

**City of Ketchum** Planning & Building

## STAFF REPORT KETCHUM PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING OF MAY 11, 2021

| PROJECT:          | Bluebird Village Community Housing Project  |  |
|-------------------|---|--|
| FILE NUMBER:      | P 21-027  |  |
| APPLICATION TYPE: | Pre-Application Design Review   |  |
| ARCHITECT:        | Michael Doty, Michael Doty Associates   |  |
| DEVELOPER:        | Greg Dunfield, GMD Development, Ketchum Community Development Corporation   |  |
| PROPERTY OWNER:   | City of Ketchum   |  |
| REQUEST:          | Pre-Application Design Review for the development of a new community<br>housing project consisting of two buildings containing 56 deed restricted<br>units and retail on the ground floor. Building height for Building A (East Ave<br>and 5 <sup>th</sup> Street) is 50'-9" and Building B (5 <sup>th</sup> Street) is 48'-1/2. There are 49<br>parking spaces provided. |  |
| LOCATION:         | 480 East Avenue, Lot 3A Block 45 and West 75' of Lots 7 and 8 in<br>Block 45 of the Ketchum Township.   |  |
| ZONING:           | Retail Core of the Community Core (CC-1)  |  |

#### POLICY BACKGROUND

For 52 years, the community of Ketchum has acknowledged the need to maintain and diversify housing within the city to retain a permanent population and labor force. The first policy statement on the need for affordable housing was adopted in 1969 in a city resolution that stated, "employment in the Ketchum area has drastically increased, to the end that a severe housing shortage exists for low-income families."

By the time the city adopted its first Comprehensive Plan in 1983, there was a firm understanding of the housing pressures and resulting consequences, "With the apparent high profitability of speculative and second-home production, the private sector has done little to develop housing affordable by residents of lower and moderate incomes [...] In order to encourage the construction of employee housing and affordable housing for low and moderate income persons, incentives should be developed by the City."

Twenty years later, the housing concerns had escalated without arrest and the 2001 Comprehensive Plan focused heavily on housing, emphasizing its role in a healthy community, "The City of Ketchum recognizes the

Page 1 of 8

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department need for a balanced and sustainable housing supply for residents, employees and visitors. An adequate and diverse housing supply in Ketchum is needed to ensure the viability of town life and businesses". As discussed in the 2001 Comprehensive Plan, healthy communities provide permanent living units for a diverse group of people, making it possible to live and work within the community year-round.

The need for affordable housing was further reinforced in the 2014 Comprehensive Plan stating, "The Ketchum community wants the majority of people who work in Ketchum to have an opportunity to reside [in Ketchum]". It goes on to say "We also want people who have lived here to be able to stay here regardless of their age. We know that a diversity of housing is critically linked to a strong economy and year-round population." Citizens and community stakeholders contributed to the goals and policies of the 2014 plan, it was a community driven effort.

# COMMUNITY HOUSING IN THE COMMUNITY CORE

Since 1994, deed-restricted community housing has been encouraged through development incentives in the Community Core of downtown Ketchum. The first regulations to incentivize development of deed-restricted housing for the local, full time, working population were enacted in 1994. Those incentives allowed additional height and floor area for community housing projects. Between 1994 and 2019, the incentives have increased in an effort to promote and develop community housing projects in the Community Core. Ketchum has long considered community housing projects to be a valuable and encouraged use within the downtown Community Core.

Presently, community housing projects are encouraged in the Community Core and are provided the following development incentives:

- No parking is required for community housing units.
- A height bonus of 10 feet is permitted (52 feet instead of 42 feet)
- The project floor area may exceed 2.25 subject to design review approval.

## PRE-DESIGN REVIEW PROCESS

Pursuant to Ketchum Municipal Code (KMC) §17.96.010.A4, Design Review is required for the development of new mixed-use buildings. The proposed Bluebird Village project is subject to Pre-Application Design Review per Ketchum Municipal Code (KMC) §17.96.010.C.1. The purpose of Pre-Application Design Review is to allow the Commission to exchange ideas and give direction to the applicant on the preliminary design concept in relation to all Design Review criteria and evaluation standards (KMC §17.96.060). A complete analysis of each evaluation standard is included as an attachment to this report.

The Commission's focus is the project's compliance with KMC 17.96.050 (Criteria, Conditions and Security), 17.96.060 (Improvements and Standards), and 17.96.070 (Community Core Projects). The focus of the Planning and Zoning Commission is the project's conformance with the design review standards, design compatibility and integration of the design into the downtown core. The Commission does not have authority over the proposed use or determining if the location is suitable for the project. As outlined above, community housing projects are a permitted and encouraged use in the downtown core.

The proposed project plans and application materials are provided in Attachments A-D.

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department

#### PROPOSED BLUEBIRD VILLAGE HOUSING PROJECT

The applicants, Greg Dunfield with GMD Development and Ketchum Community Development Corporation, are proposing a four story 56-unit deed restricted community housing project with ground floor commercial uses and 49 parking spaces. The location of the project is at the southeast corner of East Avenue and 5<sup>th</sup> Street and the parcel adjacent to the alley on 5<sup>th</sup> Street.

The project site consists of two parcels, Lot 3A (City Hall) and the west 75 feet of Lots 7 and 8 (rear parking lot). The City will be vacating 10 feet of the 30-foot wide alley adjacent to Lots 7 and 8 through a separate alley vacation and lot line shift.



As proposed, the project Floor Area Ratio is 2.29, and the building heights are 50'-9" for the building on Lot 3A and 48-1/2' for the building on Lots 7 and 8. The project is three stories at the East Avenue elevation with a fourth-floor setback from the face of the building along with a fourth-floor roof deck. (Figure 1)



Figure 1

Along 5<sup>th</sup> Street, the project heights are three stories and four stories. A walkway connecting the two buildings is proposed over the alley (Figure 2)



Figure 2

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department Page 3 of 8

At the ground floor and above, the majority of both buildings extend to the edge of the property lines with the exception of the East Avenue ground floor frontage which has portions of the building setback from the sidewalk. The majority of the second, third and fourth floor are setback from the property lines. Features such as elevator and stair shafts extend to the property line (see Figures 3, 4 and 5).



Figure 4

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department Page 4 of 8



Figure 5

### COMPLIANCE WITH CODE

The chart below provides the project compliance with the key development standards in the Community Core District. The full analysis is contained in Attachment E.

| Requirement           | Code Standard                         | Project Compliance             |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Permitted Use         | Deed restricted                       | 56 deed restricted community   |
|                       | community housing is                  | housing units                  |
|                       | encouraged in the                     |                                |
|                       | Community Core                        |                                |
|                       | (in effect since 1994)                |                                |
| Permitted Height      | 52 Feet                               | Building on Lot 3A: 50'-9"     |
|                       | (height bonuses in effect since 2006) | Building on Lots 7&8: 48'-1/2" |
| Required Parking      | No parking required                   | 49 parking spaces provided     |
|                       | (in effect since 2006)                |                                |
| Maximum FAR           | May exceed 2.25 FAR                   | 2.29                           |
|                       | Subject to design review              |                                |
|                       | (FAR bonus in effect since            |                                |
|                       | 1994)                                 |                                |
| Setbacks              |                                       | Street setbacks range from 0   |
| Front and street side | 0 feet                                | to 6 feet                      |

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department Page **5** of **8** 

| Setback adjacent to alley                                   | 3 feet  | Needs to be clarified, portions<br>of the buildings appear to<br>encroach into the 3-foot alley  |
|---|---------|--|
| Rear side not adjacent to                                   | 0 feet  | o feet with the exception of the Idaho Power easement  |
| alley<br>Interior side<br>Setback for 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor | 0 feet  | 0 feet   |
| Setback for 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor                           | 10 feet | Setbacks range from 36 feet to<br>0 feet<br>The city will propose a text<br>amendment to allow averaging<br>of the 10-foot setback to<br>provide design flexibility but<br>no increase in square footage |
|   |         | that otherwise would be permitted on the fourth floor  |

The project is in conformance with the development standards for the Community Core District with the exception of the fourth-floor setbacks. When the project proceeds to design review, three separate applications will be subject to review and approval. The design review application by the applicant, an alley vacation/lot line shift application from the City and a proposed text amendment requested by the City.

While the project is in conformance with the development standards, the Planning and Zoning Commission has the authority to request modifications to the design, massing, materials, and other building elements of the project to ensure the project is compatible and complimentary to the downtown and surrounding structures (KMC 17.96.060 E, F and 17.96.070) Attachment F.

#### **BUILDING MATERIALS**

The proposed exterior building finishes consist of an eclectic variety of colors, materials and textures. The East Avenue façade is primarily brick siding accented with wood board and fiber cement panels. The Fifth Street façade continues the mixture of brick siding, wood board and cement panels. All materials are identified on page PDR A.9.00. One of the recommendations for Commission consideration is the variety, placement and type of façade materials proposed.

#### **PROJECT PARKING**

Since 2006, no parking has been required for deed restricted community housing units in the Community Core. Affordable housing units that ensure Ketchum continues to be a diverse community with a mixture of housing types and affordability, outweigh the need to provide on-site parking. That has been the priority in Ketchum for 15 years.

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department Page 6 of 8

While no parking is required for this project, the applicant is providing 49 on-site parking spaces, a car share program with two vehicles for residents, secure bike parking, and electric bike charging stations. The parking configuration consists of 49 spaces, 18 of the spaces are arranged in a tandem configuration, 7 are compact, with 2 designated for the car share vehicles. The Planning and Zoning Commission has approved tandem parking as the configuration for required parking for a number of market rate multi-family residential projects in the downtown and in other areas. In this case, the parking is not required, however the configuration is consistent with other projects approved by the Commission.

A parking analysis was prepared by AECOM, a traffic engineering firm that has conducted other parking and traffic studies in the city of Ketchum (Attachment C). The conclusions of the report indicate the project will generate a need between 0-12 off-site parking spaces. Currently, the off-site parking demand during the day for the existing City Hall use is approximately 20 vehicles (employees and visitors). Therefore, during the day, there is no net new on-street parking demand.

Currently, there is no on-street demand for parking during evening hours after City Hall is closed. It is anticipated the project residents will create a demand for on-street parking during the evening hours. The issue may be exacerbated in winter when on-street parking is prohibited from 2:00 AM to 7:00 AM November 1 to May 1 of each year. Prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy, the applicant and City should develop a mitigation plan to address resident demand for on-street parking in the winter.

# ISSUES FOR PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION CONSIDERATION

Staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission consider the following issues for discussion with the applicant.

- Discuss design modifications to help reduce the perceived building mass and scale and improve integration of the design into the surrounding context.
- Evaluate additional building articulation and design features to reduce the stark appearance of a hardedge rectangular structure.
- Address the blank walls and lack of pedestrian interaction along the 5<sup>th</sup> Street elevation just west of and east of the alley.
- Review and discuss the building setbacks and relationship to the adjacent buildings along the south property line.
- Evaluate the proposed materials, textures and appearance of the exterior façades.

## RECOMMENDATION

After considering the Pre-Application Design Review submittal attached as Exhibit A, the applicant's presentation, and any public comment received, Staff recommends the Commission provide feedback to the applicant and move to either:

- (a) Continue the Pre-Application Design Review to a date certain and direct the applicant to submit new drawings, renderings, or information that respond to the Commission's review of the project plans and the design concept, or
- (b) Advance the Bluebird Village project to final Design Review.

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Pre-Application Design Review Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting of May 11, 2021 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department

#### ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Bluebird Village Proposed Project Plans
- B. Applicant Project Information
- C. Parking Study
- D. Application Submittal
- E. Code Compliance Analysis
- F. Standards for Review
- G. Public Comment