

October 18, 2021

Mayor Bradshaw and City Councilors City of Ketchum Ketchum, Idaho

Mayor Bradshaw and City Councilors:

# Recommendation to Approve the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision for the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project

# **Recommendation and Summary**

Staff recommends the Council approve the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision for the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project and adopt the following motion.

Recommended Motion: "I move to approve the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision for the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project."

The reasons for the recommendation are as follows:

- Footnote No. 2 of Ketchum Municipal Code §17.12.040 requires that all buildings greater than 48 feet or that contain a fourth floor receive final review and approval from the City Council. The Bluebird Village Community Housing Project contains a fourth floor and both buildings within the development exceed 48 feet in height.
- On August 10<sup>th</sup>, 2021, Planning & Zoning Commission approved the Bluebird Village Community
  Housing Project Design Review (Application File No. P21-063) conditioned upon the City Council's
  approval of the development's building height and fourth floor.
- The Ketchum City Council unanimously affirmed the Planning & Zoning Commission's approval of the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project design (Design Review Application File No. P21-063) and approved the development's building height and fourth floor during their regular meeting on October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021.

## **Introduction and History**

The Ketchum City Council held a public hearing and considered the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project during their regular meeting on October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021. After considering Staff's analysis, the applicant's presentation, and public comment, the Ketchum City Council unanimously affirmed the Planning & Zoning Commission's approval of the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project design (Design Review Application File No. P21-063) and approved the development's building height and fourth floor. The City Council recognized that the development's proposed mass and scale will accommodate more housing units and address the community's critical need for affordable housing.

Staff has drafted the attached findings to reflect the City Council's approval of the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project design.

#### Attachments:

Bluebird Village Community Housing Project: Draft Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision



IN RE:	)	
	)	
Bluebird Village Community Housing Project	)	KETCHUM CITY COUNCIL
Building Height & Fourth Floor	)	FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, AND
Date: October 18, 2021	)	DECISION
	)	

**PROJECT:** Bluebird Village Community Housing Project

ASSOCIATED APPLICATIONS: Conditional Use Permit P21-064, Pre-Application Design Review P21-027,

Design Review P21-063

**ARCHITECT:** Michael Doty, Michael Doty Associates

**DEVELOPER:** Greg Dunfield, GMD Development & Ketchum Community Development

Corporation

**PROPERTY OWNER:** City of Ketchum

**PROJECT LOCATION:** 480 N East Avenue (Ketchum Townsite: Block 45: Lot 3A) & Parking Lot at

Southeast Corner of 5th Street & Alley (Ketchum Townsite: Block 45: W

75' Lots 7 & 8)

**ZONING:** Retail Core of the Community Core (CC-1)

OVERLAY: None

#### RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

The Ketchum City Council held a public hearing and considered the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project during their regular meeting on October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021. After considering Staff's analysis, the applicant's presentation, and public comment, the Ketchum City Council unanimously affirmed the Planning & Zoning Commission's approval of the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project design (Design Review Application File No. P21-063) and approved the development's building height and fourth floor. The City Council recognized that the development's proposed mass and scale will accommodate more housing units and address the community's critical need for affordable housing.

## Public Hearing Notice & Public Comment

The public hearing notice for the project was mailed to all owners of property within 300 feet of the project site and all political subdivisions on September 15<sup>th</sup>, 2021. The public hearing notice was published in the Idaho Mountain Express on September 15<sup>th</sup>, 2021.

Public comment received prior to the City Council's review of the project was included as Attachment C to the October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021 Staff Report. Public comment received following the Staff Report's publication was incorporated into the project record and forwarded to the Council for their consideration.

#### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

The Ketchum City Council having reviewed the entire project record, provided notice, and conducted the required public hearing does hereby make and set forth these Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision as follows:

# FINDINGS REGARDING BLUEBIRD VILLAGE COMMUNITY HOUSING PROJECT 51 New Affordable Rental Housing Units in Downtown Ketchum

The applicant, GMD Development in partnership with the Ketchum Community Development Corporation, is proposing to develop a community housing project with 51 deed-restricted community housing units. The project site consists of two City-owned parcels—Lot 3A (City Hall) and the west 75 feet of Lots 7 and 8 (rear parking lot). The development site is located within the Retail Core Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-1). The community housing project consists of two buildings, Building A on the City Hall parcel and Building B on the parking lot, connected by a walkway across the Block 45 alley.

Bluebird Village project balances two key community objectives—preserving downtown's vibrancy and increasing Ketchum's supply of affordable housing units. This project will provide the social infrastructure that Ketchum so desperately needs in a high-quality, inclusive development downtown that is easily accessible by foot, bike, or transit. Bluebird Village will enhance downtown's vibrancy, support local businesses, and help maintain Ketchum's community by providing 51 affordable, rental units for locals who live and work in town.

# FINDINGS REGARDING COMPLIANCE WITH COMPREHENSIVE PLAN VISION, VALUES, AND POLICIES Community Housing Options for Ketchum Locals Living and Working in Town

We value a strong sense of community. Furthermore, we wish to be a place with a strong economy, vibrant downtown, diverse options for housing, and a varied demographic of people who live, work, and visit here.

--Community Vision, City of Ketchum 2014 Comprehensive Plan

For 52 years, Ketchum has acknowledged the need to diversify its housing options within town to retain its permanent population and labor force. The City's first policy statement emphasizing the community's critical need for affordable housing was adopted in 1969 in a resolution stating, "employment in the Ketchum area has drastically increased, to the end that a severe housing shortage exists for low-income families."

By the time Ketchum had adopted its first Comprehensive Plan in 1983, the community had experienced the consequences that resulted from extreme housing pressure created by second homes and speculative development. The private sector had done little to develop affordable housing units for residents with lower or moderate incomes. The 1983 Comprehensive Plan stated that the city should institute incentives to encourage the construction of more employee and affordable housing units.

The housing crisis escalated in Ketchum without arrest for twenty years. Focusing on housing's importance in a healthy community, the 2001 Comprehensive Plan stated that, "The City of Ketchum recognizes the need for a balanced and sustainable housing supply for residents, employees and visitors. An adequate and diverse housing supply in Ketchum is needed to ensure the viability of town life and businesses." Healthy communities depend on adequate housing options to provide permanent living units for a diverse group of people making it possible to live and work within town year-round.

The 2014 Comprehensive Plan identified housing as one of the ten core values important to the community's future emphasizing that housing should be integrated into the downtown core. The community wanted people who worked in Ketchum to have housing options to live in town. The 2014 Comprehensive Plan recognized community housing's critical role in supporting a vibrant downtown, strong economy, and a year-round population.

The Bluebird Village project balances two community key community objectives—preserving downtown's vibrancy and increasing Ketchum's supply of affordable housing units. This development is consistent with the community's vision and goals for downtown as detailed in the 2014 Comprehensive Plan. Bluebird Village will enhance downtown's vibrancy, support local businesses, and help maintain Ketchum's community by providing 51 affordable, rental units for locals who live and work in town.

#### FINDINGS REGARDING KETCHUM'S COMMUNITY HOUSING DEVELOPMENT INCENTIVES

Throughout the years, the zoning code was amended to encourage the development of affordable community housing downtown. These amendments to Ketchum's zoning code reflect a willingness to consider trade-offs of mass and scale impacts if other community objectives like increasing the supply of community housing units are met.

Since 1994, deed-restricted community housing has been encouraged through development incentives for projects in downtown Ketchum. The first regulations to incentivize development of deed-restricted housing for Ketchum's local, full-time, working population were enacted in 1994. Those incentives allowed additional height and floor area for community housing projects. Between 1994 and 2019, additional development incentives were incorporated into the zoning code to promote and develop community housing projects within the Community Core. Ketchum has long considered community housing projects and units to be a valuable and encouraged use within downtown developments.

The zoning code provides the following development incentives to encourage community housing projects downtown:

No parking is required for community housing units.

- Community housing projects are eligible for 10 more feet of building height than market-rate developments. 52 feet is the maximum permitted building height for 100% community housing projects. Market-rate developments have a maximum permitted building height of 42 feet.
- Community housing projects may exceed the maximum permitted 2.25 gross FAR subject to Design Review approval.

#### FINDINGS REGARDING ENTITLEMENT PROCESS: ROLES AND DECISIONS

Design Review is required for the development of new mixed-use buildings in all zoning districts within the city (KMC §17.96.010.A4). The Planning & Zoning Commission has the authority to review and approve Design Review applications pursuant to Ketchum Municipal Code §17.96.030.B. The Planning & Zoning Commission approved the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project Design Review (Application File No. P21-063) during their regular meeting on August 10<sup>th</sup>, 2021, and adopted the associated Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision during a special meeting on August 24th, 2021. The Commission's Design Review approval for the community housing project is conditioned upon the City Council's approval of the development's building height and fourth floor. Footnote No. 2 of Ketchum Municipal Code §17.12.040 requires that all buildings greater than 48 feet or that contain a fourth floor receive final review and approval from the City Council.

The project complies with all zoning and dimensional standards for community housing developments in the Community Core (KMC §17.12.040) except for the 10-foot fourth floor setback. The city has proposed a zoning code text amendment for projects that dedicate all residential use to community housing. The Commission's Design Review approval is contingent upon the City Council's approval of the zoning code text amendment proposing to modify the fourth-floor setback requirement for community housing project.

#### FINDINGS REGARDING ZONING CODE HISTORY

When the City of Ketchum first enacted a comprehensive zoning code through its adoption Ordinance No. 85 in 1965, the maximum permitted building height in the Community Core, then called the Business District, was 35 feet. It wasn't until 2000 through the City's adoption of Ordinance No. 849 that increases in maximum building height were permitted for certain roofing forms—38'-6" for flat roofs including parapet walls and 40' for pitched roofs with gable ends. The City's adoption of Ordinance 994 in 2006 established a form-based code for new developments downtown. Buildings were permitted a maximum of three floors under the form-based code. A fourth floor was permitted if all uses above the ground floor were exclusively affordable residential units. The consolidation of the City's zoning code in 2015 through its adoption of Ordinance No. 1135 eliminated downtown's formbased code. Buildings of three stories or less were permitted a maximum building height of 42 feet. The maximum height for community housing projects eligible for a fourth floor was 50 feet. Ordinance No. 1162 adopted in 2016 eliminated regulations related to the number of permitted floors but maintained the same maximum permitted building heights for market-rate and community housing development projects. These ordinances both included the same footnote requiring that buildings exceeding 48 feet in height or containing a fourth floor receive final approval from the City Council. This footnote was added to ensure that the additional building height would meaningfully contribute to the character of Ketchum's built environment or meet key community objectives like the provision of community housing units. Ordinance No. 1202 adopted in 2019 increased the allowable building height permitted for community housing projects to a maximum of 52 feet.

#### FINDINGS REGARDING ZONING & DIMENSIONAL STANDARDS: BUILDING HEIGHT/4TH FLOOR

The upper levels of the Bluebird Village project will include 51 deed-restricted community housing units as well as amenities for the residents, including a rooftop deck, fitness center, and community room. Multi-family dwelling units are permitted within the Retail Core above the ground floor (KMC §17.12.020: Footnote 26). Developments in the CC-1 Zone that deed restrict all residential units above the first floor as community housing are qualified as 100% community housing projects (KMC §17.12.040: Footnote 1).

Community Core Dimensional Standards (Ketchum Municipal Code §17.12.040)
The project plans for the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project are included in the October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021 Staff Report as Attachment A. Sheet A2.04 of the project plans shows the maximum heights of the two buildings.

The maximum permitted building height for community housing projects in the Community Core is 52 feet (KMC §17.12.040). The Bluebird Village project contains a fourth floor and both buildings within the development exceed 48 feet in height—Building A is 50'-10' and Building B is 48'-3".

#### FINDINGS REGARDING PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION'S DESIGN REVIEW APPROVAL

The zoning code allows community housing projects to exceed the maximum floor area and height permitted for market-rate projects. These development incentives were incorporated into zoning code to promote the development of community housing projects within downtown Ketchum. These increases in building size and mass are permitted at the Commission's discretion through Design Review.

The Commission found that the project's design and architectural features visually reduce the appearance of building bulk and mass to complement the scale and character of the surrounding built environment. The design utilizes both vertical wall and horizontal floor setbacks that move the building mass in and out from the property lines. Exterior materials change simultaneously with these setbacks to visually break up the building into distinct one-, two-, and three-story masses with visually distinguished façade designs. Upper-level balconies are placed at the corners to reduce the development's rectangular bulk and soften its transition to neighboring buildings. Unlike existing downtown developments that cover the length of an entire Ketchum Townsite block, Bluebird incorporates an elevated walkway over the alley connecting the two main buildings. This approach accommodates space for light and air to move through building mass enhancing the development's transparency and creating a unique urban spatial experience that will visually engage pedestrians and activate the streetscape.

The City Council expressed appreciation for the Planning & Zoning Commission's review of the project commenting that their iterative process resulted in design modifications that improved the Bluebird development.

## FINDINGS REGARDING SUSTAINABILITY IMPACT

Integrating affordable housing within the downtown commercial core in walking distance to jobs, stores, restaurants, and entertainment activities should decrease daily trips in and out of town currently made by commuters who work downtown but can't afford to live in Ketchum. Residential density within downtown near public transit services promotes walkable environments where people

can connect to nearby neighborhoods by walking, biking, or commuting on the bus. Infill and redevelopment projects downtown decrease the need for costly infrastructure improvements, including new utility and transportation services. The Bluebird Village Community Housing Project incorporates sustainable building systems, including a roof-mounted solar panel system that will provide electricity for the development's common areas and heated sidewalks.

#### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1. The City of Ketchum is a municipal corporation established in accordance with Article XII of the Constitution of the State of Idaho and Title 50 Idaho Code and is required and has exercised its authority pursuant to the Local Land Use Planning Act codified at Chapter 65 of Title 67 Idaho Code and pursuant to Chapters 3, 9 and 13 of Title 50 Idaho Code to enact the ordinances and regulations, which ordinances are codified in the Ketchum Municipal Code ("KMC") and are identified in the Findings of Fact and which are herein restated as Conclusions of Law by this reference and which City Ordinances govern the applicant's land use application for the development and use of the project site.
- 2. The Ketchum City Council has authority to review and approve all buildings greater than 48 feet or that contain a fourth floor pursuant to footnote 2 of Ketchum Municipal Code §17.12.040.
- 3. The City of Ketchum Planning Department provided notice for the review of this application in accordance with Ketchum Municipal Code §17.96.080.
- 4. The Bluebird Village Community Housing Project meets all applicable standards specified in Title 17 of Ketchum Municipal Code and complies with the community's vision and values identified in the 2014 Comprehensive Plan.

## **DECISION**

**THEREFORE,** the Ketchum City Council **affirms** the Planning & Zoning Commission's approval of the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project design and **approves** the development's building height and fourth floor this Monday, October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021.

Findings of Fact **adopted** this 18<sup>th</sup> day of October 2021.

Neil Bradshaw Mayor City of Ketchum