

**STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA
HENDERSON COUNTY**

**BEFORE THE HENDERSONVILLE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
FILE NO. H23-45-COA**

**IN RE THE APPLICATION OF
THE CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
FOR A CERTIFICATE OF
APPROPRIATENESS
PIN 9568-88-1652**

DECISION

This matter came before the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission on July 19, 2023 for a quasi-judicial hearing on the application of The City of Hendersonville for a certificate of appropriateness for a property located at 160 6th Ave E, Hendersonville, NC, Main Street Historic District, Hendersonville, PIN 9568-88-1652 (“Subject Property”) for the reopening of existing windows on the first floor, with the application being dated May 18, 2023.

The subject property is referred to as the City Hall and is identified as a contributing property in the Main Street designation report.

The file was submitted into the record. In addition Alexandra Hunt, Planner and Alberto Torres, architect testified and/or presented evidence, after first being duly sworn.

Issues

The Historic Preservation Commission’s adopted Main Street Historic District Design Standards and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards are incorporated in these findings and conclusions by reference. The question presented was whether the relevant standards permit the reopening of existing windows on the first floor of the structure that have been filled, as requested in the application.

Section 3.4.2 of the Main Street Historic District Design Standards provides, in pertinent part, that:

Section 3.4.2 Windows and doors:

Windows and doors by their proportion, shape, positioning, location, pattern, and size can contribute significantly to a building’s historic character and are particularly indicative of stylistic periods. These openings in a building’s exterior also provide opportunities for natural light, ventilation, and visual connections to the interior.

3.4.2.2 Retain and preserve openings and details of windows and doors, such as trim, sash, glass, lintels, sills, thresholds, shutters, and hardware.

3.4.2.4 It is not appropriate to replace windows or doors with stock items that do not fill the original openings or duplicate the unit in size, material, and design.

3.4.2.9 It is not appropriate to fill in existing window or door openings or to replace or cover them with plywood.

3.4.2.10 It is not appropriate to introduce new windows or doors if they would diminish the original design of the building or damage historic materials and features. Keep new windows and doors compatible with existing units in proportion, shape, positioning, location, size, materials, and details.

3.4.2.13 It is not appropriate to use snap-in muntins to create a false divided light appearance.

Testimony

Testimony is accurately reflected in the minutes.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Based on the above testimony, the Board finds as follows:

1. The affected property is 160 6th Ave E, Hendersonville.
2. The Subject Property is situated within the Main Street Local Historic District
3. The Subject Property is listed as contributing in the Main Street Local Designation Report.
4. The Subject Property is described in the Main Street Historic District Local Designation Report as follows:

A conservative, Neo-Classical Revival structure, designed by Erle Stillwell. It is a rectangular, two-story brick structure with a raised basement. A flight of stairs leads up to the main entrance, which is under a full height tetrastyle portico. The actual entrance consists of a bracketed, pedimented doorway. The roof is flat and unadorned. Windows are double hung, framed by molded concrete surrounds and cornice on first floor, and arched brick with a concrete keystone above second floor windows. An inscription above the portico reads "Erected by the People / Dedicated to the Perpetuation / of Civic Progress Liberty and / The Security of Public Honor." Host of the original interior fabric is intact. Hendersonville's City Hall is one of several public structures executed by local architect Erle Stillwell during the 1920s. Although he sometimes employed other styles, Stillwell worked most frequently in a conservative Neo-Classical style in his non-residential buildings. The structure reflects both the prosperity of Hendersonville during the 1920s and the architectural sophistication Erle Stillwell's practice brought to the city. It replaced a circa 1892 Romanesque City Hall and Opera House which had been on Main Street. The new structure was started in 1926 and dedicated in November of 1928.

5. Applicant has requested a Certificate of Appropriateness to reopen existing windows that have been filled in on the first floor/basement level of the building.
6. The windows were filled in approximately three years before the Historic District was established requiring certificates of appropriateness for this sort of work.
7. The proposed windows match existing windows on the building in size, scale,

shape, and material.

8. The original windows were removed and are not behind the limestone that was used to fill in the openings or set aside.
9. The proposal to reopen the windows is **not incongruous** with the Main Street Historic District because it meets the following Design Standards:
 - a. **Sec. 3.4.3.2** – The proposed windows fill the original openings.
 - b. **Sec. 3.4.2.9** – The proposed project to reopen existing filled in window openings is appropriate.
 - c. **3.4.2.10** - The proposed windows do not diminish the original design off the building or damage historic materials and features, and are compatible with existing units in proportion, shape, positioning, location, size, materials and details.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based on the above findings of fact, the Commission concludes as follows:

The reopening of the windows on the first floor of the structure, as proposed in the application, and with the representations made by the applicant at the hearing, is **not incongruous** with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards pursuant to Section 28-147 of the City Code, and the Certificate of Appropriateness should be **granted**.

DECISION

For the above reasons, the application for a certificate of appropriateness is granted subject to the conditions stated, and the certificate is ordered issued.

Done this 18th day of October, 2023.

Chair