



HISTORIC RESOURCES PRESERVATION BOARD REPORT

HRPB Project Number 23-00100025: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for garage enclosure, window replacement, and alterations to paved and gravel parking areas at **902 South Palmway**. The subject property is a non-contributing resource to the South Palm Park Historic District and is located in the Single-Family Residential (SFR) Zoning District.

Meeting Date: May 10, 2023

Property Owner/Applicant: Deborah Tobias

Address: 902 South Palmway

PCN: 38-43-44-27-01-032-0070

Lot Size: 0.34 acre /15,000 sf

General Location: Southeast corner of South Palmway and 9th Avenue South

Existing Land Use: Single Family Residential

Current Future Land Use Designation: Single Family Residential (SFR)

Zoning District: Single Family Residential (SFR)



RECOMMENDATION

The documentation and materials provided with the application request were reviewed for compliance with the applicable guidelines and standards found in the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations (LDRs) and Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, and for consistency with the Comprehensive Plan. Staff is recommending that the COA for garage enclosure, window replacement, and paver alterations be approved with conditions, including a condition to leave a recessed area to evoke the original garage door opening and conditions to add exterior applied muntins to the new windows.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property owner, Deborah Tobias, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose the existing garage door opening, replace one existing window, and alter the property's paved and gravel parking areas at 902 South Palmway. The proposed garage enclosure would fill in the garage door opening and create new openings for a door and window. Alterations to the property's paved and gravel parking areas propose to replace the existing concrete driveway with a paver patio as well as pave existing gravel parking spaces.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Staff has not received any letters of support or opposition for this application.

PROPERTY DEVELOPMENT HISTORY

The single-family house at 902 South Palmway was constructed in 1951 in a Ranch style, designed by architect Edgar S. Wortman. The house and attached garage were built using concrete blocks with a stucco exterior finish, a gable roof with concrete tile roofing, and awning windows. Original decorative features included gable vents, exposed rafter tails, raised panel window shutters, brick veneer on the front façade, front porch railings with turned spindles, decorative brackets on the front porch roofs, and a patio surrounded by a decorative brick half-wall. The property has undergone numerous alterations over time, including screened patio additions in 1980 and 1994, construction of a pool with a screened enclosure in 1993, and re-roofing in 2003 and 2018. In 2001, a front porch slab was installed (and subsequently expanded in 2003), and the rear elevation's openings were altered to replace existing windows and doors with sliding glass doors, as well as create a new opening for French doors. Sometime between 2015 and 2021, some of the house's awning windows were replaced with horizontal roller windows; no permit for these replacements was found in the property file.

In the original 2000 historic resources survey for the South Palm Park Historic District, the property was designated as a non-contributing resource, and was incorrectly surveyed as a c. 1968 structure, rather than 1951. The updated 2020 survey recommended that 902 South Palmway's designation be changed to contributing.

On January 6, 2023, the property owner contacted historic preservation staff to discuss her ideas for enclosing the existing garage. Staff informed the owner that alterations would need to comply with the Design Guidelines for the Ranch style, and that staff can only administratively approve garage enclosures that leave the existing garage door in place, create a faux garage door, or leave a recessed area in the wall to show where the garage door once existing. Staff recommended a follow-up meeting to further discuss the property owner's ideas with conceptual drawings or renderings. That follow-up meeting was conducted via Zoom on January 12, 2023; staff and the property owner reviewed appropriate window and door options, and the property owner agreed to recess the enclosed wall area to show where the garage door once was.

Following that meeting, the property owner notified staff that she would rather enclose the garage with no recessed area, and asked for the project to be brought to the HRPB to receive approval. Staff provided a checklist of the necessary documents for an HRPB project submittal, and was in frequent contact with the property owner in the subsequent

months to discuss window and door guidelines, survey requirements, and other required documentation. The submittal was deemed complete on April 1, 2023, and was scheduled for the May 10th HRPB meeting.

The home's original architectural drawings are included as **Attachment A**, an installation map and proposed new windows and door are included as **Attachment B**, and the survey and proposed site plan alterations are included as **Attachment C**. The property owner's justification statement is included as **Attachment E**.

ANALYSIS

Consistency with the Comprehensive Plan

The subject site has a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Single Family Residential (SFR). Per policy 1.1.1.2, the Single-Family Residential category is *"intended primarily to permit development of single-family structures at a maximum of 7 dwelling units per acre. Single-family structures are designed for occupancy by one family or household. Single-family homes do not include accessory apartments or other facilities that permit occupancy by more than one family or household. Residential units may be site-built (conventional) dwellings, mobile homes or modular units."*

Analysis: The existing structure is a single-family residence, and the proposed alterations will not alter or increase the property's density. The proposed alterations are consistent with the intent of the Single-Family Residential designation.

Consistency with the Land Development Regulations – Zoning

Single-Family Residential (SFR): Per LDR Section 23.3-7(a), *the "SF-R single-family residential district" is intended primarily to permit development of one (1) single-family structure per lot. Provision is made for a limited number of nonresidential uses for the convenience of residents. These nonresidential uses are compatible by reason of their nature and limited frequency of occurrence with an overall single-family residential character. The "SF-R single-family residential district" implements the "single-family residential" land use category of the Lake Worth Comprehensive Plan.*

The proposed alterations to the patio, driveway, and parking area appear to be consistent with site data requirements in the City's Land Development Regulations. Formal and complete review for compliance with the City's Land Development Regulations, including parking space requirements, will be conducted at building permit review. The proposed partial site plan is included in this report in **Attachment C**.

Consistency with the Land Development Regulations – Historic Preservation

All exterior alterations to structures within a designated historic district are subject to visual compatibility criteria. Staff has reviewed the documentation and materials provided in this application and outlined the applicable guidelines and standards found in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, detailed in the section below. The Ranch architectural style section and the window replacement section of the City's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, as well as the Secretary of the Interior's guidance for historic garage opening infill are included as **Attachment D**.

Section 23.5-4(k)(1) – General guidelines for granting certificates of appropriateness: *In approving or denying applications for certificates of appropriateness, the city shall, at a minimum, consider the following general guidelines:*

- A. What is the effect of the proposed work on the landmark or the property upon which such work is to be done?

Analysis: The proposed work will enclose the existing garage, add a new full-light door and single-light awning window to the enclosed garage. The application also proposes to replace a pair of awning windows on the front façade with a horizontal roller window, convert the existing driveway to a paver patio, and install pavers in the current gravel parking area. Staff contends that the enclosure of the garage with no imitation garage door or recessed area and the design of the proposed windows would adversely alter the appearance of the historic resource.

- B. What is the relationship between such work and other structures on the landmark site or other property in the historic district?

Analysis: The proposed garage enclosure will not maintain the existing appearance as viewed from 9th Avenue South. The proposed alterations will not imitate the appearance of a garage, nor will it leave a recessed area to exemplify the historic function of the space. The proposed full-light door is compatible with the architectural style. However, the proposed new single-light awning window on the north elevation of the garage is atypical for the house; a better option would be to add one or two muntins to imitate a historic 2-light or 3-light awning window, which was the historic window style on most of the house. The proposed horizontal roller window to replace the historic pair of 2-light awning windows is also atypical for the historic architecture at 902 South Palmway, as the front façade originally had awning windows, and the existing horizontal roller windows elsewhere on the front façade appear to have been done without permits or historic approval. The proposed horizontal roller window would better imitate the historic awning windows by adding a horizontal muntin to the window panes. The garage conversion will have a direct visual effect on the surrounding properties within the district, as the garage faces a public right-of-way. It is staff's analysis the proposal will adversely affect the existing historic resource's potential contributing status.

- C. To what extent will the historic, architectural, or archaeological significance, architectural style, design, arrangement, texture, materials and color of the landmark or the property be affected?

Analysis: Based on the information in the property file, the proposed work will enclose the original garage and replace original awning windows, and therefore will have a major effect on the property's historic architectural design and materials.

- D. Would denial of a certificate of appropriateness deprive the property owner of reasonable beneficial use of his property?

Analysis: No, denial of the COA would not deprive the applicant of reasonable use of the property.

- E. Are the applicant's plans technically feasible and capable of being carried out within a reasonable time?

Analysis: Yes, the applicant's plans can be completed in a reasonable timeframe.

- F. Are the plans (i) consistent with the city's design guidelines, once adopted, or (ii) in the event the design guidelines are not adopted or do not address the relevant issue, consistent as reasonably possible with the applicable portions of the United States Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation then in effect?

Analysis: The proposed garage enclosure without a recessed area, as well as the proposed windows, are not in compliance with the City's Historic Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance (LDR Section 23.5-4).

- G. What are the effects of the requested change on those elements or features of the structure which served as the basis for its designation, and will the requested changes cause the least possible adverse effect on those elements or features?

Analysis: The structure is currently designated as a non-contributing resource within the South Palm Park historic district; however, the updated historic resources survey in 2020 recommended that the property be given an updated designation as a contributing resource. The proposed garage enclosure would visually remove one of the structure's historic design features and would also replace a pair of historic awning windows. Staff contends that

the project as proposed by the applicant will have an adverse effect on the structure's potential contributing designation as well as the structure's relationship with the surrounding historic district.

Section 23.5-4(k)(2) – Additional guidelines for alterations and additions, noncontributing structures:

A. Is this a change to the primary façade?

Analysis: Yes, the garage is on a façade facing 9th Avenue South and the proposed window replacement is on the front façade of 902 South Palmway.

B. Is the change visually compatible and in harmony with its neighboring properties as viewed from a public street?

Analysis: As previously mentioned, the proposed door is compatible with the architectural style. The windows as proposed, are atypical for the structure's historic design, but the window design issues could be mitigated with applied exterior muntins. The garage enclosure with no indication of the space's original historic use, either through a faux garage door or a recessed area at the old door opening, would not be visually compatible with neighboring properties, which have garages facing 9th Avenue South. The use of inappropriate window styles and flat enclosure of the garage would have an adverse visual effect on the surrounding historic district, as well as the structure's potential contributing status.

CONCLUSION AND CONDITIONS

Staff contends that the application as proposed is not consistent with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines. However, the issues identified with the proposed garage enclosure and windows can be mitigated by leaving a recessed area to evoke the original garage door opening and adding exterior applied muntins to the new windows to imitate the structure's original awning windows. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the application with the conditions outlined below.

Conditions of Approval:

1. The enclosed garage door opening shall be recessed up to 6 inches, showing the area where the garage door previously existed.
2. Opening A shall be a horizontal roller window with a horizontal muntin added to each pane to imitate the appearance of the historic 2-light awning windows.
3. Opening B shall be a vertical awning window with one or two horizontal muntins added to imitate the appearance of a 2-light or 3-light awning window.
4. Opening C shall be a full-light French door. The glazing on this door may use a white interlayer for privacy purposes.
5. All divided light patterns shall be created utilizing exterior raised applied muntins. Exterior flat muntins or "grids between the glass" shall not be used.
6. All glazing shall be clear, non-reflective and without tint. Low-E (low emissivity) is allowed but the glass shall have a minimum 60% visible light transmittance (VLT) measured from the center of glazing. Glass tints or any other glass treatments shall not be combined with the Low-E coating to further diminish the VLT of the glass.
7. Original window trim, window sills, and mullions shall be retained. Where original trim and surrounds need to be replaced due to severe deterioration, the replacement elements shall match what is being removed in profile, design, shape, size, configuration, and location.
8. All windows and doors shall be installed recessed in the jambs and shall not be installed flush with the exterior wall.

9. Alterations to the patio, driveway, and parking spaces shall comply with the impermeable surface requirements in LDR Section 23.3-7 and the off-street parking space requirements in LDR Section 23.4-10. A fully dimensional site plan shall be required at permit for the alterations to the patio, driveway, and parking spaces.
10. Formal and complete review for compliance with the City's Land Development Regulations will be conducted at building permit review.

BOARD POTENTIAL MOTION:

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 23-00100025 for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for garage enclosure, window replacement, and alterations to paved and gravel parking areas **with staff recommended conditions** for the property at **902 South Palmway**, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 23-00100025 for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for garage enclosure, window replacement, and alterations to paved and gravel parking areas **with staff recommended conditions but excluding the conditions related to the recessed area at the existing garage door opening and applied window muntins** for the property at **902 South Palmway**, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 23-00100025 for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for garage enclosure, window replacement, and alterations to paved and gravel parking areas at **902 South Palmway**, because the applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application complies with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulation and Historic Preservation requirements.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Historic Architectural Drawings
- B. Proposed New Windows and Door
- C. Survey and Partial Site Plan
- D. Ranch Design Guidelines, Window Replacement Guidelines, and Secretary of Interior Standards for Historic Garage Opening Infill
- E. Applicant's Justification Statement