



**CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
AMENDED AGENDA ITEM
SUMMARY
PLANNING DIVISION**



SUBMITTER: Alexandra Hunt, Planner I **MEETING DATE:** February 15, 2023

AGENDA SECTION: New Business **DEPARTMENT:** Community Development

TITLE OF ITEM: 1304 Hyman Ave. – Replacement of Existing Windows
(H22-105-COA) – *Alexandra Hunt / Planner I*

SUGGESTED MOTION(S):

1. For Recommending Approval:

I move the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in file # H22-105-COA and located within the Hyman Heights Historic District, if replaced according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, is **not incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards (Residential) for the following reasons:

1. The existing windows are deteriorated and in need of replacement. [Sec. 3.7.6]
2. The proposed windows match the design and dimension of the original sash or panels, pane configuration, architectural trim, and detailing. [Sec. 3.7.6]
3. The proposed aluminum wood clad replacement windows are a compatible substitute material because original material is not technically feasible. [Sec. 3.7.6]

[DISCUSS & VOTE]

1. For Recommending Denial:

I move the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in file # H22-105-COA and located within the Hyman Heights Historic District, if added according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, is **incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards (Residential) for the following reasons:

1. The proposed windows do not match the existing unit in kind, detailing, and materials. [Sec. 3.7.6]
2. Artificial materials are not appropriate on buildings on contributing properties. Existing artificial materials on contributing properties should be replaced with traditional materials. [Sec. 3.12.1]
3. It is not appropriate to remove original doors from a character-defining façade [Sec. 3.7.13]

[DISCUSS & VOTE]

SUMMARY:

The City received a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) application from Kathryn Vickers (Applicant/Property Owner) for the replacement of 17 existing windows at the subject property located at 1304 Hyman Ave. The subject property is contributing Colonial Revival style two-story house constructed ca. 1922 with windows three-vertical-over-one, with multi-light casement windows in the attic.

The application was heard at the December 21, 2022, regular meeting. The Applicant submitted documentation of deterioration related to their request in support of the COA application (Exhibit C). The Applicant proposed to replace the windows with vinyl double hung windows. The Commission requested that the Applicant work with Staff to determine the extent of deterioration of each window and if replacement was required, then to replace in kind matching the design and material or a substitute material other than vinyl. The Applicant agreed and requested that the Commission continue the hearing until the February regular meeting.

On January 26th, Staff met with the Applicant and her contractor at the subject property. It was determined that 4 of the proposed 17 windows needed replacement. (*See Exhibit D*) The Applicant is now proposing to replace 4 windows with aluminum wood clad, three-vertical-over-one windows. The Applicant intends to repair the remaining 13 windows.

This COA application is considered a Major Work according to the standards of the Residential Historic District Design Standards.

PROJECT/PETITIONER NUMBER:	H22-105-COA
PETITIONER NAME:	Kathryn Vickers (Applicant)
EXHIBITS:	A. Staff Report B. COA Application C. Henderson County Property Records D. Applicant Submitted Documentation of Deterioration E. 1.26.23 Window Survey