

**STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA  
HENDERSON COUNTY**

**BEFORE THE HENDERSONVILLE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
FILE NO. H22-120-COA**

**IN RE THE APPLICATION OF  
HENDERSONVILLE HOLDINGS,  
LLC AND DUNLAP CONSTRUCTION  
CO. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF  
APPROPRIATENESS  
PIN 9568-77-8673**

**FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF  
LAW AND DECISION**

This matter came before the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission on February 15, 2023 for a quasi-judicial hearing on the application of Hendersonville Holdings, LLC and Dunlap Construction Co. for a certificate of appropriateness for a property located at 225 S Main Street, Hendersonville, NC, Main Street Historic District, Hendersonville, PIN 9568-77-8673 (“Subject Property”) to add windows to second floor side and rear facades, with the application being dated January 16, 2023.

The subject property is identified as a contributing property in the Main Street local designation report.

The file was submitted into the record. In addition Alexandra Hunt, Planner; Dennis Dunlap, applicant/contractor; and Larry Hogan, adjoining property owner testified, after first being duly sworn.

**Issues**

The Historic Preservation Commission’s adopted Main Street Design Standards and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards are incorporated in these findings and conclusions by reference. The question presented was whether the relevant standards permit the addition 8 windows to the south façade as well as the removal of an existing window and door on the rear façade and the addition of windows in a semi-circle pattern as requested in the application.

Section 3.4.2 of the Design Standards provides in pertinent part that:

**Section 3.4.2 Windows and Doors**

**Sec. 3.4.2.10** - It is not appropriate to introduce new windows or doors if they would diminish the original design of the building or damage historic materials and features. Keep new windows and doors compatible with existing units in proportion, shape, positioning, location, size, materials, and details.

**Sec. 3.4.2.11** - If a new window or door is required to meet building and safety codes, it should be done in a way that is the least intrusive to the façade and without destroying historic materials and features.

Section 3.3 of the Design Standards provides in pertinent part that:

**Section 3.3 Side and Rear Facades**

**Sec. 3.3.1** - Retain and preserve historic façade details and materials on side and rear elevations.

**Sec. 3.3.9 -** If new construction of a side or rear façade is necessary, make sure that the design is compatible with the existing side and rear facades in the district including size & spacing of windows or other fenestrations, proportion, scale, and detailing.

Section 3.8 of the Design Standards provides in pertinent part that:

**Section 3.8. Artificial Materials Policy**

**Sec. 3.8.1 -** Artificial materials are not appropriate on buildings on contributing properties. Existing artificial materials on contributing properties should be replaced with traditional materials.

**Testimony**

Testimony is accurately reflected in the minutes.

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

Based on the above testimony, the Board finds as follows:

1. The affected property is 225 N Main Street, Hendersonville.
2. The Subject Property is located at 225 N Main Street, Hendersonville, and is more particularly described in a deed recorded in Deed Book 3877 at page 151 of the Henderson County registry.
3. The Subject Property is situated within the Hendersonville Main Street Historic District.
4. The Subject Property is listed as contributing in the Local Historic Designation Report for Hendersonville Main Street Historic District Hendersonville, North Carolina (the “Designation Report.”) The Designation Report is incorporated in these findings and conclusions by reference.
5. The Subject Property is referred to as the People’s National Bank Building in the Designation Report.
6. The Subject Property was constructed circa 1910 according to the Designation Report and was designed by notable architect Richard Sharp Smith.
7. The Designation Report specifically names Richard Sharp Smith’s association with the District as a reason for the significance of the District.
8. The storefronts are in the original configuration, but with some replacement modern materials.
9. Existing windows on the second-story front façade are group in pairs with a common sill and have a limestone lintel above.
10. The building is constructed with steel framing and reinforced concrete and is one of the earliest examples of such construction in the Hendersonville Main Street Historic District.
11. There are no windows on the southern façade. The first-story shares a common wall with the property immediately to the south, the second-story is exposed.
12. There is one window and a door on the second-story of the rear façade. There is also an exterior metal staircase. The existing window and door have canvas awnings.

13. The applicant has proposed the addition of 8 aluminum clad, wood windows on the second-story side façade.
14. The applicant has also proposed the removal of the window and door on the rear façade, and the addition of a aluminum clad, wood windows in a semi-circle pattern to the rear façade.
15. There have never been windows present on the second-story side (southern) façade.
16. The rear façade crumbled when the property owner immediately to the north previously attempted to install new windows in the late 1970s.
17. The proposed windows are incongruous with the Hendersonville Main Street Historic District because the Subject Property is a contributing structure, and the applications fails to meet the following Design Standards:
  - a. Section 3.4.2.10 – The proposed windows diminish the original design of the building or damage historic materials and features.
  - b. Section 3.4.2.11 – The proposed windows are not compatible with existing units in proportion, shape, positioning, location, size, materials, and details.
  - c. Section 3.1.1 – The proposed windows do not retain and preserve historic façade details and materials on side and rear elevations.

### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based on the above findings of fact, the Commission concludes as follows:

The addition of windows on the second-story side (southern) and rear (western) facades on the Subject Property as proposed is **incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Main Street Historic District pursuant to Section 28-147 of the City Code, and the Certificate of Appropriateness should be **denied**.

### DECISION

For the above reasons, the application for a certificate of appropriateness is **denied**.

Done this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2023.

---

Chair