



MEMORANDUM DATE: December 31, 2019

AGENDA DATE: January 8, 2020

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **230 North L Street**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 19-00100276:** Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of an existing non-contributing structure and the new construction of a ± 2,592 square foot multi-family structure at **230 North L Street**; PCN#: 38-43-44-21-15-046-0150. The subject property is located in the Medium Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-30) Zoning District and the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District.

Owner: Ezra Kassin
18 Waves LLC
7300 Biscayne Boulevard #200
Miami, FL 33138

ARCHITECT: Shulman and Associates
100 NE 38th Street
Miami, FL 33137

BACKGROUND:

The 75'x135' property located at 230 North L Street has public frontage on North L Street to the west and 3rd Avenue North to the north. The original structure at 230 North L Street was constructed c. 1914 in a Wood Frame Vernacular architectural style. Although no architectural drawings of this building are available, a property card from 1944 (included as **Attachment D**) describes the main structure as being a two-story multi-family wood frame structure with a screened front porch. A single-car wood frame garage was also constructed at the rear of the lot in the same time period. In 1946, the garage structure was condemned due to structural issues. In 1950, a duplex was constructed in a Mid-Century Modern architectural style to the rear of the parcel. The structure was designed by architect Dillard Duff at a cost of \$5,000. The architectural drawings for this structure illustrates a one-story duplex with a smooth stucco exterior finish, flat roof with eyebrow, and casement windows. In 1994, the two-story primary structure was demolished. In 2003, the remaining structure on the lot was converted from a duplex to a single-family residence. The structure was captured in the 2002 designation report for the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District and was classified as a non-contributing resource. The property in its current state is mostly vacant with a rear single-family structure remaining. Photos of the remaining structure can be found in this report as **Attachment E**.

PROJECT HISTORY

A similar request by the same Applicant (HRPB Project Number 19-00100234) was heard at the November 13, 2019 meeting. The Board voted unanimously to deny the demolition of the existing non-contributing structure and the new multi-family construction because the proposed design regarding height, massing, and the relationship of solids to voids did not follow the development pattern common with the district. The Applicant is proposing two (2) revised design options in this request for the Board to review.

REQUEST:

The Applicant is currently requesting approval for the demolition of the existing non-contributing structure and a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new ± 2,592 square foot multi-family structure to be constructed on the lot. The Applicant has provided proposed architectural plans for the building, including a site plan, floor plan, elevations, and streetscape elevations, included in this report as **Attachment F**. The proposed building is Modular in design with elements of Contemporary architecture. The Application submitted two (2) design options, each containing three (3) variations of exterior finishes.

Option A

The proposed building is designed with six modular units that form a two-story multi-family building. Each module is rectangular in shape and utilizes:

- a) Corrugated metal exterior finish;
- b) Hardy board siding; or,
- c) Smooth stucco

The exterior is also detailed with accent panels and large full-view windows. Three modular units are connected horizontally on the first floor to create frontage on 3rd Avenue North. The second floor is comprised of three modular units placed perpendicular to the ground floor units. On 3rd Avenue North, the first-floor façade features three distinct ramp entrances to each unit with full-view glass doors and large vertical windows. The second-floor façade is characterized by large vertical windows and metal canopies that create covered outdoor living space. On North J Street, the first-floor façade features large vertical windows, vertical metal screening that visually supports the second story, and staircases leading up to the cantilevered second-floor units. Site features include front walkways and patios to each unit on the ground floor, walkways to access the rear yards, and parking pads and carports below the second-floor units that provide vehicular access from North L Street and the alley.

Option B

The proposed building is designed with six modular sited around a central courtyard that form a two-story multi-family building. Each module is rectangular in shape and utilizes:

- a) Corrugated metal exterior finish;
- b) Hardy board siding; or,
- c) Smooth stucco

The exterior is also detailed with accent panels and large full-view windows. Four modular units are connected on the first floor around a centralized courtyard to create frontage on 3rd Avenue North and North L Street. The second floor is comprised of two modular units connected horizontally, positioned

above the primary courtyard entrance on 3rd Avenue North. On 3rd Avenue North, the first-floor façade features a main entrance with decorative metal screens that leads directly to an open-air courtyard. The second-floor façade is characterized by large vertical windows and decorative accent panels. On North J Street, the first-floor façade features large vertical windows, metal canopies that create covered outdoor living space, and decorative accent panels. Site features include front walkways to each unit on the ground floor, a centralized courtyard, and parking pads that provide vehicular access from the alley.

The property is located in the Medium Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-30) Zoning District.

<u>Dimension</u>	<u>Required by Code</u>	<u>Option A - Proposed</u>	<u>Option B - Proposed</u>
Density	30 dwelling units/acre max. (6 units)	6 units	6 units
Lot size	5,000 sq. ft.	10,125 sq. ft.	10,125 sq. ft.
Lot width	50'-0"	75'-0"	75'-0"
Lot depth	n/a	135'-0"	135'-0"
Front setback	20'-0"	20'-0"	20'-0"
Side setback	10% of lot width (min. 3') = 7'-6" each side	16'-4" (north) 25'-4" (south)	13'-6" (north) 13'-6" (south)
Rear setback	10% of lot depth = 13'-6"	15'-0"	43'-0"
Height	30'-0" for the primary structure	25'-10"	25'-10"
F.A.R. ¹	0.70 max. (7,087 sq. ft.)	0.24 (2,400 sq. ft.)	0.26 (2,592 sq. ft.)
Max. Building Coverage ² for a Large Lot	35% max. (3,544 sq. ft.)	11.85% (1,200 sq. ft.)	17.06% (1,728 sq. ft.)
Impermeable surface	55% max. (5,569 sq. ft.)	44.87% (4,543 sq. ft.)	49.70% (5,032 sq. ft.)
Living Area (Multi-Family)	400 sq. ft. efficiency	400 sq. ft. efficiency	432 sq. ft. efficiency

¹ *Floor area ratio*: A regulatory technique which relates to total developable site area and the size (square feet) of development permitted on a specific site. A numeric rating assigned to each land use category that determines the total gross square feet of all buildings as measured from each building's exterior walls based upon the actual land area of the parcel upon which the buildings are to be located. Total gross square feet calculated using the assigned floor area ratio shall not include such features as parking lots or the first three (3) levels of parking structures, aerial pedestrian crossovers, open or partially enclosed plazas, or exterior pedestrian and vehicular circulation areas.

² *Building lot coverage*: The area of a lot covered by the impervious surface associated with the footprint(s) of all buildings on a particular lot. Structured parking garages are exempt from building lot coverage.

Accessory Structure Limitations	Not to exceed 40% of the principal structure, or 1000 sq. ft. whichever is less	No accessory structure is proposed	No accessory structure is proposed
---------------------------------	---	------------------------------------	------------------------------------

Pursuant to LDR Section 23.4-10(f) Minimum parking requirements by use.

<u>Principal Use</u>	<u>Minimum Number of Parking Spaces</u>	<u>Additional Requirements</u>	<u>Option A - Proposed</u>	<u>Option B - Proposed</u>
Multi-Family Dwelling	1 space per bedroom with a max. of 2 spaces per unit; additional 0.5 guest space per efficiency and 1-bedroom unit; no additional guest spaces required for units containing 2 or more bedrooms Total of 9 Parking Spaces	On-street parking may be counted towards required parking	6 (Off-Street) 6 (On-Street)	6 (Off-Street) 8 (On-Street)

ANALYSIS:

New Construction:

Zoning and Comprehensive Plan Consistency

The proposed new construction (Options A and B) is consistent with all site data requirements in the City's Zoning Code and Comprehensive Plan. The application (Options A and B) as proposed meets the minimum off-street parking requirements, minimum living area requirements, and is in compliance with all impermeable surface requirements. The six-unit multi-family structure is also permitted in the Medium Density Multi-Family Residential (MF-30) Zoning District. The site plan generally meets the City's Zoning Code, and final review and approval will take place during the minor development review which is conducted administratively by Staff.

A landscape plan is included in **Attachment F**. The landscaping for the property will need to be evaluated to ensure it meets the minimum requirements of Section 23.6-1, Landscape Regulations. Final review and approval will take place during the building permit review process.

Historic Preservation

After reviewing the Decision Criteria for Demolition, included as **Attachment B**, it is the analysis of Staff that the existing non-contributing structure may be considered for demolition. The structure has been altered from its original design and does not display fine examples of craftsmanship.

Proposals for new construction within the City's local historic districts are subject to specific criteria for visual compatibility as set forth in Section 23.5-4(k) of the City's historic preservation regulations. This criterion is provided in **Attachment C**, and includes Staff's response to each criterion. The criteria deal with massing, scale, materials, and design compatibility with the surrounding historic district.

Both proposed designs are constructed utilizing modular units and utilize elements commonly found in contemporary architectural styles. Staff has included an excerpt from a publication that discusses modular construction (**Attachment G**). The informative document was created by The American Institute of Architects (AIA) and National Institute of Building Sciences. This document is meant to be purely educational, as this is not a common construction method found in Lake Worth Beach, and was not covered in the City's Design Guidelines. The majority of historic structures in Lake Worth Beach were built on site with the exception of relocated properties. The proposed project is comprised of modular units (volumetric construction) joined to form a single multi-family building. The project's architect has submitted a diagram illustrating the overall massing of the proposals (P. 16 of the architectural plans), included as **Attachment F**.

The Applicant has submitted two (2) design options for the multi-family building. Staff has some remaining concerns regarding the proposed massing of **Option A**, although the project architect has addressed many of HRPB's comments provided at the November meeting. The second story units have been pushed back to align with the front façade of the first floor units, and metal screening has been proposed on the east and west elevations to visually support the rear second story cantilevered elements. The Applicant is also proposing multiple new exterior siding treatments, which are more compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

Option B emulates a typology of several Mid-Century multi-family structures found throughout the City that are designed around a central courtyard. This design features a two-story symmetrical façade fronting 3rd Avenue North with an open central entryway. The design utilizes large vertical expanses of glass, decorative panels, and metal screening. The massing elements for Option B are also similar to other multi-family structures within the district as viewed from the street. Additionally, the Applicant is also proposing multiple exterior siding treatments outlined in the architectural drawings for the Board to review.

Staff recommends that the Board review the design options and determine which is most visually compatible with the neighboring structures and development patterns found within the district. Both proposals feature exterior circulation paths, contemporary design, and provide the Board with multiple options for exterior siding materials. Both proposals are in compliance with the City's zoning code and adequately address parking requirements.

Should the Board approve the request, Staff has recommended several conditions of approval to further increase compatibility, specifically regarding the exterior building materials.

Public Comment

At the time of publication of the agenda, Staff has received no formal public comment.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN CONSISTENCY:

The project, as proposed, is consistent with the following Comprehensive Plan goals and objectives concerning future land use and housing:

Goal 1.3 To preserve and enhance the City’s community character as a quality residential and business center within the Palm Beach County urban area. (Objective 1.3.4)

Goal 1.4 Encourage preservation and rehabilitation of historic and natural resources and where appropriate restrict development that would damage or destroy these resources. (Objective 1.4.2)

Goal 3.1 To achieve a supply of housing that offers a range of residential unit styles and prices for current and anticipated homeowners and renters in all household income levels by the creation and/or preservation of housing units. (Objective 3.1.1)

CONSEQUENT ACTION:

Approve the application; approve the application with conditions; continue the hearing to a date certain to request additional information; or deny the application.

RECOMMENDATION:

If the Board chooses to approve the request for the demolition of an existing non-contributing structure and the new construction of a six-unit multi-family structure, Staff suggests the following conditions:

- 1) A sample piece of the accent paneling shall be provided to staff for review prior to permitting.
- 2) All window, door, and sliding glass door frames shall utilize a black or clear-anodized silver finish.
- 3) All windows shall be recessed and shall not be installed flush with the exterior wall.
- 4) The windows, doors, and sliding glass doors shall utilize clear glass or glass with a clear Low-E coating. Tinted, grey, colored, and/or mirrored glass shall not be used.
- 5) Staff **recommends** that the Board discuss the site plans and proposed designs of Options A and B, and determine which design is the most visually compatible with the neighboring structures and development patterns found within the district.
- 6) Staff **recommends** that the Board discuss the exterior finish variations, and determine the most compatible option for the chosen design.

POTENTIAL MOTION:

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 19-00100276: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of an existing non-contributing structure and the new construction of a ± 2,592 square foot multi-family structure at **230 North L Street**, with the conditions as recommended by Staff, based upon the competent substantial evidence, and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations, Section 23.5-4.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 19-00100276: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of an existing non-contributing structure and the new construction of a ± 2,592 square foot multi-family structure at **230 North L Street**, because the Applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is in compliance with the City of Lake Worth Beach

Land Development Regulations Section 23.5-4, the Secretary of the Interiors Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties, and the City's Comprehensive Plan.

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Location Map – 230 North L Street
- B. Decision Criteria – Demolition
- C. Decision Criteria – New Construction
- D. Property File Documentation
- E. Current Photos
- F. Proposed Architectural Plans
- G. Design for Modular Construction: An Introduction for Architects (Excerpt)

ATTACHMENT A

