

**STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA
HENDERSON COUNTY**

**BEFORE THE HENDERSONVILLE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
FILE NO. H23-83-COA**

**IN RE THE APPLICATION OF
DANIEL AND AMY YODER
FOR A CERTIFICATE OF
APPROPRIATENESS
PIN 9569-43-6952**

DECISION

This matter came before the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission on November 15, 2023 for a quasi-judicial hearing on the application of Daniel and Amy Yoder for a certificate of appropriateness for a property located at 1704 Clairmont Drive, Hendersonville, NC, Druid Hills Historic District, Hendersonville, PIN 9569-43-6952 (“Subject Property”) for the construction of a second-floor addition to be constructed above and existing room on the rear of the existing structure, with the application being dated August 10, 2023.

The subject property is identified as a contributing property in the Druid Hills designation report.

The file was submitted into the record. In addition Alexandra Hunt, Planner and Tara Jordan, employee for the applicant’s contractor, testified and/or presented evidence, after first being duly sworn.

Issues

The Historic Preservation Commission’s adopted Residential Historic District Design Standards and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards are incorporated in these findings and conclusions by reference. The question presented was whether the relevant standards permit a second-floor addition on the rear of the existing structure as requested in the application.

Section 4.2 of the Residential Historic District Design Standards provides, in pertinent part, that:

4.2 Additions to Historic Buildings

- Sec. 4.2.1 - Construct new additions so that there is the least possible loss of historic fabric and so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not destroyed, damaged, or obscured.
- Sec. 4.2.5 - Locate a new addition on an inconspicuous elevation of the historic building, usually the rear one.
- Sec. 4.2.6 - Limit the size and the scale of an addition in relationship to the historic building so that it does not diminish or visually overpower the building.
- Sec. 4.2.7 - Design an addition to be compatible with the historic building in mass, materials, and relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls, yet make the addition discernible from the original.
- Sec. 4.2.8 - It is not appropriate to construct an addition if it will detract from the overall historic character of the principal building and the site, or if it will require the removal of a significant building element or site feature, such as a mature tree.

Testimony

Testimony is accurately reflected in the minutes.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Based on the above testimony, the Board finds as follows:

1. The affected property is 1704 Clairmont Drive, Hendersonville.
2. The Subject Property is situated within the Druid Hills Historic District
3. The Subject Property is listed as **contributing** in the Druid Hills Local Designation Report.
4. The Subject Property is described in the Druid Hills Historic District Local Designation Report as follows:

“Ella Ross House.” One-story bungalow with a hip roof and a basement level at the rear. Wing at the rear projects to the northeast. Engaged wraparound porch has a projecting front gable over the entry area. Porch details include squire posts on brick piers and a simple balustrade. Wood siding on the upper level, brick on the basement level walls. Front gable end at the porch has paneled v-boards, possibly a replacement of the original. Windows are six-over-one and the front door is six-light-overpanel. A garage is located below the porch at the southeast corner. Large lot, drops away to the rear, mature trees, perennial beds. Ella Ross, widow of Henry C. Ross, lived in this house from 1937 through `944. At that time, Miss Gladys Ross also lived in the house. Gladys Ross continued to live in the house through at least 1949. Good condition.
5. Applicant has requested a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a second story addition over an existing room on the rear of the existing home.
6. The rear of the lot abuts property that is not within the Druid Hills Local Historic District.
7. It is not feasible due to the size of the lot and slope of the yard to construct the addition at the same level of the existing structure.
8. Due to the slope of the lot, only a small portion of the addition will be visible from the street.
9. The original structure has wood siding.
10. The proposed windows on the addition will be wood or aluminum-clad wood.
11. The proposed addition will have dormers and a bungalow-style roof to match the architectural style of the existing structure but provide features that differentiate it from the existing structure.
12. The applicant will agree to use asphalt shingles on the addition.

13. The proposed addition is **not incongruous** with the Druid Hills Historic District because it meets the following Design Standards:
- a. Sec. 4.2.1 – The new addition creates the least possible loss of historic fabric and does not destroy, damage, or obscure character-defining features of the historic building.
 - b. Sec. 4.2.5 – The new addition is located on the rear of the building.
 - c. Sec. 4.2.6 – The size and scale of the addition does not diminish or visually overpower the building.
 - d. Sec. 4.2.7 – The design of the addition is compatible with the historic building in mass, materials, and relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls and is discernible from the original.
 - e. Sec. 4.2.8 – The new addition does not detract from the overall historic character of the principal building and the site.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based on the above findings of fact, the Commission concludes as follows:

The second-floor addition as described in the application, and with the representations made by the applicant at the hearing, is **not incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards pursuant to Section 28-147 of the City Code, and the Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved**, with the following condition:

- a. The roof of the addition will be asphalt shingle to match the existing structure.

DECISION

For the above reasons, the application for a certificate of appropriateness is granted subject to the conditions stated, and the certificate is ordered issued.

Done this 20th day of December, 2023.

Chair