



MEMORANDUM DATE: October 14, 2020

AGENDA DATE: October 7, 2020

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **910 North M Street**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 20-00100061:** Consideration of a Completed Work Application for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption; and, the review and recommendation to the City Commission of a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the subject property located at **910 North M Street;** PCN#38-43-44-21-15-286-0030 for completed work. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District and located within the Single-Family and Two-Family Residential (SF-TF 14) Zoning District.

OWNER: Frank Vieira
910 North M Street
Lake Worth Beach, FL 33460

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property owner, Frank Viera, is requesting approval of a certification of a Completed Work Application for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption and the review and recommendation to the City Commission of a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the rehabilitated property located at 910 North M Street. The approval of a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption application requires a review and recommendation by the HRPB prior to consideration by the Lake Worth Beach City Commission. The property is located within the Single-Family and Two-Family Residential (SF-TF 14) Zoning District and retains a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Medium Density Residential (MDR). If approved, the subject application would certify the completed scope of work authorized under the Pre-Construction application, which was approved by the HRPB at the March 11, 2020 regular meeting. The Applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission for approval of a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption.

The subject property is a platted lot of record with frontage on North M Street to the west. The single-family residence on this parcel was constructed ca.1950 in a Masonry Minimal Traditional architectural style. Although the architect is unknown, Mr. and Mrs. F. Weiler of Lake Worth commissioned the building at a value of \$8,500. The architectural drawings for this structure display characteristic expressions of the Masonry Minimal Traditional style. Original character-defining features of the structure include an asymmetrical front facade, masonry construction with smooth stucco, large picture and corner casement

windows, a projecting entryway roofline supported by decorative wrought iron columns, and a flat white concrete tile roof. The property also contains a rear detached frame garage with a gable roof with asphalt shingles. Overall, the building retains a moderate degree of all seven aspects of historic integrity including location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

On March 11, 2020, the HRPB approved a request by the Applicant for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Alterations and a Pre-Construction Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption application. The Applicant worked closely with staff to arrive at a window replacement and roof replacement program for the contributing resource. Photos of the structure prior to its rehabilitation can be found in this report as **Attachment A**. The rehabilitation plans approved by the HRPB are included as **Attachment B**. An analysis of the scope of work approved by the HRPB and completed by the Applicant can be found on pages 3-5; Historic Preservation Analysis.

The application will require the following approval:

1. Approval of a **Completed Work Application** for the scope of work performed under Certificate of Appropriateness #20-00100061 as approved in the Pre-Construction Application for the property located at 910 North M Street.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Completed Work Application and a recommendation for approval of the associated historic ad valorem tax exemption for the subject property. to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

Owners	Frank Vieira
General Location	East side of North M Street between 10 th Ave N and 9 th Ave N
PCN	38-43-44-21-15-286-0030
Zoning	Single-Family and Two-Family Residential (SF-TF 14)
Existing Land Use	Single Family Residence
Future Land Use Designation	Medium Density Residential (MDR)



COMPREHENSIVE PLAN ANALYSIS

The project was determined at the March 11, 2020 regular meeting to comply with Objective 3.4.2, which encourages the identification of historically significant resources, and to promote their preservation and rehabilitation as referenced by the Surveys of Historic Properties conducted by the City of Lake Worth Beach. The project was also determined to be consistent with Policy 3.4.2.1 of the Comprehensive Plan, which encourages the preservation of historic, architectural, cultural, or aesthetic resources through the enforcement of the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance. The structure at 910 North M Street was deemed as a contributing resource to the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District and that it adds to the architectural variety and significance of the District.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION ANALYSIS

COA#20-00100061: Pre-Construction Scope of Work for Exterior Alterations

The HRPB reviewed and approved a proposal for exterior alterations to the contributing resource at the March 11, 2020, regular meeting. The general scope of work for COA#20-00100061 was approved as follows;

The Applicant requested exterior alterations for the **primary structure** as follows:

- 1) Remove all existing casement, fixed, and single-hung windows and replace them with new CGI aluminum impact horizontal roller and single-hung windows that replicate the original casement design.
- 2) Remove the existing three-tab asphalt shingle roof and replace it with a new Eagle Roofing "Malibu" simulated concrete barrel tile in white.
- 3) Remove the existing flat roof and replace it with a new CertainTeed modified bitumen roof system.

The Applicant requested exterior alterations for the rear **garage structure** as follows:

- 1) Remove the existing three-tab asphalt shingle roof and replace it with a new Owens Corning dimensional asphalt shingle roof.

COA#20-00100061: Pre-Construction Scope of Work Compliance Review

Per a review of the Post-Construction application, the approved scope of work was adhered to and the completed building reflects the exterior alterations proposed by the applicant at the March 11, 2020 meeting.

COA#20-00100061: HRPB Conditions of Approval Compliance Review

The HRPB, at Staff's recommendation, included nine (9) conditions of approval in the development order for the project. Below, please find the conditions of approval, and Staff's compliance review for each condition.

1. The replacement horizontal roller and single-hung windows shall have aluminum frames and shall be installed in the configurations as depicted in the window installation schedule.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The windows have aluminum frames and were installed in the configurations depicted in the approved window installation schedule.

2. The windows shall utilize clear glass or clear Low-E glass. Tinted, grey, mirrored, or colored glass shall not be used.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The windows do not utilize tinted, grey, mirrored, or colored glass.

3. The windows shall not be installed flush with the exterior wall but at the same plane as the existing windows.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The windows were installed recessed in the window jambs.

4. All divided light patterns shall be created utilizing exterior raised applied triangular muntins. Flat muntins or “grids between the glass” shall not be used.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The windows used raised triangular muntins.

5. The concrete roof tiles shall have a white finish.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met.

6. The asphalt shingle roof for the garage structure shall utilize a dimensional asphalt shingle. Staff recommends the shingles be white or light grey in color.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met.

Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Conditions of Approval

- 1) All work shall be conducted per the submitted and approved COA for exterior alterations, including all conditions of approval included in the Development Order. Any revisions or changes to this approval shall be reported to Staff and may require additional Staff or HRPB approvals.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. No revisions were requested.

- 2) All work shall be conducted in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met.

- 3) The Applicant shall be responsible for fully documenting the rehabilitation process so that the Board will have sufficient documentation to evaluate the completed work to make a recommendation on the tax exemption application to City Commission.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The Applicants submitted photo documentation of the completed work.

PUBLIC COMMENT

At the time of publication of the agenda, Staff has received no public comment.

CONCLUSION

According to Lake Worth Beach Building Division records, the roof replacement for the property was completed under building permit #19-2068 and the window replacement under building permit #20-1122. The Applicant valued the improvements at \$37,809.00. The Applicant submitted a Request for Review of Completed Work application to the Department of Community Sustainability and provided photo documentation of the completed work. The Completed Work application is included in this report as **Attachment C** and current photos of the property are included as **Attachment D**.

Should the Board determine that the qualifying improvements were successfully completed in accordance with the pre-construction application and recommends approval for the completed work application, Staff will forward the application to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission for final approval. Once the application has been approved by the City Commission, it will be forwarded to the County for processing and approval by the County Board of Commissioners.

Staff has reviewed the documentation and materials provided in this application and has performed a site visit to the property after final inspection. It is staff's analysis that the work performed at the property follows the scope of work approved in the Pre-Construction Application and complies with the conditions of approval included in the Certificate of Appropriateness Development Order. The HRPB made findings at the March 11, 2020 regular meeting that the property was eligible for the exemption and that the proposal was in keeping with the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the requirements set forth in Sec. 23.5-5 of the Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the Completed Work Application and also recommends that HRPB recommend approval of the Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission.

POTENTIAL MOTION

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 20-00100061 for a Completed Work Application for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the property located at 910 North M Street, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

Further, I MOVE TO **RECOMMEND** to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission this application and its approval.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 20-00100061 for a Completed Work Application for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the property located at 910 North M Street, because the Applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is in compliance with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Pre-Construction Photos
- B. Approved Rehabilitation Plans
- C. Part III – Request for Review of Completed Work Application
- D. Completed Work Photos
- E. Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulation Sec. 23-5-5