

**STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA  
HENDERSON COUNTY**

**BEFORE THE HENDERSONVILLE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
FILE NO. H22-83-COA**

**IN RE THE APPLICATION OF  
MELISSA WILKINSON FOR  
A CERTIFICATE OF  
APPROPRIATENESS  
PIN 9569-71-5665**

**FINDINGS OF FACT,  
CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND DECISION**

This matter came before the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission on November 16, 2022 for a quasi-judicial hearing on the application of Melissa Wilkinson for a certificate of appropriateness for a property located at 1109 N Main St, Hendersonville, NC, Hyman Heights Historic District, Hendersonville, PIN 9569-71-5665 (“Subject Property”) for the addition of a metal roof, painting of the exterior of the brick, and the addition of gutters that do not match the trim color of the house..

The subject property is referred to as the Robert McMinn house and is identified as a contributing property in the Hyman Heights designation report.

The file was submitted into the record. In addition Alexandra Hunt, Planner and Melissa Wilkinson, applicant/property owner testified and/or presented evidence, after first being duly sworn.

**Issues**

The Historic Preservation Commission’s adopted Residential Historic District Design Standards and the Sectary of the Interior’s Standards are incorporated in these findings and conclusions by reference. The question presented was whether the relevant standards permit the addition of a metal roof, painting of the exterior brick, and the addition of gutters that do not match the trim color of the house as requested in the application.

The Residential Historic District Design Standards provides, in pertinent part, that:

**Section 3.2 Masonry:**

**Sec. 3.2.2** - Protect and maintain historic masonry materials, such as brick, terracotta, limestone, granite, stucco, slate, concrete, cement block, and clay tile, and their distinctive construction features, including bonding patterns, corbels, water tables, and unpainted surfaces.

**Section 3.3 Architectural Metals:**

**Sec. 3.3.10** - It is not appropriate to introduce architectural metal features or details to a historic building in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.

**Section 3.4 Paint and Paint Color:**

**Sec. 3.4.3** - When repainting, paint colors appropriate to the historic building and district are recommended. Enhance the architectural style and features of a building through appropriate selection and placement of paint color.

**Sec. 3.4.4** - Brick, stone, copper, bronze, concrete, or cement block surfaces should be left in their historically unfinished condition.

### **Section 3.5 Roofs:**

**Sec. 3.5.1** - Retain and preserve roofs and roof forms that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including their functional and decorative features, such as roofing materials, cresting, dormers, chimneys, cupolas, and cornices.

**Sec. 3.5.5** - If full replacement of a deteriorated historic roofing material or feature is necessary, replace it in kind, matching the original in scale, detail, pattern, design, material, and color. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.

### **Testimony**

Testimony is accurately reflected in the minutes.

### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

Based on the above testimony, the Board finds as follows:

1. The affected property is 1109 N Main St Ave, Hendersonville.
2. The Subject Property is situated within the Hyman Heights Historic District
3. The Subject Property is listed as contributing in the Local Designation Report.
4. The Subject Property was constructed circa 1949 and is known as the Robert McMinn House, according to Historic Preservation Commission records.
5. Applicant has requested to add a metal roof, to paint the exterior brick, and to add gutters that do not match the trim color of the house.
6. The proposed metal roof has already been installed on the house, the application is for an after the fact Certificate of Appropriateness as to the roof.
7. Prior to the addition of the metal roof, the roof was previously finished with asphalt shingles.
8. The proposed gutters have already been installed on the house, the application is for an after the fact Certificate of Appropriateness as to the gutters.
9. Installation of gutters that match the trim color of the house is permitted as

normal maintenance and does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness. However, since the Applicant has added black gutters to the house which has white trim, a Certificate of Appropriateness is required.

10. The basement of the home was flooding due to deterioration of the roof prompting the Applicant to install the metal roof.
11. Asphalt shingles that matched the existing asphalt shingles would have taken several months to be delivered.
12. The Applicant withdrew her request to paint the exterior brick at the hearing.
13. The Applicant agreed to paint the gutters and downspouts to match the trim of the house.
10. The proposed addition is not incongruous with the Hyman Heights Historic District and meets the following Design Standards:
  - a. Section 3.5.5 – the replacement roof matches the original in scale and color. Compatible substitute materials are appropriate because the original material is not technically feasible due to roof deterioration causing flooding in the basement requiring prompt correction.

### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

Based on the above findings of fact, the Commission concludes as follows:

The addition of a metal roof as proposed is not incongruous with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards pursuant to Section 28-147 of the City Code, and the Certificate of Appropriateness should be granted, subject to any conditions as stated above.

### **DECISION**

For the above reasons,

The application for a certificate of appropriateness is granted, subject to the conditions as stated, and the certificate is ordered issued.

Done this 21st day of December, 2022.

---

Chair