



City of Ketchum
Planning & Building

IN RE:)
)
180 N Leadville Relocation) **KETCHUM HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**
Request to Demolish a Historic Structure) **FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, AND**
) **DECISION**
)
Date: November 7, 2023)
)
File Numbers: H23-084)

PROJECT: 180 N Leadville Relocation Request
 FILE NUMBER: H23-084
 APPLICATION TYPE: Request to Demolish a Historic Structure
 REPRESENTATIVE: Lucas Winter
 PROPERTY OWNER: 180 Leadville LLC (Bob Reniers)
 REQUEST: Proposal to relocate existing residence out of Ketchum city limits to a location undetermined
 LOCATION: 180 N Leadville Avenue (Ketchum Townsite: Lot 4 Blk 22)
 ZONING: Mixed-Use Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-2)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

The Historic Preservation Commission held a public hearing and considered the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure for the proposed relocation of the Price/Fairman residence located at 180 N Leadville Avenue during their meeting on October 17th, 2023. After considering the project plans, staff’s analysis, and the applicant’s presentation, and holding the required public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission denied the request with a vote of 3-1.

Public Hearing Notice

The public hearing notice was published in the Idaho Mountain Express on September 27th, 2023. A public hearing notice was mailed to adjacent properties within 300 feet of the project site on September 27th, 2023. A public hearing notice was posted on the project site and the City’s website on September 27th, 2023.

BACKGROUND

The applicant, 180 N Leadville LLC, has submitted a request to relocate a historic structure located at 180 N Leadville Ave (Ketchum Townsite Lot 4 Blk 22) within the Mixed Use Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-2) Zone. The building was historically a single-family residence occupied by Alonzo Price & Esther Fairman, longtime Ketchum residents in the 20th Century. The request proposes to relocate the residence to a different location within Blaine County.

The Alonzo Price/Esther Fairman Residence is a 1.5 story private residence with a detached single car garage constructed in 1929 by Alonzo Price and his family. Price was the resident agent of the Philadelphia Smelter and Idaho Mining & Smelting Company in the early 1900s and owned ranch property along Warm Springs Creek. Price sold this ranch property in 1947 to a group of investors, including Owen Simpson, who then developed the area into Warm Springs Ranch, a tourist destination and resort. Esther Fairman was one of three children of Alonzo Price and lived in the residence until 1998. Fairman was involved in many activities throughout the Wood River Valley including the founding of the Presbyterian Church of the Big Wood (across from YMCA), legal secretary for George Kneeland, and 76-year member of Snowdrop Rebekah Lodge. Rebekah Lodges were, and continue to be, locations for the International Association of Rebekah Assemblies (IARA). This organization was created in 1851 for women to practice humanitarianism particularly in assisting orphans & the elderly.

The residence remains in the same location as it was built and is an example of settlement era architecture of the 1920's. As stated in the 2005 Walsworth study, "The exterior walls of both buildings are clad in clapboard siding and the front-gable roof is covered with metal sheeting and has overhanging rafters and eaves. Architectural elements such as windows and doors are historically correct, and intact landscaping features reflect the 1920's settlement period." The residence was put on the historic building/site list by the HPC as the building met most, if not all, integrity criteria and met Architectural criteria 3.a.1 and Social/Historic criteria 3.b.4 sections of the historic building/site standards. These criteria state:

"Exemplifies specific elements of a recognized architectural style or period or a style particularly associated with Ketchum neighborhoods" (Architectural criteria 3.a.1)

"Is valued by the Ketchum community as an established or familiar visual or cultural feature due to its architectural history, siting, massing, scale, cultural characteristics, or heritage such that its removal would be irreparable loss to the setting" (Social/Historic criteria 3.b.4)

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Historic Preservation Commission having reviewed the project record, provided notice, and conducted the required public hearing does hereby find that the project does not conform to applicable standards and criteria as set forth in Chapter 17.20 – Historic Preservation. The commission discussed the project's conformance with the alteration/demolition criteria and whether the proposed relocation met standards. The Commission found the relocation to not be in conformance with the alteration/demolition criteria. Therefore, the Commission does hereby make and set forth these Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision as follows:

Findings Regarding Review Criteria for Requests to Alter or Demolish a Historic Structure

17.20.030.C.1 - Is the structure of historic or architectural value or significance and does it contribute to the historic significance of the property within the Community Core?

The Price/Fairman residence is one of the 24 structures on the Historic Building List adopted by the HPC on October 19, 2021. The 2005 Walsworth Associates Windshield Survey identified the residence as a historic building due to its themes of settlement architecture and the association with the Price family who came to Ketchum in 1885 as one of the first homesteaders. The existing residence was built in 1929 for the purpose of the Price family relocating from the Philadelphia Smelter and is an example of settlement era architecture in Ketchum.

The structure is of historic value as it was the home of Alonzo Price and Esther Fairman who are historic citizens of Ketchum, particularly with Alonzo's involvement with the Philadelphia Smelter. The residence also reflects a time period in which residential buildings were located closely to the downtown. The residence remains in its original location and has not experienced alterations, allowing for the structure to be a quality example of what development in the immediate area looked like in the 1920's & 1930's.

The architectural significance of the residence rests in the fact that it is one of the few remaining structures representing the time period in which it was built and is an example of settlement era residential architecture. While there are other settlement era residential structures within the Community Core, the subject structure differs as it has not experienced alterations/additions and remains in good quality, providing a good example of this Ketchum settlement vernacular.

The Commission finds that due to the residence's association with the Price family and its representation of the residential neighborhood which used to be in the immediate area that the structure is of historic significance and contributes to the historic significance of the property within the Community Core. The structure being one of the few remaining structures representing the time period which it was built as well as a good example of settlement era residential architecture.

17.20.030.C.2 - Would the loss, alteration of, or addition to, the structure adversely affect the historic integrity of the structure, impact the significance of the structure within the Community Core, impact the architectural or aesthetic relationship to adjacent properties, or conflict with the Comprehensive Plan?

Historic integrity measures how effectively a building's materials, design, feeling, location, association, workmanship, and setting convey the property's historic significance. The historic significance of the structure comes from the Price family residing in the structure for many decades as well as being one of the few examples of settlement era architecture. The Price/Fairman residence has not been heavily altered since its original construction in 1929 as staff has only found evidence of reroofs and interior work done to the structure. Due to the residence remaining in its original location and not experiencing any alterations to reflect its exterior appearance, the structure is found to retain its integrity. A relocation of the structure would impact the integrity of the structure as it would no longer be in its original location and not be able to effectively display the residential neighborhood which was present in the 1920's & 1930's. The relocation would also remove the built environment connection which ties the Price family to subject property.

The proposed relocation of the structure would impact the significance of the structure within the Community Core. The residence remains in its original location and represents a time period in the 1920's & 1930's when settlement residences were located close to Ketchum's downtown. The residence is one of the few remaining structures representing this architectural time period. The removal of the residence from the subject property would also impact the architectural and aesthetic relationship to adjacent properties as the small scale is one that is not found in modern development styles.

The commission finds that the project conflicts with the Comprehensive Plan, particularly Policy CD-1.2. This policy, titled *Preservation of Historic Buildings and Sites*, states "Individual buildings and sites of historical, architectural, archaeological, or cultural significance should be identified and considered for protection. The City should encourage the private sector to preserve and rehabilitate buildings and sites through local landmark designation, public improvements, guidelines, and other tools." The relocation of the residence outside of Ketchum City limits would remove the Commission's ability to preserve the structure and review any potential alterations or additions.

17.20.030.C.3 - Does the structure retain the requisite integrity to convey its historic and/or architectural significance?

The Price/Fairman residence retains its historic integrity as the building is located in its original location, still remains in good condition, and has not experienced any exterior alterations. The historic significance of being the residence for the Price family has not changed and the building still conveys that significance through being in its original location. The architectural significance of being a quality example of settlement era architecture still remains as the building has not received any alteration/additions and remains in good condition.

17.20.030.C.4 - Does the proposed demolition or alteration adversely affect the historic significance or architectural distinction of the structure or the Community Core?

The Commission finds the proposed relocation would adversely affect the historic significance and architectural distinction of the structure, particularly within the Community Core. The relocation would result in the termination of connecting Alonzo Price and Esther Fairman to the built environment in Ketchum as well as removing a building which represents an era when settlement residences were adjacent to the downtown. The proposal would also mean losing a residence with settlement era architecture not commonly seen on the historic building/site list.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The City of Ketchum is a municipal corporation established in accordance with Article XII of the Constitution of the State of Idaho and Title 50 Idaho Code and has exercised its authority pursuant to Chapter 46 of Title 67 of Idaho Code to enact the ordinances and regulations, which ordinances are codified in the Ketchum Municipal Code (“KMC”) and are identified in the Findings of Fact and which are herein restated as Conclusions of Law by this reference and which City Ordinances govern the applicant’s Request to Demolish a Historic Structure application for the use of the project site.
2. The Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to hear the applicant’s Request to Demolish a Historic Structure application pursuant to KMC 17.20.010.B. HPC review is required for all requests for partial or total demolitions, exterior alterations, and additions to all structures on the Historic Building List. A relocation constitutes a substantial exterior alteration.
3. The City of Ketchum Planning Department provided notice for the review of this application in accordance with Section 17.20.030.B and Ketchum Municipal Code § 17.96.080.
4. This Request to Demolish a Historic Structure application is governed under the regulations and review criteria specified in Ketchum Municipal Code 17.20.030.C.

DECISION

THEREFORE, for the reasons stated in the Findings of Fact above as applied to the relevant standards, the Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission **denies** the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure (Application File No. H23-084) at 180 N Leadville Avenue.

Administrative Appeal Notice: Applicant has the opportunity, pursuant to Ketchum City Code 17.20.030(F) and 17.144, to administratively appeal this Decision to the City Council.

Regulatory Taking Analysis Notice: Applicant has the opportunity, pursuant to Idaho Code 67-8003, to submit a written request for a regulatory taking analysis of this Decision.

Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision adopted this 7th day of November 2023.

Spencer Cordovano
City of Ketchum
Historic Preservation Commission