



City of Ketchum

October 19, 2021

Historic Preservation Commissioners
City of Ketchum
Ketchum, Idaho

Recommendation To Hear Public Comment and Provide Direction to Staff on the Historic Building List

Recommendation and Summary

Staff is recommending the Commission consider the written comments and any public testimony provided at the meeting about buildings on the Proposed Historic Building List. After consideration of public input, staff recommends the Commission provide direction to staff on the buildings to remain on the List.

Introduction and History

Over the last several months, the Commission has been reviewing and evaluating buildings within the downtown commercial core to determine which buildings should be placed on the Historic Building List. The Commission completed its review on September 8, 2021 and directed staff to proceed with notifying all property owners with buildings on the proposed List. A copy of the List is included in Attachment A.

Notice was sent to all property owners on the List and published in the Mountain Express on September 29, 2021.

Public Comment

Since publication of the notice, four written comments have been received (Attachment B). Additional comments that may come in after publication of the staff report will be provided to the Commission.

Attachments:

- A. Proposed Historic Building List
- B. Public Comments

CITY OF KETCHUM - HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION PROPOSED HISTORIC BUILDING LIST

Common Name:	Street Address:	GIS Address	RPK #
Greenhow & Rumsey Store, NRHP listed (Culinary Institute)	211 North Main Street	211 N Main St	RPK0000018004B
Forest Service Park, NRHP listed	Between River and 1 st Street	131 E River St	RPK0000040001A
Comstock & Clark Mercantile (Enoteca Restaurant)	300 North Main Street	300 N Main St	RPK00000040010
Lewis Bank (Rocky Mountain Hardware)	180 North Main Street	180 N Main St	RPK08410000D0
Dynamite Shed (TNT Taproom)	271 Sun Valley Road	271 E Sun Valley Rd	RPK0000017004A
Bert Cross Cabin (Vintage Restaurant)	271 ½ Leadville Avenue North	271 N Leadville Ave	RPK0000003007A
Horace Lewis Home (Elephant's Perch)	280 East Avenue North	280 N East Ave	RPK0000043003A
Ketchum Kamp Hotel (Casino)	220 North Main Street	220 N Main St	RPK000000302AA
Pioneer Saloon	308 North Main Street	320 N Main St	RPK0000004002A
First Telephone Co. (Chapter One Bookstore)	340 North 2 nd Street	340 E 2nd St	RPK0000002004B
Fagan Property (Country Cousin Store)	411 Sun Valley Road	411 E Sun Valley Rd	RPK00000240010
Bonning Cabin	531 5 th Street East	500 N East Ave	RPK00000460010
McCoy/Gooding/Miller House (Residence)	111 N east Ave	111 N East Ave	RPK0000022005B
Former Post Office (Former Formula Sports)	460 North Main Street	460 N Main St	RPK0000005003A
Michel's Christiania Restaurant	303 Walnut Avenue	303 N Walnut Ave	RPK00000440050
E.B Williams House (Ketchum Grill)	520 East Avenue North	520 N East Ave	RPK00000460020
Alonzo Price/Esther Fairman House	180 Leadville Avenue North	180 N Leadville Ave	RPK00000220040
Thornton House (Picket Fence)	560 East Avenue North	560 N East Ave	RPK0000046004A
McAtee House (Former Taste of Thai)	380 1 st Avenue	380 N 1st Ave	RPK00000370050
George Castle Cabin	431 ½ Walnut Avenue (in the alley)	431 N Walnut Ave	RPK00000450060
Community Library/Gold Mine Thrift Store	331 Walnut Avenue	331 N Walnut Ave	RPK00000440060
Jack Frost Motel (Gold Mine Consign Building)	591 4 th Street East	571 E 4th St	RPK00000450050
St. Mary's Catholic Church (Mesh Gallery)	380 Leadville Avenue North	420 E 4th St	RPK00000240040
Christina's Restaurant	520 E 2nd Street	520 E 2nd Street	RPK0000042004B
Wille Helmings House and Fix-it Shop (Residence)	140 E 5th Street	140 E 5th Street	RPK0000036005A
Louies/The Church (Picket Fence)	560 N East Ave	560 N East Ave	RPK0000046004A
Kneadery Restaurant	260 N Leadville	260 N Leadville Ave	RPK00000230030
Buildings Proposed to be Removed from List			
Sun Club (Siegle House)	571 Second Street	571 Second Street	RPK0000043005A
Helm Property (Sturtevants)	340 North Main Street	340 North Main Street	RPK0000004002B
Formally Referred to as Batis House (vacant)	431 Washington Ave	431 Washington Ave	RPK00000360030

Lilac Two, LLC
1118 South Braddock Ave Rear
Pittsburgh, PA 15218-1287
Phone: 412-247-7677
Fax: 412-247-7655
Email: gb27i@juno.com

October 6, 2021

To: Ketchum Department of Planning and Building

Gentlemen:

I am in receipt of the proposed building list to be designated historic preservation. The property I own is at 411 Sun Valley Road. This is the log building that houses the Country Cousin and Sun Valley Outfitters.

I am not in favor of having this property in any historical district. I do not wish any reduction of taxes from the city or any other governmental agency. I purchased this property in January of 2000 and I have been meticulously taking care of it since then. Anyone who owns a piece of property in Ketchum would most certainly be interested in preserving that property without interference from any historic preservation designation.

I direct that you not include this property in any historic preservation list as long as it is owned by me or my descendants. We will take care of our own properties.

If you decide otherwise, you will do so against my wishes and you may not expect any cooperation from me or my family. We shall continue to take care of the property as we have been doing for the past twenty-one years.

Sincerely,

Bing Olbum

HISTORICAL PRESERVATION COMMISSION - HPC
REQUEST TO BE REMOVED FROM PROPOSED HISTORICAL BUILDING LIST
FOR CRISTIAN'S RESTAURANT 520 E. 2ND STREET
October 11. 2021

Commission Members,

This is a formal request to remove Cristina's Restaurant Building from the proposed Historical List. The existing building has had numerous additions and remodels not only to the interior but the exterior as well. The need for the building to perform as a restaurant use, required extensive modification to all facades of the building over time.

Very little of what was the original structure remains today. Five (5) additions alone have been added to the exterior. Little of the original shape or form remain today. Any original window and door location no longer exist. Scale of this building, or any other building of similar size for that matter, does not alone constitute a "historical" classification. As well, the building is not in a designated Historical District.

Few of the other smaller building/homes in the Community Core under consideration, have received such extensive modifications as Cristina's. Many of those structures still maintain the original form and design as when they were built.

Please find that Cristina's Restaurant Building does not meet the underlying criteria for being classified as historical.

Respectfully Submitted.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Cristina Cook", written in a cursive style.

Cristina Cook Owner

October 12, 2021

VIA EMAIL ONLY

Ketchum Department of Planning and Building
P.O. Box 2315
Ketchum, ID 83340
participate@ketchumidaho.org

Re: 140 E 5th Street, Ketchum, ID
Our File No.: 11135-006

Ladies and Gentlemen:

We represent Gentian, LLC, an Idaho limited liability company (the "Company"), who owns the real property located at 140 E 5th Street, Ketchum, Idaho (the "Property"). The Company's registered agent, David Lloyd, received the City of Ketchum's (the "City") Notice of Public Hearing scheduled for October 19, 2021 regarding the Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission's ("Commission") request for public input on the buildings proposed to be included on the City's Historic Building List (the "List"), which currently includes the Property.

Please be advised that Mr. Lloyd, on behalf of the Company, requests that the Property be removed from the List since the Commission's decision to include it was not based on any substantial evidence but rather, an arbitrary and capricious decision, which was an abuse of its discretion. Indeed, Ms. Cosgrove, who is an architect, admitted during the September 8, 2021 meeting (the "Meeting") that although the Property is "cute," it is not architecturally significant and, hence, does not fit within the designation criteria as set forth in Attachment G (Historic Preservation Evaluation Criteria) of the September 3, 2021 Staff Memorandum ("Staff Memo"). (Recording of September 8, 2021 Meeting at 1:23:30). Nonetheless, the Commission voted to add the Property to the List.

The audio tapes from the Meeting reveal that the reason why the Property was added to the List was because of Mr. Galczynski's representations relating to an alleged curbside conversation that he had with Mr. Lloyd. Specifically, Mr. Galczynski claimed that Mr. Lloyd told him that the Property has been passed down through his family for

generations and that they have taken great pride in preserving the structure "as a family thing" and that it's authentic without significant alterations. (*Id.* at 1:24:50). Such representations, however, are inaccurate. For instance, the Property has not been passed down for generations through the Lloyd family. Rather, Mr. Lloyd purchased the Property a mere nine (9) years ago. Since that time, he has used his resources as a local contractor to replace almost all of the exterior components of the structure. Thus, even though the exterior of the structure and the perimeter fence may look "original," the original siding, shutters and fence have all been replaced with modern materials which provide a vintage aesthetic. Even if Mr. Galczynski had accurately represented his conversation with Mr. Lloyd, a conversation with a property owner is not a basis for adding the Property to the List. See Attachment G. Since the Commission's decision was not based on any substantive designation criteria, it must be reversed.

Furthermore, even though the Company does not have any present plans to develop the Property, designating it as a historic building would undermine its value given the small size (0.076 acres) of the lot and the location of the structure. For these reasons, the Company requests that the Commission remove the Property from the List.

Sincerely,


LAWSON LASKI CLARK, PLLC

James R. Laski

HEATHER E. O'LEARY
HEO@LAWSONLASKI.COM



October 12, 2021

VIA EMAIL ONLY

Ketchum Department of Planning and Building
P.O. Box 2315
Ketchum, ID 83340
participate@ketchumidaho.org

Re: 260 N. Leadville Avenue, Ketchum, ID (The Kneadery)
Our File No.: 11613-001

Ladies and Gentlemen:

We represent Freshly Baked, LLC, an Idaho limited liability company ("Freshly Baked"), who owns the real property located at 260 N Leadville Avenue, Ketchum, Idaho (the "Property"). We also represent Leadville Grill, LLC, an Idaho limited liability company, dba The Kneadery (together with Freshly Baked, the "Kneadery"). The Kneadery is in receipt of the City of Ketchum's (the "City") Notice of Public Hearing scheduled for October 19, 2021 regarding the Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission's ("Commission") request for public input on the buildings proposed to be included on the City's Historic Building List (the "List"), which currently proposes to include the Property.

Please be advised that the Kneadery requests that the Property be removed from the List for several reasons. First, the structure located on the Property was not constructed more than fifty (50) years ago and, thus, does not qualify as a historic building. Indeed, Attachment G (Historic Preservation Evaluation Criteria) to the September 3, 2021 Staff Memorandum ("Staff Memo"), which sets for the design criteria for placing structures and sites on the List, specifically provides that "Historic buildings **must be** at least fifty (50) years old." (*emphasis added*). Although page 36 of Attachment F (Information and Ranking Packet) to the Staff Memo identifies the current structure on the Property as being the "Sydney Venable Home" built "Circa 1912," that information is incorrect. Likewise, Ms. Holland's statement during the September 8, 2021 meeting (the "Meeting") that "the family that built this is a very significant early Ketchum family, the Venable family umm...you know, right on par with the Lewis family, the McCoy family, the Griffith family, you know original Ketchum families" is also incorrect. (Recording of September 8, 2021 Meeting at 1:28:00).

While the Venable home was located at 260 N Leadville Avenue in the early 1900's, that structure is not the same structure that is currently located on the Property. Indeed, the County Assessor's records confirm that the current structure on the Property was not built until 1975. (*Enclosed herewith as Exhibit A is a copy of the Blaine County Assessor's Records for the Property*). The date of construction of the current structure is further corroborated by a December 25, 1975 article in the Ketchum Tomorrow newspaper which states:

Following his third trip to Ketchum, Sacramento Californian Dean Johnson decided to open a family type restaurant and **promptly began construction of an attractive barnwood establishment** on Leadville Avenue called The Kneadery.

Trips to Montana for barnwood ("from a barn, chicken coop, two outhouses and a log cabin") **and antiques were made.**

(*Enclosed herewith as Exhibit B is a copy of the December 25, 1975 Newspaper Article*). The foregoing excerpt from the newspaper also confirms that the current structure was constructed with sourced materials from out of state – it was not merely a remodel of the Venable home.¹ Since the structure on the Property was not constructed until 1975, it does not qualify as a historical building under the specific designation criteria set forth in Attachment G and, thus, must be removed from the List.² Notably, at the Meeting, the Commission voted in favor of removing the Covey from the List even though that building was originally constructed in 1935 (*i.e.* more than fifty (50) years ago) based on the fact that it had been remodeled to such an extent that it was almost completely reconstructed and, hence, considered a new building even though it retained some historic features. Given that precedent, the Kneadery must be removed from the List since it is an entirely new structure built in 1975 – not simply a rebuild of a once-existing structure on the Property.

Even though Attachment G to the Staff Memo provides that a building may be added to the List if it is less than fifty (50) years old, such addition may only occur "if it is found to be exceptionally important in other significant criteria." Here, however, the Commission did not

¹ The statement on page 36 of Attachment F to the Staff Memo that "The front of the building is virtually unchanged, except that the former screened-in porch has become the restaurant main entrance. Interior room partitions have been removed to create the restaurant's large dining space" is an unsubstantiated statement that should be disregarded because there is no historical photo or evidence in the record to support it since Attachment F merely includes photos of the front of the structure from 2006 and 2021.

² It is worth noting that significant modifications and alterations were made to the structure after it was constructed in 1975. Specifically, it underwent a substantial rebuild in 1993 due to a fire that caused severe damages as well as several extensive remodels, which occurred in 2003, 2007 and 2019. It is also worth noting that the Commission voted in favor of removing the Sawtooth Club from the List, in part, because it was significantly remodeled after a fire, which is similar to the situation at hand.

identify any significant criteria to exempt the structure from the fifty (50) year requirement. In fact, there was not any substantive discussion of any of the designation criteria set forth in either Ordinance 1216 or Attachment G to the Staff Memo. Instead of engaging in a discussion relating to the designation criteria, Mr. Reynolds merely suggested adding the Kneadery to the list based solely on the following reason:

The Kneadery, oh yeah for sure, old log house, I mean it's standalone in Ketchum, very popular, I mean everybody's been in there.

(Recording of September 8, 2021 Meeting at 48:30). Simply being a popular restaurant in Ketchum, however, is not a proper basis for adding a building to the List. Furthermore, none of the Commission's members provided any explanation of how the Kneadery restaurant is connected to the Venable family or how it somehow carries on the family's legacy, which is a criteria that must be satisfied under Ordinance 1216. Nonetheless, when it came time for the Commission to vote, rather than identifying any criteria that the structure satisfied, Ms. Cosgrove simply asked "I think, aren't we all 'yes' on that?" and then the Commission went straight to a vote, which added the Property to the List. The Commission's decision was arbitrary, capricious and an abuse of discretion given its failure to undertake any substantive evaluation.

For these reasons, the Kneadery requests that the Property be removed from the List. A decision to the contrary would be improper as it would circumvent the fifty (50) year old building requirement. That said, if preserving the "name" of the Venable family is the important factor at issue, as suggested by Ms. Holland's statement during the Meeting, then the Kneadery would be willing to install a plaque on the Property which includes information regarding the Venable family and the fact that they once resided on the Property in a structure that no longer exists. We hope that the foregoing provides the Commission with sufficient information to vote to remove the Property from the List. Thank you.

Sincerely,

LAWSON LASKI CLARK, PLLC


Heather E. O'Leary

Enclosures

EXHIBIT A

Please call the Assessor's Office at 208-788-5535 for any information not available here.

Characteristic Information for Parcel Number:RPK00000230030
Commercial Characteristic Records:1

Parcel Number	RPK00000230030
Owner	FRESHLY BAKED LLC
Address	260 N LEADVILLE AVE
Legal Description	KETCHUM LOT 3 BLK 23 5500SF
Mailing Address	C/O DILLON WITMER PO BOX 5005 KETCHUM ID 83340-0000
Commercial Record	1
Total Sq. Ft.	2619
Number of Stories	1
Number of Units	0
Year Built	1975
State Category Code	42
Ground Floor Square Feet	0
Total Land Acreage	0.000

EXHIBIT B



The Kneadery is a new restaurant in town.

Country cooking comes to Ketchum

Following his third trip to Ketchum, Sacramento Californian Dean Johnson decided to open a family type restaurant and promptly began construction of an attractive barnwood establishment on Leadville Avenue called The Kneadery.

Trips to Montana for barnwood ("from a barn, chicken coop, two outhouses and a log cabin") and antiques were made, refinishing was completed and the buffing out of the interior was going on while Johnson's wife Lynne was working on the menu via several eating places in California.

The couple imported a chef, Eric Rusk, from Sacramento who whips up meals "like grandmother makes:" country fried chicken, giblet gravy, and the works, according to Mrs. Johnson who does all the baking with her partner Gail Severn.

Home baked breads, muffins, omelettes and a list of about fifteen specials await breakfast, lunch and dinner diners in the spacious restaurant.

The decision to open a food establishment was a quick one. "I had worked as a waitress and Dean was a lineman," Mrs.

Johnson explained. "We decided we wanted to live here, decided this is what we wanted to do and we're doing it!"

The Johnsons didn't want to open another dinner house because of the stiff competition already present in the area. "It's not a health food restaurant, it's a healthy place to eat," the lady says. "It's like coming into someone else's home to eat when you don't want to cook yourself."

Catering to families and to the locals, the week-old restaurant will soon be boasting Oriental cuisine, steak nights and other pocket-palatable meals.

Permits needed to go into sawtooth wilderness

Cross-country skiers, mountaineers, and anyone else going into the Sawtooth Wilderness through May 15 are required to have a winter travel permit according to Sawtooth NRA Wilderness and Backcountry Manager Dave Lee.

Permits can be obtained at the following locations: Stanley Ranger Station, three miles south of Stanley, Idaho; Sawtooth National Recreation Area Headquarters, three miles south of Ketchum, Idaho; and the Halley Ranger Station, Halley, Idaho.

The purpose of the winter travel permit is to record detailed information in case of emergency. Information required for the permit includes the names and addresses of Wilderness travelers, check-in and check-out procedures, and a day by day travel itinerary. Current avalanche and weather conditions are also discussed. Weather data is now

being gathered at Stanley, Ketchum, Halley, and Bald Mountain.

The Sawtooth Wilderness is noted for its extreme ruggedness. During winter months avalanches are common in nearly every canyon. Because of the rugged terrain, travel across these avalanche paths is difficult to avoid. Permits will not be issued during periods when extremely hazardous conditions are known to exist.

Persons traveling to any other nearby mountainous areas should make thorough preparations prior to beginning a winter trip. Latest weather conditions and forecast should be obtained. Trip itineraries and check-in check-out plans should be left with a friend, the local Forest Service, or Sheriff's office. Equipment and food for an overnight stay is important. Proper winter travel gear is a must.

AN EXCHANGE

APPEARING IN THE LIMELIGHT ROOM
SUN VALLEY INN
DEC. 26 - JAN. 31

NO PERFORMANCES ON DEC. 28 & DEC. 30



Sun Valley



HEATHER E. O'LEARY
HEO@LAWSONLASKI.COM



October 13, 2021

Ketchum Department of Planning and Building
P.O. Box 2315
Ketchum, ID 83340
participate@ketchumidaho.org

Re: 260 N. Leadville Avenue, Ketchum, ID (The Kneadery)
Our File No.: 11613-001

Ladies and Gentlemen:

This shall serve as an addendum to the letter that we previously submitted to the City on October 12, 2021 regarding the real property located at 260 N. Leadville Avenue, Ketchum, ID (the "Property") being added to the historical building list. As further confirmation that the current structure on the Property was not constructed until 1975, enclosed herewith as Exhibit A is a copy of the building permit application ("Application") dated August 1, 1975, which was approved by the City's building official on August 5, 1985. Please note, the Application seeks approval of "construction of restaurant" and identifies the class of work as "new."

Hopefully the enclosed clarifies any questions regarding when the current structure on the Property was constructed. Thank you.

Sincerely,

LAWSON LASKI CLARK, PLLC

/s/ Heather E. O'Leary
Heather E. O'Leary

Enclosures

EXHIBIT A

APPLICATION FOR BUILDING PERMIT

City of Ketchum, Idaho

OWNER: DEAN C. JOHNSON
ADDRESS: ^{BOX} 1571 SUN VALLEY
CONTRACTOR: SELF
ADDRESS: SAME

ESTIMATED COST OF CONSTRUCTION: [#] 50,000

CLASS OF WORK: X New Alter Move
 Repair Enlarge Other

DESCRIPTION OF WORK: CONSTRUCTION OF RESTAURANT
STREET ADDRESS OF WORK: Block 23 Lot 3 on LEADVILLE AVE
LEGAL LAND DESCRIPTION:

LOT AREA: 5500 Sq. Ft. FIRE ZONE: 1
ZONING: LR T MH A
 GR-L X B-1 AF F
 GR-H LI PUD D

TYPE OF CONSTRUCTION: WOOD FRAME & MASONRY
TOTAL FLOOR AREA: 1800 Sq. Ft. (Excluding garages, porches, unfinished basements)
NO. OF STORIES: 1 NO. OF DWELLING UNITS: 0
SET-BACKS: FRONT: 28 Ft.; SIDE: 0 Ft.
REAR: 32 Ft. SIDE: 0 Ft.
WATER SUPPLY SOURCE: CITY
TYPE OF SEWAGE DISPOSAL: 11

SIGNS ONLY: TOTAL AREA: 110 max Sq. Ft. (Includes all sides)
FENCES ONLY: HEIGHT: NONE Ft.; LENGTH: Ft.

I hereby acknowledge that I have filled in this application accurately to the best of my knowledge and that I agree to comply with all City ordinances and State laws regulating building construction in the City of Ketchum, Idaho.

Dean C. Johnson
Signature of Contractor, Owner, or Authorized Agent

8/1/75
Date

Thomas S. Lane
Building Official

8-5-75
Date

APPROVED

DENIED

Official Use Only

Permit No.: 354
Application No.: 75-92
Date Filed: 7-21-75
Permit Fee: 500⁰⁰
Plan Check Fee: 107⁵⁰
Total Fees: 607⁵⁰

SPM

ppp