



MEMORANDUM DATE: May 5, 2021

AGENDA DATE: May 12, 2021

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **801 North Palmway | Continuance from April HRPB Meeting**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 21-00100071:** Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for window and door replacement for the property located at **801 North Palmway**; PCN #38-43-44-21-15-232-0160. The subject property is a noncontributing resource to the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District and is located in the Single-Family Residential (SF-R) Zoning District.

OWNER: Mariusz Baran
801 North Palmway
Lake Worth Beach, FL 33460

PROPERTY DEVELOPMENT HISTORY:

The structure located at 801 N Palmway was constructed in 1997. The original architectural drawings are located within the City's property file and are included in this report as **Attachment A**. The plans illustrate a two-story building of masonry construction, smooth stucco exterior finish, and cement barrel tile pent roofs. The fenestration consists of single-hung windows, decorative circle and half-circle windows, French doors with sidelights, and a pair of half-light panel front doors. The plans included in Attachment A show decorative divided-light patterns that do not appear to have been installed at time of construction. The structure's character-defining features include a gable covered entry, second-story balconies, a breezeway connecting the main structure with the two-story garage, and an open boat garage at the rear of the property. Current photos are included as **Attachment B**.

City permit records indicate the structure has had alterations over time, including the installation of an exterior perimeter wall, roof replacement, installation of hurricane shutters, and air-conditioning upgrades.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The property owner, Mariusz Baran, is requesting a COA for window and door replacement for the property located at 801 North Palmway. The subject property is located on the southeast corner of North Palmway and 8th Avenue North in Lake Worth Beach. It is also located within the Single-Family Residential (SF-R) Zoning District and retains a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Single Family Residential (SFR).

If approved, the subject application would allow the replacement of the existing windows and doors with new Lawson aluminum impact single-hung, horizontal sliding, fixed glass windows, and French doors. The proposed windows are full-view and utilize grey-tinted glass with a visual light transmittance (VLT) of 40%.

The application will require the following approval:

1. **COA** for window and door replacement.

PROJECT HISTORY:

On January 8, 2021, Historic Preservation staff received building permit application #21-76 for window and door replacement for the structure. Staff reviewed the application and disapproved the request on January 20, 2021, as the permit application did not include a COA application, photos, or glass specifications. The subsequent resubmittal was also failed by staff as the visual light transmittance (VLT) of the proposed replacement windows measured 10%, whereas the COA Approval Matrix and Historic Preservation Design Guidelines require clear glass, or windows with a VLT measurement of at least 70%, to be approved administratively.

The HRPB reviewed the item at the April 14, 2020 regular meeting. During the meeting, the project contractor indicated that the proposed VLT of the replacement windows included in the permit application had been submitted in error, and that the VLT of the actual replacement window glass was 40%, as opposed to 10%. The HRPB continued the item to the May meeting and directed staff to conduct a site visit with the contractor and to photo document the replacement windows on-site. Staff performed a site visit on April 19, 2021. The photographs from that meeting are included in this report as **Attachment C**.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Although documentation for the existing window's VLT has not been discovered, the replacement windows with a VLT of 40% appear visually consistent with the existing original glazing. The structure was constructed in 1997 and the original windows utilized grey glass. As the replacement windows do not appear to be darker than the original products, staff recommends approval of the request as replacing the original windows in-kind with similar glass will not result in an adverse effect to the surrounding historic structures.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION:

Owner	Mariusz Baran
General Location	Southeast corner of North Palmway and 8 th Avenue North
PCN	38-43-44-21-15-232-0160
Zoning	Single-Family Residential (SF-R)
Existing Land Use	Single Family Residence
Future Land Use Designation	Single Family Residential ()



Consistency with the Comprehensive Plan

The proposed project is consistent with Policy 1.1.2.3 of the Comprehensive Plan, which intends to preserve single-family housing within the existing residential and historic neighborhoods. Window and door replacement with impact products provides protection for structures and prolongs their continued use as a single-family residence.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION ANALYSIS:

Historic Preservation Design Guidelines

The City's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines provide a guide for compatible window replacement for structures within the historic districts included as **Attachment D**. Windows are amongst the most important character-defining architectural features, but they are also one of the most commonly replaced features of a building. Consideration #5 states;

Windows historically utilized clear glass, and therefore clear glass is the most compatible type for historic structures. Windows with Low-E or Solarban coatings, applied tint, and mirrored finishes are not recommended.

Staff Analysis: The applicant is proposing an in-kind replacement of all of the structure's single-hung, horizontal sliding, and fixed glass windows and French doors with grey-tinted glass that has a visible light transmittance (VLT) of 40%. The existing windows on the structure are original and contain grey tinted glazing. Although the proposed glazing is not consistent with the replacement window considerations section of the Design Guidelines, the Guidelines do not consider buildings where the original glass was

not clear. Although staff cannot confirm the VLT of the original windows, the replacement windows do not appear darker than the existing glass, thus, could be considered an in-kind replacement, which can be permitted.

COA

For noncontributing structures in historic districts, alterations that are visible from a public street require a COA to ensure that the proposed design and materials are compatible with the district as a whole and to maintain an overall integrity of architectural style for the building. Staff has reviewed the documentation and materials provided in this application and outlined the applicable guidelines and standards found in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, detailed in the section below.

Section 23.5-4(K)(2) *Additional guidelines for alterations and additions. Noncontributing structures:*

A. Is this a change to the primary façade?

Staff Analysis: Yes, the proposed window and door replacement impacts the primary façade of the structure on North Palmway and the secondary façade fronting 8th Avenue North.

B. Is the change visually compatible and in harmony with its neighboring properties as viewed from a public street?

Staff Analysis: The subject property is classified as noncontributing and was constructed in 1997, which falls outside the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District's period of significance (1915 to 1952). Glass tints were widely available during the structure's period of construction in 1997. Therefore, an in-kind replacement of the grey-tinted glass may be considered appropriate for the structure.

The Historic Preservation Ordinance indicates in Section 23.5-4(e)(B) that changes to noncontributing buildings and structures shall be reviewed to ensure compatibility with neighboring properties within the historic district in order to protect the overall character and integrity of the district. Staff will defer cases to the HRPB where requested alterations present a conflict with the Design Guidelines to ensure that the character and integrity of the historic districts remains intact.

The structure at 801 North Palmway was constructed with grey tinted glass. Staff's current standards, as outlined in the Design Guidelines and COA Approval Matrix, limit staff authority to approving clear glass (VLT of 70%+) for all glazing on contributing structures and for visible windows on non-contributing structures. Although non-contributing structures are not designated as historic, maintaining the visual continuity of streetscapes within historic districts require the review of alterations to visible facades. Staff has determined that the replacement of the existing windows at 801 North Palmway with new glazing at a VLT of 40% will not result in any new adverse effects to the surrounding historic district as the window replacement proposal is in-kind, and therefore should not result in a substantial visual alteration to the building.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Staff has not received public comment for this item.

CONCLUSION:

Although documentation for the existing window's VLT has not been discovered, the replacement windows with a VLT of 40% appear visually consistent with the existing glazing. The structure was constructed in 1997 and the original windows utilized grey glass. As the replacement windows do not appear to be darker than the original products, staff recommends approval of the request as replacing the original windows in-kind with similar glass will not result in an adverse effect to the surrounding historic structures.

Conditions of Approval

1. The windows shall be installed recessed in the jambs and not installed flush with the exterior face of the wall.

POTENTIAL MOTION:

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 21-00100071, with staff recommended conditions, for a COA for window and door replacement for the property located at **801 North Palmway**, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 21-00100071 for a COA for window and door replacement for the property located at **801 North Palmway**, because the applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is compliant with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulation and Historic Preservation requirements.

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Property File Documentation
- B. Current Property Photos
- C. Site Visit Photos
- D. Historic Preservation Design Guidelines – Window Replacement