

MINUTES
TOWN OF JUNO BEACH, FLORIDA
Request for Proposals – Town Center Restroom Renovation Project
EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING
April 10, 2024, at 10:00AM
Council Chambers/Zoom
340 Ocean Drive

PRESENT: ANDREA DOBBINS, PROJECT COORDINATOR/RISK MANAGER
 MICHAEL A. VENTURA, FINANCE DIRECTOR
 STEVEN HALLOCK, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS
 CAITLIN E. COPELAND-RODRIGUEZ, TOWN CLERK

ALSO PRESENT: DAVID DYESS, TOWN MANAGER

Audience: 3 (1 via Zoom)

CALL TO ORDER

Finance Director Ventura called the meeting to order at 10:00am. He announced that the public is allowed to attend the meeting, but participation is limited to the Evaluation Committee members only. He also stated that the purpose of the Committee meeting is to review, rank and vet out the companies which submitted proposals to the Town’s RFP, Request for Proposal for the Town Center Restroom Renovation Project for the Town of Juno Beach.

REVIEW OF PROPOSALS

Finance Director Ventura stated that they received a total of four (4) responses to the RFP and explained the process for ranking the firms and giving a recommendation to Council.

The Committee reviewed and discussed the following proposals:

(See attached evaluation sheets.)

COOPER CONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT

Project Coordinator/Risk Manager Dobbins stated that she gave this company a total of 80 out of 100.

Director of Public Works Hallock stated that he gave this company a total of 90 out of 100.

Finance Director Ventura stated that he gave this company a total of 92.5 out of 100.

GPS – GENERAL PROPERTY SOLUTIONS

Project Coordinator/Risk Manager Dobbins stated that she gave this company a total of 80 out of 100.

Director of Public Works Hallock stated that he gave this company a total of 90 out of 100.

Finance Director Ventura stated that he gave this company a total of 80 out of 100.

JFB CONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT

Project Coordinator/Risk Manager Dobbins stated that she gave this company a total of 70 out of 100.

Director of Public Works Hallock stated that he gave this company a total of 83 out of 100.

Finance Director Ventura stated that he gave this company a total of 82.5 out of 100.

USHER & ASSOCIATES

Project Coordinator/Risk Manager Dobbins stated that she gave this company a total of 90 out of 100.

Director of Public Works Hallock stated that he gave this company a total of 95 out of 100.

Finance Director Ventura stated that he gave this company a total of 85 out of 100.

COMMITTEE DISCUSSION AND FINAL RANKING FOR RECOMMENDATION TO TOWN COUNCIL

The Committee discussed and performed a final ranking on their evaluation sheets (*see attached*).

The Committee gave consensus to recommend Usher & Associates to the Town Council.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:42am.

ATTEST:


Caitlin E. Copeland-Rodriguez, MMC, Town Clerk



Town of Juno Beach
EVALUATION COMMITTEE SUMMARY TABULATION
April 10, 2024

Request for Proposal: Town Center Restroom Renovation Project

Cooper Construction and Development

Evaluation Committee Member	Scoring Criteria Tabulation				Total
	#1	#2	#3	#4	
Andrea Dobbins <i>Project Coordinator/Risk Manager</i>	20/25	15/15	5/10	40/50	80/100
Michael Ventura <i>Finance Director</i>	20/25	15/15	10/10	47.5/50	92.5/100
Steven J. Hallock <i>Director of Public Works</i>	20/25	12/15	10/10	48/50	90/100
TOTAL					262.5/300

GPS – General Property Solutions

Evaluation Committee Member	Scoring Criteria Tabulation				Total
	#1	#2	#3	#4	
Andrea Dobbins <i>Project Coordinator/Risk Manager</i>	25/25	15/15	10/10	30/50	80/100
Michael Ventura <i>Finance Director</i>	20/25	15/15	5/10	40/50	80/100
Steven J. Hallock <i>Director of Public Works</i>	25/25	13/15	10/10	42/50	90/100
TOTAL					250/300

JFB Construction and Development

Evaluation Committee Member	Scoring Criteria Tabulation				Total
	#1	#2	#3	#4	
Andrea Dobbins <i>Project Coordinator/Risk Manager</i>	10/25	15/15	10/10	35/50	70/100
Michael Ventura <i>Finance Director</i>	15/25	15/15	7/10	45/50	82.5/100
Steven J. Hallock <i>Director of Public Works</i>	15/25	13/15	9/10	46/50	83/100
TOTAL					235.5/300

Usher & Associates

Evaluation Committee Member	Scoring Criteria Tabulation				
	#1	#2	#3	#4	Total
Andrea Dobbins <i>Project Coordinator/Risk Manager</i>	25/25	15/15	5/10	50/50	95/100
Michael Ventura <i>Finance Director</i>	15/25	15/15	5/10	50/50	85/100
Steven J. Hallock <i>Director of Public Works</i>	25/25	15/15	5/10	50/50	95/100
TOTAL					275/300

Completed By *Town Clerk Copeland-Rodriguez*:  Date: 4/10/24

	Max. Points	Category
#1	25	<p>Vendor References</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide a minimum of three (3) customers with a brief description of similar work performed (include location, date of contract, name, telephone number and address of owner/contact person).
#2	15	<p>Vendor Qualifications</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of valid state, county and local licenses and receipts proving authority to conduct business in the jurisdiction of the work.
#3	10	<p>Personnel and Equipment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide evidence of qualified personnel and a list of company equipment.
#4	50	<p>Price</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completed itemized proposal form.



Town of Juno Beach
EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION
April 10, 2024

Request for Proposal: Town Center Restroom Renovation Project

Firm <i>(in alphabetical order)</i>	Scoring Criteria Tabulation				
	#1	#2	#3	#4	Total
Cooper Construction & Development	20	15	5	40	80
GPS – General Property Solutions	25	15	10	30	80
JFB Construction and Development	25 ²⁵ 10	15	10	35	85 ⁷⁰
Usher & Associates	25	15	5	45 ⁵⁰	90 ⁹⁵

#2
tie
~~#2~~ #3
#1

	Max. Points	Category
#1	25	Vendor References <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide a minimum of three (3) customers with a brief description of similar work performed (include location, date of contract, name, telephone number and address of owner/contact person).
#2	15	Vendor Qualifications <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evidence of valid state, county and local licenses and receipts proving authority to conduct business in the jurisdiction of the work.
#3	10	Personnel and Equipment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide evidence of qualified personnel and a list of company equipment.
#4	50	Price <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Completed itemized proposal form.

Completed By: Andrea Dobbins
 Signature
Andrea Dobbins
 Print Name

Date: 4-10-24

JFB

\$41,200 / \$39,000 alternate

- ✓ vendor references - provided 3 but was not able to speak to anyone
- ✓ Qualifications + licenses provided left a msg. for 1 + the other had no VM set up
- ✓ List of personnel + equip provided
- const. schedule of 1 month
- ✓ provided all prod. specs.

Jobs indicated are applicable but not able to get a hold of Ref. people

Same name on vendor Ref. + employee list; coincidence or same person?

Usher

\$37,430.41 / alt. \$36,630.41

- ✓ 3 vendor references provided
- ✓ licenses provided
- ✓ equip indicated they possess small tools for the job, no mention of personnel; one Ref. indicated they sub out all work
- * in their estimate they have a cleaning svc come in + clean everything
- 1.5 months for const. schedule
- provided ^{product} specs but not on partitions

GDS

(\$1,000 credit for alternate)

- ✓ Provided vendor references as requested
- ✓ all licenses + proof to work for PBC/Town
- ✓ listed a statement of adequate equip + personnel
- ✓ price list of bid items; but they did not provide product specs as indicated on bid schedule

\$46,990/
 \$45,990
 alternate

< 2 month const. schedule is
 Not optimal June-Aug. >
 Indicated a C.O. to re-install soap dispensers, paper towel, T.P. etc. They did not incorporate these 'misc.' items into their price

COOPER

\$39,425 / - just a few \$ difference on flooring w/
 39,360 alt. → Rm'ing tile or leaving it. Strange given the labor involved

- ✓ vendor references; two references are for the same customer. Should have had another different reference. Technically only 2 Ref. provided
 we asked for 3 customers + they should have been different. Was not able to reach any of their Ref. to talk to.
- ✓ licenses
- ✓ const. schedule indicates 1 month
- indicate who the AM will be but no mention of other personnel + equip; would have been good to mention a statement about this as its Requested in Evaluation Criteria
- ✓ they provided product specs as Requested except for the S.S. partitions

Usher Ref.

✓ ~~msg~~ Leesa Conley 215-694-0576
MD Beauty Lab - Good job; technical wk for
medical lab, did other jobs for her also; contentious
worker

msg Kay Simon 561-762-2478
Personal Bathroom

✓ Pamela Egan 561-212-1903
Beach Way Therapy
Budget was on point + work was
acceptable. Very organized + were on
schedule. Used them on other
projects.

GPS

References - all checked out @ spoke
to the listed businesses before they
remodeled T.C. library. All good comments

Cooper Const.

msg Jonathan Welter 561-900-7013
Journey Church

closed Cent Brown 561-803-2000
PBA

- main # church

- main # PBA



Town of Juno Beach
EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION
 April 10, 2024

Request for Proposal: Town Center Restroom Renovation Project

Firm <i>(in alphabetical order)</i>	Scoring Criteria Tabulation				Total
	#1	#2	#3	#4	
Cooper Construction & Development <i>Kullen 60 DAYS</i>	20	15	21 yr exp 15 yr exp 10	37,425 47.5	92.50
GPS - General Property Solutions <i>Timeline - 8/11 113TH</i>	ok per 20	15	contract for people no 5	46,990 40	80
JFB Construction and Development <i>STAYS</i>	EE?? 15	15	List - 7	41,200 45.5	82.5
Usher & Associates <i>SS PR-1104</i>	15	15	-5	37,430 50	85

*LM
OK per
CHASE
PROPOSALS
AMEN. V.P.*

	Max. Points	Category
#1	25	Vendor References <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide a minimum of three (3) customers with a brief description of similar work performed (include location, date of contract, name, telephone number and address of owner/contact person).
#2	15	Vendor Qualifications <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evidence of valid state, county and local licenses and receipts proving authority to conduct business in the jurisdiction of the work.
#3	10	Personnel and Equipment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide evidence of qualified personnel and a list of company equipment.
#4	50	Price <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Completed itemized proposal form.

Completed By:
 Signature
Michael Ventura
 Print Name

Date: 4/10/24

MV

Town of Juno Beach

Request for Proposal (RFP), Request for Qualifications (RFQ)

Evaluation Committee Proceedings Procedures

NOTE: Record the proceedings.

A Senior level or Department Director participant shall review the guidelines of the meeting.

- Call the meeting to order.
- This is the Evaluation Committee meeting for the: Town Center Restroom Renovation
- Today is 4/10/24, it is 10:00 o'clock
- This is a public meeting and participation and discussion at the meeting shall be limited to the evaluation committee members only. The public may attend but no participation in the meeting will be permitted.
- Any protest or contest of the submittals shall be limited to a Town Council meeting, which is expected to be 4/24/24.
- In attendance are committee members Dobbins, Hallout & Ventura.
- Announce who is in audience or ask them; pass around a Sign-in Sheet
- The RFP, RFQ, ITB was made public on FEB 5, 2024, i.e. posted in newspaper, or date on our website and state whether the proposal was also posted on 3rd party websites (DemandStar and Vendor Registry)
- Public Notice for all proceedings and this Evaluation Meeting was included in the public notice and posted on the Town's bulletin board.
- The Committee members received proposals in advance of the committee meeting for their review. Individual committee members have the opportunity to preliminarily rank them prior to the committee meeting. The members rank the submittals based on the sealed, competitive proposals received in accordance with the established evaluation criteria.
- Uniform Evaluation Sheets have been provided for use by the committee.
- Committee members will discuss and review their preliminary rankings and complete and sign their final ranking on the Evaluation Tabulation sheet. The rankings provided by each committee member will be summed up on the Summary Tabulation sheet. Ranking of the most qualified submittal will be based on the highest score.
- Oral presentations may be requested or recommended by the committee members. In the event oral presentations are required, no less than three (3) firms shall be selected to participate unless fewer submittals were received. Oral presentations may be coordinated at a future date if necessary.
- In any event, the Committee shall complete their ranking prior to commencement of negotiations of a contract. The Town Manager or his designee may commence negotiations with the top ranked firm to negotiate a tentative agreement, subject to award by the Town Council; and should the Town staff be unable to negotiate a satisfactory contract with the firm considered to be the most qualified at a price the Town determines to be fair, competitive, and reasonable, negotiations with that firm must be formally terminated. The Town shall then undertake negotiations with the second most qualified firm. And so forth, until an agreement is reached.
- After staff concludes negotiations with the selected firm(s), Staff shall propose a recommendation to the Town Council for final approval. The date of the anticipated Town Council meeting and website posting date are _____
- Thank everyone for their participation, and adjourn.

3 - projects
Valid license
evidence to pers
PM

Town Center Proposal -

Cooper

- x A Ref 25 point - 3 projects -
- x B 15 - Vermon Qual-Rtn Licers - 9/30/24 ^{FL} 8/9/24
- x C 10 - Pers. + Equip -
- x D 50 - Price -
- x valid A 60 DAY

~~Book~~ - 484 - 883 - 9119 - excellent -
 Excellent - paper work Timely -
~~Book~~ x - PROJECT ON TIME -

~~Book~~
~~platt~~
~~with~~

- ON TIME
- SFB - purchase LIST - DETAILS - ATTENTION TO DETAIL - ^{issues with}
- AT Budget
- Not good Experience
- surprised they have them in person
- 1.2m -
- multiple jobs going on -
- Rough -

Jesus
 return

SFB - Dixon side of Lot - work at you -
 work on my @ - multiple 18hrs -
 - self performer 12-15 - skilled carpenters - ^{Not employee}

Reference 25 p -

MW

Cooper -
3 - Ref -

curr Brown Excellent -

GPS - older -

Town - OK Matt P. 8/10 -

Price High - charge order -

SFB -

Plant Fitness - Brett Plant Fitness - not Rehire -

Jesus Robor - contractor - hired then as GE -
Director of Operations -

Ushier - Project 2 - Kay, not best quality materials
-ok B- pointer -

~~MATERIALS~~