



MEMORANDUM DATE: March 4, 2020

AGENDA DATE: March 11, 2020

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **522 South Palmway**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 20-00100032:** Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement with a 5V-Crimp metal roof for the single-family structure at **522 South Palmway**; PCN# 38-43-44-27-01-004-0040. The subject property is a contributing resource to the South Palm Local Historic District and located within the Single-Family Residential (SF-R) Zoning District.

Applicant/Owner: Jeannie Gedeon
522 South Palmway
Lake Worth Beach, FL 33460

BACKGROUND:

The single-family residence located at 522 South Palmway was constructed c.1939 in a Masonry Minimal Traditional architectural style. The structure was designed by prominent Lake Worth architect, Edgar S. Wortman at a cost of \$5,000. The structure has dual frontages on South Palmway to the west and South Lakeside Drive to the east. The original architectural drawings are located within the City's property files and are included in this report in **Attachment C**. The architectural drawings for the structure illustrate a single-story residence of masonry construction with an exposed exterior brick, a flat concrete tile gable roof, a front-facing integral garage, a terrace with a masonry knee-wall, and casement windows with brick sills. City permit records indicate the structure has had alterations over time, including permits to replace the roof with dimensional asphalt shingles, enclosing the front-facing garage into additional living space, window and door replacement, and fencing. Overall, the structure retains a moderate to high degree of historic integrity of location, setting, materials, and design.

REQUEST:

The Applicant is proposing to replace the existing dimensional asphalt shingle roof on the single-family structure with a new 5V-Crimp metal roof in a "Copper" metallic paint finish.

Historic Preservation

Staff has reviewed the documentation and materials provided in this application and outlined the applicable guidelines and standards found in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, detailed in **Attachment B – Decision Criteria**.

The National Park Service and Secretary of the Interior’s Standards have specific criteria regarding replacement of historic materials. Specifically, Standards 2, 3, 5 and 6 apply in this situation:

Standard 2 - The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard 3 - Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

Standard 5 - Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

Standard 6 - Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

According to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and the City of Lake Worth Beach Design Guidelines, distinctive materials that characterize a property shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind. If a distinctive feature must be replaced, the new feature should match the old in design, color, texture, and materials where possible. The roof material is an important character-defining feature of a historic property. Dimensional asphalt shingles that match the existing roof and flat concrete tiles that replicate historic tile profiles and dimensions are still in production today and could be utilized as the replacement roofing material.

It is the analysis of Staff that the proposed material change to a 5V-Crimp metal roof in a “Copper” metallic paint finish could negatively affect the character-defining features of this property. Utilizing a copper finish may also lead to false sense of historical development, as the 5V-Crimp metal roof will imitate copper, but will not oxidize and patina overtime as a true copper roof does. In addition, Staff has been unable to locate any documented examples of historic structures with copper roofs in Lake Worth Beach. The Masonry Minimal Traditional style of architecture primarily used flat concrete tile as a roofing material, and occasionally used an asbestos shingle, asphalt shingle, or rolled roofing. Utilizing a 5V-Crimp metal roof on Masonry Minimal Traditional structures is a significant departure in material and design. Masonry residential structures throughout Lake Worth Beach were designed with an emphasis placed on horizontality. The buildings are typically linear in appearance, often one story, and utilized horizontal details in windows and doors. The roofing materials for these buildings continued this theme, with thick concrete tiles laid in horizontal rows creating a visually stepped appearance towards the high point of the roof. 5V-Crimp metal roofs have the opposite visual effect, as the seams are vertically oriented and the roofing material itself has a slender profile more appropriate for frame construction.

The National Park Service Preservation Brief #4 “*Roofing for Historic Buildings*” has been included as **Attachment D**. This Brief discusses the issues and options for the repair and replacement of historic roofs.

Under the “Alternative Materials” section of the Brief, Staff would like to draw special attention to this paragraph:

“In a rehabilitation project, there may be valid reasons for replacing the roof with a material other than the original. The historic roofing may no longer be available, or the cost of obtaining specially fabricated materials may be prohibitive. But the decision to use an alternative material should be weighed carefully against the primary concern to keep the historic character of the building. If the roof is flat and is not visible from any elevation of the building, and if there are advantages to substituting a modern built-up composition roof for what might have been a flat metal roof, then it may make better economic and construction sense to use a modern roofing method. But if the roof is readily visible, the alternative material should match as closely as possible the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic roofing material.”

The Applicant has submitted photographs of the existing structure, included as **Attachment E**. Product information on the requested 5V-Crimp metal roof has also been included as **Attachment F**.

Public Comment

At the time of publication of the agenda, Staff has received no written public comment.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN CONSISTENCY:

The project, as proposed, is consistent with the following Comprehensive Plan goals and objectives concerning future land use and housing:

Goal 1.3 To preserve and enhance the City’s community character as a quality residential and business center within the Palm Beach County urban area. (Objective 1.3.4)

Goal 1.4 Encourage preservation and rehabilitation of historic and natural resources and where appropriate restrict development that would damage or destroy these resources. (Objective 1.4.2)

Goal 3.1 To achieve a supply of housing that offers a range of residential unit styles and prices for current and anticipated homeowners and renters in all household income levels by the creation and/or preservation of housing units. (Objective 3.1.1)

CONSEQUENT ACTION:

Approve the application; approve the application with conditions; continue the hearing to a date certain to request additional information; or deny the application.

RECOMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Board discuss the visual and material compatibility criteria of the proposed 5V Crimp roof for the Masonry Minimal Traditional structure provided in this report as **Attachment B**.

POTENTIAL MOTION:

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 20-00100032: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement with a 5V-Crimp metal roof for the single-family structure at **522 South Palmway**, based upon the competent substantial evidence, and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Land Development Regulations, Section 23.5-4, the City’s Comprehensive Plan, and the City of Lake Worth Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 20-00100032: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement with a 5V-Crimp metal roof for the single-family structure located at **522 South Palmway**, because the Applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is in compliance with the City of Lake Worth Land Development Regulations Section 23.5-4, the City’s Comprehensive Plan, and the City of Lake Worth Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Location Map – 522 South Palmway
- B. Decision Criteria
- C. Property File Documentation
- D. NPS Preservation Brief #4 “Roofing for Historic Buildings”
- E. Current Photos
- F. Proposed Product Information

ATTACHMENT A

