

City of Ketchum

June 15,2021

Historic Preservation Commissioners City of Ketchum Ketchum, Idaho

Recommendation To Review and Adopt Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures and Review Historic Building List

Recommendation and Summary

Staff is recommending the Commission review and adopt the Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures and adopt the following motion:

I move to adopt the Ketchum Criteria for designating historic structures.

Introduction and History

At the June 1, 2021, meeting, the Commission reviewed and provided direction on criteria to be used for designating structures that will be placed on the Historic Building List. These criteria will be used to evaluate the 26 buildings currently on the Historic Building List.

Attachment A is the proposed criteria based on Commission review and comments at the last meeting.

Analysis

Staff is requesting Commission review and adoption of the proposed criteria. Once the criteria are established, staff is recommending the Commission use the criteria to evaluate the 26 building currently on the Historic Building List.

To assist the Commission evaluation of the 26 buildings and any other building that may be considered for the list, staff has prepared an evaluation matrix (Attachment B).

Attachments:

A: Proposed Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures

B: Evaluation matrix

Designation criteria for structures on the Historic Building List.

The following Primary Criteria shall be used to determine if a structure shall be placed on the Historic Building List:

- 1. Primary Criteria Historic Building. Historic buildings must be at least fifty (50) years old and meet one or more of the criteria for architectural, social/historic or geographic/environmental significance as described below. A historic building may be exempt from the age standard if it is found to be exceptionally important in other significant criteria.
- 2. *Primary Criteria Historic Buildings or Sites*. Historic buildings or sites shall meet one or more of the following criteria:

A. Architectural criteria.

- (1) Exemplifies specific elements of an architectural style or period;
- (2) Example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, state-wide, regionally, or locally;
- (3) Demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value;
- (4) Represents an innovation in construction, materials or design;
- (5) Style particularly associated with Ketchum or one of its neighborhoods;
- (6) Represents a built environment of a group of people in an era of history;
- (7) Pattern or grouping of elements representing at least one of the above criteria; or
- (8) Significant historic remodel.

B. Social/historic criteria.

- (1) Site of historic event that had an effect upon society;
- (2) Exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community;
- (3) Associated with a notable person or the work of a notable person; or
- (4) Is valued by the Ketchum community as an established or familiar visual or cultural feature due to its architectural history, siting, cultural characteristics or

heritage.

- C. Geographic/environmental criteria.
- (1) Enhances sense of identity of the community;
- (2) Is an established and familiar natural setting or visual feature of the community; or
- (3) Relates positively to buildings in its immediate vicinity in terms of scale, size, massing, etc. such that its removal would be an irreparable loss to the setting.
- 3. *Primary Criteria for All Sites*. All sites will be evaluated for their physical integrity using the following criteria, but a site need not meet all of the following criteria:
 - A. Shows character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the community, region, state or nation;
 - B. Retains original design features, materials and/or character;
 - C. Is in the original location or same historic context after having been moved; and
 - D. Has been accurately reconstructed or restored based on documentation.

Historic Preservation Designation Criteria - Ranking Matrix

Purpose:

This ranking matrix has been prepared for the Historic Preservation Commission as a tool to assist in determining whether a proposed building qualifies to be placed on the City of Ketchum Historic Building List. A specific ranking or certain total of points does not dictate placement on the list.

Elligibility:

For a building to be placed on the Historic Building List, it must qualify for all three primary criteria.

Criteria 1 - Historic Building

Criteria 2 - Significance

Must meet a minimum of one subcriteria for one significance area (architectural, social/historic, or geographic/environmental).

Criteria 3 - Physical Integrity

Must meet a minimum of one subcriteria for physical integrity.

Ranking:

Primary Criteria 1: Historic Building

Place an "X" in the box for properties 50 years or older.

Primary Criteria 2: Significance and Primary Criteria 3: Integrity

Rank each building/site on a scale of 0-3 using the following assumptions. Please attempt to be as consistent in the use of each ranking level as possible.

- 0 does not meet criteria
- 1 minimally meets criteria
- 2 meets criteria
- 3 exceeds criteria

NOTES:

This section is for Commission members to put their thoughts or comments on the rankings.

		CRITERIA 1	CRITERIA 2													CRITERIA 3]		
		Historic Building		Architectural Criteria								Social/Historic Criteria				Geographic/Environmental			Physical			1
Common Name	Street Address		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	Α	В	C	D	NOTES:
																						recent restoration based on historic photographs, but not really representing innovations.
																						Associated with a notable person, but should be discussed further on whether that criteria
Example: My House	1234 5th St	X	0	2	3	0	0	0	1	3	0	0	1	0	2	0	3	0	0	0	1	is met.
PROPOSED LIST																						
Bonning Cabin	531 5 th Street East																					
Thornton House	560 East Avenue North																					
E.B Williams House	520 East Avenue North																					
Jack Frost Motel	591 4 th Street East																					
George Castle Cabin	431 1/2 Walnut Avenue																					
Michel's Christiania Restaurant	303 Walnut Avenue																					
Brass Ranch House	571 2 nd Street																					
McCoy/Gooding/Miller House	480 East 2 nd Street																					
Lon Price/Esther Fairman House	180 Leadville Avenue North																					
St. Mary's Catholic Church	380 Leadville Avenue North																					
Fagan Property	411 Sun Valley Road																					
Comstock & Clark Mercantile	300 North Main Street																					
Pioneer Saloon	308 North Main Street																					
Helm Property	340 North Main Street																					
Former Post Office	460 North Main Street																					
Bert Cross Cabin	271 ½ Leadville Avenue North																					
Ketchum Kamp Hotel	220 North Main Street																					
Lewis Bank	180 North Main Street																					
First Telephone Co.	340 North 2 nd Street																					
Dynamite Shed	271 Sun Valley Road																					
Battis house	431 Washington Avenue																					
McAtee House	380 1 st Avenue																					
Forest Service Park	Between River and 1 st Street																					
Community Library/Gold Mine	331 Walnut Avenue																					
Thrift Shop																						
Greenhow & Rumsey Store (NRHP listed)	211 North Main Street																					
Horace Lewis Home/Elephant's Perch	280 East Avenue North																					