IN RE:)
)
Gold Mine Thrift Store) KETCHUM HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Request to Alter a Historic Structure) FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, AND
) DECISION
)
Date: November 1, 2022)
)
File Numbers: H22-051)

PROJECT: Gold Mine Thrift Store Historic Building Alteration Request

FILE NUMBER: H22-051

APPLICATION TYPE: Request to Alter a Historic Structure

REPRESENTATIVE: Morley Golden

PROPERTY OWNER: The Community Library Association

REQUEST: Proposal of a rear detached roof assembly, site improvements, and repainting

LOCATION: 331 North Walnut Avenue (Ketchum Townsite: Block 44: Lot 6)

ZONING: Mixed-Use Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-2)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

The Historic Preservation Commission held a public hearing and considered the Request to Alter a Historic Structure for the proposed alteration of the Gold Mine Thrift Store located at 331 N Walnut Avenue during their meeting on October 4th, 2022. After considering the project plans, staff's analysis, and the applicant's presentation and holding the required public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission unanimously approved the request.

Public Hearing Notice

The public hearing notice was published in the Idaho Mountain Express on September 14th, 2022. A public hearing notice was mailed to adjacent properties within 300 feet of the project site on September 14th, 2022. A public hearing notice was posted on the project site and the City's website on September 27th, 2022.

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Historic Preservation Commission having reviewed the project record, provided notice, and conducted the required public hearing does hereby make and set forth these Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision as follows:

Findings Regarding Project Background

The applicant, The Community Library Association, has submitted a Request to Alter a Historic Structure located at 331 N Walnut Ave (Ketchum Townsite: Block 44, Lot 6) within the Mixed-Use Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-2) Zone. The request proposes to construct a detached roof assembly to the rear of the building, install site improvements including benches and site walls, and repaint the soffit color to more closely resemble what was present on the building in the 1950's. The Gold Mine Thrift Store building was constructed in 1957 and is one of the few examples of Mid-Century Modern architecture in downtown Ketchum. The primary period of Mid-Century Modern architecture was from 1945-1969 and was a by-product of post war optimism and innovation. The character defining features of Mid-Century Modern architecture include flat planes, clean lines and geometric shapes, little ornamentation, an emphasis of functionality over form, open floor plans and large windows for light and views. This building reflects the key characteristics of the architectural style.

The project is subject to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review pursuant to KMC 17.20.010.B. HPC review is required for all requests for partial or total demolitions, exterior alterations, and additions to all structures on the Historic Building List.

Findings Regarding Review Criteria for Requests to Alter or Demolish a Historic Structure

Is the structure of historic or architectural value or significance and does it contribute to the historic significance of the property within the Community Core?

The Gold Mine Thrift Store is one of the 24 structures on the Historic Building List. The 2005 Walsworth Associates Windshield Survey identified the Gold Mine Thrift Store as a locally significant historical resource. The existing structure was built in 1957 for the purpose of housing the Community Library and the Gold Mine Thrift Store. The Community Library moved out of the location in 1977 and the building has since been solely used as the home for the Gold Mine.

Limited alterations have been made to the building over time. Staff found one building permit in City records from 1991 (Building Permit Application File No. 91-004). This building permit was for an addition to the rear of the building. The purpose of this addition was to add storage space for the Gold Mine. Staff was also able to find mention of one other addition to the building in the mid 1960's. Again, the purpose of this addition was to allow for greater space for the operation of the library and thrift store. Both additions to the building used the same materials and roof line as the original building.

The Gold Mine building has social and cultural value to the community and architectural significance within downtown Ketchum. The building has been used in the past as the home of the Community Library. The single-story building is architecturally significant as it is one of the few examples of mid-

331 N Walnut Avenue Building: Request to Alter a Historic Structure Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision Historic Preservation Commission Meeting of November 1st, 2022 City of Ketchum Planning & Building Department

century modern architecture within the downtown. The building's slanted roof, frontside glazing, and minimal ornamentation are representative of this style of architecture.

Would the loss, alteration of, or addition to, the structure adversely affect the historic integrity of the structure, impact the significance of the structure within the Community Core, impact the architectural or aesthetic relationship to adjacent properties, or conflict with the Comprehensive Plan?

Historic integrity measures how effectively a building's materials, design, feeling, location, association, workmanship, and setting convey the property's historic significance. The Gold Mine building has retained its historic and architectural integrity over the 65 years since it was originally constructed. The structure has remained in its same location and retained its original building form and materials. The development's small scale contributes to downtown's mix of diverse building types that visually track Ketchum's incremental growth through time.

The proposed project includes a detached roof assembly to the rear of the building which would match the roof line of the existing building. The minimal architectural ornamentation to the roof assembly and the angled roof line is consistent with mid-century modern architectural principles. The roof assembly follows standard #9 of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitations which states,

"New additions, exterior alteration, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment".

The roof assembly is differentiated from the existing building due to the use of metal and it being a detached structure while still being compatible in terms of size, scale, and architectural features.

Other aspects of the project include site walls and benches at the front of the property. These features are small in scale and do not take attention away from the existing building. The site walls and benches are characterized with clean geometric shapes and don't have much architectural detail, keeping in line with mid-century modern architecture characteristics. The alterations to the existing building include repainting the soffit to match the coloration used in the 1950's and replacing the roof shingles with similar material.

Does the structure retain the requisite integrity to convey its historic and/or architectural significance?

The Gold Mine retains its historic integrity through the feeling and association conveyed through its original building form along with it being the original location of the Community Library. The building is in good condition and contains most of the same materials and color palette from the original construction. The two additions which have occurred after the original construction have used the same materials and design characteristics. The architectural features which make the building representative of mid-century modern architecture are still present and will not be affected by the proposed project.

Does the proposed demolition or alteration adversely affect the historic significance or architectural distinction of the structure or the Community Core?

The proposed alteration/addition does not adversely affect the historic significance or architectural distinction of the structure. The alterations/additions won't detract from the existing architectural qualities which make the existing building significant (angled roof line, large storefront windows, minimal architectural ornamentation). The historic significance of the Gold Mine building is it being the first location of the Community Library. This historic significance will not be negatively impacted due to the proposed additions/alterations.

Findings Regarding Commissioner Deliberations

Commissioner Galczynski noted a post for the proposed detached roof assembly may block one of the rear windows of the existing building. The Commission added a condition of approval that the applicant should work to ensure that the posts for the detached roof assembly not block the window on the rear of the building. Otherwise, the Commission found that the project met all the criteria for alterations to a historic structure and approved to the project with a vote of 4-0.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The City of Ketchum is a municipal corporation established in accordance with Article XII of the Constitution of the State of Idaho and Title 50 Idaho Code and has exercised its authority pursuant to Chapter 46 of Title 67 of Idaho Code to establish a historic preservation program and enact ordinances, special conditions, or restrictions for the protection and preservation of historic properties. The regulations adopted through Interim Historic Preservation Ordinance No. 1216 are identified in the Findings of Fact and are herein restated as Conclusions of Law by reference.
- 2. The Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to hear the applicant's Request to Alter a Historic Structure application pursuant to KMC 17.20.010.B. HPC review is required for all requests for partial or total demolitions, exterior alterations, and additions to all structures on the Historic Building List.
- 3. The City of Ketchum Planning Department provided notice for the review of this application in accordance with Section 17.20.030.B and Ketchum Municipal Code § 17.96.080.
- 4. This Request to Alter a Historic Structure application is governed under the regulations and review criteria specified in Ketchum Municipal Code 17.20.030.C.

DECISION

THEREFORE, the Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission **approves** the Request to Alter a Historic Structure (Application File No. H22-051) at 331 N Walnut Avenue.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The rear window shall not be blocked by posts of the detached roof assembly

Findings of Fact **adopted** this 1st day of November 2022.

Rick Reynolds City of Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission