

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of the Meeting of January 18, 2023

Commissioners Present: Jim Welter (Vice-Chair), Ralph Hammond-Green, Crystal Cauley, Chris Battista, Jim Boyd, and Jane Branigan

Commissioners Absent: Cheryl Jones, Anthony Baltiero

Staff Present: Alexandra Hunt, Planner I, Daniel Heyman, Staff Attorney, Matt Manley, Planning Manager

- I **Call to Order.** Chair called the regular meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 pm.
- II **Public Comment.** Ken Fitch, 1046 Patton Street. Mr. Fitch commented on the local properties and local landscapes that are considered to have local significance but are not on the National Register of Historic Places and his concerns about the loss of historic properties such as those in the African American community which are then considered development prospects.
- III **Agenda.** A motion was made by Commissioner Hammond-Green to amend the agenda to move the approval of the minutes to the next regular meeting and seconded by Commissioner Boyd to approve the agenda as amended.
- IV **Minutes.**
- V **New Business**
- V(A) **Certificate of appropriateness,** Laura Flores, 147 4th Ave W (File No. H22-119-COA). Prior to the opening of the public hearing, Chair announced that any persons desiring to testify at any of the public hearings must first be sworn as witnesses and will be subject to cross-examination by parties or persons whose position may be contrary to yours. A copy of the protocol for a quasi-judicial hearing is provided on the back table next to the agenda. Since this is a quasi-judicial hearing, it is very important that we have an accurate record of what goes on. Therefore, we must ask that you refrain from speaking until recognized by the Chair and, when recognized, come forward to the podium and begin by stating your name and address. Anyone who wishes to testify during the public hearings should come forward to be sworn in. Chair swore in all potential witnesses.

Chair opened the public hearing.

Alexandra Hunt, Planner, stated that the City is in receipt of a Certificate of Appropriateness application from Laura Flores for the addition of an exterior light fixture above an existing sign at the subject property located at 147 4th Ave W (PIN: 9568-78-6159). The subject property is approximately 0.36 acres and is zoned C-1 Central Business and is located in the Main Street Historic District. The COA application is considered a Major Work.

A vicinity map was shown with the subject property highlighted in green.

An aerial view was shown with the parcel outlined in red.

The subject property is a contributing, two-story brick Commercial style building constructed ca. 1920/ There are 6 storefronts that have been modified with metal panels and aluminum frame display windows and doors.

Ms. Hunt read through the COA history of the subject property which is included in the staff report.

Photos of the existing condition of the subject property were shown including the proposed location of the light fixture above the existing sign.

Ms. Hunt stated that the applicant submitted a proposed light fixture which is an exterior black steel gooseneck sconce. A photo of the proposed light fixture is included in the staff report.

Photos of examples of exterior lighting within the Main Street Historic District were shown.

Ms. Hunt referenced in the staff report Section 2.4.1 of the Design Standards which state to introduce exterior lighting that is compatible with the historic nature of the structure, the property and the district with the compatibility of the exterior lighting fixtures is assessed in terms of design, materials, use, size, scale, color, and brightness.

Ms. Hunt showed a photo of D-9 Brewing's exterior light fixtures which are similar to what has been proposed by the applicant.

The Design Standards that are applicable to this COA application were shown and are also included in the staff report.

The Chair asked if there were any questions for Staff.

Commissioner Boyd asked if it is just to be a single light fixture.

Ms. Hunt stated that the applicant is proposing just one single light fixture.

The Chair asked the applicant to address the Commission.

Laura Flores, 832 4th Ave W. Ms. Flores stated that the awning itself hampers the visibility of the business sign itself and that is why she is proposing to add a light fixture to make her sign more visible.

The Chair asked if there was anyone present who was opposed or for the application.

The Chair closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Hammond-Green moved the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in File # H22-119-COA and located within the Main Street Historic District, if added according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hendersonville Historic

Preservation Commission Design Standards (Main Street) for the following reasons: (1) The proposed exterior light fixture is compatible with the historic nature of the property and district in terms of design, material, use, size, scale, and color. [Sec. 2.4.1] (1) The proposed location of the exterior light fixture does not conceal any historic architectural features of the existing brick façade. [Sec. 2.4.3]; with the following Condition(s): (1) The proposed exterior light will be compatible with the district in terms of brightness and will not spill light onto adjacent properties; (2) Mount the proposed exterior light fixture in a manner that does not damage the historic brick façade and that follows historic preservation best practices for mounting fixtures on brick facades. Commissioner Branigan seconded the motion which passed unanimously. The application was approved.

V(B) **Certificate of Appropriateness.** Eli M. Jones, 123 3rd Ave W. (File No. H22-117-COA).

Chair opened the public hearing.

Ms. Hunt stated staff was in receipt of a Certificate of Appropriateness application Eli M. Jones to partially fill-in the existing window openings of two windows located on the rear façade of the subject property and the addition of two new windows in each of the remaining window openings. In addition to the request in the submitted COA application, the Applicant is also requesting approval for the replacement of the existing door located between the two windows on the rear façade be replaced with a steel door to match an existing steel door located in the rear façade of the adjacent storefront – 119 3rd Ave W. The subject property located at 123 3rd Ave W /PIN 9569-72-0766. It is approximately .18 acres and is zoned C-1 Central Business and is located in the Main Street Historic District. This COA application is considered a Major Work according to the standards of the Main Street Historic District Design Standards.

A vicinity map was shown with the subject property highlighted in green.

An aerial view was shown with the parcel outlined in red.

The subject property is a Contributing, two-story brick Commercial Style building with two storefront openings.

Ms. Hunt indicated that there is a mistake in the staff report as it shows the storefronts to the left of the subject property addressed 127-131 3rd Ave W. The storefront shown during the presentation is the correct storefront and the subject property was constructed in 1910 as shown on the Sanborn Map circled in green.

Ms. Hunt reviewed the past COA history which is included in the staff report.

Site photos were shown of the subject property taken by staff.

Photos were shown of examples of filled-in window openings fronting N. Main Street.

Ms. Hunt stated that these windows were filled in prior to the establishment of the Main Street local historic district.

The Design Standards that are applicable to this COA application were shown and are also included in the staff report.

Ms. Hunt stated that Aaron Black with Black and Alm Construction who has been contracted by the applicant is present to represent the application.

Chair asked if there were any questions for staff.

The Chair asked the applicant to address the Commission

Aaron Black, . Mr. Black stated that the existing windows had a lot of termite and water damage. There is also a safety concern as the windows are in the rear alley of the building.

The Chair asked if Mr. Black reviewed the design standards and that the specific proposal to fill in the existing windows are prohibited by the design standards and the Commission is held to the design standards.

Mr. Black stated that they would be willing to work with Staff to find an alternative proposal.

The Chair asked if Mr. Black would consider continuing this application to work with Staff to find a more appropriate proposal that is in line with the design standards.

Ms. Hunt asked if there was any particular guidance from the Commission on the door.

The Chair asked if there were previous COA applications for the replacement of the door on the rear façade.

Ms. Hunt stated that the only COA application that is on file is for the replacement of the roof system. There is no indication as to when the steel door was installed. Ms. Hunt also stated that the design standards for rear facades state that when used as service entry and place for garbage receptacles, rear facades are not held to the same design standards and are more private in appearance than side and front facades.

Mr. Manley stated that given Ms. Hunt's statement that this lends itself to have a rear façade door be more utilitarian in use which a steel door could meet that requirement.

The Chair stated that the design standards also state that the rear facades should be treated just as important as the front façades however, he understands the reality of today and the need for security particularly in the rear alleys. The Chair suggested that the applicant consider safety measures that could be installed from the interior.

**Commissioner Hammond-Green moved to continue this application to the February meeting.
Commissioner Battista seconded the motion which passed unanimously.**

VI Other Business.

VI(A) Discussion of Draft Presentation for Community Education & Outreach on Historic Preservation.

Commissioner Welter discussed the Community Affairs Committees work which includes community outreach about the importance of preservation and information about the local historic districts and what that means. One idea that the committee has worked on is to create a presentation to give to the different real estate offices around the City on the local historic districts and the difference between historic districts. Commissioner Welter presented a proposed outline for the presentation.

VIII ***Adjournment.*** The Chair adjourned the meeting at 6:40 p.m.

Chair

DRAFT