



MEMORANDUM DATE: June 3, 2020

AGENDA DATE: June 10, 2020

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **407 South Lakeside Drive**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 18-00100211:** Consideration of a Completed Work Application and a recommendation to Lake Worth Beach City Commission for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the subject property located at **407 South Lakeside Drive**; PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-165-0080. The subject property is a contributing resource to the South Palm Park Local Historic District and is located within the Low-Density Multi-Family Residential 20 (MF-20) Zoning District.

OWNER: Justin Hu
Crouching Tiger Hidden Dragon Investment Group, LLC.
2226 Balsan Way
Wellington, FL 33414

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property owner, Justin Hu, is requesting certification of a Completed Work Application and a recommendation to Lake Worth Beach City Commission for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the rehabilitated property located at 407 South Lakeside Drive. The property is located in the Low-Density Multi-Family Residential 20 (MF-20) Zoning District and retains a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Medium-Density Residential (MDR). If approved, the subject application would certify the completed scope of work authorized under the Pre-Construction application, which was approved by the HRPB at the October 10, 2018, regular meeting. The Applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission for approval of a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption.

The subject property is a 50' x 135' platted lot of record with frontage on South Lakeside Drive to the east. The primary multi-family structure and the rear two-story garage apartment were constructed c. 1928 in a Mediterranean Revival architectural style. Remaining character-defining features include asymmetrical facades, sloped barrel tile roofs, stucco siding, arched recessed window hoods, wood bracketed overhangs, vertical wood plank entry doors, decorative curving exterior staircases, and a copula tower with triplets of arches and a pecky cypress ceiling. Overall, the buildings retain a significant degree of historic integrity of location, setting, materials, and design.

On October 10, 2018, the HRPB approved a request by the Applicant for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Alterations and a Pre-Construction Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption application. The Applicant worked closely with Staff to devise a rehabilitation plan for the structure, as the building had sat in a state of disrepair for many years. Photos of the structure prior to its rehabilitation can be found in this report as **Attachment A**. The rehabilitation plans approved by the HRPB are included as **Attachment B**. An analysis of the scope of work approved by the HRPB and completed by the Applicant can be found on pages 4-7; Historic Preservation Analysis.

The application will require the following approval:

1. Approval of a **Completed Work Application** for the scope of work performed under Certificate of Appropriateness #18-00100211 as approved in the Pre-Construction Application for the property located at 407 South Lakeside Drive.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Completed Work Application and a recommendation for approval of this application to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

Owner	Justin Hu, Crouching Tiger Hidden Dragon Investment Group, LLC.
General Location	South Lakeside Drive, between 4 th Ave S and 5 th Ave S
PCN	38-43-44-21-15-165-0080
Zoning	Low Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-20)
Existing Land Use	Multi-Family
Future Land Use Designation	Medium Density Residential (MDR)



Map Legend

407 South Lakeside Drive

0 37.3 75 150 Feet



SITE ANALYSIS

Surrounding Properties

The site is surrounded by properties with similar Zoning and FLU designation. The following summarizes the nature of the surrounding properties adjacent to the subject site.

NORTH: Immediately north of the subject site is a multi-family structure. This area contains a FLU designation of Medium Density Residential (MDR) and a Zoning designation of Low-Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-20).

SOUTH: Immediately south of the subject site is a multi-family structure. This area contains a FLU designation of Medium Density Residential (MDR) and a Zoning designation of Low-Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-20).

EAST: Immediately east of the subject site is Bryant Park. This area contains a FLU designation of Public Recreation and Open Space (PROS) and a Zoning designation of Public Recreation and Open Space (PROS).

WEST: Immediately west of the subject site across the alley is a single-family residence. This area contains a FLU designation Medium Density Residential (MDR) and a Zoning designation of Low-Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-20).



Map Legend

- 0 37.5 75 150 Feet
- Single Family Residential
 - Public Recreation and Open Space (PROS)
 - Low-Density Multi-Family Residential, 20 du/net acre(MF-20)
 - 407 South Lakeside Drive
- N

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN ANALYSIS

Objective 3.4.2: To encourage the identification of historically significant structures, and to Promote its preservation and rehabilitation as referenced by the Surveys of Historic Properties conducted by the City of Lake Worth Beach.

Staff Analysis: The structure at 407 South Lakeside Drive was surveyed as a historic contributing resource to the South Palm Park Local Historic District when the district was designated in March of 2000. Due to its classification as a contributing resource through a historic resource survey, the property is eligible for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption.

Policy 3.4.2.1: Properties of special value for historic, architectural, cultural or aesthetic reasons will be restored and preserved through the enforcement of the City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance to the extent possible.

Staff Analysis: The structure at 407 South Lakeside Drive has special architectural value as it retains many architectural features, was designed as a contributing resource, and adds to the architectural variety and significance of the South Palm Park Local Historic District.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION ANALYSIS

COA#18-00100211: Pre-Construction Scope of Work for Exterior Alterations

The HRPB reviewed and approved a proposal for exterior alterations to the contributing resource at the October 10, 2018, regular meeting. The general scope of work for COA#18-00100211 was approved as follows;

Primary Structure

- 1) Remove all existing non-original windows and replace them with aluminum impact Lawson single-hung windows with compatible divided light patterns.
- 2) Remove all existing exterior doors and replace them new Masonite “Mahogany Textured” fiberglass two panel plank impact doors.
- 3) Remove the existing barrel roof tiles and replace them with new Veree clay barrel tiles.
- 4) Repair all of the exterior stucco.
- 5) Remove existing non-original decorative metal posts, railings, and screens on the front porches and replace them with a new decorative wood post and railing system.
- 6) Remove existing broken floor tiles in exterior porch spaces and replace it with new ceramic tiles.
- 7) Remove all window air conditioning units and install (10) new mini-split air conditioning systems. All condensing units will be installed on the ground and all refrigerant and drip lines will be run inside the walls of the structure and not on the exterior building facades.

Garage Apartment

- 1) Remove all existing non-original windows and replace them with aluminum impact Lawson single-hung windows with compatible divided light patterns.
- 2) Remove all existing exterior doors and replace them new Masonite “Mahogany Textured” fiberglass two panel plank impact doors.
- 3) Remove existing deteriorated exterior staircases and reconstruct in existing location.
- 4) Reconstruct the existing fixed wood carriage doors.
- 5) Repair all of the exterior stucco.
- 6) Remove all window air conditioning units and install (1) new mini-split air conditioning system. The condensing unit will be installed on the ground and all refrigerant and drip lines will be run inside the walls of the structure and not on the exterior building facades.

COA#18-00100211: Pre-Construction Scope of Work Compliance Review

In addition to the above scope of work for exterior alterations, both structures were also painted and received complete interior renovations; including but not limited to new electric, plumbing, and mechanical upgrades, new drywall, new interior doors, new flooring, and new kitchens and bathrooms. New landscaping and paver walkways were installed and various site features were also improved. Extensive portions of the building were also reframed from the interior and new flood vents were added to make the structure FEMA compliant.

The approved scope of work was generally adhered to with two exceptions. The barrel tile roof on the primary structure was not replaced per the proposed scope, as the existing roof of the structure was in good condition and had been recently replaced prior to the Applicant’s ownership. In addition, at Staff’s recommendation, the HRPB added a condition of approval that the four remaining original vertical wood plank doors be retained, restored, and preserved, as they were excellent examples of hand-built craftsmanship that originally defined the character of the building. The Applicant did restore the four entry doors; therefore, all exterior doors were not replaced with the fiberglass impact doors.

COA#18-00100211: HRPB Conditions of Approval Compliance Review

The HRPB, at Staff’s recommendation, included twelve (12) conditions of approval in the development order for the project. Below, please find the conditions of approval, and Staff’s compliance review for each condition.

1. The replacement windows shall be aluminum impact single-hung windows, as proposed. The proposed 6/1 divided light patterns may be altered depending on the size of the window openings, and will be subject to Staff review at permitting. All divided light patterns shall be created by utilizing exterior raised applied triangular muntins, as proposed. No external flat muntins or “grills between the glass” shall be used. The windows shall utilize clear glass.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The windows were installed properly, are of the correct material, and utilize the correct glass type, muntin type, and divided light patterns.

2. All existing window trim, sills and recessed stucco arched hoods, shall be retained and repaired or replaced in-kind where deterioration is too severe for continued use.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The window trim, sills, and stucco hoods were retained or repaired appropriately.

3. The replacement windows shall be installed in the original window openings, and the openings shall not be relocated, made smaller by building in the framing, or made larger by expanding the opening.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The new impact windows were sized and installed appropriately.

4. The replacement windows shall be installed recessed in the jambs a minimum of two inches, and not installed flush with the exterior wall.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The new impact windows are recessed appropriately.

5. Character defining features utilizing pecky cypress on the structure shall not be altered (aside from painting) or removed, specifically regarding the ceiling of the porches and copula tower.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The pecky cypress features were retained and preserved.

6. The four original vertical plank doors featured on the primary façade be retained, restored, and preserved. If deteriorated beyond repair replacements shall match, subject to staff review.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The four original wood plank doors were preserved and retained. The doors were sanded, repainted, and appropriate hinges and hardware were installed.

7. Staff recommends that the proposed Masonite “Mahogany Textured” fiberglass two panel plank replacement doors come with a wood-look factory finish, and be painted or stained brown to enhance the visual appearance of a wood door.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The replacement fiberglass two panel plank doors have a wood-look factory finish. At Staff’s last visit to the property, the doors had yet to be painted. Due to Condition of Approval #6, the replacement doors are located to the rear of the property as the original wood doors remain on the front of the building.

8. The column configuration of the proposed front porch shall closely replicate the column configuration and detailing found on the structure located at 602 North Lakeside Drive. Detailed scaled drawings of the proposed columns shall be submitted and reviewed by Staff at permitting. Staff recommends painting or staining the wood porch elements brown to emphasize the detailing of the wood post and beam construction. The vertical pickets in the railing system shall be 36 inches in height with an added guardrail at 42 inches.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. Detailed scaled drawings of the proposed column and railing configuration were submitted and reviewed at permitting. The constructed column and railing system are property proportioned and were constructed per the approved drawings.

9. The exterior stairs on the rear structure shall be reconstructed in the same configuration and location as they currently exist. Any alterations to the stair design shall be subject to Staff review at permitting and shall meet current code requirements.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The replacement stairs were reconstructed in the same location and utilize decorative period appropriate splats. The stair design was reviewed and approved by the City's Building Official.

10. The replacement stucco shall match the existing stucco in texture, coarseness, and application, subject to Staff review during construction. A 48 x 48 inch mockup of sample texture shall be reviewed by staff prior to completion.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The replacement stucco matches the existing in texture, coarseness, and application. Staff was called on-site to review stucco textures prior to application.

11. The new clay barrel tiles shall be "red/terracotta" in color with variegation as listed in the "Verea" color options brochure. Staff recommends the "Jacobea" finish.

Staff Analysis: The condition is not met. Due to the good condition of the existing barrel tiles and underlayment, the barrel tile roofs were not replaced. The roof replacement segment will be removed from Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Application's improvement plan.

12. The front south parapet shall be heightened 16 inches at front corners with ¼ circle reductions to the existing parapet height which is typical for the style.

Staff Analysis: The condition is met. The parapet wall was raised and new masonry ¼ circle reductions were added to the corners.

PUBLIC COMMENT

At the time of publication of the agenda, Staff has received no public comment.

CONCLUSION

According to Lake Worth Beach Building Division records, all associated work for the property was reviewed under Building Permit #18-1558. The building permit application was applied for on April 24, 2018, and final inspection occurred on April 2, 2020. A Certificate of Completion was issued on April 13, 2020. The overall project was given a building permit valuation of \$275,000.00. The Applicant submitted a Request for Review of Completed Work application to the Department of Community Sustainability and provided photo documentation of the completed work. The Completed Work application is included in this report as **Attachment C** and current photos of the property are included as **Attachment D**.

Should the Board determine that the qualifying improvements were successfully completed in accordance with the pre-construction application and recommends approval for the completed work application, Staff will forward the application to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission for final approval. Once the application has been approved by the City Commission, it will be forwarded to the County for processing and approval by the County Board of Commissioners.

Staff has reviewed the documentation and materials provided in this application and has performed multiple site visits to the property during the construction process and at final inspection. It is Staff's analysis that the work performed at the property follows the scope of work approved in the Pre-Construction Application and is in compliance with the conditions of approval included in the Certificate of Appropriateness Development Order. In addition, the HRPB made findings at the October 10, 2018, regular meeting that the property was eligible for the exemption and that the proposal was in keeping with the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the requirements set forth in Sec. 23.5-5 of the Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations. Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the Completed Work Application and a recommendation for approval of the Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission.

POTENTIAL MOTION

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 18-00100211 for a Completed Work Application for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the property located at 407 South Lakeside Drive, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements. Further, I MOVE TO **RECOMMEND** to the Lake Worth Beach City Commission this application and its approval.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 18-00100211 for a Completed Work Application for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the property located at 407 South Lakeside Drive, because the Applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is in compliance with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Pre-Construction Photos
- B. Approved Architectural Drawings
- C. Part III – Request for Review of Completed Work Application
- D. Completed Work Photos
- E. Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulation Sec. 23-5-5