

City of Ketchum

July 7,2021

Historic Preservation Commissioners City of Ketchum Ketchum, Idaho

Recommendation To Review and Adopt Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures and Review Historic Building List

Recommendation and Summary

Staff is recommending the Commission review and adopt the Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures and adopt the following motion:

I move to adopt the Ketchum Criteria for designating historic structures.

Introduction and History

At the June 15, 2021, meeting, the Commission reviewed and provided direction on criteria to be used for designating structures that will be placed on the Historic Building List. These criteria will be used to evaluate the 26 buildings currently on the Historic Building List.

Attachment A is the proposed criteria based on Commission review and comments at the last meeting.

Analysis

Staff is requesting Commission review and adoption of the proposed criteria. Once the criteria are established, staff is recommending the Commission use the criteria to evaluate the 26 building currently on the Historic Building List.

To assist the Commission evaluation of the 26 buildings and any other building that may be considered for the list, staff has prepared an evaluation matrix (Attachment B).

Attachments:

A: Proposed Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures

B: Evaluation matrix

Designation criteria for placing structures and sites on the Historic Building/Site List. Buildings or sites shall meet Criteria 1 and 2 and shall meet one or more of the Criteria listed in 3.

The following Criteria shall be used to determine if a structure or site shall be placed on the Historic Building/Site List:

- 1. Historic buildings must be at least fifty (50) years old. A historic building may be exempt from the age standard if it is found to be exceptionally important in other significant criteria.
- 2. All buildings and sites must retain their physical integrity as determined by the following criteria. However, a site need not meet all of the following criteria:
 - A. Shows character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of Ketchum, the region, state, or nation;
 - B. Retains a significant amount of the original design features, materials, character or feeling of the past;
 - C. Is in the original location or same historic context after having been moved;
 - D. Has been accurately reconstructed or restored based on documentation.
- 3. Historic buildings or sites shall meet one or more of the following criteria:

A. Architectural criteria.

- (1) Exemplifies specific elements of a recognized architectural style or period or a style particularly associated with Ketchum neighborhoods;
- (2) Example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, state-wide, regionally, or locally;
- (3) Demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value;
- (4) Represents an innovation in construction, materials or design;
- (5) Pattern or grouping of elements that enhance the identity of the community;
- (6) Significant historic remodel contributing to Ketchum's identity.

B. Social/historic criteria.

- (1) Site of historic event;
- (2) Exemplifies cultural, political, ethnic, economic, or social heritage of the community through the built environment or with people associated with an era of history;
- (3) Associated with a notable person or the work of a notable person;
- (4) Is valued by the Ketchum community as an established or familiar visual or cultural feature due to its architectural history, siting, massing, scale, cultural characteristics, or heritage such that its removal would be irreparable loss to the setting.

C. Geographic/Natural Features.

- (1) Enhances sense of identity of the community;
- (2) Is an established and familiar natural setting or visual feature of the community.

Historic Preservation Designation Criteria - Ranking Matrix

Purpose:

This ranking matrix has been prepared for the Historic Preservation Commission as a tool to assist in determining whether a proposed building qualifies to be placed on the City of Ketchum Historic Building List. A specific ranking or certain total of points does not dictate placement on the list.

Elligibility:

For a building to be placed on the Historic Building List, it must qualify for all three primary criteria.

Criteria 1 - Historic Building

Criteria 2 - Integrity

Must meet all four subcriteria

Criteria 3

Must meet a minimum of one subcriteria for one significance area (architectural, social/historic, or geographic/environmental).

Ranking:

Primary Criteria 1: Historic Building

Place an "X" in the box for properties 50 years or older.

Primary Criteria 2 and 3

Rank each building/site on a scale of 0-3 using the following assumptions. Please attempt to be as consistent in the use of each ranking level as possible.

- 0 does not meet criteria
- 1 minimally meets criteria
- 2 meets criteria
- 3 exceeds criteria

NOTES:

This section is for Commission members to put their thoughts or comments on the rankings.

	Г	CRITERIA 1	CRITERIA 2										CRITE	ERIA 3					
		Historic Building	Integrity				Architectural Criteria						Social/Historic Criteria Geographic/Natural Features						res
Common Name	Street Address		Α	В	С,	D	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	1	2	NOTES:
																			recent restoration based on historic photographs, but not really representing innovations.
																			Associated with a notable person, but should be discussed further on whether that criteria is
Example: My House	1234 5th St	X	1	3	2	3	0	2	3	0	0	0	0	2	1	0	2	0	met.
PROPOSED LIST																			
Bonning Cabin	531 5 th Street East																		
Thornton House	560 East Avenue North																		
E.B Williams House	520 East Avenue North																		
Jack Frost Motel	591 4 th Street East																		
George Castle Cabin	431 ½ Walnut Avenue																		
Michel's Christiania Restaurant	303 Walnut Avenue																		
Brass Ranch House	571 2 nd Street																		
McCoy/Gooding/Miller House	480 East 2 nd Street																		
Lon Price/Esther Fairman House	180 Leadville Avenue North																		
St. Mary's Catholic Church	380 Leadville Avenue North																		
Fagan Property	411 Sun Valley Road																		
Comstock & Clark Mercantile	300 North Main Street																		
Pioneer Saloon	308 North Main Street																		
Helm Property	340 North Main Street																		
Former Post Office	460 North Main Street																		
Bert Cross Cabin	271 ½ Leadville Avenue North																		
Ketchum Kamp Hotel	220 North Main Street																		
Lewis Bank	180 North Main Street																		
First Telephone Co.	340 North 2 nd Street																		
Dynamite Shed	271 Sun Valley Road																		
Battis house	431 Washington Avenue																		
McAtee House	380 1 st Avenue																		
Forest Service Park	Between River and 1 st Street																		
Community Library/Gold Mine	331 Walnut Avenue																		
Thrift Shop																			
Greenhow & Rumsey Store (NRHP listed)	211 North Main Street																		
Horace Lewis Home/Elephant's Perch	280 East Avenue North																		