrey Siegel

PROJECT PLANNER: Erin Walters

Vice Chair Cheskin recused himself from Item 4, as his residence is located within 1,000 feet of the subject property.

Erin Walters, Associate Planner, presented the staff report.

Opened Public Comment.

Applicant presented the project.

Jeffrey Siegel, Owner/Applicant

- He is president of the Los Gatos Historic Society. He undertook extensive analysis to prepare the report. This property doesn't meet any criteria set by the State. The only reason for inclusion is because it is Pre-1941. He bought it five years ago. The building has been changed by every owner except the original owner. It went from an 890 square foot cottage with an outhouse, to a 2600 square foot, 4 bathroom, 5 bedroom, two-story house. It bears no resemblance to the original house. The one remaining element is the front fascia. The front porch was demolished and rebuilt to match. However, updated seismic and safety building codes dictated the use of concrete, steel, and a higher railing. The home has no connection to a historic person or event. It is not in a historic district.

Committee members asked questions of the applicant.

Jeffrey Siegel, Owner/Applicant

- I did not make a request for removal in 2018 or 2019 when the front porch was evaluated. The HPC allowed demolition of the deteriorated porch. The railing was too low and not safe.

Susan Burnett

- When was it declared a Bellringer house?

Staff

- 1984.

Jeffrey Siegel, Owner/Applicant

- Nothing historic remains. A remaining roof membrane shows where the original slope of the roof.
- Expanded on the first floor in 1948 and 1950. In 1985 it became a two-story building. In 2006, 2007 and 2008, the upstairs and roof were changed.

Closed Public Comment.

Committee members discussed the matter.

- There have been changes made to the structure. However, in 2018, both the applicant and HPC treated it as a historic property. Nothing substantive has changed besides the approved work.
- This project is coming before the committee after a problem was flagged by staff.
- Most of the history has been removed. The owner attempted to preserve the front but removed over 25%. It now comes to HPC because of that removal. Leaning towards denial.
- Every structure has a story. Some big or small, intended, unintended, permitted and before HPC was established. It would be a shame to have those changes justify removal.
- It is up to the HPC to determine, based on the provided information, if anything left is historic.

MOTION: **Motion by Planning Commissioner Raspe to Deny a Request to Remove a Presumptive Historic Property (Pre-1941) from the Historic Resources Inventory for Property Zoned R-1:8. **Seconded** by Planning Commissioner Clark.**

VOTE: **Motion passed unanimously.**

Appeal rights were recited.

Vice Chair Cheskin rejoined.

OTHER BUSINESS (*Up to three minutes may be allotted to each speaker on any of the following items.*)

5. 223 Tait Avenue

Preliminary Review for Technical Demolition of a Presumptive Historic Single-Family Residence (Pre-1941) and Construction of a New Two-Story Residence Located in the Almond Grove Historic District on Property Zoned R-1D:LHP. APN 510-17-004.

PROPERTY OWNER: Mark and Tammy De Mattei

APPLICANT: Jay Plett, Architect

PROJECT PLANNER: Ryan Safty

Ryan Safty, Associate Planner, presented the staff report

Opened public comment.

Jay Plett, Applicant

- Proposing a Craftsman style home. They will maintain the stucco siding and the lower sloped roofs. The structure has no architectural significance due to several post 1941 additions. The porch was enclosed, several walls were demolished, and the siding was removed along the rear with the previous addition. It already has been technically demolished. They would like preliminary feedback on the conceptual proposal. They have floor plans and a rendering and would like feedback on the design.

Committee member asked questions of the applicant:

Jay Plett, Applicant

- In terms of scale and massing, the height will be 27 feet. This is below the maximum allowed. The existing structure is already elevated four feet.
- There are examples of other homes in the neighborhood with Arts and Crafts or Craftsman style. The apartment complex next door has no style at all.

Susan Burnett

- Glen Ridge and Almond Grove neighborhoods have a mix of styles. The street doesn't have a certain style.

Jay Plett

- There are no Craftsman style homes immediately adjacent to the subject property but they do exist in the area.

Closed Public Comment.

Committee members provided the following comments:

- The site was not part of Bloomfield survey and nothing architecturally significant. Good candidate for rehabilitation. The Craftsman is fine. Any style that fits in.
- Concerned more about size, massing, shadowing, and privacy.
- Need more info about the surrounding neighborhood. It doesn't seem to fit in with the neighborhood.
- Important for the style to fit in with the neighborhood. Need to justify the style choice with photos of nearby homes. Justification should be provided for any demolition.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

This is to certify that the foregoing is a true and correct copy of the minutes of the February 23, 2022, meeting as approved by the Historic Preservation Committee.

/s/ Jennifer Armer, AICP, Planning Manager