

# DEPARTMENT FOR COMMUNITY SUSTAINABILITY Planning Zoning Historic Preservation Division

1900 2<sup>ND</sup> Avenue North Lake Worth Beach, FL 33461 561-586-1687

## PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD REPORT

<u>PZB Project Number 24-01400017</u>: A Major Site Plan, Conditional Use Permit, and Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program request for the construction of eight townhouses (townhouse complex) on platted lots of record at 1719-1737 North Federal Highway within the Mixed Use – Federal Highway (MU-FH) zoning district.

Meeting Date: October 2, 2024

Property Owner: Michael Gizewski, MAMPG, LLC

**Applicant:** Contin Architecture and Design

Address: 1719-1737 North Federal Highway

## PCNs:

38-43-44-15-39-001-0000 | 38-43-44-15-39-000-0010 38-43-44-15-39-000-0020 | 38-43-44-15-39-000-0030 38-43-44-15-39-000-0040 | 38-43-44-15-39-000-0050 38-43-44-15-39-000-0060 | 38-43-44-15-39-000-0070 38-43-44-15-39-000-0080

**Size:** 0.44 acre in total for the 8-townhouse platted lots of record and 1 platted lot of record for the common rear parking area.

**General Location:** Northeast corner of 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue North and North Federal Highway

North and North Federal Ingliway

Existing Land Use: Vacant

**Current Future Land Use Designation**: Mixed Use

East (MU-E)

**Zoning District:** Mixed Use – Federal Highway

(MU-FH)

# **Location Map**



#### **RECOMMENDATION**

The documentation and materials provided with the application request were reviewed for compliance with the applicable guidelines and standards found in the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations (LDRs), and for consistency with the Comprehensive Plan and Strategic Plan. The proposed Major Site Plan, Conditional Use Permit, and SBIP requests are consistent with the Comprehensive Plan, Strategic Plan, and LDRs, as conditioned, and, therefore, a **recommendation of approval with conditions** is provided to the Planning and Zoning Board. The conditions are located on pages 7-9 of this report.

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The applicant, Contin Architecture and Design, seeks approval for the construction of an eight-unit townhouse complex including additional site improvements.

- Major Site Plan to construct a residential development with more than 7,500 square feet.
- Conditional Use to establish a townhouse complex greater than 7,500 square feet.
- Sustainable Bonus Program Incentive Program for additional intensity (FAR) and height.

The original townhouse project on this site was approved by the PZB in 2009 for eight (8) townhouse units, and was subsequently platted. Since that time, the development standards for townhouses have been amended and the previous development approval has expired. The project was reintroduced in 2021 (Solimar) as a Major Site Plan and Conditional Use Permit request, and was approved by the PZB to amend the 2009 townhouse project approval, while remaining consistent with the previously approved platted lots of record for eight (8) townhouses. The 2021 applications were approved at the June 15, 2022, Planning and Zoning meeting. The development order for the subject approval was issued on September 16, 2022. The property, under new ownership, requested and was granted an administrative time extension in 2023.

The current proposal is requesting a major site plan, conditional use, and sustainable bonus to allow the proposed project to be constructed. The proposed major site plan would amend the previously approved townhouse complex, while remaining consistent with the approved plat with each townhouse unit located on a platted lot of record. The site is platted into 8 townhouse lots of record with a rear common area lot of record. The project as proposed would not be consistent with the supplementary standards for townhouses under the current code as set forth in Article 4 Sec 23.3-13 Development Standards. However, as the project is modifying a previous approval where the existing townhouse lots were platted prior to the current requirements for townhouses, compliance with these supplementary standards is not required.

The proposed project is implementing the sustainable bonus incentive to allow for one (1) additional story of height to the building (3 stories total) and additional FAR. The additional story of height allows for the first floor of the building to serve as garages and living area, the 2<sup>nd</sup> story serves as bedrooms, and the third floor serves as amenity rooms that provide access to the front and back roof terraces.

## **COMMUNITY OUTREACH**

Staff has not received any letters of opposition for this application. Per LDR Section 23.2-20, Public Neighborhood Meeting, a public neighborhood meeting shall be required for all Planned Developments, Developments of Significant Impact, and Lake Worth Beach Community Redevelopment Agency sponsored new construction projects along the City's major thoroughfares as well as those utilizing the City's Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program, Transfer of Development Rights Program and/or Economic Investment Incentives.

On February 12, 2024, the applicant held a virtual meeting to discuss the project. Notices were mailed to all property owners within 400 ft of the project on January 26, 2024, and signs were placed on the property on January 26, 2024. There were no attendees from the public at the meeting. The applicant created a project webpage: https://www.nowbuilders.net/single-project.

The applicant indicated that although no members of the public attended the virtual meeting, a response was provided through their website in support of the project.

#### **BACKGROUND**

Below is a summary of the property based on Palm Beach Property Appraiser's records and City records:

Construction: Palm Beach County Property Appraiser's records indicate that the subject site is vacant.

Use: The property's use is vacant.

**Code Compliance:** There are no active code cases on the subject site.

## **ANALYSIS**

## Consistency with the Comprehensive Plan and Strategic Plan

The subject site has a Future Land Use (FLU) designation of Mixed Use – East (MU-E). The MU-E FLU is intended to provide for a mixture of residential, office, service and commercial retail uses within specific areas east of I-95, near or adjacent to the central commercial core and major thoroughfares of the City. The maximum density of permitted residential development is 30 dwelling units per acre. The preferred mix of uses area-wide is 75% residential and 25% non-residential. While mixed-use projects are allowed on a single site, it is not a requirement that each site within the category incorporate multiple uses. Zoning regulations implementing the Mixed-Use East category shall permit the establishment and expansion of residential (including single family, two-family and multi-family), office, service and commercial retail uses either as uses permitted by right or through conditional use permit provisions. All buildings are required to provide transitional buffering and design features to mitigate impact of the MU-E sites adjacent to residential zoning districts. The proposed project is seeking to develop an eight-unit townhouse complex.

The City's Strategic Plan focuses on fostering safer neighborhoods, encouraging community pride, building a vibrant and diverse economy, planning for the future, and enhancing the natural, historic, and cultural environment of the City. Pillars II.A & II.D and Pillar IV.E of the Strategic Plan state that the City shall diversify housing options while preserving the character of existing neighborhoods and ensure that the development anticipates and embraces the future. The proposed townhouse complex and site improvements will add to the housing stock within the city, which will contribute towards the City's tax base and sustain or increase jobs as recommended under Pillar II.A & II.D and Pillar IV.E.

Based on the analysis above, the proposed Major Site Plan, Conditional Use, and Sustainable Bonus requests are consistent with the goals, objectives, and polices of the City of Lake Worth Beach's Comprehensive Plan and Strategic Plan.

## **Consistency with the Land Development Regulations**

The Mixed Use-Federal Highway (MU-FH) zoning district is intended to provide for limited retail, office, hotel/motel and low-density multiple-family residential development. Provision is also made for the establishment of low-density multiple-family residential uses and single-family and two-family residential uses in accordance with the provisions of the "low-density multiple-family residential district, 20 du/net acre." The "mixed use - Federal Highway" district implements in part the "mixed use" land use category of the Lake Worth Comprehensive Plan.

**Analysis:** Townhouses are permitted as conditional uses in the MU-FH district, subject to the regulations and standards as set forth in LDR Section 23.4-13.

The proposed townhouse complex is consistent with the intent of the MU-FH zoning district as conditioned. The analysis for both the major site plan and the conditional use permit is provided in this section below and as consistent with the review criteria located in Attachments A & B.

The table below shows the proposed site features and its compliance with the LDRs, as applicable:

Mixed Use – Federal Highway (MU-FH)/ West side of Federal Highway (LDR Section 23.3-16)				
Development Standard		Base Zoning District & Townhouses Standards (Sec. 23.4-13.(c)11.)	Proposed	
Min. Lot Size in squa	are feet (sf)	6,500	19,125 SF	
Min. Lot Width		50'	185′	
	Front (East)	10 feet, with an open porch permitted in a minimum of 5 feet of setback	10′	
Setbacks	Rear (West)	20'	36' – 8"	
	Street Side (North)	10'	10'	
	Side (South)	10'	10′	
Max. Impermeable	Surface Coverage	55%	54.6%	
Max. Structure Coverage		45%	44.9%	
Parking Spaces		Single-family attached three (3) or more units - 1.25 spaces per unit x 8 units = 10 spaces	14 garage spaces	
Max. Building Height		30'	*35′	
Development Standard		Base Zoning District & Townhouses Standards (Sec. 23.4-13.(c)11.)	Proposed	
Density		20 units per acre x 0.439 acres = 8 units	8 units	
Floor Area Ratio (FAR) Limitations		0.6	*1.00	

<sup>\*</sup>Additional height and FAR per Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program

**Section 12-7, Dumpster Requirements:** The location of all dumpsters shall be approved by the public services director or his designee and/or the building official or his designee. All dumpsters shall meet the requirements set forth in this section and all other ordinances, rules, regulations and policies adopted by the city.

**Analysis:** The location of the proposed dumpster and enclosure is within the side setback. Per LDR Section 12-7(d), dumpsters and enclosures may be exempt from all setback requirements, provided they shall not be placed within the visibility triangle or in other locations that could interfere with on-site/off-site traffic circulation. The proposed dumpster location was reviewed and approved by Public Works. The proposed dumpster complies with Code Section 12-7, Dumpster requirements.

**Section 23.4-3, Exterior Lighting:** All outdoor lighting shall be installed in conformance with the provisions of this chapter, applicable electrical and energy codes, and applicable sections of the building code.

**Analysis:** A photometric plan was provided depicting compliance with the exterior lighting requirements in Section 23.4-3, including that light does not trespass upon neighboring residential properties in excess of 12.57 lumens. A

recommended condition of approval has been provided requiring the proposed lighting to comply with Dark Sky lighting recommendations. The proposed fixtures shall be required to have a warm tone setting of 3000 K or less. The proposed fixtures may be substituted with similar fully shielded light fixtures at building permit to achieve a warm LED light tone of 3000K or less if the proposed fixture cannot be set to provide the required light tone.

**Section 23.4-10. - Off-street parking:** This section provides general provisions for off-street parking. The standards "apply to all parking spaces required for new buildings, new uses, additions, enlargements, or changes."

Analysis: Per Sec. 23.4-10(f)(1)(A), Off-street parking, single-family attached residential uses with three or more units require 1.25 parking spaces per unit. Therefore, the required parking for the proposed eight townhouse units is 10 parking spaces. The proposed site plan depicts 14 total parking spaces being proposed, all of which are located within garages.

**Signage:** Signage is required to comply with the size and design requirements in the Land Development Regulations. Any proposed signage will be reviewed at building permit for consistency with these requirements.

**Section 23.6-1. - Landscape regulations:** The objective of this section is to provide minimum standards for the installation and maintenance of landscaping within the city. Per Section 23.6-1(c)(2), "on the site of a building or open-lot use providing an off-street parking, storage or other vehicular use area, where such an area will not be screened visually by an intervening building or structure from an abutting right-of-way or dedicated alley, shall require landscaping".

**Analysis:** The development proposes adequate perimeter landscaping on all sides. The proposed landscape plan provides acceptable screening from the adjacent residential zoning districts on the west and south sides of the subject site. The landscape plan will provide adequate screening on the north and east side adjacent to 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue North and North Federal Highway, respectively. Perimeter landscaping will include shade trees, palm trees, and hedges/shrubs. Interior landscaping and vegetation will also be provided. The proposed landscape plan is consistent with City landscape code requirements.

## Section 23.2-31 - Site Design Qualitative Standards (Attachment A)

Site Design Qualitative Standards are intended to "promote safety and minimize negative impacts of development on its neighbors by establishing qualitative requirements for the arrangements of buildings, structures, parking areas, landscaping and other site improvements. The qualitative standards are designed to ensure that site improvements are arranged in ways which cannot be otherwise accomplished with quantitative standards." These qualitative standards are applicable to site plan applications as well as all conditional uses. The Major Thoroughfare Design Guidelines are an adopted component of these Site Design Qualitative Standards as per Section 23.2-31(j), which are applicable to properties adjacent to the City's major thoroughfares, inclusive of the subject site. Compliance determinations with the applicable standards in Section 23.2-31 are provided in Attachment A. The following analysis of the site, building, vehicular use area and appearance support the compliance findings for the applicable standards listed in Attachment A and in the Major Thoroughfare Design Guidelines.

Site Design Qualitative Standards Analysis (including vehicular use areas) & Major Thoroughfare Design Guidelines: The proposed project will develop the parking lot and vehicular use areas to the rear of the townhome units in a manner that will be adequately screened from the public view with buildings, shade trees and shrubs within the landscape areas. The proposed curb cut and parking lot layout does not create an unsafe situation and will provide and support internal vehicle circulation consistent with the LDRs. The proposed building architecture is in a contemporary style that is harmonious as a whole and will improve the aesthetics of the site. The building architecture, project siting, and parking are consistent with both the site design qualitative standards and the Major Thoroughfare Design Guidelines.

The existing uses in the surrounding area are as follows:

Direction	Future Land Use	Zoning District	Existing Use	
North (across 18 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North)	Mixed Use – East (MU-E)	Mixed Use – Federal Highway (MU-FH)	Multi-family residential	
South	Mixed Use – East (MU-E)	Mixed Use – Federal Highway (MU-FH)	Commercial Office	
East (across North Federal Highway)	Mixed Use – East (MU-E)	Mixed Use – Federal Highway (MU-FH)	Multi-family residential & commercial	
West	Mixed Use – East (MU-E)	Mixed Use – Federal Highway (MU-FH)/Single Family Residential (SFR)	Single-family residential	

The proposed uses and site improvements will not negatively affect the existing surrounding properties and uses. The proposed changes are harmonious and compatible with the existing residential and mixed-use area.

## **Community Appearance Criteria:**

The proposed project is suitable and compatible with the surrounding zoning districts and land uses. The townhouse complex will contribute to the surrounding character of the area and is an anticipated form of development in the Federal Highway corridor. The current site is vacant. The proposed townhouses and concurrent site improvements will provide new construction in an architecturally appropriate style with landscape screening around the perimeter of the property, and ensuring that on-site and off-site site circulation is adequate. The proposed architecture of the building is appropriate and in harmony with the surrounding residential and mixed-use area.

#### **Conditional Use Findings (Attachment B)**

Based on the data and analysis provided by the applicant, the proposed conditional use is not anticipated to impact the surrounding area greater than uses permitted by right and are generally compatible with the surrounding uses. The townhouse complex will be served by municipal services, including water, sewer, refuse, fire and police. The proposed concurrent site improvements would provide improved screening and site circulation over the site development. A traffic study was submitted. However, it should be noted that the proposed project is located on existing platted lots of records and residential development is exempt from PBC traffic concurrency.

## Sec. 23.2-39.k). - Affordable/workforce housing program.

The City's Affordable/Workforce Housing Program is intended to implement Objective 3.1.2 of the city comprehensive plan future land use element and provisions therein regarding affordable and workforce housing. The affordable/workforce housing program provides for a density bonus and a reduction in overall housing unit areas for developments that incorporate residential units with restrictive covenants that meet the requirements of the program.

Per LDR Section 23.2-39, Tier Two of the Affordable/Workforce Housing Program applies to all projects utilizing other city incentives and/or bonus programs. As the proposed project is requesting to use a city incentive (Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program) to allow additional height and FAR, the Tier Two requirement applies. However, as the proposed project is proposing townhouses, of which none are deed restricted as affordable/workforce housing, the project must use the in-lieu fee (LDR Section 23.2-39.k). The in-lieu fee is based on fifteen (15%) percent of the gross area of the bonus requested for the project (15% of 7,579 square feet = 1,136.85 square feet) and shall incorporate a one-time payment of fifty dollars (\$50) or 0.0625% of the area median income (\$104,000), whichever is greater, per gross square foot (\$104,000 x 0.000625 = \$65). Therefore, the total required Affordable/Workforce Housing Program in lieu payment to the City is \$73,895.25 (\$65 x 1,136.85). Conditions of approval are proposed to address the in-lieu payment for the Affordable/Workforce Housing Program.

## **Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program**

The City of Lake Worth Beach Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program (SBIP) is intended to implement Objective 1.2.3 of the City's Comprehensive Plan which states the City shall establish incentives to help support the creation of a compact, sustainable, community-oriented development by implementing a Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program. The Program offers the opportunity to attain an option for increased height and/or FAR in exchange for the incorporation of sustainable design features, community-based improvements and overall design excellence as part of a development proposal.

Per Policy 1.2.3.4 of the City's Comprehensive Plan, "incorporation of Sustainable features is required for developments over two stories, which allows for increases in density, height and intensity over base line maximums. Annually, the City Commission shall establish base line sustainable bonus values required to participate in the program." The applicant is asking for a bonus height which is less than the maximum allowances that can be permitted for height through a sustainable bonus incentive in a MU-FH zoning district.

The total square footage of the bonus area above the second floor is +/- 7,579 square feet. Therefore, the value of required improvements for the SBIP bonus areas is \$56,842.50 (7,579 square feet x \$7.50 per sf). Fifty percent (50%) of the incentive award value is \$28,421.25, which the applicant is required to pay to the City. For the remaining 50% of the incentive award value (\$28,421.25), the applicant may propose qualified on-site improvements or provide additional payment to the City.

The Applicant is proposing to provide qualified improvements per LDR Section 23.2-33. These improvements include on-site features and have prioritized Energy Efficiency and Conservation, Water Conservation, Community Health and Safety as well as Bicycle Mobility Systems. The features include water conservation through low flow water fixtures, shower heads, and high-performance toilets; increased energy efficiency through ENERGY STAR appliances; and community health and safety through antimicrobial door handles. The estimated value of these improvements is \$34,385.48.

#### **CONCLUSION AND CONDITIONS**

The Mixed Use-Federal Highway (MU-FH) zoning district is intended to provide for limited retail, office, hotel/motel, and low-density multiple-family residential development. Provision is also made for the establishment of low-density multiple-family residential uses and single-family and two-family residential uses in accordance with the provisions of the "low-density multiple-family residential district, 20 du/net acre." The "mixed use - Federal Highway" district implements in part the "mixed use" land use category of the Lake Worth Comprehensive Plan. Development in the mixed-use land use category should be guided to minimize negative impacts on nearby mixed-use areas. Uses identified as conditional uses are subject to additional review to ensure they will not have a negative impact on nearby residential uses or on the commercial viability of their neighbors. Based on the data and analysis in this report and the supporting materials by the applicant, the use requested is not anticipated to negatively impact adjacent properties. Further, the proposed townhouse complex, site improvements, landscaping, and lighting will be compatible with the neighboring uses. Therefore, a recommendation of approval is provided to the PZB with the following conditions:

## Planning & Zoning - Site

- 1. Fifty percent of the sustainable bonus fee shall be paid to the City within one year of approval, or prior to the issuance of the building permit, whichever comes first.
- 2. The applicant shall provide qualifying sustainable bonus features equal to 50% of the sustainable bonus fee, or shall be required to pay the remaining incentive value in its entirety prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy.
- 3. The applicant shall provide the in-lieu affordable/workforce housing fee within one year of approval, or prior to the issuance of the building permit, whichever comes first.
- 4. Prior to issuance of a building permit, provide a detailed proforma ensuring that the buildings will meet the required performance standards.

- 5. Prior to issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a revised narrative removing references to proposed commercial and mixed uses of the proposed development.
- 6. A PBC Traffic Performance Standards (TPS) approval letter for the 8 townhouse units is required prior to the issuance of a building permit. The proposed development is east of I-95 and is located in a concurrency exception area for new residential projects.
- 7. Signage shall be reviewed through the building permit process for consistency with the requirements of the Land Development Regulations. If ground signage is desired at a later date, a minor site plan amendment shall be required to amend both the site plan and landscape plans.
- 8. All lighting fixtures shall be fully shielded, have a warm LED light tone of 3000K or less, and be Dark Sky compliant.
- The applicant shall submit the final School District Availability Determination (SCAD) from the PBC School District at building permit and shall pay all applicable fees to the PBC School District prior to the issuance of a building permit.

#### **Public Works**

- 1. The issuance of any permits shall comply with all provisions of the Lake Worth Municipal Code and all other applicable standards including but not limited to the Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT), Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD), and City of Lake Worth Public Works Construction Standards and Policy and Procedure Manual.
- 2. No Certificate of Occupancy shall be granted until all conditions of approval have been satisfied under jurisdiction of the Department of Public Works.
- 3. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, contact the Lake Worth Drainage (LWDD) District's Engineering Department and obtain any required permit(s), if necessary, and furnish to the City. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, contact the South Florida Water Management District's (SFWMD) Engineering Department and obtain any required permit(s), if necessary.
- 4. Prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy, reconstruct the roadway (or mill and overlay, overlay) along 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue North from North Federal Highway west to the end of the property line in compliance with the Public Works Department's specifications.
- 5. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, (should the construction of off-site improvements not be feasible due to timing, future City planning, etc.) make a contribution to the City's Construction Fund for the associated costs of those improvements to the associated right of way.
- 6. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the existing stormwater system that is being tied into is to be cleaned thoroughly the entire limit of the property.
- 7. Prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy, ensure the entire surrounding off-site infrastructure inclusive of the roadway, sidewalk, curbing, stormwater system piping and structures, valve boxes, manholes, landscaping, striping, signage, and other improvements are in the same condition as prior to construction. A pre-construction video of the entire perimeter shall be performed and submitted to the City.
- 8. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, submit an Erosion Control plan (SWPPP) and indicate the BMP's and NPDES compliance practices.
- 9. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, broom sweep all areas of the affected right of way and remove of all silt and debris collected as a result of construction activity.
- 10. Prior to performing work in the City Right-of-Way (ROW), apply for and receive issuance of a "Right of Way/Utility Permit" application.

#### **Utilities (Water, Sewer & Stormwater)**

- 1. During the building permit application, show the conflict elevation of the proposed 1" water service line and existing 8" sewer main.
- 2. Show underground utility lines on landscape plan. Confirm minimum spacing between landscape and services per Public Services Detail 23, Typical Tree with Root Barrier.
- 3. Please provide manufacturer's data sheet on geotextile driveway.

- 4. Impermeable and permeable surface totals shown on site plan are different from areas used in stormwater calculations.
- 5. Detail for exfiltration trench depicts two catch basin structures while drainage plan only shows one. Detail should also include proposed elevations and dimensions to match stormwater calculations.
- 6. Stormwater calculations reference DERM criteria. The policy of the City is a property must retain the 3-year, 1-hour storm event on site based on the runoff of the entire site area. This is equivalent to 2.6 inches of precipitation.
- 7. Provide geotechnical information for the determination of the hydraulic conductivity of the soil and groundwater elevation.
- 8. Prior to building permit issuance, capacity fees for water and sewer must be paid in full in accordance with the current City Ordinance.

#### **Electric Utilities**

- 1. Before or at the time of application for a Building Permit, Developer must provide the load calculation, voltage requirements and riser diagram.
- 2. Before the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the utility easement must be recorded.
- 3. Developer to show the location of the meter center on the site plan.
- 4. Developer will be responsible for installing their own lightning for the parking areas.
- 5. Developer will be responsible for the cost of Lake Worth Beach's materials and labor for this project.
- 6. Before the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy (CO) a final electrical inspection must be done.
- 7. The connection point must be at the primary pole located west of the development on the alley. The transformer locations must be accessible to our vehicles, and must have 8-ft minimum clearance in front of them and 3-foot clearance to the side and rear, including landscaping.
- 8. Electric Utility distribution system only has one (1) phase on this location. If the customer/developer needs three phase service to this location, all costs and labor associated to the changes to the distribution system will be the customer/developer financial responsibility.

## **BOARD POTENTIAL MOTION:**

I move to <u>approve with conditions</u> the request for PZB Project Number 24-01400017 Conditional Use Permit, Major Site Plan, and Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program request based on upon the competent and substantial evidence provided in the staff report and in the testimony at the public hearing.

I move to <u>disapprove</u> the request for PZB Project Number 24-01400017 Conditional Use Permit, Major Site Plan, and Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program request. The project does not meet the conditional use criteria for the following reasons [Board member please state reasons.].

**Consequent Action:** The Planning & Zoning Board's decision will be final decision for the Conditional Use Permit, Major Site Plan, and Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program request. The Applicant may appeal the Board's decision to the City Commission.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

- A. Qualitative Development Standards
- B. Conditional Use Findings
- C. Application Package (survey, site plan, architectural plans & supporting documents)

## ATTACHMENT A – Qualitative Development Standards

## Section 23.2-31(c) -Qualitative Development Standards

**Analysis** 

1. Harmonious and efficient organization. All elements of the site plan shall be harmoniously and efficiently organized in relation to topography, the size and type of plot, the character of adjoining property and the type and size of buildings. The site shall be developed so as to not impede the normal and orderly development or improvement of surrounding property for uses permitted in these LDRs.

In compliance

2. **Preservation of natural conditions.** The natural (refer to landscape code, Article 6 of these LDRs) landscape shall be preserved in its natural state, insofar as practical, by minimizing tree and soil removal and by such other site planning approaches as are appropriate. Terrain and vegetation shall not be disturbed in a manner likely to significantly increase either wind or water erosion within or adjacent to a development site. Natural detention areas and other means of natural vegetative filtration of stormwater runoff shall be used to minimize ground and surface water pollution, particularly adjacent to major waterbodies. Fertilizer/pesticide conditions may be attached to development adjacent to waterbodies. Marinas shall be permitted only in water with a mean low tide depth of four feet or more.

In compliance

3. **Screening and buffering.** Fences, walls or vegetative screening shall be provided where needed and practical to protect residents and users from undesirable views, lighting, noise, odors or other adverse off-site effects, and to protect residents and users of off-site development from on-site adverse effects. This section may be interpreted to require screening and buffering in addition to that specifically required by other sections of these LDRs, but not less.

In compliance

4. Enhancement of residential privacy. The site plan shall provide reasonable, visual and acoustical In compliance privacy for all dwelling units located therein and adjacent thereto. Fences, walks, barriers and vegetation shall be arranged for the protection and enhancement of property and to enhance the privacy of the occupants.

5. **Emergency access**. Structures and other site features shall be so arranged as to permit emergency In compliance vehicle access by some practical means to all sides of all buildings.

6. Access to public ways. All buildings, dwelling units and other facilities shall have safe and In compliance convenient access to a public street, walkway or other area dedicated to common use; curb cuts close to railroad +crossings shall be avoided.

- 7. **Pedestrian circulation.** There shall be provided a pedestrian circulation system which is insulated In compliance as completely as reasonably possible from the vehicular circulation system.
- 8. **Design of ingress and egress drives.** The location, size and numbers of ingress and egress drives to the site will be arranged to minimize the negative impacts on public and private ways and on adjacent private property. Merging and turnout lanes traffic dividers shall be provided where they would significantly improve safety for vehicles and pedestrians.

In compliance

9. **Coordination of on-site circulation with off-site circulation.** The arrangement of public or common ways for vehicular and pedestrian circulation shall be coordinated with the pattern of existing or planned streets and pedestrian or bicycle pathways in the area. Minor streets shall not be connected to major streets in such a way as to facilitate improper utilization.

In compliance

10. **Design of on-site public right-of-way (ROW).** On-site public street and rights-of-way shall be designed to for maximum efficiency. They shall occupy no more land than is required to provide access, nor shall they unnecessarily fragment development into small blocks. Large developments containing extensive public rights-of-way shall have said rights-of-way arranged in a hierarchy with local streets providing direct access to parcels and other streets providing no or limited access to parcels.

Not applicable

11. **Off-street parking, loading and vehicular circulation areas.** Off-street parking, loading and vehicular circulation areas shall be located, designed and screened to minimize the impact of noise, glare and odor on adjacent property.

In compliance

12. *Refuse and service areas.* Refuse and service areas shall be located, designed and screened to minimize the impact of noise, glare and odor on adjacent property.

In compliance

13. **Protection of property values**. The elements of the site plan shall be arranged so as to have minimum negative impact on the property values of adjoining property.

In compliance

14. **Transitional development.** Where the property being developed is located on the edge of the zoning district, the site plan shall be designed to provide for a harmonious transition between districts. Building exteriors shall complement other buildings in the vicinity in size, scale, mass, bulk, rhythm of openings and character. Consideration shall be given to a harmonious transition in height and design style so that the change in zoning districts is not accentuated. Additional consideration shall be given to complementary setbacks between the existing and proposed development.

In compliance

15. **Consideration of future development.** In finding whether or not the above standards are met, **In** the review authority shall consider likely future development as well as existing development.

In compliance

## Section 23.2-31(d) - Qualitative Buildings, generally

Analysis

1. Buildings or structures which are part of a present or future group or complex shall have a unity of character and design. The relationship of forms of the use, texture and color of material shall be such as to create one (1) harmonious whole. When the area involved forms an integral part of, is immediately adjacent to, or otherwise clearly affects the future of any established section of the city, the design, scale and location of the site shall enhance rather than detract from the character, value and attractiveness of the surroundings. Harmonious does not mean or require that the buildings be the same.

In compliance

2. Buildings or structures located along strips of land or on a single site, and not a part of a unified multi-building complex shall achieve as much visual harmony with the surroundings as is possible under the circumstances. If a building is built in an undeveloped area, three (3) primary requirements shall be met, including honest design construction, proper design concepts, and appropriateness to the city.

In compliance

3. All façades visible to public or adjacent property shall be designed to create a harmonious whole. Materials shall express their function clearly and not appear foreign to the rest of the building.

In compliance

4. The concept of harmony shall not infer that buildings must look alike or be of the same style. Harmony can be achieved through the proper consideration of scale, mass, bulk, proportion, height, orientation, site planning, landscaping, materials, rhythm of solids to voids and architectural components including but not limited to porches, roof types, fenestration, orientation and stylistic expression.

In compliance

5. Look-alike buildings shall not be allowed unless, in the opinion of the board, there is sufficient In compliance separation to preserve the aesthetic character of the present or evolving neighborhood. This is not to be construed to prohibit the duplication of floor plans and exterior treatment in a planned development where, in the opinion of the board, the aesthetics or the development depend upon, or are enhanced by the look-alike buildings and their relationship to each other.

6. Buildings, which are of symbolic design for reasons of advertising, unless otherwise compatible with the criteria herein, will not be approved by the board. Symbols attached to the buildings will not be allowed unless they are secondary in appearance to the building and landscape and are an aesthetic asset to the building, project and neighborhood.

In compliance

7. Exterior lighting may be used to illuminate a building and its grounds for safety purposes, but in an aesthetic manner. Lighting is not to be used as a form of advertising in a manner that is not compatible to the neighborhood or in a manner that draws considerably more attention to the building or grounds at night than in the day. Lighting following the form of the building or part of the building will not be allowed if, in the opinion of the board, the overall effect will be detrimental to the environment. All fixtures used in exterior lighting are to be selected for functional as well as aesthetic value.

In compliance

8. Building surfaces, walls and roofs shall be compatible and in harmony with the neighborhood.

In compliance

9. "Take-out" or "pick-up" windows of retail or wholesale establishments shall not be located on a building façade that faces a public right-of-way, unless they are designed in such a manner as to constitute an aesthetic asset to the building and neighborhood.

**Not Applicable** 

10. All exterior forms, attached to buildings, shall be in conformity to and secondary to the building. They shall be an asset to the aesthetics of the site and to the neighborhood.

In compliance

11. All telephones, vending machines, or any facility dispensing merchandise, or a service on private property, shall be confined to a space built into the building or buildings or enclosed in a separate structure compatible with the main building, and where appropriate and feasible, should not be readily visible from off-premises.

Not applicable

12. Buildings of a style or style-type foreign to south Florida or its climate will not be allowed. It is also to be understood that buildings which do not conform to the existing or to the evolving atmosphere of the city, even though possessing historical significance to south Florida, may not be approved.

In compliance

- 13. No advertising will be allowed on any exposed amenity or facility such as benches and trash In compliance containers.
- 14. Light spillage restriction. The applicant shall make adequate provision to ensure that light In compliance spillage onto adjacent residential properties is minimized.

## Section 23.2-31(h) - Criteria for parking lots and vehicular use areas

## **Analysis**

1. Parking lots and other vehicular use areas are to be designed as an aesthetic asset to a neighborhood and to the building, group of buildings, or facility they serve. A parking lot is to be considered an outside space; a transitional space that is located between access areas (such as roads) and the building, group of buildings or other outside spaces which it serves. The parking lot, because it is viewed from above as well as at eye level, should be designed accordingly.

In compliance

2. Parking lots, vehicular use areas, and vehicles parked therein are to be effectively screened from the public view and from adjacent property in a manner that is attractive and compatible with safety, the neighborhood and the facility served.

In compliance

3. The responsibility for beautification and design of a parking lot is the same as that which a homeowner has to his residential lot. The atmosphere within a parking lot or vehicular use area is to be as pleasant and park-like as possible, rather than a harsh stand of paving. Trees are of primary importance to the landscape and are not to be minimized in either height or quantity. Trees impart a sense of three-dimensional space in a relatively flat area. Trees cast shadows that help to reduce the monotony of an expanse of paving and create a refuge from the tropical sun. Signs designating entrances, exits and regulations are to be of a tasteful design and shall be subject to review by the board. Consideration may be given to use of pavement which is varied in texture or color to designate lanes for automobile traffic, pedestrian walks and parking spaces. Brightly colored pavement is to be used with restraint. In order to create a pleasant atmosphere, it is recommended that consideration be given to sculpture, fountains, gardens, pools and benches. Design emphasis is to be given to the entrance and exit areas of the lot. Trash, refuse and unaesthetic storage and mechanical equipment shall be screened from the parking lot.

In compliance

4. Lighting is to be designed for visual effects as well as safety and resistance to vandalism. Care should be taken not to create a nuisance to the neighborhood from brightness or glare. Low lights in modest scale can be used along with feature lighting emphasizing plants, trees, barriers, entrances and exits. The fixtures are to be selected for functional value and aesthetic quality. Fixtures should be regarded as "furniture of the parking lot" which are visible both day and night.

In compliance

## Section 23.2-31(I) - Community Appearance Criteria

**Analysis** 

1. The plan for the proposed structure or project is in conformity with good taste, good design, and in general contributes to the image of the city as a place of beauty, spaciousness, harmony, taste, fitness, broad vistas and high quality.

In compliance

2. The proposed structure or project is not, in its exterior design and appearance, of inferior quality such as to cause the nature of the local environment or evolving environment to materially depreciate in appearance and value.

In compliance

3. The proposed structure or project is in harmony with the proposed developments in the general area, with code requirements pertaining to site plan, signage and landscaping, and the comprehensive plan for the city, and with the criteria set forth herein.

In compliance

4. The proposed structure or project is in compliance with this section and 23.2-29, Conditional Use In compliance Permits (CUP), as applicable.

In compliance

# **ATTACHMENT B - Findings for Granting Conditional Uses**

Prior to approving any conditional use permit, the decision-making authority shall find based on competent and substantial evidence that the following criteria related to conditional uses are met:

Section 23.2-29(d) General findings relating to harmony with LDRs and protection of public interest.	
1. The conditional use exactly as proposed at the location where proposed will be in harmony with the uses which, under these LDRs and the future land use element, are most likely to occur in the immediate area where located.	In compliance
2. The conditional use exactly as proposed at the location where proposed will be in harmony with existing uses in the immediate area where located.	In compliance
3. The conditional use exactly as proposed will not result in substantially less public benefit or greater harm than would result from use of the site for some use permitted by right or some other conditional use permitted on the site.	In compliance
4. The conditional use exactly as proposed will not result in more intensive development in advance of when such development is approved by the future land use element of the comprehensive plan.	In compliance

Section 23.2-29(e) Specific findings for all conditional uses.		Analysis
1.	The proposed conditional use will not generate traffic volumes or movements which will result in a significant adverse impact or reduce the level of service provided on any street to a level lower than would result from a development permitted by right.	In compliance
2.	The proposed conditional use will not result in a significantly greater amount of through traffic on local streets than would result from a development permitted by right and is appropriately located with respect to collector and arterial streets	In compliance
3.	The proposed conditional use will not produce significant air pollution emissions, or will appropriately mitigate anticipated emissions to a level compatible with that which would result from a development permitted by right.	In compliance
4.	The proposed conditional use will be so located in relation to the thoroughfare system that neither extension nor enlargement nor any other alteration of that system in a manner resulting in higher net public cost or earlier incursion of public cost than would result from development permitted by right.	In compliance
5.	The proposed conditional use will be so located in relation to water lines, sanitary sewers, storm sewers, surface drainage systems and other utility systems that neither extension nor enlargement nor any other alteration of such systems in a manner resulting in higher net public cost or earlier incursion of public cost than would result from development permitted by right.	In compliance

The proposed conditional use will not place a demand on municipal police or fire protection

service beyond the capacity of those services, except that the proposed facility may place a

6.

demand on municipal police or fire protection services which does not exceed that likely to result from a development permitted by right.

7. The proposed conditional use will not generate significant noise, or will appropriately mitigate 
In compliance anticipated noise to a level compatible with that which would result from a development permitted by right. Any proposed use must meet all the requirements and stipulations set forth in section 15.24, Noise control.

8. The proposed conditional use will not generate light or glare which encroaches onto any In compliance residential property in excess of that allowed in section 23.4-10, Exterior lighting.

Sec. 23.4-13.(c)11 Administrative uses and conditional uses/Standards/Townhouses		Analysis
1.	Front setback shall be ten (10) feet, with an open porch permitted in a minimum of five (5) feet of setback;	In compliance
2.	Distance between townhouse structures shall be twenty (20) feet; however, distance between double-stacked townhouse structures shall be thirty (30) feet;	Not applicable
3.	Rear setback shall be twenty (20) feet with ten (10) feet for accessory structures;	In compliance
4.	Townhouse structures shall not exceed one hundred twenty (120) feet in overall length or six (6) units;	Not applicable platted lots of record
5.	The maximum number of attached townhouse units within a townhouse building fronting on Federal Highway shall be four (4) units, unless a planned development district is approved; and.	Not applicable platted lots of record
6.	No front door access from alleys when abutting single family residential use or district.	In compliance
7.	For all stories above the second story, both the front façade and rear façade must be setback an additional distance beyond the minimum, except three-story townhouses not higher than thirty-five (35) feet shall meet the minimum front and rear setback requirements.	In compliance