



Town of Haymarket  
 15000 Washington Street, #100  
 Haymarket, VA 20169  
 703-753-2600

**Thomas Britt**  
 TOWN PLANNER

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Architectural Review Board  
 FROM: Thomas Britt  
 DATE: March 10, 2025  
 SUBJECT: ZP #2025-0303, 6750 Fayette Street Window, Door, and Siding Replacement

**APPLICATION SUMMARY:**

Business/ Applicant: Rev. Sean Rousseau, St. Paul’s Episcopal Church

Street Address: 6750 Fayette Street

Proposed Alteration: Sign Installation

Applicant’s Brief Description of the Activity: Replacement of doors, windows, and siding of rectory building of St. Paul’s Episcopal Church.

Town Planner Assessment		
Zoning Ordinance	Application Details	Staff Response
Sec. 58-16.8 Matters to be considered by board in acting on appropriateness of erection, reconstruction, alteration, restoration or demolition of building or structure.	Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.	The proposed alteration is visible from the public right of way.  The materials are in compliance with the zoning ordinance.
Sec. 58-16.8 (1) Exterior architectural features, including all signs, which are subject to public view from a public street, way or place.	Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.	The proposed alteration is visible from the public right of way.
Sec. 58-16.8 (2) General Design Arrangement	Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.	The design is in keeping with the guidelines.

<p><b>Sec. 58-16.8 (3)</b> Texture, material and color</p>	<p>Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.</p>	<p>All replacement materials are vinyl, with the siding design mastic 5” double woodgrain.</p> <p>The design and materials are in keeping with the guidelines.</p>
<p><b>Sec. 58-16.8 (4)</b> The relation of the factors, subsections (1), (2), and (3) of this section, to similar features of the buildings and structures in the immediate surroundings</p>	<p>Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.</p>	<p>The design is in keeping with the guidelines and the immediate surrounding tenants and buildings.</p>
<p><b>Sec. 58-16.8 (5)</b> The extent to which the building or structure would be harmonious with or obviously incongruous with the old and historic aspect of the surroundings</p>	<p>Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.</p>	<p>The design is in keeping with the guidelines and the immediate surrounding tenants and buildings.</p>
<p><b>Sec. 58-16.8 (6)</b> In the case of a building to be razed, a primary consideration will be the extent to which its continued existence would tend to protect irreplaceable historic places and preserve the general historic atmosphere of the Town</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>
<p><b>Sec. 58-16.8 (7)</b> The extent to which the building or structure will promote the general welfare of the Town, and all citizens, by the preservation and protection of historic places and areas</p>	<p>Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.</p>	<p>This matter is at the discretion of the ARB</p>
<p><b>Sec. 58-16.8 (8)</b> The extent to which the building or structure will promote the general welfare by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Maintaining and increasing real estate values</li> <li>(b) Generating business</li> <li>(c) Creating new positions</li> </ul>	<p>Replacement of current wood doors, windows, and siding at the church offices (rectory) of St. Paul’s Episcopal with vinyl windows, doors, and siding. Colors will be white to match the current structural elements.</p>	<p>These matters are at the discretion of the ARB</p>

(d) Attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, and new residents		
(e) Encouraging study of and interest in American history		
(f) Stimulating interest in and study of architecture and design		
(g) Educating citizens in American culture and heritage		
(h) Making the Town a more attractive and desirable place in which to live		
<b>Comprehensive Plan</b>		
<b>Comp Plan 1.5.3</b> Historic Resource Inventory List	Site – 6750 Fayette Street	The main structure/site IS listed as a Historic Resource
<b>Comp Plan 1.5.4</b> Potential Archaeological Site	Site – 6750 Fayette Street	The site is not one of those listed as a potential archaeological site in the Comprehensive Plan.
<b>Architectural Review Board Historic Guidelines</b>		
<b>I. Introduction (E) Community Design and the Comprehensive Plan</b>	Site – 6750 Fayette Street	R-1 Property
<b>II. Streetscape and Site Design</b>		
<b>II. (a) Washington Street Enhancement Project</b>	Not applicable	Not applicable
<b>II. (b) Streetscapes Other Than Washington Street</b>	Not applicable	Not applicable
<b>II. (c) Fences and Walls</b>		
<b>II. (d) Lighting (Free Standing/Posts)</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>II. (e) Telecommunication Dishes, Drums and Towers</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>II. (f) Screening</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>III. New Construction and Additions to Existing Non-Historic and Non-Contributing Structures</b>		
<b>III. (a) General Guidelines</b>	<i>“to create a more pleasing blend of historic and new elements in the Town, new structures shall be compatible with the prevailing and recognized historic architectural character of the existing adjacent structures”</i>	These matters are at the discretion of the ARB

<b>III. (b) Colors</b>		The colors for the siding proposed are outside of the Historic Color Palette, the colors proposed are neutral and do not distract from streetscape and neighborhood character.
<b>III. (c) Exterior Elements</b>		Not Applicable
<b>III. (d) Chimneys</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>III. (e) Roofing</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>III. (f) Lighting, (attached to structure)</b>	None	None
<b>III. (g) Windows and Doors</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>III. (h) Decks</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>III. (i) Handicapped Ramps</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>III. (j) Awnings</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>IV. Guidelines for Alterations or Additions to Historic Structures or Contributing Structures</b>		
<b>IV. (a) General Guidelines</b>	See excerpt from ARB Guidelines below	The proposed work alters a structure considered historic per the zoning ordinance and alters but improves the appearance of the accessory structure to St Paul's Church. St Paul's church is listed on the National Register for Historic Places.
<b>V. Signage</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable, not historic or contributing
<b>VI. Demolition Guidelines</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
<b>VII. Situations Not Covered, Additional Requirements</b>	Not Applicable	Not Applicable

**IV. GUIDELINES FOR ALTERATIONS OR ADDITIONS TO HISTORIC STRUCTURES OR CONTRIBUTING STRUCTURES**

**A. GENERAL GUIDELINES:**

- Any exterior alteration or addition to a historic structure has the potential to radically alter the structure's appearance and/or obscure its historic significance. When an alteration or addition is planned, it shall be designed and constructed in a manner consistent with the architecture and design elements of the period of initial construction and not detract from the character-defining features of the historic structure. To this end, the ARB shall examine the proposed modifications to the historic structure and determine if such proposed modification would detract from the significance or integrity of the structure.
- The following considerations shall be met in any renovation or addition to a historic structure:
  1. The size and scale of any alteration or addition shall be limited so as not to compromise the integrity of the historic structure or the surrounding structures.

2. The alteration or addition must use materials, level of detail, fasteners, finishes and colors that are consistent with the historic structure's period of construction and should take into account compatibility with surrounding structures.
3. The alteration or addition must incorporate the design elements and principles of the existing structure.
4. Original siding materials shall be repaired and retained, rather than removed or covered. If replacement must be made, and is approved by the ARB, it must be with like materials. Replacing original wood siding with cement siding products, such as Hardiplank siding, is not permitted.
5. Existing paint may be removed if done in a manner that will not damage the surface of the structure. Such method of paint removal shall be reviewed in advance by the ARB if such facility is a historic building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the above assessment of the window, door, and siding replacement, The Town Planner recommends further discussion of the historic significance of the church offices relative to St Paul's Church in this meeting. The rectory is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places, but is accessory to it. The rectory roof replacement that is a deviation from the original roof structure has been previously approved by the ARB in October 2024, with conditions. While the deviation from wood to vinyl siding is a disapproved change per the ARB guidelines, there is no language in the Zoning Ordinance regarding like for like materials on historic or contributing structures. This will not be the first alteration to the rectory that alters materials, as the roof was changed from aluminum to asphalt.

Draft Motion: To be discussed by the ARB in the meeting.