



M E M O R A N D U M

To: Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission
From: Logan Simpson
Date: May 27, 2021
Project Name: Ketchum Historic Preservation Phase 2 – Design Guidelines, Permanent Ordinance, and Historic Preservation Handbook
Subject: Materials for 6/1 HPC Meeting

Overview

During the last Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) Meeting on May 18th, the commissioners were tasked with reviewing the list of 26 buildings currently listed on the “Community Core District Study” and begin to identify possible additional criteria or modifications to existing criteria for designation as a Ketchum Heritage Site. The Logan Simpson team (LS) was tasked with bringing examples of designation criteria and, if possible, examples of a number/percentage of changes that can be made but still retain integrity from other communities to review and discuss with the commission as working session during the next meeting.

Listed below are the existing criteria to be listed as a Ketchum Heritage Site, and a summary of the first round of recommended modifications to those criteria from the May 18th meeting. The purpose of the meeting on 6/1 is to identify additional modifications or additions to the existing criteria for designating a Ketchum Heritage Site based off the examples provided by LS and the commissioners’ review of the 26 buildings from the “Community Core District Study”.

Existing Criteria to be listed as a Ketchum Heritage Site

1. “Representative of traditional Ketchum residential and/or commercial architecture, scale proportion and site orientation including but not limited to, being built before 1956 (significant periods include 1880s, 1920s, 1930s), gabled roofs, overhanging eaves, log or brick construction, one to two story, chalet style.”
2. “Representative of Ketchum’s community traditions and/or heritage, including but not limited to, mining, railroad, ranching, timber, farming, sheep herding or skiing.”
3. “Associated with significant events and/or people of the past, including but not limited to, being a residence or business of an early Ketchum family or resident (1880’s to 1940’s).”
4. “Listed on or eligible for the National or State Register of Historic Places.”

Summarized Recommendations for Revised Criteria to be listed as a Ketchum Heritage Site (From HPC Meeting 5/18/21)

- 1) Add to bullet two: reference to other ethnicities and heritage
 - a) Can use Walsworth survey for additional ethnicity language
- 2) Add integrity requirement
 - a) Ketchum Criteria for Integrity - meet 4/7 from NRHP
 - i) **Location** is really important criteria
 - (1) Generally if property is moved - not eligible for register
 - ii) **Materials** - want majority of historic materials and replacements and repairs to be same as historic materials
 - iii) **Design** – must remain the same as original intent
 - iv) **Association** – The use of the building should be similar or the same if possible
- 3) Include archeological resources criteria
 - a) Idaho does not have environmental protections requiring below-surface review
 - i) This would need to be a new procedure for requiring review once the surface is disturbed.
- 4) Add criterion regarding - Ernest Hemmingway, Dave Ketchum, April Herrimann, and other important Ketchum figures.

Community Examples of Designation Criteria

See attached for the following community examples:

- Boise, ID
- Lafayette, CO
- Salida, CO
- Taos, NM
- Tuscon, AZ

Proposed Meeting Agenda:

1. Brief review of each eligibility criteria examples
2. What do you like from these examples?
3. What doesn't apply to Ketchum?
4. Which eligibility criteria would you want included in the ordinance?
5. What's missing from these comparative examples?

- (1) Provide funds from current revenues;
- (2) Receive and expend monies from any other available source or sources, or
- (3) Use any combination of the foregoing.

Sample #1:
Boise, ID

B. Funds received for a Historic Preservation Commission may be accumulated from year to year and need not be expended during any one fiscal year, except that unexpended monies appropriated by the Council shall be deemed surplus to be budgeted and appropriated for the subsequent year as provided by law.

6. Designation Of Historical Districts, Including Historical Districts - Residential: Historic Districts shall be designated by ordinance and in accordance with the following requirements:

A. Criteria For Designation: The buildings, sites, structures and objects of an historic district shall meet one of the following 3 criteria:

(1) Historical Or Cultural Importance:

(a) Has significant character, interest or value, as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the city, state or nation; or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past; or

(b) Is the site of an historic event with a significant effect upon society; or

(c) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, educational or historic heritage of the community; or

(d) By being part of or related to a street, square, park or other distinctive area, should be developed or preserved according to a plan based on historic, cultural or architectural motif; or

(e) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or city; or

(2) Architectural Importance:

(a) Portrays the environment in an era of history characterized by a distinctive architectural style; or

(b) Embodies those distinguishing characteristics of an architectural-type or engineering specimen; or

(c) Is the work of a designer, architect or craftsman whose individual work has significantly influenced the development of the city, state or nation; or

(d) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or

(3) Archeological Importance:

(a) Has yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in pre- history or history.

(b) Contains or is likely to contain physical remains, such as fossils, relics, monuments, art or symbols, of past human life and activities.

B. Commission Research And Report On Proposed District: The Commission, either on its own initiative or upon the request of the City Council, or upon the request of one or more owners of property in the area of a proposed historic district, may recommend the designation of one or more historic districts. Prior to recommending designation the Commission shall conduct studies, research and investigations based on the relevant criteria given in Section 11-05-09.6.A regarding buildings, sites, structures and objects of such proposed historic district or districts. Thereafter, the Commission shall prepare a report containing recommendations concerning the area or areas to be included in the proposed historic district or districts.

C. Transmittal Of Report To Planning And Zoning Commission: Copies of the report shall be transmitted for review and recommendation to the Planning and Zoning Commission. Not less than 60 days after the date of transmittal of such report to the Planning and Zoning Commission, the Historic Preservation Commission shall hold a public hearing regarding the proposed district.

D. Notice Requirements For Historic Preservation Commission Public Hearing:

City of Lafayette
Ordinance No. 37, Series 1999
Page 13

landmark or any structure in a designated historic district by, without limitation, issuing certificates of recognition and authorizing plaques to be affixed to the exteriors of such structures.

Sec. 47-17. Criteria for designation.

The board and city council shall consider the following criteria in reviewing nominations of properties for designation:

- (a) *Historic landmarks.* Historic landmarks must be at least fifty (50) years old and meet one or more of the criteria for architectural, social/historic or geographic/environmental significance as described below. An historic landmark may be exempt from the age standard if it is found to be exceptionally important in other significant criteria.
- (1) Historic sites shall meet one or more of the following criteria:
 - (i) *Architectural criteria.*
 - (aa) Exemplifies specific elements of an architectural style or period;
 - (bb) Example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, state-wide, regionally, or locally;
 - (cc) Demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value;
 - (dd) Represents an innovation in construction, materials or design;
 - (ee) Style particularly associated with Lafayette or one of its neighborhoods;
 - (ff) Represents a built environment of a group of people in an era of history;
 - (gg) Pattern or grouping of elements representing at least one of the above criteria; or

- (hh) Significant historic remodel.
- (ii) *Social/historic criteria.*
 - (aa) Site of historic event that had an effect upon society;
 - (bb) Exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community; or
 - (cc) Association with a notable person or the work of a notable person.
- (iii) *Geographic/environmental criteria.*
 - (aa) Enhances sense of identity of the community; or
 - (bb) An established and familiar natural setting or visual feature of the community.
- (2) Archaeological sites (historic and prehistoric) shall meet one or more of the following criteria:
 - (i) *Architectural criteria.*
 - (aa) Exhibits distinctive characteristics of a type, period or manner of construction; or
 - (bb) A unique example of structure.
 - (ii) *Social/historic criteria.*
 - (aa) Demonstrable potential to make an important contribution to the knowledge of the area's history or prehistory;
 - (bb) An association with an important event in the area's development;
 - (cc) An association with a notable person(s) or the work of notable person(s);
 - (dd) A typical example/association with a particular ethnic group; or

- (ee) A unique example of an event in Lafayette's history.
 - (iii) *Geographic/environmental criterion:* geographically or regionally important.
- (3) All sites will be evaluated for their physical integrity using the following criteria, but a site need not meet all of the following criteria:
- (i) Shows character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the community, region, state or nation;
 - (ii) Retains original design features, materials and/or character;
 - (iii) Original location or same historic context after having been moved; and
 - (iv) Has been accurately reconstructed or restored based on documentation.
- (b) *Historic districts.*
- (1) Historic significance is determined by applying criteria to the pattern(s) and unifying element(s) found within a district. Nominations will not be considered unless the application contains written approval of fifty-one percent (51%) of the owners within the district boundaries. Noncontributing structures may be included within the boundaries, as long as the noncontributing structures do not noticeably detract from the district's sense of time, place and historical development. Noncontributing structures will be evaluated for their magnitude of impact by considering their size, scale, design, location, and/or information potential.
 - (2) District boundaries will be defined by visual changes, historic documentation of different associations or patterns of development, or evidence of changes in site type or site density as established through testing or survey.
 - (3) In addition to meeting at least one of the criteria outlined below, the historic district must contain structures that are at least fifty

(50) years old. The district could be exempt from this age standard if the resources are found to be exceptionally important in other significant criteria.

(4) Historic districts shall meet one or more of the following criteria:

(i) *Architectural criteria.*

(aa) Exemplifies specific elements of an architectural period or style;

(bb) Example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, state-wide, regionally or locally;

(cc) Demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value;

(dd) Represents an innovation in construction, materials, or design;

(ee) Style particularly associated with the Lafayette area;

(ff) Represents a built environment of a group of people in an era of history;

(gg) Pattern or grouping of elements representing at least one of the above criteria; or

(hh) Significant historic remodel.

(ii) *Social/historic criteria.*

(aa) The site of an historic event that had an effect upon society;

(bb) Exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community; or

(cc) An association with a notable person(s) or the work of notable person(s).

- (iii) *Geographic/environmental criteria.*
 - (aa) Enhances sense of identity of the community; or
 - (bb) An established and familiar mutual setting or visual feature of the community.

- (iv) *Archaeologic/subsurface criteria.*
 - (aa) Demonstrable potential to make an important contribution to the area's history or prehistory;
 - (bb) An association with an important event in the area's development;
 - (cc) An association with a notable person(s) or the work of notable person(s);
 - (dd) Distinctive characteristics of a type, period or manner of construction;
 - (ee) Geographic importance;
 - (ff) A typical example or association with particular ethnic group;
 - (gg) A typical example or association with a local cultural or economic activity; or
 - (hh) A unique example of an event or structure.

Sec. 47-18. Criteria for certificate of appropriateness - new construction or alterations.

(a) The board shall issue a certificate of appropriateness for any proposed new construction or alteration on a designated historic landmark site or within a historic district only if the board can determine that the proposed work would not detrimentally alter, destroy or adversely affect any architectural or landscape feature that contributes to its original historic designation. The board must find that the proposed work is visually compatible with designated historic structures located on the property in terms of design, finish, material, scale, mass and height. When the subject site is an historic district, the board must also find

b. Copies. The final approved ordinance shall be maintained in the office of the City Clerk.

(b) Application Contents. An application for designation of an historic district or landmark shall contain the following information.

(1) General Development Application.

(2) Geographic Boundaries.

a. Map. An adequate description of the geographical boundaries of the proposed district or landmark and a map accurately defining the boundaries of the proposed district or landmark.

b. Name. A proposed name for the proposed historic district or landmark. (Ord. 03, 2002 §9-20-3; Ord. 01, 2005 §1; Ord. 2005-07 §1)

Sec. 16-12-50. Historic district and landmark designation review standards.

In determining whether a historic district or landmark shall be established, one (1) or more of the following criteria shall be satisfied:

(1) Historic District.

a. Whether the proposed district contains and is defined by a certain style of buildings, sites, structures and/or appearance associated with a significant period, person, event or architectural style in the City's past.

b. Whether the buildings, sites, structures and/or appearance of the proposed district possess historical and/or architectural significance which identifies or differentiates the district from surrounding areas, and/or whether allowing variations or changes thereto would harm the unique historic character or value of the buildings, sites and structures within the district.

c. At least fifty-one percent (51%) of the property owners in the desired district must not object to the designation. A survey of support for the creation of the district must be solicited via certified mail, with each property owner in the proposed district permitted one (1) response. A lack of response will not be considered either an affirmation of support or a negative response to the creation of the district. Certified mailings must be sent at least thirty (30) days prior to action by the HPC, with responses due at least fifteen (15) days prior to action by the HPC.

(2) Landmark.

a. Exemplary property. The subject property exemplifies or reflects the City's cultural, social, economic, political, engineering or architectural history.

b. Historic significance. The subject property is identified with a historically important person or persons, or with an important event in the history of the City, region, State or Nation.

c. Architectural significance. The subject property embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, type or specimen valuable for the study of a period, type or method of construction, or the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

d. Noted designer. The subject property is representative of the work of a notable or master architect, builder, engineer or designer whose work influenced architecture, building, design or development in the City, region, State or Nation.

e. Archeological importance. The subject property contains or reflects significant archeological importance.

f. Contributing building or structure. The subject property has been listed as a contributing building or structure within a historic district or nominated for inclusion and/or listed on the National Register of Historic Places or the State Inventory of Historic Places. (Ord. 03, 2002 §9-20-4; Ord. 01, 2005 §1; Ord. 2005-07 §1)

Sec. 16-12-60. Activities subject to review and certificate of approval with regard to landmarks or within historic districts.

Unless otherwise specifically provided for in this Article, no person may or shall engage in, or allow or direct others to engage in, any of the following activities within a historic district or on a landmarked building structure or site without first applying for and obtaining a certificate of approval as outlined in Section 16-12-80 below.

(1) The construction, erection, demolition, moving, exterior alteration or relocation of or exterior addition to any building or structure.

(2) The exterior renovation, rehabilitation, reconstruction, repair or remodeling of any building or structure, excepting ordinary maintenance and/or repair.

(3) The removal, modification, reconstruction, covering up or destruction of an exterior architectural feature.

(4) The cleaning of an exterior surface of a contributing or landmark building or structure by sandblasting, high-pressure spraying or other chemical or mechanical means which could cause physical damage to the building or structure.

(5) The construction of public or private improvements upon public property by any person or unit of government which alters the layout, design or character of a street, alley, sidewalk, pedestrian way, right-of-way, utility installation, street light, wall or fence.

(6) The application of any sealant, paint, stucco, texture or other material that would conceal, alter or damage the exterior of any contributing or landmark building with an existing unfinished or unpainted brick, masonry or other unfinished siding or structural element. (Ord. 03, 2002 §9-20-8; Ord. 01, 2005 §1; Ord. 2005-07 §1)

Sec. 16-12-70. Demolition or relocation of buildings, structures or sites.

Consistent with the purposes of this Article, it is the intent of this Section to preserve the historic districts and historical and architectural resources of the City through limitations on the

16.16.210.4: APPLICATION PROCEDURE:

The application procedure shall follow section 16.12.040.5 of this title. (Ord. 99-05, 1999)

16.16.220: HOZ HISTORIC OVERLAY ZONE:**16.16.220.1: INTENT AND PURPOSE:**

The Town intends to protect, preserve, and perpetuate areas of historical, cultural, architectural, artistic or geographical significance located within the Town of Taos. The Town finds it desirable to protect and enhance the Town's economic base by attracting tourists, visitors and residents; to stabilize and improve property values; to foster civic pride by protecting the Town's unique cultural heritage by prohibiting the unnecessary destruction and defacement of its cultural assets; to preserve historic architectural design and integrity; and to ensure the harmonious, architecturally sympathetic, orderly and efficient growth and development of the Town. (Ord. 99-05, 1999)

16.16.220.2: HISTORIC OVERLAY ZONE, HISTORIC DISTRICTS, CONTRIBUTING PROPERTIES:

The Historic Overlay Zone boundaries are shown on the most recent Town of Taos zoning map. The Town of Taos Historic Overlay Zone contains two (2) historic districts, the La Loma Plaza Historic District and the Taos Downtown Historic District, registered as such with the State of New Mexico Office of Cultural Affairs, Historic Preservation Division on April 15, 1982. Contributing properties are identified by the 1981 New Mexico Historic Building Inventory conducted by Garner Hicks Architects and the 1996 New Mexico Building Inventory - Taos Resurvey conducted by Vicente Martinez. The Town may, from time to time, conduct an inventory of potentially contributing properties to determine if the property meets the criteria for designation as a contributing property. The Historic Preservation Commission must receive written consent from the property owner prior to designating the property as a contributing property. In addition, a contributing property must meet at least one (1) of the following criteria as determined by the Historic Preservation Commission:

- A. Be associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of national, State or Taos history;
- B. Possess architectural significance;
- C. Embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction;
- D. Have yielded, or be likely to yield, scientific information that creates a better understanding of Taos' diverse cultures, prehistory or history;
- E. Be valued by the local Taos community as an established or familiar visual or cultural feature due to its architectural history, siting, cultural characteristics or heritage; or
- F. Be suitable for preservation. (Ord. 17-07, 2017)

16.16.220.3: APPLICABILITY OF OTHER HISTORIC STANDARDS:

The Code Administrator and Historic Preservation Commission may use the most recent guidelines and publications of the New Mexico State Historic Preservation Office or the National Register of the U.S. Department of the Interior in their decision making processes, so long as such guidelines and publications do not conflict with the provisions of this section 16.16.220. (Ord. 10-07, 2010)

16.16.220.4: PROCEDURE FOR DESIGNATING A HISTORIC OVERLAY ZONE:

Whenever, in the opinion of the Historic Preservation Commission, an area meets the criteria for Historic Overlay Zone designation, the Historic Preservation Commission or property owner may initiate the procedure for designating such area as a Historic Overlay Zone, as follows:

A. Notice: The Historic Preservation Commission shall contact the property owner(s) within the area of the proposed Historic Overlay Zone in order to inform them of the time, date and place of the Historic Overlay Zone public hearing. Notice of the public hearing shall be given as follows:

1. Written notice of the time, date, place and subject of the public hearing shall be sent by registered or certified mail not less than thirty (30) days nor more than forty five (45) days prior to the hearing to all property owners of record who own property in the proposed Historic Overlay Zone.
2. Signs indicating the proposed action and time, date and place of the public hearing, shall be posted by the Historic Preservation Commission for a period of not less than fifteen (15) days immediately preceding the public hearing on the boundaries of all areas proposed for Historic Overlay Zone designation.
3. A legal notice indicating the nature of the public hearing, the area involved, and the time, date and place of the hearing, shall be published once in a newspaper of general circulation in the town, at least fifteen (15) days prior to the public hearing.

B. Moratorium On Building Permits And Use Changes: Upon notification of the proposed rezoning to the property owners within a proposed historic overlay zone, no building permits will be issued nor will any use changes be granted until the town council approves or rejects the historic overlay zone designation proposal.

C. Hearing: A quorum of the historic preservation commission shall conduct the hearing. All interested parties shall be given a reasonable opportunity to express their opinions regarding the proposed designation(s). The historic preservation commission may establish reasonable limits on the length of individual presentations. A record of the hearing shall be made. The historic preservation commission's records shall include the name and address of each speaker; the organization or person represented, if any; whether or not the speaker is an owner or holder of some other interest in the affected property, or represents such owners or holder; and a summary of the relevant portions of each statement.

D. Historic Preservation Commission's Recommendations: Within forty five (45) days after the public hearing, the historic preservation commission shall act upon the proposed designation. The historic preservation commission may approve, reject or modify any proposal without instituting a new designation procedure. If the historic preservation commission fails to act within sixty (60) days, the designation shall be deemed to have been rejected.

4. Mayor and Council Decision

WHERE TO APPLY: Historic Preservation Office/Rezoning, City of Tucson Planning & Development Services, 201 N. Stone, 3rd Floor, Tucson, AZ 85701.

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS FOR HL NOMINATION PROPOSAL: Refer to Submittal Checklist. Complete application form and supplemental materials are required. Digital files and one hard copy of the nomination package are required.

THE FOLLOWING DEFINITIONS AND STANDARDS ARE CONSIDERED WHEN REVIEWING A CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK NOMINATION APPLICATION:

Historic Landmark (UDC Article 11.4.9, Definitions) - A historic site or structure of the highest historic, cultural, architectural, or archaeological importance to Tucson that if demolished or significantly altered would constitute an irreplaceable loss to the quality and character of Tucson. A Historic Landmark is an outstanding or unique example of architectural style; is associated with a major historic event, activity, or person; or has unique visual quality and identification. A Historic Landmark may be located within the boundaries of or outside a historic district.

Historic Site or Historic Structure (UDC Article 11.4.9, Definitions) - A building, structure, object, or site, including vegetation or signs located on the premises, that:

- Dates from a particular significant period in Tucson's history, i.e., prehistoric, native indigenous, Pre-Colonial (before 1775), Spanish Frontier (Colonial) (1775-1821), Mexican Frontier (1821-1853), Territorial (1854-1912), Post-Territorial (1912-1920), or Post-World War I Development (1920-1945), or relates to events, personages, or architectural styles that are at least 50 years old; however, outstanding examples less than 50 years old should be evaluated on their own merits; and
- Is associated with the lives of outstanding historic personages; or
- Is associated with significant historic events or occurrences; or
- Exemplifies the architectural period in which it was built and has distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or method of construction or is the notable work of a master builder, designer, or architect whose individual genius influenced his/her age; or
- Contributes information of archaeological, historic, cultural, or social importance relating to the heritage of the community; or
- Relates positively to buildings in its immediate vicinity in terms of scale, size, massing, etc., such that its removal would be an irreparable loss to the setting.

Standards for Establishing and Amending HLs (UDC Article 5.8.5.A):

1. A HL shall include historic sites, historic buildings, or historic structures, as defined in Section 11.4.9, Definitions, and which are individually listed or individually eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places at the local, state, or national level of significance.
2. A HL should include a group of related sites, buildings, and structures in their original setting that contribute to an understanding of the heritage of the community.

APPLICATION CLARITY AND COMPLETENESS: HPO staff will not forward an application for review to the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee unless it is complete. If staff feels there is insufficient information to inform a recommendation, additional materials may be requested.

REV. 7/18

Planning & Development Services Department (PDS) - 201 N. Stone Avenue
P.O. Box 27210 - Tucson, AZ 85726-7210 | Telephone: (520) 791-5550 - Fax: (520) 791-5852

Website: www.tucsonaz.gov/pds

EMAIL: DSD_ZONING_ADMINISTRATION@TUCSONAZ.GOV