



DATE: August 4, 2022
TO: Brian Pahle
COMPANY: City of Hendersonville, NC
ADDRESS: 160 Sixth Avenue East, Second Floor
CITY/STATE: Hendersonville, NC 28792
COPY TO: Jamie Carpenter
FROM: Posluszny, Geoffrey
PROJECT NAME: Hendersonville Multi-space Meters
PROJECT NUMBER: 19-001279.00

3545 WHITEHALL PARK DRIVE,
SUITE 425
CHARLOTTE NC 28273

704.247.6230
WALKERCONSULTANTS.COM

The City of Hendersonville, NC (“Hendersonville”) through a public process issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for a comprehensive Multi-Space Meter (“MSM”), and Mobile License Plate Recognition (“MLPR”) system for on-street and off-street parking areas. The RFP was issued June 17, 2022, a mandatory site visit was held on July 7, 2022, and the Proposals were due on July 29, 2022. Following is a review of the proposals received.

MSM OVERVIEW

The RFP was advertised on the City of Hendersonville’s website, North Carolina’s Interactive Purchasing System, which includes the Historically Underutilized Businesses, and invitations were emailed to known vendors that supply these systems. Two nationally recognized manufacturers and two local value-added resellers (“VAR”) responded and attended the mandatory site visit. The manufacturers represented were Flowbird and T2 Systems, while the VARs were Carolina Time and Risetek. Carolina Time, on behalf of Flowbird, and T2 Systems provided responses to the RFP. Both responses included Genetec AutoVu as the solution for the Mobile License Plate Recognition (“MLPR”) solution.

CAROLINA TIME

Carolina Time & Parking Group (“Carolina Time” or “CT”) is a local Value-added Reseller and provided a proposal including Flowbird “Strada” multi-space meters and Genetec “AutoVu” mobile license plate recognition system. Carolina Time was founded in 1959 and is headquartered in Charlotte, North Carolina and many offices across the Carolinas and Virginia. CT is an authorized distributor of Flowbird parking solutions in the Carolinas.

Carolina Time’s RFP response was issued from their closest local office located in Greenville, SC less than one (1) hour from Hendersonville which will also support Hendersonville’s installation. The Greenville location is supported by three (3) technicians and one operations manager. They employ over 60 staff members in multiple offices including 32 service technicians. Their references include:

City of Savannah, GA, Sean Brandon, 912.651.6470, SBrandon@SavannahGA.gov

City of Greenville, SC, Bill Foster, 864.298.2780, BiFoster@GreenvilleSC.gov

City of Durham, NC, Thomas Leathers, 919.560.4157 x36207, Thomas.Leathers@DurhamNC.gov

City of Clemson, SC, Lindsey Newton, 864.653.2081, LNewton@CityofClemson.org

FLOWBIRD MULTI-SPACE METERS

Flowbird boasts as the largest parking meter manufacturer in the world. In 2018, two of the largest multi-space meter manufacturers, Parkeon and Cale, merged and is now called the “Flowbird Group”. The proposed Flowbird “Strada” Meter will be programmed and controlled by Flowbird’s WebOffice software. The Strada meter is manufactured using epoxy powder-coated heavy grade steel and will be equipped with a 9.7” touch-screen display, bill and coin acceptors, EMV compliant credit card reader, and receipt printer.

WebOffice is a complete suite of services based on a unique IT platform developed and managed by Flowbird as a fully hosted service. The application manages information and programming via a password protected, web-based interface. All event occurrences at the meter are recorded, time stamped, and regularly transmitted to the server which is then available for client review and analysis. WebOffice is available to those with a valid username and password, with each user being assigned certain roles within the software, i.e., reporting but not programming.

Flowbird’s references include:

City of Durham, NC, Thomas Leathers, 919.560.4157 x36207, Thomas.Leathers@DurhamNC.gov

City of Raleigh, NC, Tony Howard, 919.996.3996, Charles.Howard@RaleighNC.gov

Parking Authority of River City in Louisville, KY, Steve Bartley, 502.574.2797, Steven.Bartley@LouisvilleKY.gov

T2 SYSTEMS

T2 systems proposed directly to the City’s RFP and included their Luke Cosmo multi-space meter with IRIS software, and Genetec “AutoVu” mobile license plate recognition system. T2 will contract with Creative Parking Concepts to install the T2 Luke Cosmo meters and Comsonics to install the Genetec LPR system.

T2’s Luke Cosmo MSM is designed specifically as a cost-effective solution for on-street parking. The Cosmo features the shallowest cabinet available and is pedestrian and maintenance friendly. The Cosmo meter will come equipped with a tactile keyboard, coin acceptor, EMV compliant credit card reader, and receipt printer. The Cosmo meter does not come with an available bill acceptor. T2’s proposal referred installing Luke II paystations; however, this is not accurate.

T2 IRIS software is a secure cloud-based system accessible from any web browser; however, it is actually a “hosted solution”. The IRIS features include a customizable dashboard, flexible reporting, per performance metrics, maps of paystation locations, account management, user management, user defined alerts, and maintenance and collections centers.

T2 references include:

City of Glendale, CA, Tad Dombroski, 818.548.3960, TDombroski@GlendaleCA.gov

City of Houston, TX, Maria Irshad, 832.393.8643, Maria.Irshad@HoustonTX.gov

City of Miami Beach, FL, Saul Frances, 305.673.7000 x6483, SaulFrancis@MiamiBeachFL.gov

CREATIVE PARKING CONCEPTS

Creative Parking Concepts is an authorized reseller of T2 products in TN, GA, and the Carolinas and will be providing installation and maintenance services of the T2 Cosmo meters. They are headquartered in Nashville, TN, which is over five (5) hours from Hendersonville, NC. Their references include:

CARTA/Chattanooga Parking Authority, Brent Matthews, 423.421.3476, Matthews_Brent@GoCARTA.org

City of Charlotte, NC, Allison Naftel, 704.336.3922, ANaftel@ci.Charlotte.NC.US

Vanderbilt University, Tracy Owens, Tracy.A.Owens@Vanderbilt.Edu, Tiffany.M.Fentress@Vanderbilt.Edu, 615.322.8941

COMSONICS – MOBILE LICENSE PLATE RECOGNITION

Both companies are proposing Genetec AutoVu Cameras, Panasonic Toughpad, and Patroller Software installed by ComSonics.

The following information is provided via the Carolina Time proposal as T2 did not provide any information for this subcontractor.

ComSonics is an authorized LPR certified partner of Genetec, Inc. ComSonics contact it Mike Nesselrodt, 540.434.5965 x1228, MNesselrodt@Comsonics.com. Comsonics is an employee-owned corporation located in Harrisonburg, VA which is approximately six (6) hours away from Hendersonville, NC.

ComSonic references include:

City of Greenville, SC, Bill Foster, 864.298.2780, BiFoster@GreenvilleSC.gov

City of Greensboro, NC, Stephen Carter, 336.333.6879, Stephen.Carter@Greensboro-NC.gov

City of Houston, TX, Rami Arafat, 832.393.8658, Rami.Arafat@HoustonTX.gov

PRICING BREAKDOWN

Carolina Time's base price for the Multi-Space Meters of \$290,269.83 was lower than T2 Systems' price of \$360,497.79 by approximately \$70,000 and the Flowbird meter includes a bill acceptor while T2's meter does not. Carolina Time's price for the Mobile License Plate Recognition System of \$46,739.42 was higher than T2 Systems' price of \$36,107.55 by approximately \$10,000 even though they are both proposing Genetec MLPR installed by ComSonic. The total base price for Carolina Time is \$337,009.25 while T2's is \$396,605.35.

Recurring Fees are mandatory expenses to operate the systems you have purchased. For instance, the programming and reporting software is an on-line hosted service that must be paid for over time. These fees are known as Software as a Service ("SAAS") fees.

Multi-Space SaaS fees were \$89,100.00 for Carolina Time's Flowbird meters and WebOffice software compared to \$121,500 for T2's meters and Iris software. The MLPR fees were \$22,020.00 for Carolina Time's MLPR software compared to \$22,620.51 for T2's MLPR software. These fees are considered Operating Expenses vs. the Capital Expense of the hardware pricing. The total six-year cost for Carolina Time's proposal is \$448,129.25 and \$540,725.85 for T2 Systems proposal.

Preventive Maintenance and Service as well as parts warranty annual pricing was also requested from the vendors. These services are optional, but if contracted for, serve as a fixed operating expense for budgeting purposes. PM, Service, and warranty pricing for Carolina Time Meters totaled \$71,835.00 while T2's pricing totaled \$113,400.00 and these fees for MLPR totaled \$33,283.95 and \$34,619.73, respectively. If PM, Service, and Warranty are selected for the six-years, the total is \$553,248.20 for Carolina Time's system and \$688,745.58 for T2 Systems.

Spare parts pricing was also requested and is again, optional. Carolina Time suggested spare parts totaling \$6,584.00 and T2 suggested \$7,858.95 for spare parts.

Please reference pricing table on the following page.

Respectfully Submitted,

Walker Consultants



Geoffrey Poslusny, CPP
Parking Technology and Operations Consultant



Appendix A Proposal Price Tabulation Form City of Hendersonville, NC - Price Comparison		
OFFEROR:	Carolina Time/Flowbird/Genetec	T2/Genetec
MSM BASE PRICE	\$285,669.83	\$360,497.79
Other Costs	\$4,600.00	\$0.00
1 YEAR COST BASE	\$290,269.83	\$360,497.79
MLPR BASE PRICE	\$42,789.42	\$36,107.55
Other Costs	\$3,950.00	\$0.00
1 YEAR COST BASE	\$46,739.42	\$36,107.55
TOTAL SYSTEM 1 YEAR COST BASE	\$337,009.25	\$396,605.34
RECURRING FEES, PREVENTIVE MAINTENANCE, AND SERVICE CONTRACTS		
MSM Recurring FEES (Years 2-6)	\$89,100.00	\$121,500.00
MSM 6 YEAR MANDATORY COST	\$379,369.83	\$481,997.79
MSM PM & SERVICE (Years 2-6)	\$43,335.00	\$45,900.00
MSM PARTS WARRANTY (Years 2-6)	\$28,500.00	\$67,500.00
MSM 6 YEAR OPTIONAL COST	\$451,204.83	\$595,397.79
MLPR Recurring FEES (Years 2-6)	\$22,020.00	\$22,620.51
MLPR 6 YEAR MANDATORY COST	\$68,759.42	\$58,728.06
MLPR PM & SERVICE (Years 2-6)	\$19,750.00	\$20,625.80
MLPR PARTS WARRANTY (Years 2-6)	\$13,533.95	\$13,993.93
MLPR 6 YEAR OPTIONAL COST	\$102,043.37	\$93,347.79
TOTAL SYSTEM MANDATORY 6 YEAR COST	\$448,129.25	\$540,725.85
TOTAL SYSTEM OPTIONAL 6 YEAR COST	\$553,248.20	\$688,745.58
OPTIONAL SPARE PARTS		
MSM OPTIONAL SPARE PARTS	\$6,584.00	\$7,440.00
MLPR OPTIONAL SPARE PARTS	\$0.00	\$418.95