



MEMORANDUM DATE: November 10, 2020

AGENDA DATE: November 18, 2020

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **302 North Lakeside Drive**

FROM: Jordan Hodges, Senior Preservation Coordinator
Abraham Fogel, Preservation Planner
Department for Community Sustainability

TITLE: **HRPB Project Number 20-00100205:** A Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a ± 3,096 square foot single-family structure located at **302 North Lakeside Drive**, pursuant to but not limited to Sections 23.2-7, 23.3-7, and Section 23.5-4 of the Land Development Regulations. The subject property is located in the Single-Family Residential (SF-R) Zoning District and is located within the Old Lucerne Local Historic District.

OWNER: 302 LAKESIDE LLC
Gustavo Moro
1035 S. State Road 7 Ste. 315
Wellington, FL 33414

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The property owner of 302 North Lakeside Drive, Mr. Gustavo Moro, is requesting approval for the construction of a new single-family residence. The property is located within the Old Lucerne Local Historic District at the northeast corner of the intersection of North Lakeside Drive and 3rd Avenue North, and has public frontage to the west on North Lakeside Drive and on the Lake Worth Beach Municipal Golf Course to the east. The property has 70' of linear frontage along North Lakeside Drive, which includes a vacant 50' x 135' platted lot of record and the north 20' of the abandoned 3rd Avenue North between North Lakeside Drive and the municipal golf course. The earliest information available in the property file indicates that this property has been a vacant lot since the property appraiser's inspection in 1956. In addition, Sanborn Maps from 1928 (Book 1, Page 15) also show the property as vacant. The HRPB has reviewed two (2) previous proposals for new construction for the vacant lot. The new single-family residences were approved by the Board in 2012 and 2015, respectively, but were never constructed. The property is located in the Single-Family Residential (SF-R) Zoning District and retains a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Single Family Residential (SFR).

If approved, the subject application would allow construction of a new +/- 3,096 square foot residence. The proposed building is designed in a contemporary architectural style. The application will require the following approval:

1. **Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)** for the new construction of a \pm 3,096 square foot single-family structure at 302 North Lakeside Drive.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval with conditions as provided on page 10.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

Owner	302 LAKESIDE LLC (Gustavo Moro)
General Location	Northeast intersection of North Lakeside Drive and 3rd Avenue North
PCN	38-43-44-21-15-430-0010
Zoning	Single-Family Residential (SF-R)
Existing Land Use	Vacant
Future Land Use Designation	Single Family Residential (SFR)



LAND DEVELOPMENT REQUIREMENTS

Land Development Code Requirements		
Code References	23.3-7 (SF-R); 23.4-10 (Off-street parking); FEMA	
	Required	Proposed
Lot Area	5,000 square feet	9,450 square feet
Lot Width	50'-0"	70'-0"
Building Height	30'-0" (2 stories)	14'-0"
Setback - Front	20'-0"	20'-0"
Setback - Side	7'-0" (10% of lot width)	7'-6" (north) 20'-0" (south)
Setback - Rear	13'-6" (10% of lot depth)	20'-0"
Setback – Rear (Accessory Structure)	5'-0"	5'-0"
Impermeable Surface Total ⁽¹⁾	55.0% total	41.8%
Front Yard Impermeable Surface Total	250 square foot maximum (75 % of the front yard area)	150 square feet (50% credit for pavers over sand) ⁽³⁾
Maximum Building Coverage ⁽¹⁾	30.0% maximum 35% with Sustainable Bonus ⁽²⁾	32.8% ⁽²⁾
Density/Number of Units	1 dwelling unit	1 dwelling unit (single-family residence)
Floor Area Ratio ⁽¹⁾	0.45 maximum	0.40
Living Area	800 square feet	3,096 square feet
Parking	2 spaces	2 spaces
Parking Dimensions	9'x18' perpendicular or angled	9'x18' perpendicular
Base Flood Elevation* <small>*Determined by the City's Floodplain Administrator based on FEMA maps and requirements</small>	Required BFE with 12" of freeboard: 10'-0"	Proposed:10'-0"

- (1) Large lot (Lots over 7,500 square feet).
- (2) Medium and large lots, may qualify for an additional five (5) percent impermeable surface for all structures with the construction of a single family, single story house not to exceed 15'-0" in height and must include the incorporation of additional sustainable features or improvements including but not limited to those listed under section 23.2-33, City of Lake Worth Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program.
- (3) Semi-pervious surface: A surface covered by materials with a percolation rate of at least fifty (50) percent relative to the ground percolation rate. Semi-pervious surface may include but are not limited to permeable paving material and other semi-pervious materials such as gravel, small stone, and other substantially similar materials. For semi-pervious surfaces, two (2) square feet of semi-pervious surface shall be equivalent to one (1) square foot of impervious surface for the purpose of calculating development regulations. The semi-pervious surface credit shall not reduce the required open space and landscape area requirements.

The proposed new construction project is consistent with all site data requirements in the City's Zoning Code. The maximum building lot coverage is allowed to exceed 30%, per LDR Sec. 23.3-7(c)(6), as the project is a single-story house that does not exceed 15'-0" in height and incorporates sustainable features and improvements. The Applicant has provided a justification statement that outlines the sustainable features of the project, included as **Attachment D**. It is Staff's analysis that the project qualifies for an additional 2.8% building lot coverage above the 30% allowed by the base zoning and will be able to provide the additional \$1,320 in sustainable features as outlined in LDR Section 23.2-33(d)(1):

- (d) Higher quality or additional open space beyond the requirements of the code.
- (e) Higher quality or additional landscaping beyond the requirements of the code.

According to the Applicant, the landscaping is beyond the requirements of the code through the utilization of a large number of plant materials (mostly native to the state of Florida), the incorporation of large specimen-quality trees, the construction of a vertical garden on the fences fronting North Lakeside Drive, and the implementation of two (2) large bamboo groves along the north and south property lines. The landscaping will be evaluated at permitting to ensure that the proposal meets and exceeds the city's landscape requirements in accordance with the Sustainable Bonus Incentive. Additional open space is provided beyond the requirements of the code as the project proposes an impermeable surface total of 41.8%, whereas 55% is allowed for a large lot in the SF-R Zoning District. Additionally, the building may meet the qualifying standards for a Florida Green Building Coalition (FGBC) certification to meet the requirement. The total value of qualifying improvement shall be reviewed by staff prior to the issuance of a building permit.

SITE ANALYSIS

Surrounding Properties

The site is surrounded by single-family structures with similar Zoning and FLU designations, and thus, are found to be compatible with the proposed residential use on the subject site. The following summarizes the nature of the surrounding properties adjacent to the subject site:

NORTH: Immediately north of the subject site is a single-family structure. This area contains a FLU designation of SF-R and a Zoning designation of SFR.

SOUTH: Immediately south of the subject site is a single-family structure. This area contains a FLU designation of SF-R and a Zoning designation of SFR.



EAST: East of the subject site is the Lake Worth Beach Municipal Golf Course. This area contains a FLU designation of PROS (Public Recreation and Open Space) and a Zoning designation of PROS (Public Recreation and Open Space).

WEST: West of the subject site across North Lakeside Drive is a single-family structure. This area contains a FLU designation of SF-R and a Zoning designation of SFR.

The applicant is requesting approval of a new +/- 3,096 square foot single-family residence. The design of the proposed single-family residence is contemporary, utilizing four (4) rectangular volumes at staggered heights, large outswing glass doors and slender vertical windows, a smooth stucco exterior finish, and accents in natural coral stone. Site features for the property include an above-ground pool, raised rear deck, wood fences with vertical garden features, paver walkways and driveways, and a hidden carport beneath one of the structure's rectangular volumes. The site plan, elevations, and renderings are included as **Attachment C**.

Consistency with the Comprehensive Plan

The subject is located in the Single Family Residential Future Land Use (FLU) designation. Per Policy 1.1.1.2 in the City's Comprehensive, the FLU designation allows for a maximum density of 7 dwelling units per acre. The purpose for the Single-Family Residential designation is to permit the development of single-family structures designed for occupancy by one family or household. As the proposed structure is a single-family residence and has a proposed density of less than 7 units per acre, it is consistent with the intent of the Single-Family Residential designation.

The proposed single-family structure is consistent with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan:

GOAL 3.1: To achieve a supply of housing that offers a variety of residential unit types and prices for current and anticipated homeowners and renters in all household income levels by the creation and/or preservation of a full range of quality housing units.

Objective 3.2.4: To encourage architectural design that complements the City's appearance and considers the objectives of all facilities and services provided by the City.

The proposed development will provide additional housing and utilizes a contemporary architectural design that complements the City's appearance.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION ANALYSIS

All new construction within a designated historic district shall be visually compatible. New buildings should take their design cues from the surrounding existing structures, using traditional or contemporary design standards and elements that relate to existing structures that surround them and within the

historic district as a whole. Building design styles, whether contemporary or traditional, should be visually compatible with the existing structures in the district.

Staff Analysis: The building utilizes concrete block construction with a smooth stucco finish, flat roofs, large outswing glass doors and slender vertical windows, and natural coral stone accents. The structure is broken into four rectangular massing components at staggered heights. The unique design accommodates a carport beneath one of the rectangular volumes and gives the structure a single-story appearance.

As proposed, the design is contemporary in style and massing and utilizes natural materials, layered setbacks, and integrated landscaping. New construction in the City's historic districts is not limited to any particular architectural style, but staff always recommends that the design professional design solely within one architectural style. It is the analysis of Staff that the new construction project, as proposed, is generally compatible with the regulations set forth in the historic preservation ordinance, and that the design of the structure displays architectural features and materials that are consistent with contemporary architecture. Adding contemporary structures into historic districts creates an architectural record for present styles, which can add to the unique character and to the chronology of building styles constructed throughout the city's history.

Recent increases in FEMA base flood elevation requirements have impacted residential neighborhoods and residential historic districts along Florida's southeast low-lying coastal cities. The required base flood elevation (BFE) for this property is 10 feet, including 12" of freeboard required by the City as determined by the City's floodplain administrator based on FEMA maps and requirements. New construction must comply with current flood elevation requirements, which results in structures that are built substantially higher than their historic counterparts. The proposed single-family residence responds to this challenge with a volumetric design that attempts to conceal the overall height of the structure and places covered parking where it is least visible from the street. While soil is mounded on the parcel to minimize the visual impacts of the FEMA elevation requirements, the site will be reviewed for drainage during the building permit process to ensure water is retained on the property. It is Staff's analysis that the proposal responds adequately to the lot size, shape, and configuration, development pattern in the district.

Staff does have remaining concerns regarding several long, unbroken facades that lack windows and doors on the north and south elevation. The following section provides a detailed review of the project's compliance with visual compatibility standards provided in LDR Section 23.5-4(k)(3). Staff has included a condition of approval to help create a consistent rhythm of solids to voids.

Section 23.5-4(k)(3) – Review/Decision

- A. In approving or denying applications for certificates of appropriateness for new construction and additions (as applicable), the city shall also, at a minimum, consider the following additional guidelines which help to define visual compatibility in the applicable property's historic district:
- (1) The height of proposed buildings shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the height of existing buildings located within the historic district.

Staff Analysis: The required base flood elevation (BFE) for this property is 10 feet. The proposed single-family residence responds to this challenge with a volumetric design that attempts to conceal the overall height of the structure. The resulting design is consistent with the height of other single-story buildings surrounding the property, and is in harmony with the height of other historic properties in the district.

- (2) The relationship of the width of the building to the height of the front elevation shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the width and height of the front elevation of existing buildings located within the district.

Staff Analysis: The width and height of the front elevation of the proposed building are in scale with the surrounding properties.

- (3) The openings of any building within a historic district should be visually compatible and in harmony with the openings in buildings of a similar architectural style located within the historic district. The relationship of the width of the windows and doors to the height of the windows and doors in a building shall be visually compatible with buildings within the district.

Staff Analysis: The proposed windows and doors create a pattern that largely avoids large expanses of blank façade. There are large outswing glass doors and slender vertical windows on the proposed structure that are of different proportions than neighboring contributing resources.

- (4) The relationship of solids to voids in the front facade of a building or structure shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the front facades of historic buildings or structures located within the historic district. A long, unbroken facade in a setting of existing narrow structures can be divided into smaller bays which will complement the visual setting and the streetscape.

Staff Analysis: The north and south elevation have volumes with long, unbroken facades. To satisfy this requirement, Staff has included a condition of approval that additional windows or exterior finishes be installed to avoid a long expanse of blank façade.

- (5) The relationship of a building to open space between it and adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the relationship between buildings elsewhere within the district.

Staff Analysis: The proposed building adheres to setback requirements within the current zoning code.

- (6) The relationship of entrance and porch projections to sidewalks of a building shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the prevalent architectural styles of entrances and porch projections on buildings and structures within the district.

Staff Analysis: The proposed design utilizes wood fences with vertical garden features, which generally obscure human entrances to the structure. While atypical for most properties within the Old Lucerne Historic District, obscure entryways are common in more contemporary forms of residential architecture.

- (7) The relationship of the materials, texture and color of the façade of a building shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the predominant materials used in the buildings and structures of a similar style located within the historic district.

Staff Analysis: The building will be constructed of concrete block and finished with smooth stucco and natural coral stone accents, which are common siding and accent materials within the city's historic districts.

- (8) The roof shape of a building or structure shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the roof shape of buildings or structures of a similar architectural style located within the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District.

Staff Analysis: The proposed structure utilizes a series of flat roofs. Due to FEMA requirements, the structure is required to be constructed with a required base flood elevation (BFE) of 10 feet. The flat roof design helps conceal the overall height of the structure and ensures visual compatibility with other single-story buildings surrounding the property.

- (9) Appurtenances of a building, such as walls, wrought iron, fences, evergreen, landscape masses and building facades, shall, if necessary, form cohesive walls of enclosures along a street to insure visual compatibility of the building to the buildings and places to which it is visually related.

Staff Analysis: The new wood fences with vertical garden features create visual compatibility with the new structure and overall streetscape.

- (10) The size and mass of a building in relation to open spaces, the windows, door openings, porches and balconies shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the buildings and places to which it is visually related.

Staff Analysis: The structure is broken into four (4) massing components at staggered heights. The unique design allows a carport to be accommodate beneath one of the rectangular volumes and gives the structure a one-story appearance.

- (11) A building shall be visually compatible and in harmony with the buildings and places to which it is visually related in its directional character: vertical, horizontal or non-directional.

Staff Analysis: The Applicant has provided a streetscape showing the building in relation to those on either side of it. The building's height and massing are visually compatible with other residential structures on the North Lakeside Drive.

(12) The architectural style of a building shall be visually compatible with other buildings to which it is related in the historic district, but does not necessarily have to be in the same style of buildings in the district. New construction or additions to a building are encouraged to be appropriate to the style of the period in which it is created and not attempt to create a false sense of history.

Staff Analysis: The design of the structure displays architectural features and materials that are consistent with contemporary architecture. Adding contemporary structures into historic districts creates an architectural record for present styles, which can add to the unique character and to the chronology of building styles constructed throughout time.

(13) In considering applications for certificates of appropriateness to install mechanical systems which affect the exterior of a building or structure visible from a public right-of-way, the following criteria shall be considered:

(a) Retain and repair, where possible, historic mechanical systems in their original location, where possible.

Staff Analysis: This requirement is not applicable to the new construction project on a vacant property.

(b) New mechanical systems shall be placed on secondary facades only and shall not be placed on, nor be visible from, primary facades.

Staff Analysis: The mechanical systems associated with this property are located in the backyard behind a fence, not visible from North Lakeside Drive.

(c) New mechanical systems shall not damage, destroy or compromise the physical integrity of the structure and shall be installed so as to cause the least damage, invasion or visual obstruction to the structure's building materials, or to its significant historic, cultural or architectural features.

Staff Analysis: The new mechanical systems are ground-mounted and will not be visible from the street.

(14) The site should take into account the compatibility of landscaping, parking facilities, utility and service areas, walkways and appurtenances. These should be designated with the overall environment in mind and should be in keeping visually with related buildings and structures.

Staff Analysis: The proposed new construction project is consistent with all site data requirements in the City's Zoning Code. The maximum building lot coverage is allowed to exceed 30% as the project is a single-story house that does not exceed 15'-0" in height and incorporates sustainable features and improvements. Parking is provided in a carport beneath one (1) of the structure's rectangular volumes. A preliminary landscape plan is included in **Attachment C**. The landscaping for the property will need to be evaluated to ensure it meets the minimum requirements of LDR Section 23.6-1, Landscape Regulations. Final review and approval will take place during the building permit review process.

B. In considering certificates of appropriateness for new buildings or structures, which will have more than one primary facade, such as those on corner lots facing more than one street, the HRPB shall apply the visual compatibility standards to each primary facade.

Staff Analysis: This requirement is not applicable to the subject property with one primary façade on North Lakeside Drive.

PUBLIC COMMENT

At the time of publication of the agenda, Staff has received no public comment.

CONCLUSION

The proposed application is consistent with the City's Land Development Regulations as conditioned and the structure's design and site plan are generally consistent with the contemporary architectural style and the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Therefore, staff recommends approval with conditions, listed below, to allow construction of a new ± 3,096 square foot single-family structure.

Conditions of Approval:

- 1) The windows and doors shall be wood, wood-clad, aluminum, or fiberglass, subject to Staff review at permitting. All proposed exterior entry doors shall be compatible with the contemporary architectural style, and shall be subject to Staff review at permitting.
- 2) The windows shall be recessed a minimum of three inches (3") as measured from the finished face of the exterior wall to the glass. Windows shall not be installed flush with the exterior wall.
- 3) All glazing shall be clear, non-reflective and without tint. Low-E (low emissivity) is allowed but the glass must have a minimum 70% visible light transmittance (VLT) measured from the center of glazing. Glass tints or any other glass treatments shall not be combined with the Low-E coating to further diminish the VLT of the glass.
- 4) Staff *recommends* that additional windows or exterior finishes such as "wood-look" screening or natural stone be installed on the north and south elevations to avoid long expanses of blank façade.

POTENTIAL MOTION:

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 20-00100205 with staff recommended conditions for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the new construction of a ± 3,096 square foot single-family structure at **302 North Lakeside Drive**, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report

and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 20-00100205 for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the new construction of a ± 3,096 square foot single-family structure at **302 North Lakeside Drive**, because the Applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that the application is consistent with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulation and Historic Preservation requirements.

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Property File Documentation
- B. Current Photos
- C. Proposed Architectural Plans
- D. Applicant Justification Statement