



TOWN OF LAKE PARK

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Meeting Date: January 22, 2024

Agenda Item # HPB 24-001

DESCRIPTION: QUASI JUDICIAL HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ALLOW THE REPLACEMENT OF A ROOF FOR A LOCALLY HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED HOME LOCATED AT 250 FORESTERIA DRIVE

Owner/Applicant: Jordan and Erica Alexander
Address: 250 Foresteria Drive
Historic Property Survey: Florida Master Site File, #8PB9581, Masonry Vernacular
Zoning: R-1 Single Family
Future Land Use: Single Family Residential

Request

The applicant's home at 250 Foresteria Drive received a local historic designation by the Town's Historic Preservation Board on July 20, 2000. (Attachment # 1) The house is a stucco, two-story Masonry Vernacular style, built ca. 1925. The structure has hip roofs covered in asphalt composite shingles. It is located in an R-1 Single Family Zoning District, one-half block west of the Federal Highway Mixed Use District Overlay.

Location



The owners, the Alexanders, purchased the home in April 2023. The applicant states that their insurance company is now requiring that the roof be replaced in order to maintain their homeowners insurance and they are on a strict timeline before they lose their coverage.

Section 66-10 (e) of the code requires a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for any work on an historic structure that requires a building permit.

The roof is currently covered with asphalt shingles, and will be replaced with shingles of the same material and color. See attachments # 2 and #3 for COA Application and shingle photos.



Photo - Current



Photo- 1997

Historical Background

The full master site file form is contained in attachment #5. To quote excerpts that describe the home's architectural style:

"Masonry Vernacular structures tend to be simple, largely unornamented, and constructed out of readily-available materials. Modest in design, most of these buildings were designed and constructed by non-professionals. Many of these structures, built in the 1920s and 1930s, were influenced by the Spanish architectural designs of the time. During that period, the predominant masonry building materials were hollow clay tile and brick. Masonry Vernacular buildings dating from the World War II and Aftermath-era of the 1940s were primarily constructed of concrete block, a popular building material found throughout Florida's residential areas. Structures from this era typically possess shallow-pitched gabled or cross-gabled roofs, but in several instances, they exhibit hipped roofs. The concrete walls are often covered with a stucco veneer. Occasionally, horizontal bands are scored into the stucco exterior. Decoration is simple and usually limited to string courses, window and door lintels, decorative bricks, and attic vents. Fenestration consists of metal casement windows, fixed showcase front windows, or bay windows. This building also exhibits components of the Four Square style. Some elements include a low-pitched pyramidal roof, a symmetrical facade, and a focal entryway."

"This residence has elements of the Four Square style, which is unusual for this town but typical of late 1920s construction practices. Modification include the replacement of some original windows and the enclosure of the front porch. Based on architectural significance and associations with the early history of Kelsey City,

this building is considered to be potentially eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places as part of the Kelsey City Multiple Property Listing.”

Analysis and Staff Determination:

As stated in the application, the roof will be replaced with the same color composite shingles (See Attachment #3). The applicant states they have worked with their roofing contractor to use shingles as close as possible to the current ones. While the replacement shingles in the attachment may not look exactly like those being replaced, the applicant has stated that he re-checked with the roofing contractor who looked again at the existing roof shingles and confirmed that the new shingles are the same size, style and color. (See attachment #4) The contractor will also be at the meeting.

While repair rather than total replacement is preferred by the standards for rehabilitation, given the requirements by the applicant's insurance company they do not have the option of only replacing a portion of the roof.

No changes will be made to the roof structure, chimney or any other features

Staff conducted an assessment of the historic impacts of the proposed materials for compliance with the Town's historic preservation code as well as the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Standards 1-4 were applicable to this review, which are:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new user that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
Staff Comment: Standard met. No change in use, remains residential.
2. The historic character of property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
Staff comment: Standard met. No roof features are proposed to be altered.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
Staff comment: Standard met. Applicant is not detracting from historical nature.
4. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
Staff Comment: Standard met Applicant intends to replace shingles as close as possible to current color and composition, per attachment # 3.

Staff finds the above 4 criteria have been met.

Additionally, staff finds that the roof proposed replacement is in keeping with the following recommended guidelines from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation specifically regarding roofs:

"Identifying, retaining and preserving roofs and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building. The form of the roof (gable, hipped, gambrel, flat or mansard) is significant as are its decorative and functional features (such as cupolas, parapets, monitors, chimneys, weather vanes and dormers), roofing material (such as slate, wood, clay, tile, metal, roll roofing, or asphalt shingles) and size, color and patterning."

"Replacing in kind the entire roof covering or feature that is too deteriorated to repair (if the overall form and detailing are still evident) using the physical evidence as a model to reproduce the feature or when the replacement can be based on historic documentation.... If using the same kind of material is not feasible, then a compatible substitute may be considered."

Based on the Findings above, Staff concludes the requested roof replacement is consistent with the Land Development Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Staff recommends APPROVAL and the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the new roof.

Attachments:

1. Original Resolution of Designation
2. Application for COA
3. Applicant photos
4. E-mail from Applicant
5. Master File form