

Staff Analysis

HPC Certificate of Appropriateness Application

File Number/Name: 26-70-COA, 1040 Patton Street – Rehabilitation and Repair of Historic Residence

Applicable Standards

<i>Sections</i>	<i>Applicable Standards</i>	<i>Description of Work</i>
3.1 Wood	3.1.1, 3.1.2, 3.1.3, 3.1.4, 3.1.5, 3.1.7, 3.1.8	• Repair front porch utilizing existing or in-kind replacement of wood • Repair wood siding using in-kind replacement if necessary
3.2 Masonry	3.2.1, 3.2.2, 3.2.3, 3.2.4	• Repairs to brick foundation, while also re-stuccoing the foundation
3.5 Roofs	3.5.1, 3.5.2, 3.5.3, 3.5.5, 3.5.8	• Re-roofing using in-kind replacement of asphalt shingles
3.6 Exterior Walls	3.6.1, 3.6.2, 3.6.4	• Repair wood siding using in-kind replacement if necessary
3.8 Entrances, Porches, and Balconies	3.8.1, 3.8.2, 3.8.3, 3.8.4, 3.8.5, 3.8.10	• Repair front porch without changing footprint or design and using in-kind replacement materials • Removal of side entrance landing and replacement with wood deck and steps
4.1 Decks	4.1.1, 4.1.2, 4.1.3, 4.1.4, 4.1.5, 4.1.6, 4.1.7	• Removal of existing rear deck and replacement with

		smaller deck and stairs
--	--	-------------------------

Congruity Analysis:

Per the Applicable Standards & Submittal Requirements:

Item 1: Roof Repair

- The applicant proposed to replace the existing roof utilizing similar asphalt shingles and proposes no changes to the pitch, roofline, or configuration. (Section 3.5.1, 3.5.3, and 3.5.5)

Item 2: Fascia, Soffits, Gable Vents, Exterior Trim, gutters and Downspouts

- The applicant's proposal is to repair and repaint all elements including wood fascia, soffits, wood gable vents, and exterior wood trim. The gutters will be repaired and in some instances replaced, however, they will remain in their current configuration. (Section 3.1.1, 3.1.3, 3.1.4)
- The application is silent whether the decorative brackets will also be repairs, replaced, or removed. The brackets are a character-defining feature of the craftsman style, and should be repaired. (Section 3.1.4 and 3.1.5)
- Though it does not appear to be the intention of the applicant, it is not appropriate to enclose the exposed rafter tails under the eaves.

Item 3: Exterior Walls – German Siding

- The application proposing leaving the existing German siding in place and making repairs. However, it does indicate that there may be the need to replace some siding. The least amount of full replacement should be sought to align with the design standards, and any replacement should match the current siding. (Section 3.1.4, 3.6.1, 3.6.3, 3.6.4, 3.6.5)

Item 4: Stucco and Masonry

- The proposal to repair the stucco and masonry aligns with the design standards. (Section 3.2.1, 3.2.2, 3.2.3, 3.2.4, and 3.2.5)

Item 5: Front Porch

- The proposal to restore the front porch aligns with the design standards because it uses a minimally invasive technique to make repairs, while preserving as much of the original materials or using in-kind replacement materials when necessary. Additionally, no physical alterations are being proposed that would change the appearance of the porch. (Section 3.1.1, 3.8.1, 3.8.2, 3.8.3, and 3.8.4)

Item 6: Decks

- The side deck is located on a non-character defining side of the house and will be constructed in place of an existing concrete landing. The concrete landing, which appears to be a later addition, will be removed and the deck will fit within the footprint of the current landing. Given the location and design, the deck aligns with the design standards. (Section 4.1.1 and Section 4.1.3)
- The current rear deck, which does not appear on the 1926 Sanborn map but does appear in the 1949 Sanborn map is not visible from Patton Street other than the steps. The proposal is to demolish the current deck. The new design does meet many of the design standards due to it being situated in an inconspicuous location and will not materially alter the structure of the historic property. (Section 4.1.1, 4.1.2, 4.1.3)

Item 7: Foundation Repairs

- The foundation repairs are all beneath and within the structure, not visible from the exterior. The foundation repairs are necessary for the long-term viability of the structure.

Proposed Conditions:

Based on the congruity analysis and staff concerns, the following conditions are suggested for consideration by the Commission, should the Commission choose to approve the application:

1. The character defining exposed rafters and the eave brackets shall be retained and preserved.
2. When repairing the siding, the least amount of replacement that is technically feasible shall be pursued. All replacement siding shall match the existing German siding.