THE POWER HOUSE AT UNION STATION • 401 S. 18th ST., STE. 400 • SAINT LOUIS, MISSOURI 63103-2296 314-531-4321 • FAX 844-339-2910 • www.HornerShifrin.com

April 11, 2022

Kent Peetz, P.E. Public Works Director City of Jackson 101 Court Street Jackson, MO 63755

Re: City of Jackson Kimbeland Pump Station Improvements Project Evaluation of Bids

HORNE

Dear Mr. Peetz:

In accordance with your request, Horner & Shifrin (H&S) has reviewed the bid proposal pertaining to the above-referenced project, which were received by the City of Jackson on March 10, 2022. Enclosed is the Bid Tabulation which summarizes the results of our bid evaluation.

Three contractors took out plans for the project, however; only one bid was received from Robinson Industrial, Heavy & Commercial, Inc (RIHC). RIHC's total base bid was \$2,042,345.00 and total base bid plus Alternate "A" was \$2,411,586.00. Please note that our Engineer's Opinion of Probable Cost for this construction was \$988,864.00 for the total base bid and \$1,301,864.00 for the total base bid plus Alternate "A". A summary of the bid tabulation is attached.

In order to assess conformance of the submitted bids with the Procedural Bid Submittal Requirements, we examined the supplemental materials required by the Bidding Documents to be submitted with the Bid Form – Bid Bond, List of Major Subcontractors, and qualifications data. RIHC met conformance with all bid submittal items.

Followup with the two contractors that did not submit bids indicated they recently were awarded contracts for other projects and did not have the staffing to complete the Kimbeland project. Discussion with RIHC indicated the increased cost of their bid was due to the complexity of the project and the volatility of material pricing/availability at the time of bidding.

After discussion with City Staff, it was agreed that bidding the project a third time would not result in more competitive bids and the existing pump station needs immediate replacement. Horner & Shifrin worked with RIHC to develop value engineering alternatives to reduce the construction cost of the project. The following alternatives were evaluated:

- Eliminate detention tank & associated piping (Bid Alternate 1).
- Shift pump station wet well approximately 30'east and 20' north.
- Lower pump station site plan elevation from 468 to 460.
- Raise bottom of wet well and 16" DIP incoming sanitary sewer 2'.
- Delete special manhole 7D-017 and install 8" PVC sewer between Ex MH 7D-016 and New MH 1.



- Eliminate 10" bypass piping and valves between Hwy 61 East pump station forcemain and New MH 1.
- Miscellaneous pump station piping and valve modifications.

A summary of the adjusted construction cost based on the above noted alternatives is attached to this letter. Change Order No. 1 will be issued with the contract agreement reducing the contract amount from \$2,411,586.00 to \$1,833,491.00.

Based on our review of these bids, supporting materials submitted, and value engineering analysis discussions with RIHC and Jackson city staff, it is the recommendation of Horner & Shifrin that the City of Jackson award RIHC as the successful bidder for the Kimbeland Pump Station Improvements Project.

The adjusted contract amount will be \$1,833,491.00.

If there are any questions or need to discuss our bid evaluation further, please contact me. We greatly appreciate the opportunity to continue to serve the City of Jackson.

Respectfully Submitted,

Dillet E. Sering

Gilbert (Ed) Sewing, P.E. Project Manager

cc: File

CITY OF JACKSON, MO KIMBELAND PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECT BID TABULATION

		Bid	ders
	Bid Rank (Low to High)	1	2
Conformance to Bid Submittal Requirements	Engineer's Estimate Horner & Shifrin	Robinson Construction Company	N/A
Bid Signed		YES	
Addendums 1 & 2		YES	
Bid Bond Submitted 5%		YES	
List of Major Subcontractors		YES	
Qual's Submitted		YES	

		Bidders	
List of Major Sub-Contractor Named on Bid Form	Engineer's Estimate Horner & Shifrin	Robinson Construction Company	N/A
1. Gravity Sewer	-	Prime Contractor	
2. Forcemain / Piping	-	Prime Contractor	
3. Electrical	-	KT Power Systems	
4. Paving	-	Prime Contractor	
5. Civil / Site Work	-	Prime Contractor	
6. Manhole Lining / Rehab.	-	CCIMW	
7. Pump Station	-	Prime Contractor	
8. Submersible Pump Supplier	-	Municipal Equipment	

CITY OF JACKSON, MO KIMBELAND PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECT BID TABULATION

				Engineer's		Robinson Co			_
	BASE BID ITEMS		Horner & Unit Bid	& Shifrin Extended	Comı Unit Bid	bany Extended	N/	A Extended	
Item	Description	Quantity	Unit	Price	Bid Price	Price	Bid Price	Unit Bid Price	Bid Price
1	Excavation - Class "A"	102	CY	250.00	25,500.00	345.00	35,190.00	onit bla i nec	0.00
2	Excavation - Class "C"	259	CY	38.00	9,842.00	73.00	18,907.00		0.00
3	Granular Backfill	84	CY	65.00	5,460.00	90.00	7,560.00		0.00
4	Force Main - 10 Inch, DIP	60 60	LF	434.00	26,040.00	1,359.00	81,540.00		0.00
5	Force Main - 12 Inch, PVC	22	LF	521.00	11,462.00	461.00	10,142.00		0.00
6	Pipe Sewer - 15 Inch, PVC	50	LF	100.00	5,000.00	217.00	10,142.00		0.00
7	Pipe Sewer - 15 Inch, PVC Pipe Sewer - 16 Inch, DIP				41,400.00	492.00	,		0.00
8	Manhole - Standard Construction	207	LF	200.00 480.00	15,360.00	492.00	101,844.00 51,104.00		
_		32	VLF		,		,		0.00
9	Outside Foulwater Drop	2	EA	2,400.00	4,800.00	9,416.00	18,832.00		0.00
10	Concrete Encasement - Class A	51	CY	400.00	20,400.00	477.00	24,327.00		0.00
11	Air Release Manhole	1	EA	7,000.00	7,000.00	9,434.00	9,434.00		0.00
12	Special Manhole 7D-017	1	EA	15,000.00	15,000.00	75,964.00	75,864.00		0.00
13	Special Storm Manhole "A"	1	EA	2,500.00	2,500.00	1,117.00	1,117.00		0.00
14	Rock Blanket - Heavy	307	SY	100.00	30,700.00	92.00	28,244.00		0.00
15	Electrical Conduits (2-4" Dia. PVC) Buried (Incl. Excavation)	275	LF	60.00	16,500.00	132.00	36,300.00		0.00
16	Sectionalizing Cabinet	2	EA	4,000.00	8,000.00	6,128.00	12,256.00		0.00
17	30" x 60" Pull Box	1	EA	4,600.00	4,600.00	7,580.00	7,580.00		0.00
18	Electrical Transclosure	1	EA	9,800.00	9,800.00	21,244.00	21,244.00		0.00
19	Portable Backup Generator	1	EA	83,000.00	83,000.00	133,705.00	133,705.00		0.00
20	Abandon Ex. Water Service	1	EA	1,500.00	1,500.00	1,358.00	1,358.00		0.00
21	12" Tap Valve & Saddle - BRANCH	1	EA	20,000.00	20,000.00	15,624.00	15,624.00		0.00
22	12" Tap Valve & Saddle - LINE	1	EA	15,000.00	15,000.00	15,624.00	15,624.00		0.00
23	Mobilization	1	LS	40,000.00	40,000.00	260,773.00	260,773.00		0.00
24	Protection & Restoration of Site	1	LS	100,000.00	100,000.00	31,650.00	31,650.00		0.00
25	Bypass Pumping	1	LS	40,000.00	40,000.00	44,363.00	44,363.00		0.00
26	Abandon Ex. Kimbeland Pump Station	1	LS	30,000.00	30,000.00	22,808.00	22,808.00		0.00
27	New Kimbeland Pump Station	1	LS	400,000.00	400,000.00	964,105.00	964,105.00		0.00
	TOTAL BASE BID (Sum Items 1 - 2	7) =	•	\$988,8	64.00	\$2,042,	345.00	\$0.0	00

CITY OF JACKSON, MO KIMBELAND PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECT BID TABULATION

				Engineer's Estimate		Robinson Construction			
	ALTERNATE "A"			Horner	& Shifrin	Com	pany	N/.	А
		Estimated		Unit Bid	Extended	Unit Bid	Extended		Extended
Item	Description	Quantity	Unit	Price	Bid Price	Price	Bid Price	Unit Bid Price	Bid Price
28	Detention Storage Bank "A"	1	LS	\$313,000.00	\$313,000.00	\$369,241.00	\$369,241.00		\$0.00
ALTERNATE "A" SUBTOTAL (Item 28) =		\$313,000.00		\$369,241.00		\$0.00			

BID TOTAL SUMMARY	Engineer's Estimate Horner & Shifrin	Robinson Construction Company	N/A
TOTAL BASE BID (Sum Items 1 - 27) =	\$988,864.00	\$2,042,345.00	\$0.00
ALTERNATE "A" SUBTOTAL (Item 28) =	\$313,000.00	\$369,241.00	\$0.00
TOTAL BASE BID + ALTERNATE "A" =	\$1,301,864.00	\$2,411,586.00	\$0.00

CITY OF JACKSON, MO KIMBELAND PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECT CHANGE ORDER NO. 1 - ADJUSTMENT OF BID QUANTITIES & UNIT PRICES

				Engineer's		Robinson Construction		
BASE BID ITEMS			Horner & Shifrin		Company			
	Description	Estimated	Unit	Unit Bid	Extended	Unit Bid	Extended	
	Description	Quantity		Price	Bid Price	Price	Bid Price	
1	Excavation - Class "A"	102	CY	250.00	25,500.00	345.00	35,190.00	
2	Excavation - Class "C"	259	CY	38.00	9,842.00	73.00	18,907.00	
3	Granular Backfill	84	CY	65.00	5,460.00	90.00	7,560.00	
4	Force Main - 10 Inch, DIP	60	LF	434.00	26,040.00	1,359.00	81,540.00	
5	Force Main - 12 Inch, PVC	22	LF	521.00	11,462.00	461.00	10,142.00	
6	Pipe Sewer - 15 Inch, PVC	50	LF	100.00	5,000.00	217.00	10,850.00	
7	Pipe Sewer - 16 Inch, DIP	207	LF	200.00	41,400.00	492.00	101,844.00	
8	Manhole - Standard Construction	32	VLF	480.00	15,360.00	1,597.00	51,104.00	
9	Outside Foulwater Drop	2	EA	2,400.00	4,800.00	9,416.00	18,832.00	
10	Concrete Encasement - Class A	51	CY	400.00	20,400.00	477.00	24,327.00	
11	Air Release Manhole	1	EA	7,000.00	7,000.00	9,434.00	9,434.00	
12	Special Manhole 7D-017	1	EA	15,000.00	15,000.00	75,964.00	75,864.00	
13	Special Storm Manhole "A"	1	EA	2,500.00	2,500.00	1,117.00	1,117.00	
14	Rock Blanket - Heavy	307	SY	100.00	30,700.00	92.00	28,244.00	
	Electrical Conduits (2-4" Dia. PVC) Buried (Incl.			60.00	CO 00 1C 500 00 133	132.00	36,300.00	
15	Excavation)	275	LF	60.00	16,500.00	132.00		
16	Sectionalizing Cabinet	2	EA	4,000.00	8,000.00	6,128.00	12,256.00	
17	30" x 60" Pull Box	1	EA	4,600.00	4,600.00	7,580.00	7,580.00	
18	Electrical Transclosure	1	EA	9,800.00	9,800.00	21,244.00	21,244.00	
19	Portable Backup Generator	1	EA	83,000.00	83,000.00	133,705.00	133,705.00	
20	Abandon Ex. Water Service	1	EA	1,500.00	1,500.00	1,358.00	1,358.00	
21	12" Tap Valve & Saddle - BRANCH	1	EA	20,000.00	20,000.00	15,624.00	15,624.00	
22	12" Tap Valve & Saddle - LINE	1	EA	15,000.00	15,000.00	15,624.00	15,624.00	
23	Mobilization	1	LS	40,000.00	40,000.00	260,773.00	260,773.00	
24	Protection & Restoration of Site	1	LS	100,000.00	100,000.00	31,650.00	31,650.00	
25	Bypass Pumping	1	LS	40,000.00	40,000.00	44,363.00	44,363.00	
26	Abandon Ex. Kimbeland Pump Station	1	LS	30,000.00	30,000.00	22,808.00	22,808.00	
27	New Kimbeland Pump Station	1	LS	400,000.00	400,000.00	964,105.00	964,105.00	
	TOTAL BASE BID (Sum Items 1 - 27) =			\$988,8	364.00	\$2,042,:	345.00	

CHANGE ORDER NO. 1 w/ REVISED UNIT QUANITITES (AS OF 04/11/2022)				Robinson Construction Company	
Item	Description	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Unit Bid Price	Extended Bid Price
1	Excavation - Class "A"	55	CY	342.00	18,810.00
2	Excavation - Class "C"	203	CY	72.00	14,616.00
3	Granular Backfill	15	CY	89.00	1,335.00
4	Force Main - 10 Inch, DIP	60	LF	1,247.00	74,820.00
5	Force Main - 12 Inch, PVC	20	LF	1,580.00	31,600.00
6	Pipe Sewer - 15 Inch, PVC	30	LF	215.00	6,450.00
7	Pipe Sewer - 16 Inch, DIP	144	LF	412.00	59,328.00
8	Manhole - Standard Construction	35	VLF	1,680.00	58,800.00
9	Outside Foulwater Drop	2	EA	9,308.00	18,616.00
10	Concrete Encasement - Class A	51	CY	471.00	24,021.00
11	Air Release Manhole	1	EA	9,322.00	9,322.00
12	Special Manhole 7D-017	1	EA	9,100.00	9,100.00
13	Special Storm Manhole "A"	1	EA	1,104.00	1,104.00
14	Rock Blanket - Heavy	307	SY	91.00	27,937.00
15	Electrical Conduits (2-4" Dia. PVC) Buried (Incl. Excavation)	275	LF	130.00	35,750.00
16	Sectionalizing Cabinet	2	EA	6,049.00	12,098.00
17	30" x 60" Pull Box	1	EA	7,483.00	7,483.00
18	Electrical Transclosure	1	EA	20,973.00	20,973.00
19	Portable Backup Generator	1	EA	132,027.00	132,027.00
20	Abandon Ex. Water Service	1	EA	1,343.00	1,343.00
21	12" Tap Valve & Saddle - BRANCH	0	EA	15,431.00	0.00
22	12" Tap Valve & Saddle - LINE	1	EA	15,431.00	15,431.00
23	Mobilization	1	LS	257,907.00	257,907.00
24	Protection & Restoration of Site	1	LS	31,271.00	31,271.00
25	Bypass Pumping	1	LS	43,855.00	43,855.00
26	Abandon Ex. Kimbeland Pump Station	1	LS	22,553.00	22,553.00
27	New Kimbeland Pump Station	1	LS	893,301.00	893,301.00
28	Pipe Sewer - 8 Inch, PVC	28	LF	130.00	3,640.00
	TOTAL BASE BID (Sum Items 1 - 28) =				33,491.00

				Engineer's Estimate		Robinson Construction	
ALTERNATE "A"			Horner & Shifrin		Company		
		Estimated		Unit Bid	Extended	Unit Bid	Extended
Item	Description	Quantity	Unit	Price	Bid Price	Price	Bid Price
28	Detention Storage Bank "A"	1	LS	\$313,000.00	\$313,000.00	\$369,241.00	\$369,241.00
ALTERNATE "A" SUBTOTAL (Item 28) =			\$313,000.00		\$369,241.00		

	ALTERNATE "A"				struction Company
Item	Description	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Unit Bid Price	Extended Bid Price
29	Detention Storage Bank "A"	1	LS	\$0.00	\$0.00
	ALTERNATE "A" SUBTOTAL (Item 29) =				\$0.00

BID TOTAL SUMMARY	Engineer's Estimate Horner & Shifrin	Robinson Construction Company
TOTAL BASE BID (Sum Items 1 - 27) =	\$988,864.00	\$2,042,345.00
ALTERNATE "A" SUBTOTAL (Item 28) =	\$313,000.00	\$369,241.00
TOTAL BASE BID + ALTERNATE "A" =	\$1,301,864.00	\$2,411,586.00

BID TOTAL SUMMARY	Robinson Construction Company
TOTAL BASE BID (Sum Items 1 - 28) =	\$1,833,491.00
ALTERNATE "A" SUBTOTAL (Item 29) =	\$0.00
TOTAL BASE BID + ALTERNATE "A" =	\$1,833,491.00