

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of the Meeting of December 21, 2022

Commissioners Present: Jim Welter (Vice-Chair), Cheryl Jones, (Chair), Ralph Hammond-Green, Crystal Cauley, Chris Battista, Jim Boyd, and Jane Branigan

Commissioners Absent: Anthony Baltiero

Staff Present: Alexandra Hunt, Planner I, Daniel Heyman, Staff Attorney, Matt Manley, Planning Manager

- I **Call to Order.** Chair called the regular meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 pm.
- II **Public Comment.** Lynne Williams, Chadwick Avenue. Ms. Williams stated that she requested that Commission consider designating Chadwick Avenue as a historic district.
- III **Agenda.** A motion was made by Commissioner Hammond-Green and seconded by Commissioner Welter to approve the agenda.
- IV **Minutes.** On motion of Commissioner Hammond-Green and seconded by Commissioner Battista the minutes of the meeting of November 15, 2022 were approved.
- V **Old Business.**
- V(A) **Approval of Findings of Fact – 921 N. Main Street – H22-082-COA**
- V(B) **Approval of Findings of Fact – 1109 N. Main Street – H22-083-COA.**
- Commissioner Welter moved to approve the Findings of Fact for 921 N Main Street and 1109 N. Main Street as written. Commissioner Hammond-Green seconded the motion which passed unanimously.**
- VI **Other Business.**
- VI(A) **Update on Staff Approved COA's.** Alexandra Hunt, Planner provided an update to the Commission on staff approved COA's.
- VII **New Business**
- VII(A) **Certificate of appropriateness,** Marshall Kanner, 118 5th Ave W (File No. H22-106-COA). Prior to the opening of the public hearing, Chair announced that any persons desiring to testify at any of the public hearings must first be sworn as witnesses and will be subject to cross-examination by parties or persons whose position may be contrary to yours. A copy of the protocol for a quasi-judicial hearing is provided on the back table next to the agenda. Since this is a quasi-judicial hearing, it is very important that we

have an accurate record of what goes on. Therefore, we must ask that you refrain from speaking until recognized by the Chair and, when recognized, come forward to the podium and begin by stating your name and address. Anyone who wishes to testify during the public hearings should come forward to be sworn in. Chair swore in all potential witnesses.

Chair opened the public hearing.

Alexandra Hunt, Planner, stated that the City is in receipt of a Certificate of Appropriateness application from Marshall Kanner for the addition of a store front entry door and windows at the subject property located at 118 5th Ave W.

The subject property is 0.18 acres and is zoned C-1 Central Business and is located in the Main Street Historic District. This COA application is considered a Major Work.

A vicinity map was shown with the subject property highlighted in green and an aerial view was shown of the subject property.

The subject property is a one-story brick addition at the northwest corner of a large, two-story brick commercial style building known as the "Morey Building." This commercial building was constructed ca. 1912 to house Hunter's Pharmacy, formerly located down the street. The subject property is described in the local historic district designation report as having replacement fixed panes in the original display opening and a glass block transom.

Photos were shown of the property's existing conditions which are included in the staff report.

Ms. Hunt indicated that the Applicant submitted an alternate storefront design after the packet was submitted to the Commission. The difference in the alternate storefront design is the design of the entry door. The proposed design that is in the packet is one single door with fixed glass panels on each side and the alternate design proposal is a double door with fixed side lights on each side.

Ms. Hunt stated that the Applicant is requesting that the Commission consider the alternate proposed storefront design as part of this COA application.

Ms. Hunt requested that the alternate design proposal marked Exhibit C be admitted into the record.

Chair admitted Exhibit C into the record.

Photos were shown of storefronts that front Main Street that have painted metal doors and window frames. Ms. Hunt stated that staff surveyed the Main Street district and that a majority of the storefronts that front Main Street feature wood trim and most of the metal framing appears to have been introduced as part of renovations in the 1970's and 1980's prior to the establishment of the Main Street Local Historic District. Ms. Hunt stated that the subject property does not front Main Street.

The Design Standards that are applicable to this COA application were shown and are also included in the staff report.

Ms. Hunt asked if there were any questions for staff and indicated that a representative of the applicant, Peggy Mayer, was present to answer questions from the Commission. Ms. Mayor is the property

manager for Hunter Building Properties LLC which is the property owner of the subject property.

The Chair asked if there were any questions for Staff. Commissioner Hammond-Green asked Staff if there are any historic pictures available of the subject property or building and the storefront in particular after it was repaired from the fire in 1926.

Commissioner Welter asked whether Staff was satisfied with the historical research that was done in trying to establish what the storefront originally looked like.

Ms. Hunt stated that what Staff was able to find was what was indicated in the Designation Report.

The Chair asked if what is currently the storefront is what was noted as contributing in the Main Street Local Historic District Designation report. Ms. Hunt stated that it was.

Commissioner Cauley stated that a pharmacy was originally located in the Morey Building. Hunter Pharmacy.

Commissioner Welter stated that the guidelines call for historical research to try and determine what the original structure looked like.

Ms. Hunt stated that no other historic pictures were available of the subject property, which is an addition to the Morey Building, that staff could locate. Ms. Hunt indicated that the applicant also attempted to locate historic pictures of the property from the previous owner and was unable to find any.

The Chair asked the applicant to address the Commission.

Peggy Mayer, 118 5th Ave W, property manager for Hunter Building Properties, LLC. Ms. Mayer stated that she went to the library to see if they had photos of the building and contacted the previous property owner to see if he had any photos and he did not. Ms. Mayer stated that she could not find any photos of 5th Avenue.

Commissioner Boyd asked if the glass block transom is a wood frame. Ms. Mayer stated that it is in a metal frame and it will be kept as is.

Chair asked to confirm that there will be 4 total panes and if the existing frames are metal or wood. Ms. Mayer responded that it is currently a wood frame and that there will be two glass doors and one pane on either side so 4 panes in total.

Mr. Manley, Planning Manager, stated that it seems that the subject property was originally an independent building with its own storefront entrance and then at some point the building was accessed through an interior door of the adjoining building to create one large space and the storefront doors were replaced with windows as it looks today.

Mr. Manley asked Ms. Mayer if the subject property will still have that interior access and Ms. Mayer stated that it will be up to the tenant.

The Chair asked if there was anyone present who was opposed or for the application.

The Chair closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Hammond-Green moved the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in File # H22-106-COA and located within the Main Street Historic District, if replaced according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards (Main Street) for the following reasons: 1. The proposed addition design is based on historical research and maintains the original proportions, dimensions, and architectural elements. [Sec. 3.1.5] as we were able to determine. 2. The proposed addition retains the commercial character of the building through contemporary design and is compatible with the scale, design, materials, color, and texture of the historic building. [Sec. 3.1.7] Commissioner Batista seconded the motion which passed unanimously. The application was approved.

VII(B) **Certificate of Appropriateness.** Kathryn Vickers, 1304 Hyman Avenue (File No. H22-105-COA).

Chair opened the public hearing.

Ms. Hunt stated staff was in receipt of a Certificate of Appropriateness application from Kathryn Vickers for the replacement of 17 existing windows on the subject property located at 1304 Hyman Avenue. (PIN 9569-72-0766). The subject property is approximately 0.31 acres and is zoned R-6 High Density Residential and is located in the Hyman Heights Historic District. This COA is considered a Major Work according to the Residential Design Standards.

A vicinity map was shown with the subject property highlighted in green.

An aerial view was shown with the parcel outlined in red.

The subject property is a Contributing, Colonial Revival style two-story house constructed ca. 1922. The windows are described as three-vertical-over-one with a multi-light casement windows at the attic.

Ms. Hunt reviewed the past COA history which is included in the staff report.

Site photos were shown of the subject property taken by staff.

Photos were shown of the condition of some of the windows at the subject property. Ms. Hunt stated that these photos were submitted by the Applicant and are attached to the staff report as Exhibit C. Ms. Hunt stated that the submitted photos in Exhibit C were the only documentation that staff was provided as to the condition of the windows. Staff does not know the exact condition of each of the 17 windows that the applicant is requesting to replace. Staff cannot determine which windows are able to be replaced or if some of the windows can be repaired.

The Design Standards that are applicable to this COA application were shown and are also included in the staff report.

Chair asked if there were any questions for staff.

The Chair asked the applicant to address the Commission

Kathryn Vickers, 1304 Hyman Avenue. Ms. Vickers stated that she is trying to keep the windows accurate matching the grids and details. She has 30 total windows in the house and it is costly to replace all windows.

Commissioner Welter asked whether Ms. Vickers has looked at the cost of wood windows or aluminum clad wood windows. Ms. Vickers stated that Windows and Doors Specialists did quote her the cost of wood windows and it is 3x the cost of vinyl windows. Ms. Vickers stated that her contractor, Dan, submitted a letter with the application that given the settling of the house none of the windows can open and need new weights and it would be too costly to repair.

Commissioner Welter asked if the applicant looked at the design standards and Ms. Vickers stated that she was informed they have to be wood windows. Ms. Vickers stated that she is on a budget and wood windows are too much and she cannot afford them. That the vinyl windows are still costly and it is very expensive to replace the windows to the standards.

The Chair stated that the legislature came in and stated that the guidelines are no longer advisory and are now a mandatory. The commission does not have flexibility to a complete change from all wood windows to vinyl windows.

Ms. Vickers stated that the house has settled and it would be too expensive to repair each window with the weight system. That the windows that need to be replaced are in her children's rooms and do not open and those are her concern for safety reasons.

The Chair stated that the commission would like to see another material option other than vinyl. The Chair stated that the State Historic Preservation Office has resources for window specialists.

Ms. Vickers asked if some of the windows not facing the street could be replaced with vinyl.

Commissioner Welter stated that the standards state that vinyl is not appropriate.

The Chair asked if there is a possibility of a different type of window that meets the required materials.

Mr. Manley, stated that wood windows or aluminum clad wood windows have been approved in historic districts in other municipalities.

Ms. Hunt stated that it would be staff's position that the Commission could continue this application to the next meeting to work with the applicant on determining the level of deterioration of each window and whether any of them could be repaired and not replaced and to prioritize replacement versus repair needs of the windows.

Ms. Vickers asked if the Commission could continue the application to February.

The Chair asked that Ms. Vickers work with staff to determine the extent of deterioration and repairs.

**Commissioner Hammond-Green moved to continue this application to the February meeting.
Commissioner Welter seconded the motion which passed unanimously.**

VIII ***Adjournment.*** The Chair adjourned the meeting at 6:32 p.m.

Chair

DRAFT