



# CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY PLANNING DIVISION



**SUBMITTER:** Alexandra Hunt, Planner I      **MEETING DATE:** November 16, 2022

**AGENDA SECTION:** New Business      **DEPARTMENT:** Community Development

**TITLE OF ITEM:** 1109 N Main St. – Addition of Metal Roof & Painting the Exterior Brick (H22-083-COA) – *Alexandra Hunt | Planner I*

## **SUGGESTED MOTION(S):**

### **1. For Recommending Approval:**

I move the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in file # H22-083-COA and located within the Hyman Heights Historic District, if replaced according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, is **not incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards (Residential) for the following reasons:

1. The addition of the metal roof matches the original in scale and color of the building. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible. [Sec. 3.5.5]

**[DISCUSS & VOTE]**

### **1. For Recommending Denial:**

I move the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in file # H22-083-COA and located within the Hyman Heights Historic District, if added according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, **is incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards (Residential) for the following reasons:

1. The addition of the metal roof **does not** contribute to the overall historic character of the building including roofing materials. [Sec. 3.5.1]
2. The addition of the metal roof **does not** match the original in scale, detail, pattern, design, and material. [Sec. 3.5.5]
3. The proposed request to paint the exterior brick is **not appropriate** as brick should be left in their historically unfinished condition. [Sec. 3.4.4]

**[DISCUSS & VOTE]**

## SUMMARY:

The City is in receipt of an after-the-fact Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) application from Melissa Wilkinson (Applicant/Property Owner) for the addition of a metal roof and painting the exterior brick of the subject property located at 1109 N Main St.

The subject property is a contributing building that was constructed ca. 1949 and known as the Robert McMinn House.

On August 22, 2022, Staff notified the Applicant by letter that a roof replacement in the Hyman Heights Historic District requires a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) application from the Historic Preservation Commission pursuant to Chapter 28 of the City Code of Ordinances as it is a change to the exterior of the house/property.

On August 29, 2022, the Applicant submitted an after-the-fact COA application for the addition of the metal roof and painting the exterior brick. The Applicant also included additional proposed work that is considered normal maintenance and repair, or a minor work project that would either not require a COA or can be approved by staff. (*see* Exhibit A) The proposed major works projects that are being considered by the HPC is the addition of the metal roof and painting the exterior brick. The Applicant made the following statement related to their request:

“I respectfully ask for approval on my roof, and advisement on the color of paint for the exterior body of the house and trim.”

On November 4, 2022, staff conducted a survey of the Hyman Heights Historic District and identified one house with a metal roof similar. Staff verified that there was no COA application submitted for the replacement of the roof and the property owner was sent a notice of violation. Additionally, Staff identified homes with painted brick veneer specifically along Patton Avenue, Highland Avenue, Hyman Avenue, and N Main Street and verified that the painted brick veneer existed at prior to and/or at the time the district was surveyed.

This COA Application is considered a Major Work according to the standards of the Residential Historic District Design Standards.

<b>PROJECT/PETITIONER NUMBER:</b>	H22-083-COA
<b>PETITIONER NAME:</b>	Melissa Wilkinson (Owner/Applicant)
<b>EXHIBITS:</b>	A. Staff Report B. COA Application C. Henderson County Property Records