



Town of Haymarket
 15000 Washington Street, #100
 Haymarket, VA 20169
 703-753-2600

Thomas Britt
 TOWN PLANNER

MEMORANDUM

TO: Architectural Review Board
 FROM: Thomas Britt
 DATE: December 12, 2024
 SUBJECT: ZP #2024-1104: 14920 Washington Street Demolition COA Application

APPLICATION SUMMARY:

Business/ Applicant: Water Creek Homes

Street Address: 14920 Washington Street

Proposed Alteration: Request for Demolition COA

Applicant’s Brief Description of the Activity: Request to obtain COA for demolition of structures at 14920 Washington Street. The Applicant has provided a narrative/request letter for the demolition, as well as reports of a two-phase environmental study to determine the level of contamination of the soil on site due to a hydraulic system used previously in the main building.

Town Planner Assessment		
Zoning Ordinance	Application Details	Staff Response
<p>Sec. 58-16.8 Matters to be considered by board in acting on appropriateness of erection, reconstruction, alteration, restoration or demolition of building or structure.</p>	<p>Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site.</p> <p>The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures and an environmental study.</p>	<p>The proposed alteration is visible from the public right of way.</p>
<p>Sec. 58-16.8 (1) Exterior architectural features, including all signs, which are subject to public view from a public street, way or place.</p>	<p>Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site.</p> <p>The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the</p>	<p>The proposed alteration is visible from the public right of way.</p>

	demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.	
Sec. 58-16.8 (2) General Design Arrangement	Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site. The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.	.
Sec. 58-16.8 (3) Texture, material and color	Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site. The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.	
Sec. 58-16.8 (4) The relation of the factors, subsections (1), (2), and (3) of this section, to similar features of the buildings and structures in the immediate surroundings	Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site. The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.	Not Applicable
Sec. 58-16.8 (5) The extent to which the building or structure would be harmonious with or obviously incongruous with	Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site.	Not Applicable

<p>the old and historic aspect of the surroundings</p>	<p>The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.</p>	
<p>Sec. 58-16.8 (6) In the case of a building to be razed, a primary consideration will be the extent to which its continued existence would tend to protect irreplaceable historic places and preserve the general historic atmosphere of the Town</p>	<p>Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site.</p> <p>The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.</p>	<p>The structures on site are listed in the Historic Inventory, removal of structures would compromise some of the 20th Century history of Haymarket.</p>
<p>Sec. 58-16.8 (7) The extent to which the building or structure will promote the general welfare of the Town, and all citizens, by the preservation and protection of historic places and areas</p>	<p>Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site.</p> <p>The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.</p>	<p>This matter is at the discretion of the ARB</p>
<p>Sec. 58-16.8 (8) The extent to which the building or structure will promote the general welfare by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Maintaining and increasing real estate values (b) Generating business (c) Creating new positions (d) Attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, and new residents 	<p>Demolition of original car repair shop and two accessory buildings on site.</p> <p>The applicant has supplied a brief narrative as to why the demolition permit has been requested for the structure, along with photo documentation of the structures.</p>	<p>These matters are at the discretion of the ARB</p>

(e) Encouraging study of and interest in American history		
(f) Stimulating interest in and study of architecture and design		
(g) Educating citizens in American culture and heritage		
(h) Making the Town a more attractive and desirable place in which to live		
Comprehensive Plan		
Comp Plan 1.5.3 Historic Resource Inventory List	Site - 14920 Washington Street	The main structures/site ARE NOT listed as a Historic Resource
Comp Plan 1.5.4 Potential Archaeological Site	Site - 14920 Washington Street	The site is not one of those listed as a potential archaeological site in the Comprehensive Plan
Architectural Review Board Historic Guidelines		
I. Introduction (E) Community Design and the Comprehensive Plan	Site - 14920 Washington Street	B-1 Property
II. Streetscape and Site Design		
II. (a) Washington Street Enhancement Project	Not applicable	Not applicable
II. (b) Streetscapes Other Than Washington Street	Not applicable	Not applicable
II. (c) Fences and Walls		
II. (d) Lighting (Free Standing/Posts)	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
II. (e) Telecommunication Dishes, Drums and Towers	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
II. (f) Screening	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
III. New Construction and Additions to Existing Non-Historic and Non-Contributing Structures		
III. (a) General Guidelines	<i>"to create a more pleasing blend of historic and new elements in the Town, new structures shall be compatible with the prevailing and recognized historic architectural character of the existing adjacent structures"</i>	These matters are at the discretion of the ARB
III. (b) Colors		
III. (c) Exterior Elements		Not Applicable
III. (d) Chimneys	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
III. (e) Roofing	Not Applicable	Not Applicable

III. (f) Lighting, (attached to structure)	None	None
III. (g) Windows and Doors	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
III. (h) Decks	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
III. (i) Handicapped Ramps	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
III. (j) Awnings	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
IV. Guidelines for Alterations or Additions to Historic Structures or Contributing Structures		
IV. (a) General Guidelines	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
V. Signage	Not Applicable	Not Applicable, not historic or contributing
VI. Demolition Guidelines	See Below	See Below
VII. Situations Not Covered, Additional Requirements	Not Applicable	Not Applicable

VI. DEMOLITION GUIDELINES

The Town Code has important requirements for all demolition of buildings within the Town.

A. SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS FOR HISTORIC STRUCTURES

The Haymarket Comprehensive Plan supports the preservation of the Town’s historic resources to the greatest extent possible. Therefore, there must be a compelling reason to demolish a historic structure.

- Applicants must provide a written statement explaining the reason for the demolition and describe alternatives to demolition and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.
- In some instances, the ARB may require a structural analysis of the building by a licensed professional engineer regarding the structural integrity of a building prior to a demolition permit decision.
- If an applicant is successful in demonstrating that a historic structure is a candidate for demolition the ARB may approve the demolition request with one or more of the following conditions, depending on the circumstances surrounding the request:
 1. Complete, professional, photographic documentation of the interior and exterior of the building, including black and white print and digital images.
 2. Phase I archaeological survey of the property to determine if the property yields information important to the Town’s history.
 3. The applicant must demonstrate that the site will be prepared and maintained in accordance with a landscape plan once the building has been demolished.
 4. The demolition may occur only following receipt of a building permit for the new construction.

ARTICLE XVI. - OLD AND HISTORIC HAYMARKET DISTRICT OVERLAY

Sec. 58-16.1 - Definitions.

The following words, terms, and phrases, when used in this article, shall have the meanings ascribed to them in this section, except where the context clearly indicates a different meaning:

'Board' means the Architectural Review Board, abbreviated 'ARB'.

'Altered' means any readily apparent change, including paint.

Sec. 58-16.2 - Purpose and Intent.

The Town of Haymarket seeks to identify, preserve, and enhance landmarks, buildings, structures, and neighborhoods with historical, cultural, and architectural significance to the Town. The historic overlay is intended to implement these goals and ensure that new development is in keeping with the character of Haymarket. The overlay intends to encourage a compatible aesthetic treatment within the Town, promote tourism and visitor opportunities, provide an attractive entry into town, and promote and advance the health, welfare and safety of town residents and visitors.

Sec. 58-16.3 - Creation; boundaries.

(a) In order to preserve the unique culture of the Town, there is hereby established an overlay district to be known as the "Historic Haymarket Overlay" which shall include all that area that lies within the corporate limits of the Town.

(b) Prior to any expansion of the historic district the Town shall identify and inventory all structures being considered for inclusion in such a district and shall establish written criteria to be used in making such determination. The Town shall identify all landmarks and designate by ordinance any resource as part of a local historic district, subsequent to soliciting public input in a manner consistent with Code of Virginia, §15.2-2204. The owners of such property proposed for designation shall be given written notice of the public hearing on the ordinance.

(c) The town may annually consider updates to the boundaries of the Historic Haymarket Overlay so that it is expanded to include newly identified historic resources, and/or contracted to reflect the removal or demolition of historic resources.

In order to promote the general welfare, through the preservation and protection of historic places and areas of historic interest, all buildings within the Historic Haymarket Overlay which were built prior to 1950 are designated historic resources.

Sec. 58-16.4 - Certificate of appropriateness required in the Historic Haymarket Overlay

(a) Application for a certificate of appropriateness shall be made to the Architectural Review Board. Any decision of the Architectural Review Board shall be appealable by any member of the Town Council after consultation with the Board, or any aggrieved person to the Town Council.

(b) No building, structure or sign shall be erected, reconstructed, altered, or restored within the Historic Haymarket Overlay, unless and until a complete application for a certificate of appropriateness shall have been approved by the Board or, on appeal, by the Town Council. Review of such applications by the Board will include analysis of external architectural features which are subject

to public view from a public street, way, or place, in light of their architectural compatibility with the historic buildings in the district.

(c) The zoning administrator shall determine whether a change is readily apparent, subject to appeal to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Sec. 58-16.5 - Architectural review board; creation, membership.

(a) For the purpose of making effective the provisions of this article, an Architectural Review Board (ARB) is established. The Board shall consist of up to seven members, but not fewer than five, appointed by the Town Council, and shall be legal residents of the Town. Board members will be appointed from the Town Council and one from the Planning Commission. Members should have a demonstrated interest, competence, or knowledge of historic preservation.

(b) The term of office of the members shall be for three years, except that the term of the Council member and Planning Commission member shall correspond to their official tenure of office. Members may be removed from office by Town Council at will and without notice. Appointments to fill vacancies shall be only for the unexpired portion of the term. Members may be reappointed to succeed themselves.

Sec. 58-16.6 - Chairman, vice-chairman, and secretary of the board.

The Architectural Review Board shall elect its chairman and vice-chairman from its membership, and the Town Clerk shall be its secretary.

Sec. 58-16.7- Rules

1. The ARB shall meet for a regular session at least once a month.
2. The Architectural Review Board shall adopt and maintain bylaws governing the procedure for meeting dates and other rules set forth by this article. The bylaws may be reviewed annually for updates.
3. Special meetings may be called in accordance with the ARB procedures as adopted and amended.
4. A quorum shall be no less than a majority of sitting members.
5. All meetings shall be open to the public unless the ARB enters closed session as permitted by the Virginia Freedom of Information Act.

Sec. 58-16.8 - Matters to be considered by the Board

1. The board shall not consider interior arrangement, relative size of the building or structure, detailed design or features not subject to any public view and shall not make any requirements regarding such matters. After receiving a certificate of appropriateness, the zoning administrator shall determine whether this provision applies.
2. The board shall consider the following in passing upon the appropriateness of architectural features:
 - (1) Exterior architectural features, including all signs, which are subject to public view from a public street, way, or place
 - (2) General design arrangement.
 - (3) Texture, material, and color.

- (4) The relation of the factors, subsections (1), (2), and (3) of this section, to similar features of the buildings and structures in the immediate surroundings.
- (5) The extent to which the building or structure would be harmonious with or obviously incongruous with the old and historic aspect of the surroundings.
- (6) In the case of a building to be razed, a primary consideration will be the extent to which its continued existence would tend to protect irreplaceable historic places and preserve the general historic atmosphere of the Town.
- (7) The extent to which the building or structure will promote the general welfare of the Town, and all citizens, by the preservation and protection of historic places and areas.
- (8) The extent to which the building or structure will promote the general welfare by:
 - a. Maintaining and increasing real estate value
 - b. Generating business;
 - c. Attracting tourists and visitors;
 - d. Encouraging study of and interest in American history, architecture, and design;
 - e. Making the Town a more attractive and desirable place in which to live.

Sec. 58-16.9 - Issuance of certificate of appropriateness.

Decisions of the Board will be incorporated in approved certificates of appropriateness or written reasons for disapproval. Immediately upon approval by the board of any application to erect, reconstruct, alter, restore, or raze a building, a certificate of appropriateness, signed by the chairman of the Board and bearing the date of issuance, shall be made available to the applicant. The zoning administrator shall refuse to honor any request for a building permit without such certificate of appropriateness, but a certificate of appropriateness will in no way affect the requirement to comply with the other provisions necessary to obtain a building permit.

Sec. 58-16.10 - Right of appeal.

- (a) Whenever the board shall approve or disapprove an application for a certificate of appropriateness or fail to take action within 60 days of its filing, any aggrieved party shall have the right to appeal and be heard before the Town Council provided such person files with the Town Clerk on or before 30 days after the decision of the board a written notice of appeal. Upon receipt of such notice, the Town Clerk shall place such appeal on the agenda for the next regular meeting of the Town Council.
- (b) Any party may appeal the decision of the Town Council to the circuit court pursuant to this section.
 - (1) A party is any applicant or any person who owns property adjacent to the property which the application concerns. For the purposes of this section, the term "adjacent" includes any property separated from the applicant's property only by a road and which would be adjacent if the road were not present.
 - (2) Appeal shall be by petition at law setting forth the alleged illegality of the action of the Town Council.
 - (3) The appellant must file the appeal with the circuit court of the county within 30 days of the Town Council's decision.
- (c) In addition to the right of appeal, the owner of an historic landmark, building or structure shall have

a right to raze or demolish such landmark, building or structure provided he has complied with the provisions of the second paragraph of Code of Virginia, § 15.2-2306(A)(3), as amended.

Sec. 58-16.11 - Deterioration by neglect.

(a) No owner of an officially designated historic building within the historic district shall allow it to deteriorate to the point where it is not economically feasible to repair or restore it. Specifically, no owner may permit:

(1) Deterioration of the exterior of a historic building to the extent that it creates or permits a hazardous or unsafe condition;

(2) Deterioration of exterior walls or other vertical supports, horizontal members, roofs, chimneys, exterior wall elements such as siding, wooden walls, brick, plaster, or mortar, of a historic building to the extent that it adversely affects the character of the historic district or could reasonably lead to irreversible damage to the structure. In determining whether deterioration adversely affects the character of the historic district, the zoning administrator shall be guided by the comprehensive plan and, if adopted, the strategic plan and capital improvements budget.

(b) If a building inspector determines that a historic structure is violating the Property Maintenance Code, he shall so notify the owner, the zoning administrator, and the chairman of the Architectural Review Board of this conclusion, stating the reason for such determination, and shall give the owner 30 days from the date of the notice in which to commence work rectifying the specifics, or to initiate a request to demolish, move or relocate such structure. If appropriate action is not timely taken, the Town Building Inspector shall initiate appropriate legal action.

Sec. 58-16.12 - Demolition review and approval

1. No historic resource, as defined in this article within the Historic Haymarket Overlay shall be demolished or moved, in whole or in part, until the demolition or moving thereof is approved by the Architectural Review Board, or, on appeal by the town council after consultation with the ARB.

2. In addition to the right of appeal set forth herein, the owner of a historic resource, the demolition or moving of which is subject to the provisions of this section, shall, as a matter of right, be entitled to demolish or move such historic resource provided that:

a. The owner or applicant has applied to the town council for such right,

b. the owner has for the period of time set forth in the schedule contained in Section 15.2-2306 of the Virginia code and at a price reasonably related to its fair market value, made a bona fide offer to sell the historic resource, and the land pertaining thereto, to the town or to any person, firm, corporation, government or agency thereof, or political subdivision or agency thereof, which gives reasonable assurance that it is willing to preserve and restore the historic resource and the land pertaining thereto, and,

c. No bona fide contract, binding upon all parties thereto, shall have been executed for the sale of any such historic resource, and the land pertaining thereto, prior to the expiration of the applicable time period set forth in the time schedule specified in the Virginia Code. Any appeal which may be taken to the court for the decision of the town council, whether instituted by the owner or by any other proper party, notwithstanding the provisions heretofore stated relating

to a stay of the decision appealed from shall not affect the right of the owner to make the bona fide offer to sell referred to above. No offer to sell shall be made more than one year after a final decision by the town council, but thereafter the owner may renew his request to the town council to approve the demolition or moving of the historic resource.

3. Demolition Approval Criteria Considerations. In reviewing applications for the demolition or moving of a historic resource from or within the Historic Haymarket Overlay, the Architectural Review Board shall consider the following:

- a. How the demolition or removal of a historic resource from the property on which it is located will impact the historic integrity of the site and any remaining on-site historic resources on the same property;
- b. How the loss of the historic resource will impact the historic integrity of any adjacent historic property;
- c. The impact the loss of the historic resource will have on the overall integrity to any historic district the historic resource is located in ;
- d. The ability of the historic resource to be adaptively reused as part of a new on-site development which would not adversely impact the historic resource's ability to convey its historic significance through its integrity of location, setting, feeling, association, design, materials and workmanship; and
- e. Whether any monies or assistance for preservation of the historic resource could be made available to the property owner within 180 days of the owner's request to demolish or move it.

Sec. 58-16.13 Time Limit

A certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for one (1) year from the date of issuance. If the demolition, erection, reconstruction, alteration, relocation or restoration for which the certificate of appropriateness was issued is not commenced within one year and thereafter diligently pursued, a new certificate shall be obtained prior thereto.

Discussion:

- a. How the demolition or removal of a historic resource from the property on which it is located will impact the historic integrity of the site and any remaining on-site historic resources on the same property;**

Staff Response – The structures were built in 1922. While not listed as a historic resource in the 2008-2013 Comprehensive Plan, the structures on this site meet the Zoning Ordinance definition of a historic structure. There have been two environmental surveys conducted by the applicant to check for soil contamination from the previous vehicle repair and use on site. Additionally, the foundations of the structure, especially the main building, are so severely damaged/rotted that adaptive reuse of the existing structures would be very costly. The demolition of the structures would remove all historic resources from the site.

b. How the loss of the historic resource will impact the historic integrity of any adjacent historic property;

Staff Response – The Lane Motors property is located next to a historic structure built in 1870. However, the architectural style of both properties are not similar, and demolition would not detract the adjacent property from its historic significance.

c. The impact the loss of the historic resource will have on the overall integrity to any historic district the historic resource it is located in;

Staff Response – The demolition of the structure would remove a well-known historic building from the Town of Haymarket and could have potential impact to the integrity of the Historic District Overlay due to its location along Washington Street a major corridor running through the center of Haymarket.

d. The ability of the historic resource to be adaptively reused as part of a new on-site development which would not adversely impact the historic resource’s ability to convey its historic significance through its integrity of location, setting, feeling, association, design, materials and workmanship;

Staff Response – The foundations of the structure, especially the main building, are so severely damaged/rotted that adaptive reuse of the existing structures or use of the structure as a viable addition to a new development would be difficult. While the demolition proposal would raze the buildings, the applicant has proposed new construction that would reflect the original form and scale of the demolished properties.

e. Whether any monies or assistance for preservation of the historic resource could be made available to the property owner within 180 days of the owner’s request to demolish or move it.

Staff Response – There are no grant funding options currently available from the Town of Haymarket, Grant funding options would require further discussion by Town Council.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

The buildings at 14920 Washington Street are part of the core of historic Haymarket. Removal of any structure will cause part of the history of the Town to be removed. However, the state of these structures at its worst case prevents adaptive reuse of the buildings entirely or at its best case would become very costly for any property owner to repair the structures to a viable state. The environmental studies conducted by the applicant show that minimal brownfield development work is required for adaptive reuse of the site. The applicant also has provided a set of designs that would aid in preserving the old form of these structures while allowing for more durable and higher quality materials to be used in a new construction.

Based on the above assessment of the proposed demolition of the main building and two additional structures at 14920 Washington Street, the Town Planner recommends a site visit to be scheduled by the ARB to assist in their decision.

Draft Motion: "I move the Board defer the COA for ZP#2024-1104, for the demolition of the three structures at 14920 Washington Street to the January 15th meeting." Or an alternate motion.