



MEMORANDUM DATE: July 5, 2023

AGENDA DATE: July 12, 2023

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **HRPB #23-00100084 | 722 North K Street** | Additional information requested by the HRPB at the June 14, 2023 meeting on the proposed replacement of an existing metal shingle roof with asphalt shingles

FROM: Anne Greening, Senior Preservation Planner
 Yeneneh Terefe, Preservation Planner
 Department for Community Sustainability

PROJECT UPDATE

On June 14, 2023, the HRPB discussed project #23-00100084, a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for replacement of historic metal shingle roofing with asphalt shingle roofing at 722 North K Street. The property is a contributing resource in the Northeast Lucerne Historic District. The HRPB continued the item to the next HRPB meeting with a request for additional information from staff regarding how many metal shingle roofs exist in the City and examples of the visual impact of replacing historic metal shingles with new metal shingles, asphalt shingles, or standing seam metal roofing. The HRPB also requested that the applicant acquire quotes for replacement of the roof with asphalt shingles and metal shingles.

EXTANT METAL SHINGLE ROOFS

Staff researched metal shingle roofs in the Old Lucerne, South Palm Park, and Northeast Lucerne Historic Districts. Through that research, staff is aware of 15 extant metal shingle roofs in the City’s historic districts, including 722 North K Street. Within the 3 historic districts studied, structures with metal shingle roofs accounted for 0.95% of all resources (15 out of 1,577).

Please note that staff did not have the capacity to engage in a full study of metal shingle roofs in the City. There may be other extant metal shingle roofs that staff is not currently aware of.

| Address | Current Roofing |
|--------------------|---|
| 127 N Palmway | New metal shingle (2017) - Oxford |
| 507 N Palmway | New metal shingle (2016) – Tamko Stonecrest Steel |
| 520 N Palmway | New metal shingle (2016) – Tamko Stonecrest Steel |
| 612 N Palmway | Historic metal shingle |
| 623 N Ocean Breeze | Historic metal shingle |
| 415 S Palmway | Historic metal shingle |
| 535 S Palmway | New metal shingle (2023) - Berridge |
| 329 N Lakeside Dr | New metal shingle (2006) - Berridge |
| 718 N M St | New metal shingle (2013) |

| | |
|------------|------------------------|
| 232 N M St | Historic metal shingle |
| 129 N M St | Historic metal shingle |
| 726 N L St | Historic metal shingle |
| 722 N K St | Historic metal shingle |
| 702 N K St | Historic metal shingle |
| 905 N J St | Historic metal shingle |

STATE DIVISION OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES (DHR) GUIDANCE

Per email correspondence with a staff member from the Florida Division of Historical Resources (the state-level historic preservation office) in 2016, the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards allow for replacement with a compatible substitute material when an in-kind replacement of a historic roof is not technically or economically feasible. The actual material of the compatible substitute roofing is subordinate to the color and pattern that the historic roof provided. Therefore, per the SHPO interpretation, if replacement with new metal shingles is determined not to be feasible, replacement with light gray asphalt shingles is preferable to replacement with standing seam or 5V crimp metal roofing. City staff contacted the DHR in July 2023 to get updated guidance on replacement of metal shingle roofs; the state’s staff reaffirmed their 2016 guidance. This email correspondence has been included as **Attachment A**.

PREVIOUS HRPB DIRECTION

At the Historic Resources Preservation Board workshop on May 11, 2022, the Board gave direction that staff can administratively approve replacement of historic metal shingle roofs with new metal shingles that meet the Florida Building Code and the Florida Wind Code; staff has identified at least four metal shingle options that meet these requirements: the Oxford Shingle by Classic Metal Roofing Systems, the MetalWorks StoneCrest Tile Steel Shingles by TAMKO Building Products, the Arrowline Permanent Metal Slate and Steel Shake by EDCO Products, and the Victorian Shingles by Berridge Manufacturing. The Board also gave direction that they would consider applications to replace metal shingles with light gray asphalt shingles on a case-by-case basis, preferably with an economic hardship claim to justify the alternative material.

PUBLIC COMMENT

At the time of publication of the July HRPB agenda, staff has received no public comment.

CONCLUSION AND STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Board discuss the information provided regarding the remaining metal shingle roofs in the City, options for alternative materials, and cost differences for the roofing materials, to determine if replacement with new metal shingles is technically or economically infeasible, and if the proposed replacement asphalt shingles may serve as a compatible substitute material for the historic metal shingles at 722 North K Street. Staff also recommends that the Board discuss whether there will be changes to the previously-recommended HRPB policy towards metal shingle roof replacement throughout the City’s historic districts. Should the HRPB move to approve the asphalt shingle roofing at 722 North K Street, staff has drafted conditions of approval, included below:

Conditions of Approval

1. The replacement dimensional asphalt shingles shall be light gray to best imitate the appearance of the historic galvanized metal roofing.
2. This approval does not include any modification or alteration to the structural elements of the roof system that may alter its configuration and height. This approval does not include any alterations to the decorative trim, fascia, and soffits.

POTENTIAL MOTIONS

I MOVE TO **APPROVE** HRPB Project Number 23-00100084, with staff recommended conditions, for a COA for the replacement of historic metal shingle roofing with asphalt shingle roofing at **722 North K Street**, because replacement with metal shingles is not feasible for [Board member please state reasons] and light gray asphalt shingles are a compatible substitute roofing material, based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report, supplementary memorandum, and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

I MOVE TO **DENY** HRPB Project Number 23-00100084, with staff recommended conditions, for a COA for the replacement of historic metal shingle roofing with asphalt shingle roofing at **722 North K Street**, as the applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that replacement with metal shingles is infeasible or that the application is compliant with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. DHR Correspondence – 2016 and 2023
- B. Existing and Proposed Roofing
- C. Design Guidelines – Minimal Traditional Style and Roofing