

MEETING DATE: 09/24/2025

ITEM NO: 4

DATE: September 19, 2025

TO: Historic Preservation Committee

FROM: Joel Paulson, Community Development Director

SUBJECT: Consider a Preliminary Review of a Request to Construct a New Second-Story

Addition and Exterior Alterations to an Existing Pre-1941 Single-Family Residence on Property Zoned R-1D. **Located at 446 San Benito Avenue**. APN 410-16-051. Request for Review Application PHST-25-015. Exempt Pursuant

to CEQA Guidelines, Section 15301: Existing Facilities. Property

Owner/Applicant: Devendra Deshwal. Project Planner: Maria Chavarin.

RECOMMENDATION:

Consider a preliminary review of a request to construct a new second-story addition and exterior alterations to an existing pre-1941 single-family residence located at 446 San Benito Avenue.

PROPERTY DETAILS:

- 1. Date primary structure was built: 1905 per County Assessor's Database; 1920s per Anne Bloomfield Survey
- 2. Bloomfield Preliminary Rating: " $\sqrt{}$ " or historic and some altered
- 3. Does property have an LHP Overlay? No
- 4. Is structure in a historic district? No
- 5. If yes, is it a contributor? N/A
- 6. Findings required? N/A
- 7. Considerations required? Yes

BACKGROUND:

The County Assessor indicates that the residence located at 446 San Benito Avenue was constructed in 1905 and the 1991 Bloomfield Survey estimates the construction date as the 1920s (Attachment 1). The building footprint shown on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps is consistent between 1928 and 1944 (Attachment 1).

PREPARED BY: Maria Chavarin

Assistant Planner

PAGE **2** OF **3**

SUBJECT: 446 San Benito Avenue/PHST-25-015

DATE: September 19, 2025

The 1991 Anne Bloomfield Survey rates the residence as historic and some altered (Attachment 1), making note of alterations to the porch and some windows. A review of Town permit records provides the following permit history:

- 2004 Electrical Permit;
- 2010 Building Permit front porch and roof eaves repairs; and
- 2015 Building Permit re-roof.

The applicant provided documentation suggesting an unpermitted addition was made to the original structure at the right rear portion of the residence (Attachment 1). The applicant also provided plans for the existing house showing the existing floor area at 889 square feet, while the County Assessor reports the residence as being 685 square feet. Town records do not include any permits for an addition to the residence; however, the portion of the residence in question is included in the building footprint shown in the 1928 and 1944 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. It is unclear whether this portion of the residence is unpermitted, was simply constructed at a time when permits were not required, and/or the County Assessor provided an inaccurate measure of the residence.

DISCUSSION:

The property is located on the east side of San Benito Avenue, between Andrews Street and Los Gatos-Saratoga Road. The applicant is requesting a preliminary review of their project to construct a new second-story addition and exterior alterations to an existing pre-1941 single-family residence.

The applicant proposes additions to the first floor, a new second-story addition, and other exterior alterations (Attachment 4). The first-floor addition would be located on the to the rear and left side of the existing residence accommodating new living area and a new two-car garage. The proposed second-story addition would be located toward the rear of the expanded residence, expanding the living area and providing a new second-story deck. Exterior alterations include relocating the front door and other window changes. The development plans do not include full details of all the exterior materials included in the project. Based on what is provided, proposed exterior materials include new wood shingle siding on the front and side elevations, stucco on the rear elevation, a belly band on the side elevations, vinyl windows and a new front door.

Staff provides the following points to aid in the Committee's discussion of the project:

- Appropriateness of the location and scale of the proposed additions (RDG 3.9)
- Appropriateness of the attached garage, apparent aluminum roll-up doors, and proportion of the garage relative to the front façade of the residence (RDG 4.8.15);

PAGE **3** OF **3**

SUBJECT: 446 San Benito Avenue/PHST-25-015

DATE: September 19, 2025

• Compatibility of the proposed contemporary front door with the architecture of the existing/expanded residence (RDG 4.8.3);

- Inclusion of vinyl windows, which are discouraged (RDG 4.8.4);
- Appropriateness of stucco siding and its inclusion on only one elevation (RDG 4.8.9, .10, and .11); and
- Use of the belly band on the side elevations to break up the two-story mass (RDG 3.3.3).

CONSIDERATIONS:

A. Considerations

Sec. 29.80.290. Standards for review.

In evaluating applications, the deciding body shall consider the architectural style, design, arrangement, texture, materials and color, and any other pertinent factors. Applications shall not be granted unless:

For pre-1941 structures, the proposed work will neither adversely affect the exterior architectural characteristics or other features of the property which is the subject of the application.

B. Residential Design Guidelines

Section 3.9 of the Town's Residential Design Guidelines offers recommendations for the construction of additions to existing residences (Attachment 3).

CONCLUSION:

The applicant is requesting preliminary review by the Committee of a request to construct a new second-story addition and exterior alterations to an existing pre-1941 residence located at 446 San Benito Avenue. A new second-story addition, if not triggering a technical demolition, would be processed under a future Minor Residential Development application. This application would return to the Committee for a formal recommendation to be forwarded to the Community Development Director and the application would continue through the Minor Residential Development process.

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1. Applicant's Research
- 2. Project Description
- 3. Section 3.9, Residential Design Guidelines
- 4. Development Plans

This Page Intentionally Left Blank