

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION SUMMARY

ITEM: Certificate of Approval

CASE NUMBER: HPDR2022-0013

PROJECT: Demolition – Brick Accessory Building

LOCATION: 818 12th Street

APPLICANT: Jeannie Sears

CASE HISTORIC PRESERVATIONIST: Elizabeth Kellums

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HEARING DATE: December 19, 2022

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION FUNCTION:

Review the proposal for compliance with Criteria and Standards for altering designated properties or contributing properties in an historic district in Section 24-1003j of the City of Greeley Municipal Code and approve or deny the request.

PROJECT OVERVIEW AND BACKGROUND:

Proposed Project

On November 23, 2022, owner Jeannie Sears submitted a complete application for a Certificate of Approval for demolition of a brick accessory building at 818 12th Street to the Historic Preservation Office. The applicant proposes to demolish a small brick building at the back of the property. The building is in poor condition and is falling down in places.

Please see the Application and Narrative for a Certificate of Approval (Attachment A), Site Photos (Attachment B) and the Existing Site Map (Attachment C).

Existing Conditions

The site has a historic house and a small brick building that is in poor condition. The building has been broken into several times and is currently boarded up. It poses a potential threat if broken into or used in the future.

Background

The Historic Preservation Commission designated the Sterling House at 818 12th Street on the Greeley Historic Register in August 2014 for historical, architectural and geographical significance. The Sterling House is also a contributing property in the Monroe Avenue Historic District, designated on the Greeley Historic Register in December 1999, upheld by Council in February 2000. The site is subject to review by the Historic Preservation Commission for major

alterations and is subject to the Historic Preservation General Design Review Guidelines and the District Designation Plan for the Monroe Avenue Historic District.

SITE DATA:

Legal Description:	GR5459 E90' L2 BLK97, City of Greeley, County of Weld, State of Colorado
Neighborhood:	Monroe Avenue Historic District
Designation:	Individually designated on the Greeley Historic Register and contributing property in the Monroe Avenue Historic District
Year Property Built:	1886-87 (Source: Greeley Tribune, January 1887)
Architectural Style/Type:	Queen Anne
Zoning:	Commercial – High (C-H)
Dates of Significant Renovations:	<p>Certificate of Approval: Install Heritage Architectural Shingles and approval of copper shingles to remain on the house but requirement for oxidizing solution to be painted on the shingles to speed oxidation process; Owner: St. Peter's Catholic Church; Date of COA: 5/22/2000; Recording date: 4/18/2007.</p> <p>Architectural Drawing – St. Peter's Catholic Church Rectory Garage Addition (two pages); Keith J. Ames, Architect; Date: 10/16/1998.</p> <p>Architectural drawing – Kitchen Remodel for St. Peter's Catholic Church Residence; Keith J. Ames, Architect; Permit #98030143; Date: 3/6/1998.</p> <p>Certificate of Occupancy Approval for 818 12th Street; Owner: Lillian Peeples; Occupant: Sterling House (bed and breakfast); Permit: 870782; Date: 1/22/1988.</p> <p>Remodel 818 12th Street for bed and breakfast Concept; Owner and Contractor: Lillian Peeples; Plumbing contractor: Adolph; Electrical: All Electric; Permit: 870782; Date: 8/10/1987; Final date: 1/22/1988; note by T. McKellar, 6/22/1987:</p>

on back of permit that the bed and breakfast use is permissible, sufficient parking onsite and it meets all zoning code requirements.

Remodel upstairs; Owner: Olive Moore; Contractor: Debra Sich; Permit: 850452; Date: 6/18/1985.

Certificate of Final Approval: To Sears Investment Co., Compliance with Applicable Provision of Housing Code; Date: 2/21/1973.

Adding low water cutoff and aquastat (correction from correction notice); Owner: Sears Investment Co; Contractor: Stone & Stone Plumbing; Mechanical Permit: 733052; Date: 2/7/1973.

Correction Notice indicating permit required for corrective work; Date: 1/18/1973.

Remodel for office use; Owner: Sears Investment; Contractor: Fletcher (?) Electric; Wiring Permit: 731023; Date: 1/18/1973.

Housing Inspection Report Form: 818 12th Street, Rental Unit; Owner: Doug Sears; Correction required by completion of remodeling: rewire the building due to hazardous brittle wiring; Date: 12/24/1972.

Housing Code Enforcement Master File Control Card; Frame construction; B-1 Zoning, 2 occupants, 1 dwelling unit; Condition: standard; No further action as dwelling will be converted into office space; Date of Initial Inspection: 12/23/1972.

The existing front porch was added to the house between July 1906 and October 1909. The July 1906 Sanborn map shows the property as originally constructed without the porch, and the October 1909 map shows the house with the existing front porch. Historic photos show the house without the porch, but a 5/7/1936 photo shows the house with the porch.

Source: Building Permit File, 818 12th Street; Greeley Historic Register property file for 818 12th

Street; historic photos from photo files at the Hazel E. Johnson Research Center at the Greeley History Museum; Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, CU Boulder online library website.

KEY ISSUES AND ANALYSIS:

The proposed work is evaluated according to the relevant criteria for alteration of designated properties, defined in Section 24-1003j of the Greeley Municipal Code, as follows in the staff analysis.

Greeley Municipal Code, Section 24-1003j Criteria and Standards for Certificate of Approval

3. Demolition. Criteria for demolition of a designated property or contributing property in a district. A permit for demolition shall be issued if the applicant can clearly demonstrate that the designated property meets the criteria for demolition as set forth under this section by balancing the criteria of subsections (a) through (d) below versus (e). Not all of the criteria must be met for the Commission to recommend demolition. Appeals of the decision shall be made under section 24-1003.g.

(a) The structure must be demolished because it presents an imminent hazard.

(b) The structure proposed for demolition is not structurally sound despite evidence of the owner's efforts to properly maintain the structure.

(c) The structure cannot be rehabilitated or reused on site to provide for any reasonable beneficial use of the property.

(d) The structure cannot be moved to another site because it is physically or economically impractical.

(e) The applicant demonstrates that the proposal mitigates to the greatest extent practicable the following:

(1) Significant impacts that negatively alter the visual character of the neighborhood where demolition is proposed to occur.

(2) Significant impact on the historical importance of other structures located on the property and adjacent properties.

(3) Significant impact to the architectural integrity of other structures located on the property and adjacent properties.

(f) If partial demolition is approved by the Commission and is required for the renovation, restoration or rehabilitation of the structure, the owner should mitigate, to the greatest extent possible:

(1) Impacts on the historical importance of the structure or structures located on the property.

(2) *Impacts on the architectural integrity of the structure or structures located on the property.*

Applicable Guidelines from the General Design Review Guidelines (#60) & Monroe Avenue Historic District Designation Plan (#41)

Secondary Structures

Secondary structures, including carriage houses, garages, and sheds, are important elements of residential sites. They help establish a sense of scale and define yards. Their presence helps interpret how an entire site was used historically.

41/60. Preserve original secondary structures when feasible.

Use the same guidelines as for primary structures.

Staff Analysis:

The proposed demolition of the brick accessory building at the rear of the property complies with the applicable criteria and standards for the following reasons:

The dilapidated brick accessory building has been broken into by homeless people several times and the building is in poor condition. Portions of the north wall have fallen down. For these reasons, the building presents an imminent hazard and is not structurally sound. Rehabilitation of the building would cost more than its value and would not likely be reasonably possible without extensive changes and expense, making it an unreasonable option. Rehabilitation would likely require deconstruction and then rebuilding. The building cannot be moved to another site to be reused, as it would not structurally withstand a move and moving it would be economically impractical, as it would still require extensive rehabilitation that would cost far more than the value of the structure. It is located at the rear of the property and is not visible from 12th Street.

It is not practically feasible to preserve this accessory building.

In summary, for these reasons, the proposed demolition of the brick accessory building meets the Criteria and Standards in Section 24-1003(j)(3) of the Greeley Municipal Code.

Section 24-1003(j) (3) Criteria and Standards Addressed: a, b, c, d, e

PUBLIC NOTICE:

Greeley Municipal Code Section 24-1003(f) specifies public notification requirements for Certificate of Approval applications, specifically posting a sign at the property, readily visible by adjacent property owners and from the public right-of-way, no less than 14 days prior to the public hearing. The applicant posted notice at this property on November 30, 2022. On November 23, Staff emailed a letter of notification to the applicant with the date, time and location of the public hearing. No inquiries have been received as of December 14, 2022.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval, with the condition that all required permits be obtained.

RECOMMENDED MOTION:

A motion that, based on the application received and the preceding analysis, the Commission finds that the proposed demolition of the brick accessory building at the Sterling House at 818 12th Street meets (3) Demolition criteria a, b, c, d, and e of Section 24-1003(j)(3) of the Greeley Municipal Code, and therefore approves the Certificate of Approval for demolition, with the condition that all required permits be obtained.

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A – Application & Narrative for Certificate of Approval

Attachment B – Site Photos

Attachment C – Existing Site Map