



DATE: July 3, 2024

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

FROM: William Waters, Director
Department for Community Sustainability

THROUGH: Annie Greening, Principal Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

MEETING: July 10, 2024

SUBJECT: **COA Approval Matrix Amendment:** Consideration of an amendment to the COA Approval Matrix to provide flexibility for administrative review of roofing replacement on non-contributing resources with flat white concrete tile roofs, and to clarify review processes for replacement of flat white concrete tile roofs on contributing resources and replacement of metal shingle roofs.

BACKGROUND

The Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Approval Matrix is a document that provides a summary of authority (Staff Approval vs. Board Approval) for actions that impact the exterior appearance of properties located within the historic districts. At the June 12, 2024, Historic Resources Preservation Board (HRPB) meeting, staff initiated a discussion about replacement of flat white concrete tile roofs on non-contributing resources in the City's historic districts. The Historic Preservation Design Guidelines state that flat white concrete tile roofs can only appropriately be replaced in kind with new concrete tiles roofing. In alignment with the Design Guidelines and COA Approval Matrix, staff can currently only administratively approve replacement in-kind; any requests for replacement with an alternative roofing type must be brought to the Historic Resources Preservation Board, typically with a simultaneous Unreasonable Economic Hardship application.¹

Flat white concrete tiles roofs are an important character-defining feature of Masonry Vernacular and Masonry Minimal Traditional resources, and are occasionally a character-defining feature on Mid-Century Modern and Ranch resources. As resources with this roof type generally range from about 50 years old to about 90 years old, growing numbers of homeowners in Lake Worth Beach are applying to replace their historic concrete tile roofs. Recently, staff has received a handful of requests for alternatives for tile replacement on non-contributing structures, and staff anticipates that these requests will increase in the coming years.

PROPOSAL:

To provide for additional flexibility for owners of non-contributing resources and avoid taking numerous projects to the HRPB for review, the Director of Community Sustainability recommended that the HRPB consider amending the COA Approval Matrix to allow for alternative roofing options for non-contributing resources with existing

¹ For more information about Unreasonable Economic Hardship applications, please see the definition in [LDR Section 23.1-12](#) and the supplemental standards in [LDR Section 23.5-4\(I\)](#).

concrete tile roofs. The amended COA Approval Matrix will also codify HRPB direction from May 2022 regarding the replacement of historic metal shingles.

City staff contacted the State Historic Preservation Office (Bureau of Historic Preservation, Florida Department of State) for input regarding the proposed matrix amendment. In email communications on July 1, 2024, a representative from the State Historic Preservation Office confirmed that the proposed amendment would be appropriate to provide flexibility for non-contributing resources and would have no negative impact on the City's status as a Certified Local Government (see Attachment B).

Alternative Materials for Flat White Concrete Tile Roofing: Below are examples of alternate roofing materials that are known to staff and that meet Florida Building Code requirements as of the date of publication of this staff report. See Attachment C for images of roofing brands noted below.

Dimensional Asphalt Shingles (most common brands in Lake Worth Beach):

- Owens Corning – Duration Shingles and Oakridge Shingles – Shasta White, Antique Silver
- GAF – Timberline Shingles – Birchwood, Fox Hollow Gray
- CertainTeed – Landmark Shingles – Silver Birch
- TAMKO – Heritage Shingles – Glacier White

Stone-Coated Steel Shingles:

- Westlake Royal Roofing – Pine Crest Shake – Dover
- Westlake Royal Roofing – Granite Ridge Shingle and Cottage Shingle - *currently no appropriate color options in their pre-made colorways; custom color options may be available*

Metal Shingles:

- Classic Metal Roofing Systems – Oxford Shingle – White
- EDCO – Arrowline Shake Steel Roofing – Pewter
- TAMKO – MetalWorks StoneCrest Tile Shingles – *currently no appropriate color options in their pre-made colorways, but a custom color option is available*

Implementation:

The review process(es) for replacement of concrete tile and metal shingle roofing will be included in the COA Approval Matrix as footnotes #6 and 7. In addition, Staff will require all administrative Certificate of Appropriateness applications for replacement of concrete tile roofing with an alternate material on non-contributing structures to provide an image showing the color of the proposed replacement roofing.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Resources Preservation Board carefully discuss the proposed amendment to the COA Approval Matrix and assess whether the proposed amendment aligns with the intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance (LDR Section 23.5-4).

POTENTIAL MOTION:

I move to **ADOPT/NOT ADOPT** the amended COA Approval Matrix.

Attachments

- A. Draft Amended COA Approval Matrix
- B. State Historic Preservation Office Communication
- C. Roofing Material Images