

Johnstown Low Point WWTP Expansion- Equipment Selection  
 Proposal Evaluation  
 HEADWORKS SCREENING EQUIPMENT - BID ITEM #1

Item	Evaluation Criteria	Weighted Value	Huber		Ovivo		EnviroCare	
			\$427,750		\$467,231		\$243,993	
			Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score
1	Operability	2.0	5	10	5	10	2	4
2	Installed Capital Cost	3.0	3	9	2	6	5	15
3	Operation and Maintenance Costs	2.0	4	8	5	10	3	6
4	Experience and References	1.0	5	5	3	3	5	5
5	Local Service	0.5	4	2	4	2	4	2
6	Warranties	1.5	3	4.5	4	6	5	7.5
7	Owner's Preference	2.0	4	8	5	10	2	4
			<b>Total</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>44</b>

**Exceptions:**

**Notes:**  
 Operability: Scoring is based on the capture rate (Huber has the highest, third-party verified CR). Envirocare submitted on a smaller diameter screen resulting in higher headloss  
 Capital Cost: See Evaluation spreadsheet  
 O&M Cost: See Evaluation spreadsheet  
 Experience and References: Ovivo Ozzy Cup is a relatively new product with limited references  
 Local Service: All manufactureres have established and reputable local representation. Service typically out of regional centers.  
 Warranty: Huber offers a 12 month warranty. Ovivo and Envirocare are close with 6 months of additional warranty for Envirocare  
 Spriac bid was non-responsive

2021.02.17 - Town Workshop Notes:

Huber

Repairs are more expensive for Huber,

Service will be good.

Greater experience/references

Huber will have smallest future O&M cost

Consensus is to proceed with Huber

Ovivo

Conveyor for the Ovivo is a disadvantage

96% capture rate (3% greater than Huber)

2 more motors tha Huber (Separate screen/washer compactor)

Ovivo maintenance is better than Huber (Huber requires a crane)

Envirocare submitted on a smaller diameter screen resulting in higher headloss

**Johnstown Low Point WWTP Expansion- Equipment Selection  
Proposal Evaluation  
GRIT REMOVAL EQUIPMENT - BID ITEM #2**

Item	Evaluation Criteria	Weighted Value	Huber - Vormax		Huber - Grit Wolf		Smith and Loveless		Hydro International	
			\$285,390		\$385,896		\$202,798		\$251,500	
			Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score
1	Operability	2.0	2	4	5	10	5	10	5	10
2	Installed Capital Cost	3.0	3	9	2	6	5	15	4	12
3	Operation and Maintenance Costs	2.0	4	8	3	6	4	8	5	10
4	Experience and References	1.0	2	2	1	1	4	4	4	4
5	Local Service	0.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	5	2.5
6	Warranties	1.5	5	7.5	5	7.5	5	7.5	5	7.5
7	Owner's Preference	2.0	4	8	4	8	4	8	5	10
			<b>Total</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>56</b>

**Exceptions:**

**Notes:**

**Operability:** Removal efficiency and overall complexity major factors

**Installed Capital Cost:** See Evaluation Sheet

**O&M Cost:** See Evaluation Sheet

**Experience and References:** Huber has limited references.

**Local Service:** Local supplier representatives w. regional/national service centers.

**Warranties:** Same warranty offered from all vendors.

2021.02.17 - Town Workshop Notes:  
Huber

S&L  
S&L and Hydro claim the same removal

Hydro  
Grit King (like the tea cup unit)  
Less moving parts than S&L

**Johnstown Low Point WWTP Expansion- Equipment Selection**

**Proposal Evaluation**

**MBR - BID ITEM #3**

Item	Evaluation Criteria	Weighted Value	Kubota		Memcor		Suez	
			\$1,364,900		\$1,019,979		\$1,035,250	
			Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score
1	Operability	2.0	4	8	5	10	5	10
2	Installed Capital Cost	3.0	2	6	5	15	5	15
3	Operation and Maintenance Costs	2.0	2	4	5	10	5	10
4	Experience and References	1.0	5	5	3	3	5	5
5	Local Service	0.5	5	2.5	4	2	5	2.5
6	Warranties	1.5	4	6	5	7.5	5	7.5
7	Owner's Preference	2.0	3	6	4	8	5	10
			<b>Total</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>60</b>

**Exceptions:**

**Notes:**

**Johnstown Low Point WWTP Expansion- Equipment Selection**

**Proposal Evaluation  
BLOWERS - BID ITEM #4**

Item	Evaluation Criteria	Weighted Value	Aerzen		Inovair	
			\$423,000		\$588,500	
			Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score
1	Operability	2.0	5	10	5	10
2	Installed Capital Cost	3.0	5	15	2	6
3	Operation and Maintenance Costs	2.0	3	6	5	10
4	Experience and References	1.0	5	5	3	3
5	Local Service	0.5	4	2	4	2
6	Warranties	1.5	3	4.5	5	7.5
7	Owner's Preference	2.0	4	8	4	8
			<b>Total</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>47</b>

**Exceptions:**

**Notes:**  
United bid was non-responsive

**Johnstown Low Point WWTP Expansion- Equipment Selection**

**Proposal Evaluation**

**UV DISINFECTION - BID ITEM #5**

Item	Evaluation Criteria	Weighted Value	Wedeco		Trojan	
			\$236,070		\$326,454	
			Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score
1	Operability	2.0	4	8	5	10
2	Installed Capital Cost	3.0	5	15	2	6
3	Operation and Maintenance Costs	2.0	4	5	5	10
4	Experience and References	1.0	3	3	5	5
5	Local Service	0.5	3	1.5	5	2.5
6	Warranties	1.5	4	6	4	6
7	Owner's Preference	2.0	3	6	5	10
			<b>Total</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>

**Exceptions:**

**Notes:**

**Johnstown Low Point WWTP Expansion- Equipment Selection**

**Proposal Evaluation**

**DEWATERING EQUIPMENT - BID ITEM #6**

Item	Evaluation Criteria	Weighted Value	Fournier		Huber		Prime Solution		Trident		PW Tech		Schwing	
			\$621,297		\$593,746		\$777,073		\$468,750		\$525,000		\$482,061	
			Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score	Impact Value (1 to 5)	Score
1	Operability	2.0	5	10	5	10	5	10	4	8	5	10	5	10
2	Installed Capital Cost	3.0	3	9	4	12	2	6	5	15	4	12	4	12
3	Operation and Maintenance Costs	2.0	5	10	3	6	3	6	3	6	3	6	3	6
4	Experience and References	1.0	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	5	5	2	2
5	Local Service	0.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	5	2.5
6	Warranties	1.5	4	6	2	3	5	7.5	4	6	4.5	6.75	4	6
7	Owner's Preference	2.0	5	10	4	8	4	8	4	8	4	8	4	8
			<b>Total</b>	<b>51.50</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>50.25</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>47</b>

**Exceptions:**

**Notes:**

**Operability** No spare part issues, simple solenoid valves need replacement No major complaints about operations. To Easy controls

**Installed Capital Cost** Installed costs computed relative to the lowest cost.

**Operation and Maintenance Costs** Lowest O&M Cost    One of highest costs    One of lowest costs    Highest cost    Middle of pack    Middle-high costs, uses a lot more polymer then promised

**Experience and References** All references contacted provided positive feedback. PW Tech has many more installations than the others.

**Local Service** All suppliers have local, legitimate equipment reps that provide service. All references stated that local service has never been an issue.

**Warranties** Standard warranty is 24 months following commissioning, or 36 months after delivery. Huber did not meet these requiremnts. Prime Solutions and PW Tech provided warranties above and beyond the requirements.

**Owner's Preference** Operations has positive experiences with Fournier and Huber. These are the operation staff's preferences. Town has had poor experience with the existing Prime Solutions system, so it scored low. Trident lacks the local and similary installation resume compared to the other more established suppliers. Operations staff has never worked with PW Tech or Schwing, so there is a learning curve and a lesser preference towards these units. Fournier has room for expansion and can more easily handle the lower flows.

Product	Vendor	Vendor	Vendor	Vendor	Vendor	Vendor
Screening	Huber \$427,750	Ovivo \$467,231	EnviroCare \$243,993			
Grit Removal	Huber - Vormax \$285,390	Huber - Grit Wolf \$385,896	Smith and Loveless \$202,798	Hydro International \$251,500		
MBR	Kubota \$1,364,900	Memcor \$1,019,979	Suez \$1,035,250			
Blower	Aerzen \$423,000	Inovair \$588,500				
UV Disinfection	Wedeco \$236,070	Trojan \$326,454				
Dewatering	Fournier \$621,297	Huber \$593,746	Prime Solution \$777,073	Trident \$468,750	PW Tech \$525,000	Schwing \$482,061

Summary Sheet - Selected Equipment and Associated Cost:

Vendor	Huber	Hydro International	Suez	Aerzen	Trojan	Fournier	Total Equipment
Total Cost (includes submittal cost)	\$427,750	\$251,500	\$1,035,250	\$423,000	\$326,454	\$621,297	\$3,085,251