



MEMORANDUM DATE: December 31, 2019

AGENDA DATE: January 8, 2020

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **217 South J Street**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 19-00100264:** Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for exterior alterations and the construction of a +/- 233 sq. ft. addition to the single-family residence at **217 South J Street**; PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-085-0240. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Southeast Lucerne Local Historic District and located within the Multi-Family Residential (MF-20) Zoning District.

Owner: Chris Couture
217 South J Street
Lake Worth Beach, FL 33460

BACKGROUND:

The single-story single-family residence located at 217 South J Street was constructed c.1925 in a Wood Frame Vernacular architectural style. The property has frontage on South J Street to the east. Although no architectural drawings of the building are available in the City's property files, a property card from 1944 (included as **Attachment C**) describes the structure as being of wood frame construction on a concrete block foundation, having a gable roof with asphalt shingles, wood windows, and two screened porches. The property card also indicates that a rear cottage and detached garage were constructed on the lot. City permit records indicate the structure has had alterations over time, including permits for roof replacement, installation of asbestos siding, and window replacement. Overall, the structure retains a high degree of historic integrity of location, setting, and design, and a moderate degree of historic integrity of materials due to window, siding, and roof replacement.

REQUEST:

The Applicant has submitted plans for a new +/- 233 square foot one-story front porch addition to the east of the structure, included as **Attachment E**. The proposed addition will accommodate a new porch and additional enclosed living area for the structure. The addition is proposed to attach to the existing historic structure on the east (front) façade and extend the existing gable roof by removing the smaller gable roof over the projecting enclosed front porch. The new front porch is designed with simple wood beams and posts, wood railings, decorative brackets, and a gable vent. New dimensional asphalt shingles

will be installed in the gable roof extension to match the existing structure. Photos of the existing structure are included in this report as **Attachment D**.

The request also includes exterior alterations to the existing structure. The proposal includes partial window replacement with new aluminum impact 4/1 single-hung, awning, and horizontal roller windows. The majority of windows being replaced are altering or relocating the existing window openings. All the existing jalousie windows will remain on the north façade. In addition, the exterior doors will be replaced with new aluminum impact full-view French doors.

The property is located in the Multi-Family Residential (MF-20) Zoning District.

<u>Dimension</u>	<u>Required by Code</u>	<u>Existing or Proposed</u>
Lot size	5,000 sq. ft.	6,750 sq. ft.
Lot width	50'-0"	50'-0"
Lot depth	n/a	135'-0"
Front setback	20'-0"	Existing: 29'-8" Proposed: 20'-0"
Side setback	10% of lot width = 7'-6" each side	26'-4" (north) 17'-5" (south)
Rear setback	10% of lot depth = 13'-6"	61'-11"
Height	30' for principal structure	14'-0" (roof ridge)
F.A.R. ¹	0.50 max. (5,062 sq. ft.)	0.29 (2,972 sq. ft.)
Max. Building Coverage ² for a Large Lot	35% max. (3,544 sq. ft.)	18.28% (1,850 sq. ft.)
Impermeable surface	55% max. (5,569 sq. ft.)	29.36% (2,972 sq. ft.)
Accessory Structure Limitations	Not to exceed 40% of the principal structure, or 1000 sq. ft. whichever is less	No accessory structure expansion is proposed.

¹ *Floor area ratio*: A regulatory technique which relates to total developable site area and the size (square feet) of development permitted on a specific site. A numeric rating assigned to each land use category that determines the total gross square feet of all buildings as measured from each building's exterior walls based upon the actual land area of the parcel upon which the buildings are to be located. Total gross square feet calculated using the assigned floor area ratio shall not include such features as parking lots or the first three (3) levels of parking structures, aerial pedestrian crossovers, open or partially enclosed plazas, or exterior pedestrian and vehicular circulation areas.

² *Building lot coverage*: The area of a lot covered by the impervious surface associated with the footprint(s) of all buildings on a particular lot. Structured parking garages are exempt from building lot coverage.

ANALYSIS:

Exterior Alterations and Addition:

Zoning and Comprehensive Plan Consistency

The proposed addition is consistent with all site data requirements in the City's Zoning Code and is generally consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. The addition as proposed would be conforming, and would not require any variances from the zoning code. A determination to see if a landscape review will be required will be performed at permitting.

Historic Preservation

Additions within a local historic district are subject to specific criteria for visual compatibility as set forth in Section 23.5-4(k) of the City's historic preservation regulations. This criterion is provided in **Attachment B** and include Staff's response to each criterion. The criteria deal with massing, scale, materials, and design compatibility with the surrounding historic district.

The proposed exterior alterations and addition alter character-defining features of the historic structure and obscure the front façade. The majority of the proposed new windows create new openings and significantly alter the existing historic openings. The property is characterized by pairs and triplets of windows, specifically on the enclosed front porch. The current proposal removes these configurations and the spatial relationships of solids to voids on the exterior walls are significantly altered. In addition, the property retains its original wood window trim, sills, and mullions, which Staff recommends not to be removed. The proposal's elimination of the existing window configuration on the front façade completely removes the character defining projecting enclosed porch, which is an important character-defining feature for a structure of this period. The Staff recommends that the original window openings be maintained.

The existing historic structure is also characterized by three staggered gable ends that can be found on similar Wood Frame Vernacular structures that date from this period. The proposed front porch addition will remove the existing gable roof above the enclosed front porch and extend the gable roof of the main structure to cover the proposed front porch, significantly altering the massing and design of the structure. The new façade design will not distinguish the old from the new and could create a false sense of historical development. The proposed front porch design is also atypical for the City's Wood Frame Vernacular structures, which typically did not have broad and deep open front porches under the main roofline of the structure. Staff recommends that if a new open front porch is desired, that it should be located under the south gable, and set back from the front façade, or be redesigned to not obscure the existing historic front façade.

Staff has discussed the concerns noted above with the project architect. Because the concerns were not addressed, Staff has added several conditions of approval to increase the overall visual compatibility of the exterior alterations and addition should the Board approve the request, to ensure consistency with the City's historic preservation regulations and the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines. Staff also proposed an alternate design, which incorporates the addition that the Applicant is requesting, but retained the historic window openings and incorporated a covered porch to the south side of the front façade. An elevation and partial plan drawing of this design can be found as **Attachment F**.

Public Comment

At the time of publication of the agenda, Staff has received no written public comment.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN CONSISTENCY:

The project, as proposed, is generally consistent with the following Comprehensive Plan goals and objectives concerning future land use and housing:

Goal 1.4 Encourage preservation and rehabilitation of historic and natural resources and where appropriate restrict development that would damage or destroy these resources. (Objective 1.4.2)

Objective 3.2.5: To encourage the identification of historically significant housing, and to promote its preservation and rehabilitation as referenced by the Surveys of Historic Properties conducted for the City of Lake Worth.

CONSEQUENT ACTION:

Approve the application; approve the application with conditions; continue the hearing to a date certain to request additional information; or deny the application.

If the Board chooses to approve the application, Staff suggests the following conditions:

- 1) All proposed exterior entry doors shall be compatible with the Wood Frame Vernacular architectural style, and the final design shall be subject to Staff review at permitting. The windows and doors shall be wood, wood-clad, aluminum, or fiberglass.
- 2) The windows shall be recessed a minimum of two inches (2") in the wall, and shall not be installed flush with the exterior wall.
- 3) The windows and doors shall utilize clear glass or glass with a clear Low-E coating. Tinted or highly reflective glass shall not be used.
- 4) The proposed siding shall have the same reveal, design, and proportions as the asbestos siding on the existing structure, and all window trim and sills shall replicate the trim and sills on the historic structure.
- 5) The proposed front porch detailing (rafter tails, fascia, beams, posts, and railings) shall be created out of wood, and shall be compatible with the Wood Frame Vernacular architectural style. The Applicant shall submit a detailed measured drawing of the front porch detailing at permitting.
- 6) Staff *recommends* that windows and doors be replaced in their original openings, and the openings are not made smaller by building in the framing or made larger by expanding the opening. In addition, the divided light patterns shall be revised to maintain consistently proportioned light sizes utilizing exterior raised applied triangular muntins. The proposal may be continued at the Board's discretion to facilitate a review of the design change, or could be reviewed by Staff at permitting.
- 7) Staff *recommends* the new front porch be redesigned to not obscure the existing historic front façade by lowering the roof height and relocating the porch to the south gable. The proposal may be continued at the Board's discretion to facilitate a review of the design change, or could be reviewed by Staff at permitting.

POTENTIAL MOTIONS:

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 19-00100264: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for exterior alterations and the construction of a +/- 233 sq. ft. front porch addition to the single-family residence at **217 South J Street**, with the conditions as recommended by Staff, based upon the competent substantial evidence, and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Land Development Regulations, Section 23.5-4.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 19-00100264: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for exterior alterations and the construction of a +/- 233 sq. ft. front porch addition to the single-family residence at **217 South J Street**, because the Applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is in compliance with the City of Lake Worth Land Development Regulations Section 23.5-4, the Secretary of the Interiors Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties, and the City's Comprehensive Plan.

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Location Map – 217 South J Street
- B. Decision Criteria – Exterior Alterations and Additions
- C. Property File Documentation
- D. Current Photos
- E. Proposed Architectural Plans
- F. Staff's Recommended Design

ATTACHMENT A

