

# PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT NOVEMBER 18, 2025

**Prepared by:** Amy Wolfson, City Planner

**DATA SUMMARY:** 

**Application Number:** 25PLN-14

Subject: Development Review to consider a 43,000 square foot

expansion of an existing contractor's equipment yard at 928

Taylorville Road.

**Location/APN:** 928 Taylorville Road / 022-150-034 **Applicant:** Charlie Faber, property owner

Representative: Martin Wood, SCO Planning and Engineering

Zoning/General Plan: Light Industrial (M-1), Open Space (OS), Multifamily

Residential (R2)/ Commercial (C), Open Space (OS), Urban

Medium Density (UMD)

**Entitlement:** Development Review Permit **Environmental Status:** Recommended Draft IS/MND

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

That the Planning Commission approve the Development Review application for the expanded contractor's yard as presented, or as modified by the Development Review Committee, which includes the following actions:

- 1. Adoption of the tiered Mitigated Negative Declaration, prepared for the project, as the appropriate level of environmental review, in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Guidelines (Attachment 1);
- 2. Adoption of a Mitigation Monitoring & Reporting Program (MMRP), implementing and monitoring all Mitigation Measures, in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Guidelines (Attachment 2);
- 3. Adoption of Findings of Fact for approval of the C&D Development Review Permit as presented in the staff report; and,
- 4. Approval of the Development Review Permit as presented and in accordance with Conditions of Approval as presented in the Staff Report.

### **BACKGROUND:**

According to a 1987 staff report for the property, use of the property as a contractor's equipment yard began around 1951 as determined by legal counsel in 1977 as part of a research effort to determine whether the use could be legal, non-conforming under the County's zoning jurisdiction at the time. A County-issued use permit to expand the nonconforming use as a contractor's equipment yard was completed in April 1980 (County

permit U78-29). The property was annexed to the City in November 1982 as Annexation no. 54 (City Resolution 82-226). A Use Permit was approved by the city for expansion of a non-conforming use in November 1987 (U87-30) because the property was zoned for residential use at the time. The zoning was updated pursuant to the General Plan update in 1999 to commercial to reflect the use of the property. The property owner acquired the area in which he is expanding through a lot line adjustment in 2014. The property was again rezoned, along with a portion of the adjusted area to Light Industrial (M-1) in 2021 with the adoption of the Southern Sphere Planning and Annexation project. The applicant filed a grading permit with the city in December 2024 at which time planning staff determined the need for a Development Review permit, which was applied for in April 2025.

### PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

A Development Review application for a proposed 43,300 square feet of ground disturbance, including 13,406 cubic yards of import fill, for the purpose of expanding a contractor's equipment yard. The applicant is not proposing to expand the existing operation but will use the additional area to more efficiently store equipment and stockpile material. The use itself is considered a permitted use in the M-1 zoning designation. A Development Review application is being requested in order to accommodate the proposed grading in excess of 50 c.y. pursuant to Table 7-2 of the City Municipal Code.

Access, Parking & Circulation – Primary ingress/egress is from an existing driveway encroachment off of Taylorville Road. A second concrete driveway is being added approximately 170 feet south of the existing driveway to serve the expanded equipment yard area. The driveway aisle is 30-feet wide, to accommodate the large vehicles accessing the site, which exceeds the city's standard requiring a 24 ft drive aisle width for two-way drive aisles.

Landscaping – The preliminary landscape plan includes perimeter landscaping along with internal parking lot landscaping. The proposed plan is characterized by a variety of vegetation forms including shade trees, large shrubs/small trees, medium shrubs, and understory planting that are predominantly California natives. Landscaping shall also be installed in the common areas and surrounding the parking lot. The landscaping shall be in accordance with the City and State Model Water Efficiency Landscape requirements.

*Lighting* – No new lighting is being proposed

Tree Removal – According to the site plan a total of 36 trees ranging in size from 8 to 24 inches DBH, and consisting primarily of pines and firs, are proposed to be removed from the site in order to accommodate the development. The City of Grass Valley acknowledges the importance of trees to the community's health, safety, welfare, and tranquility. Chapter 12.36 of the Municipal Code outlines standards for tree removal and for obtaining a tree removal permit to ensure that community trees would be prudently protected and managed so as to ensure these multiple civic benefits.

Grading – As previously stated, earthwork grading involves 43,300 square feet of ground disturbance, including 1 cubic yard of cut and 13,405 cubic yards of import fill. The applicant is proposing a stacked "Ready Rock" block wall that will range in height from 5-feet to 7-feet, and spans 464 feet at the southern edge of the property.

Drainage – A 15-inch storm drainpipe will be installed to collect storm water and direct it toward a natural swale at the south of the property. According to Registered Professional Engineer, Jason Barnum, because there is not impervious surface being added, a drainage report is not required. A 3-foot wide drainage traverses the proposed expansion area, flowing in a southwesterly direction. Eventually it connects downstream through a culvert with the unnamed tributary to Wolf Creek outside of the proposed area of the proposed vegetation removal and grading area. Drainage inlets, routing and Best Management Practices are proposed to be implemented.

Utilities – *Water Supply:* The property is currently connected to City water and no new connections are required to serve the expanded equipment yard.

Sanitary Sewer: The property is currently connected to City sewer and no new connections are required to serve the expanded equipment yard.

Dry Utilities: No new connections to dry utilities (i.e., natural gas, electrical supply, telephone, cable) are required to serve the expanded equipment yard.

## **Development Review Committee:**

The project was presented to the Development Review Committee at their meeting held on November 12, 2025. Much of the discussion revolved around visual screening of the expanded area. It was noted that screening would be a challenge in some areas due to topography, particularly to the west, toward the Berriman Loop residential neighborhood. The DRC recommended additional conditions of approval including increasing the height of the required screening wall from 6-feet to 8-feet along the western property line or western edge of the expansion area, and also at the chain-link fencing along Taylorville Road and the addition of privacy slats. They also requested that a condition be added to reiterate the standard noise requirements of the development code. Finally, Engineering requested that the added parking be relocated to a paved area of the site. The committee asked the applicant to consider a landscape screen within the OpenSpace "finger" that borders the western edge of the expanded yard area, which may offer a more effective screen due to the topography of the site. With these recommended project requirements, which have been incorporated into the conditions of approval, the Development Review Committee recommended approval of the project.

# General Plan Land Use Designation

The bulk of the project area has a land use designation of Commercial (C) according to the City of Grass Valley 2020 General Plan. The Commercial designation is a broad category intended to encompass all types of retail commercial and commercial service establishments. There is also an area of approximately 0.47 acres that has a designation

of Urban Medium Density, and an area of approximately 0.075 acres that is designated for Open Space, presumably as a buffer between the residential and commercial designation. Zoning

## **Zoning Designation**

The proposed expanded contractor's yard is within the Light Industrial (M-1) zoning designation. The M-1 zone is applied to areas appropriate for a range of light industrial uses. The M-1 zone implements and is consistent with the manufacturing-industrial designation of the general plan. The project design shall be in accordance with the M-1 zone standards regarding height, setbacks, parking standards, etc.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION:**

Implementation of the proposed project is not expected to pose a new or more severe impact than was concluded under the 2014 SOI EIR and the 2021 SEIR. Mitigation outlined in the previous EIR and SEIR remain applicable due to the potential to result in adverse effects to special-status plant and wildlife species. Additionally, while unlikely, the project could result in impacts related to eliminating important examples of California History or Pre-history associated with undiscovered archeological and/or paleontological resources during project construction. However, this previous EIR and SEIR includes mitigation measures that remain applicable and would reduce any potential impacts to less than significant levels. With implementation of the mitigation measures outlined in this IS/MND, as well as compliance with General Plan policies these potential impacts are less than significant. The IS/MND has been circulated for a 30-day public review ending on Monday, November 18, 2025 (SCH No. 2025100695).

### **FINDINGS:**

In accordance with Sections 17.72.30 J (Development Review Permit) of the Development Code, the Planning Commission is required to make the following specific findings before it approves the Development Review permit.

- 1. The City received a complete application for the C&D expanded contractor's yard development permit (25PLN-14); and
- 2. The Development Review Committee recommends that the Planning Commission find the Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) prepared for the C&D contractor's yard expansion project has been completed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) (Public Resources Code Section 2100 et seq.) and the State CEQA Guidelines (California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Section 15000 et seq.); and
- That the MND reflects the independent judgement and analysis of the City of Grass Valley and has considered the information contained in the MND and the public record; and
- 4. That based on the record as a whole, including the Initial Study/MND (attachment 1), public comments, and the Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Program table (attachment

- 2), there is no substantial evidence that the project as mitigated, will have a significant effect on the environment; and
- 5. The 2020 General Plan designates the project site as Manufacturing-Industrial (M-I). The C&D contractor's yard business is consistent with the General Plan; and
- 6. The proposed project is allowed within the applicable zone and complies with all other applicable provisions of the Development Code and the City Municipal Code; and
- 7. The design, location, size, and characteristics of the proposed project is in compliance with any project-specific design standards in effect and any standards and guidelines for Development Review Permits.

## **RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:**

## **PLANNING:**

- 1. The approval date for Development Review is November 18, 2025 with an effective date of Thursday, December 4, 2025 pursuant to Section 17.74.020 GVMC. This project is approved for a period of one year and shall expire on December 4, 2026 unless the project has been effectuated or the applicant requests a time extension that is approved by the Development Review Committee pursuant to the Development Code.
- 2. The final design shall be consistent with the Development Review application and plans provided by the applicant and approved by the Development Review Committee (25PLN-14). The project is approved subject to plans on file with the Community Development Department. The Community Development Director may approve minor changes as determined appropriate.
- 3. A tree removal permit shall be required for the removal of any tree over 10 inches Diameter at Breast Height (DBH) pursuant to city municipal code chapter 12.36
- 4. The applicant's landscape architect shall submit a letter specifying that the landscaping and irrigation has been installed in accordance with the approved landscape plans
- 5. The applicant's landscape architect or landscape contractor shall submit to the City for approval the "certificate of completion" form as required by the Model Water Efficiency Landscape Ordinance (MWELO)
- 6. The applicant shall conduct an irrigation audit pursuant to the requirements of the MWELO. This shall be conducted by a third-party certified landscape irrigation auditor that did not install or design the landscape and irrigation. Prior to the audit City must confirm the selected auditor complies with MWELO requirements.
- 7. Install an 8-foot, decorative wall of masonry or similar durable material along the western property line with incorporated plant material to provide screening that benefits the Berriman Loop neighborhood to the west, in compliance with Section 17.30.040 (F)

- of the development code. Screening along the southern border is not necessary due to the span of Open Space.
- 8. The chain-link fence along Taylorville Road shall be increased in height to 8-feet, and shall incorporate privacy, screening slats in compliance with Section 17.44.170 (F) of the development code.
- 9. Storage material within the enclosed area shall not be higher than the approved perimeter fence or wall.
- 10. In any case where an outdoor storage area abuts a street right-of-way, the required screening wall or fence shall be set back from the right-of-way as required by the applicable zone, and the setback area shall be landscaped to the approval of the director, and in compliance with Chapter 17.34 (landscaping standards).
- 11. The perimeter wall or fence to be installed as conditioned pursuant to condition 7 above will be required to be setback a minimum of 30-feet from back of curb along Taylorville Road. The proposed landscaping should remain between the wall and the street to soften the aesthetics from public viewsheds
- 12. Pursuant to Chapter 8.28 of the development code, noise levels at the nearby residential area shall be consistent with Section 8.28.060 which includes dbA levels not to exceed 45 dbA during nighttime hours of 8 p.m. to 7 a.m. in the nearby residential area, and 55 dbA during daytime hours of 7 a.m. to 8 p.m. unless ambient noise levels are in excess of those levels, in which case noise shall not exceed those ambient levels.
- 13. The added parking spaces shall be paved or relocated to an existing paved area of the site.
- 14. The applicant agrees to defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City of Grass Valley in any action or proceeding brought against the City of Grass Valley to void or annul this discretionary land use approval

## **ENGINEERING:**

- 15. The applicant shall submit to the Building Department for review and approval, an improvements and grading plan prepared by a Registered Civil Engineer; shall obtain a Grading Permit; and shall pay all appropriate fees for plan check and inspection. The grading and improvement plans shall incorporate all standard conditions in accordance with City Improvement Standards.
- 16. Frontage improvements shall be required along the additional frontage of the property to extend the existing pedestrian network.

- 17. If any retaining walls or other wall structures equal to or greater than four feet in height (from the base of the footing to the top of the wall) are identified on the grading/improvement plans, the applicant shall:
  - a. Place a note on the grading/improvement plans stating that any walls equal to or greater than four feet in height will require a Building Permit prior to being constructed.
  - b. Submit design calculations for the walls for review and acceptance.
  - c. If the proposed walls are to be constructed against a cut slope that cannot be graded back per the California Building Code, submit:
  - d. A signed and stamped letter from a Licensed Civil Engineer or Geotechnical Engineer identifying a temporary shoring plan and how the cut slopes for the walls will be protected from the weather during construction.

## **FIRE**

- 15. The property shall adhere to City of Grass Valley municipal cod for compliance with vegetation management.
- 16. Access, gates, and grade shall adhere to California Fire Code (CFC) for Fire apparatus.

# **MITIGATION MEASURES:**

#### AQ1

Submit a dust control plan to the Air Pollution Control Officer prior to disturbance of topsoil.
The duct control plan must be approved by the Air Pollution Control Officer and submitted to the Planning Department prior to issuance of a grading perm

## AQ2

- 1) A paved entry apron or other effective cleaning techniques be required for the second driveway. This may include a road section, extra coarse aggregate, a steek grate to "knock off" dirt which accumulated on the vehicle wheels, an/or a wheel washer.
- 2) Any material which is tracked onto a paved roadway must be removed (swept or washed) as quickly and as safely as possible.
- 3) The following mitigation measures shall be implemented during the construction phase of the project and shall be made notes on grading and construction plans:
  - a. Alternatives to open burning of vegetative material will be used unless otherwise deemed infeasible by the District. Among suitable alternatives are chipping, mulching, or conversion to biomass fuel.
  - b. Grid power shall be used (as opposed to diesel generators) for jobsite power needs where feasible during construction.
  - c. Temporary traffic controls shall be provided during all phases of the construction to improve traffic flow as deemed appropriate by the City Engineer and /or Caltrans.

d. Construction activities shall be scheduled to direct traffic flow to off-peak hours as much as practicable.

### AQ3

**Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.1-1a (2021 SEIR):** Future development projects within the Southern Sphere of Influence Planning and Annexation project area shall submit to the NSAQMD for approval an Off-Road Construction Equipment Emission Reduction Plan prior to ground breaking demonstrating that all off-road equipment(portable and mobile) meets or is cleaner than Tier 24 engine emission specifications unless prior written approval for any exceptions is obtained from the NSAQMD. Note that all off-road equipment must meet all applicable state and federal requirements. Construction contracts shall stipulate the following:

- Emissions from on-site construction equipment shall comply with NSAQMD Regulation II, Rule202, Visible Emissions.
- The primary contractor shall be responsible to ensure that all construction equipment is properly tuned and maintained.
- Idling times shall be minimized either by shutting equipment off when not in use or reducing the maximum idling time to 5 minutes when not in use (as required by California airborne toxics control measure Title 13, Section 2485 of California Code of Regulations). Clear signage shall be provided for construction workers at all access points.
- All construction equipment shall be maintained and properly tuned in accordance with manufacturers' specifications. All equipment shall be checked by a certified mechanic and determined to be running in proper condition prior to operation.
- Existing power sources (e.g., power poles) or clean fuel generators shall be utilized rather than temporary power generators where feasible.

#### AQ4

**Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.1-1b (2021 SEIR):** All architectural coating activities associated with construction of future development projects within the Southern Sphere of Influence Planning and Annexation project area shall be required to use interior and exterior coatings that contain less than 250100 grams of volatile organic compounds (VOC/ROG) per liter of coating

#### AQ5

Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.1-2(2021 SEIR): Subsequent development projects within the Southern Sphere of Influence Planning and Annexation project area shall submit to the City of Grass Valley and receive approval for a GHG Emissions Reduction Plan prior to issuance of building permits for the development project in question. The GHG Emissions Reduction Plan shall demonstrate adherence to the following measures or alternative measures to reduce GHG emissions (building-specific mitigation was omitted for this grading-only project):

• Low-water-use landscaping (i.e., drought-tolerant plants and drip irrigation) shall be installed. At least 75 percent of all landscaping plants shall be drought-tolerant as determined by a licensed landscape architect or contractor.

 Parking lots serving non-residential buildings shall have at least 12.5 percent of parking spaces served by electric vehicle charging stations that achieves similar or better functionality as a Level 2 charging station

### **BIO 1**

Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.3.2: Project applicants for each future development project proposed within the project shall retain qualified biologists to determine if suitable habitat for this species occurs within 250 feet of the proposed impact area, including construction access routes, as part of submittals of tentative maps and /or improvement plans. If suitable habitat exists, development agreements will require preconstruction surveys to be performed by a qualified biologist in a manner to maximize detection of coast horned lizards (i.e., during warm weather, walking slowly) prior to any grading activity. If any coast horned lizards are discovered within the work areas, they shall be actively moved or passively encouraged to leave the work area. Workers shall drive slowly when driving overland, within suitable habitat areas, to allow any lizards to move out of the way of the vehicles.

#### **BIO 2**

Previously adopted Mitigation 3.3.1: The project applicant for each future development project proposed within the project area shall retain a qualified biologist to perform focused surveys to determine the presence/absence of special-status plant species with potential to occur in and adjacent to (within 100 feet, where appropriate) the proposed impact area, including construction access routes. These surveys shall be conducted in accordance with the Guidelines for Assessing Effects of Proposed Developments on Rare Plants and Plant Communities (Nelson 1994.) These guidelines require that rare plant surveys be conducted at the proper time of year when rare or endangered species are both evident and identifiable. Field surveys shall be scheduled to coincide with known flowering periods and/or during appropriate development periods that are necessary to identify the plant species of concern. If any state- or federally listed CNPS List 1 or CNPS List 2 plant species are found in or adjacent to (within 100 feet) of the proposed impact area during surveys, these plant species shall be avoided to the extent possible and the following mitigation measures shall be implemented:

- 1. In some cases involving state-listed plants, it may be necessary to obtain an incidental take permit under Fish and Game Code Section 2081. The applicant shall consult with the CDFW to determine whether a2081 permit is required, and obtain all required authorizations prior to initiation of ground-breaking activities.
- 2. Before the approval of grading plans or any ground-breaking activity within the study area, the applicant shall submit a mitigation plan concurrently to the CDFW and the USFWS for review and comment. The plan shall include mitigation measures for the population(s) to be directly affected. Possible mitigation for impacts to special-status plant species can include implementation of a program to transplant, salvage, cultivate, or re-establish the species at suitable sites (if feasible), through the purchase of credits from an approved mitigation bank, or through an in-lieu fee program, if available. The actual level of mitigation may vary depending on the sensitivity of the species, its prevalence in the area, and the current state of knowledge about overall population trends and threats to its survival. The final mitigation strategy for directly

- impacted plant species shall be determined by the CDFW and the USFWS through the mitigation plan approval process.
- 3. Any special-status plant species that are identified adjacent to the study area, but not proposed to be disturbed by the project, shall be protected by barrier fencing to ensure that construction activities and material stockpiles do not impact any special-status plant species. These avoidance areas shall be identified on project plans.

#### BIO<sub>3</sub>

Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.3.3a: If clearing and/or construction activities for future development projects within the project area will occur during the migratory bird nesting season (April 15–August 15), reconstruction surveys to identify active migratory bird nests shall be conducted by a qualified biologist within 14 days of construction initiation. Focused surveys must be performed by a qualified biologist for the purposes of determining presence/absence of active nest sites within the proposed impact area, including construction access routes and a 200-foot buffer (if feasible). If active nest sites are identified within 200 feet of project activities, the applicant shall impose a limited operating period (LOP) for all active nest sites prior to commencement of any project construction activities to avoid construction or access-related disturbances to migratory bird nesting activities. An LOP constitutes a period during which project-related activities (i.e., vegetation removal, earth moving, and construction) will not occur, and will be imposed within 100 feet of any active nest sites until the nest is deemed inactive. Activities permitted within and the size (i.e., 100 feet) of LOPs may be adjusted through consultation with the CDFW and/or the City.

#### **BIO 4**

Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.3.3b: If clearing and/or construction activities for future development projects will occur during the raptor nesting season (January 15–August 15), preconstruction surveys to identify active raptor nests shall be conducted by a qualified biologist within 14 days of construction initiation. Focused surveys must be performed by a qualified biologist for the purposes of determining presence/absence of active nest sites within the proposed impact area, including construction access routes and a 500-foot buffer (if feasible). If active nest sites are identified within 500 feet of project activities, the applicant shall impose an LOP for all active nest sites prior to commencement of any project construction activities to avoid construction or access-related disturbances to nesting raptors. An LOP constitutes a period during which project-related activities (i.e., vegetation removal, earthmoving, and construction) will not occur and will be imposed within 250 feet of any active nest sites until the nest is deemed inactive. Activities permitted within and the size (i.e., 250 feet) of LOPs may be adjusted through consultation with CDFW and/or the City.

### **BIO 5**

**Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.3.5:** The City shall ensure that the project will result in no net loss of federally protected waters through impact avoidance, impact minimization, and/or compensatory mitigation, as determined in CWA Section 404 and 401 permits and/or 1602 Streambed Alteration Agreement. Evidence of compliance with this mitigation measure shall be provided prior to construction and grading activities for the proposed project.

#### CUL 1

**Previously Adopted Mitigation Measure 3.5.1c**: If, during the course of construction of future projects within the project area, cultural resources (i.e., prehistoric sites, historic sites, and isolated artifacts and features) are discovered, work shall be halted immediately within 50 feet of the discovery, and the City of Grass Valley Community Development Department shall be notified. A qualified archaeologist (that meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications Standards in prehistoric or historical archaeology) shall be retained to determine the significance of the discovery. Based on the significance of the discovery, the professional archaeologist shall present options to the City and project applicant for protecting the resources.

The City and the project applicant shall consider mitigation recommendations presented by a qualified archaeologist (as described) for any unanticipated discoveries. The City and the project applicant shall consult and agree upon implementation of a measure or measures that the City and the project applicant deem feasible and appropriate. Such measures may include avoidance, preservation in place, excavation, documentation, curation, data recovery, or other appropriate measures. The project applicant shall be required to implement any mitigation necessary for the protection of cultural resources.

### CUL 2

**Previously Adopted Mitigation Measure 3.5.1d:** The Native American community will be notified of any unanticipated and accidental discoveries of prehistoric or historic Native American cultural resources and will monitor activities associated with determining the significance of any discoveries as agreed to by the City of Grass Valley in consultation with the Native American community.

### GEO 1

- Prior to building and grading permit issuance, written verification from a geotechnical engineer shall be provided to the City Planner indicating that grading and construction plans include all pertinent recommendations from a Geotechnical Investigation Report prepared for the project.
- 2. Prior to building permit final, written verification from a geotechnical engineer shall be provided to the City Planner that indicates all recommendations from the Geotechnical Investigation Report prepared for the project by Geocon Consultants, Inc., dated December 2024, have been incorporated in to the geotechnical engineer's satisfaction.

#### GHG 1

**Mitigation Measure 3.3-1:** Subsequent development projects within the Southern Sphere of Influence Planning and Annexation project are shall submit to the City of Grass Valley and receive approval for a GHG Emissions Reduction Plan prior to issuance of building permits for the development project in question. The GHG Emissions Reduction Plan shall demonstrate adherence to the following measures or alternative measures to reduce GHG emissions.

a) Prior to the issuance of building permits for residential and commercial development the project developer or its designee shall submit a Zero Net Energy Confirmation Report (ZNE Report) prepared by a qualified building

energy efficiency and design consultant to the City for review and approval. For residential and commercial development within the project area, the ZNE Report shall demonstrate that the most recent version of the California Energy Code has been applied. Residential and commercial development shall be designed and shall be constructed to achieve ZNE, as defined by CEC in its 2015 Integrated Energy Policy Report, or otherwise achieve an equivalent level of energy efficiency, renewable energy generation, or GHG emissions savings. If the ZNE Report determines that attainment of ZNE is not feasible, it shall substantiate this conclusion and will identify the maximum building energy efficiency that is attainable.

- b) All buildings shall include rooftop solar photovoltaic systems to supply electricity to the buildings. Alternatively, solar photovoltaic systems can be installed on canopies that also shade parking areas. The project applicant shall provide prewired solar for residential garage/parking structures as a design feature.
- c) Any household appliances included in the original sale of the residential units shall be electric and certified Energy Star-certified (including clothes washers, dishwashers, fans, and refrigerators, but not including tankless water heaters).
- d) Indoor water conservation measures shall be incorporated, such as use of low-flow toilets, showers, and faucets (kitchen and bathroom), in each residential unit
- e) All buildings shall be designed to include cool roofs consistent with requirements established by Tier 2 of the CALGreen Code.□
- f) The proposed project shall be designed to exceed state energy efficiency standards the California Energy Code in effect at the time of construction by 15 percent (to Tier 1 Title 24 Standards) as directed by Appendix A5 of the 2010 California Green Building Standards (CBSC2011). This measure helps to reduce emissions associated with energy consumption.
- g) Low-water-use landscaping (i.e., drought-tolerant plants and drip irrigation) shall be installed. At least 75 percent of all landscaping plants shall be drought-tolerant as determined by a licensed landscape architect or contractor.
- h) The installation of wood-burning fireplaces shall be prohibited in all new residential units.
- i) The project applicant shall provide a minimum of one single-port electric vehicle charging station at each new single-family housing unit that achieves similar or better functionality as a Level 2 charging station (referring to the voltage that the electric vehicle charger uses). The project applicant shall also provide Level 2 electric vehicle charging stations at a minimum of 10 percent of parking spaces that serve multi-family residential buildings.
- j) Parking lots serving non-residential buildings shall have at least 12.5 percent of parking spaces served by electric vehicle charging stations that achieves similar or better functionality as a Level 2 charging station.

#### GHG 2

Previously adopted Mitigation Measure 3.3-2: Subsequent development within the project area [including the subject project] shall implement all feasible measures to reduce construction-related GHG emissions associated with the Southern SOI Amendment, including, but not

limited to, the construction-related measures listed below. A mitigation measure may be deemed infeasible if the project applicant provides rationale, based on substantial evidence to the City that substantiates why the measure is infeasible. The GHG reductions achieved by the implementation of measures listed below shall be estimated by a qualified third-party selected by the City. All GHG reduction estimates shall be supported by substantial evidence. Mitigation measures should be implemented even if it is reasonable that their implementation would result in a GHG reduction but a reliable quantification of the reduction cannot be substantiated.

- a) The project applicant shall require its contractors to enforce idling of on-and offroad diesel equipment for no more than 5 minutes while on site.
- b) The project applicant shall implement waste, disposal, and recycling strategies in accordance with Sections4.408 and 5.408 of the 2016 California Green Building Standards Code (CALGreen Code), or in accordance with any update to these requirements in future iterations of the CALGreen Code in place at the time of project construction.
- c) Project construction shall achieve or exceed the enhanced Tier 2 targets for recycling or reusing construction waste of 75 percent for residential land uses as contained in Sections A4.408 and A5.408 of the CALGreen Code.
- d) All diesel-powered, off-road construction equipment shall meet EPA's Tier 4 emissions standards as defined in 40 Code of Federal Regulation (CFR) 1039 and comply with the exhaust emission test procedures and provisions of 40 CFR Parts 1065 and 1068. This measure can also be achieved by using battery-electric off-road equipment as it becomes available.
- e) The project applicant shall implement a program that incentivizes construction workers to carpool, use public transit, or EVs to commute to and from the project site.

#### GHG 3

Previously Adopted Mitigation Measure 3.3-3: If, following the application of all feasible onsite GHG reduction measures listed under Mitigation Measures3.3-1 and3.3-2,theSouthern generate Amendment would continue to GHG emissions 2.74MTCO2e/year/SP, the project applicant for subsequent development in the project area shall offset the remaining GHG emissions to meet 2.74MTCO2e/year/SP in 2040 by funding activities that directly reduce or sequester GHG emissions or by purchasing and retiring carbon credits. To the degree that a project relies on GHG mitigation measures, the City of Grass Valley, NSAQMD, and CARB recommend that lead agencies prioritize on-site design features, such as those listed under Mitigation Measures 3.3-1and 3.3-2, and direct investments in GHG reductions within the vicinity of the project site to provide potential air quality and economic co-benefits locally. While emissions of GHGs and their contribution to climate change is a global problem, emissions of air pollutants, which have an adverse localized effect, are often emitted from similar activities that generate GHG emissions (i.e., mobile, energy, and area sources). For example, direct investment in a local building retrofit program could pay for cool roofs, solar panels, solar water heaters, smart meters, energy efficient lighting, energy efficient appliances, energy efficient windows, insulation, and water conservation measures for subsequent development within the geographic area of the Southern SOI Amendment. Other examples of local direct investments include financing installation of regional electric vehicle charging stations, paying for electrification of public school buses, and investing in local urban

forests. These investments would not only achieve GHG reductions, but would also directly improve regional and local ambient air quality. However, to adequately mitigate GHG emissions to 2.74MTCO2e/year/SP, it is critical that any such investments inactions to reduce GHG emissions meet the criteria of being real, quantifiable, permanent, verifiable, enforceable, and additional, consistent with the standards set forth in Health and Safety Code section 38562, subdivisions (d)(1) and (d)(2). Such credits shall be based on protocols approved by the California Air Resources Board (CARB), consistent with Section 95972 of Title 17 of the California Code of Regulations. Project applicants shall not use offset projects originating outside of California, except to the extent that the quality of the offsets, and their sufficiency under the standards set forth herein, can be verified by the City of Grass Valley, NSAQMD, or CARB. Such credits must be purchased through one of the following: (i) a CARBapproved registry, such as the Climate Action Reserve, the American Carbon Registry, and the Verified Carbon Standard; (ii) any registry approved by CARB to act as a registry under the California Cap and Trade program; or (iii) through the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association's GHG Rx and NSAQMD. Prior to issuing building permits for subsequent development projects in the Southern SOI Amendment area, the City shall confirm that the project applicant or its designee has fully offset the project's remaining(i.e., postimplementation of GHG reduction measures pursuant to Mitigation Measure3.3-1 and 3.3-2) GHG emissions by relying upon one of the following compliance options, or a combination thereof:

- a. demonstrate that the project applicant has directly undertaken or funded activities that reduce or sequester GHG emissions that are estimated to result in GHG reduction credits (if such programs are available), and retire such GHG reduction credits in a quantity equal to the project's remaining GHG emissions;
- b. provide a guarantee that it shall retire carbon credits issued in connection with direct investments (if such programs exist at the time of building permit issuance) in a quantity equal to the subsequent project's GHG emissions;
- c. undertake or fund direct investments (if such programs exist at the time of building permit issuance) and retire the associated carbon credits in a quantity equal to the subsequent project's remaining GHG emissions; or if it is impracticable to fully offset GHG emissions through direct investments or quantifiable and verifiable programs do not exist, the project applicant or its designee may purchase and retire carbon credits that have been issued by a recognized and reputable, accredited carbon registry in a quantity equal to the subsequent project's remaining GHG Emissions.

## TRA 1

**Previously adopted Mitigation 3.9-1a:** Provide Bicycle and Pedestrian Network Improvements Subsequent development projects within the Southern SOI Amendment area shall ensure adequate access to destinations by making walking and biking feasible and safe. These improvements shall include, but are not limited to the following:

- Provide continuous Class II bicycle facilities for throughout the entirety of the Southern SOI Amendment area and provide connections to any adjacent off-site bicycle facilities;
- Provide for, contribute to, or dedicate land for the provision of off-site bicycle trails linking the project to designated bicycle commuting routes in accordance with an adopted citywide or countywide bikeway plan;
- Provide bicycle and pedestrian connections to the Empire Mine State Park trail network north and east of the Southern SOI Amendment area Provide continuous pedestrian facilities (i.e., sidewalks, paths, cross-walks, etc.) along all roadways within the Southern SOI Amendment area;
- Provide pedestrian access connecting to all existing or planned external streets and pedestrian facilities contiguous with the within the Southern SOI Amendment area. If present, the implementation of this measure could include elimination of barriers (e.g., walls, landscaping, slopes) to pedestrian access and interconnectivity.
- Provide pedestrian and bicycle safety and traffic calming measures in excess of any applicable jurisdictional requirements designed to reduce motor vehicle speeds and encourage pedestrian and bicycle trips with traffic calming features. Traffic calming features may include:
  - marked crosswalks.
  - o count-down signal timers,
  - o curb extensions,
  - speed tables,
  - raised crosswalks,
  - o raised intersections,
  - median islands,
  - o tight-corner radii,
  - o roundabouts or mini-circles,
  - o on-street parking,
  - planter strips with street trees,
  - o chicanes/chokers,
  - o and others.

### TRA 2

- **Previously adopted Mitigation 3.9-1b:** Provision of Bicycle Parking Subsequent development projects within the Southern SOI Amendment area shall provide secure and convenient bicycle parking at all nonresidential land uses. The associated bicycle parking shall include, but are not limited to the following:
  - Provide bicycle parking facilities at all non-residential buildings that meet or exceed bicycle parking requirements required under the 2016 California Green Building Standards Code;
  - Incorporate the provision of long-term bicycle parking and support facilities (i.e., shower/changing space, secure storage for bicycle gear) into the design of the commercial and high-density residential areas of the project site;
  - Provide short-term bicycle parking (i.e., anchored bicycle racks) at all commercial, high density residential, industrial, and publicly dedicated open space areas within the Southern SOI Amendment area.

### TRA 3

**Previously adopted Mitigation 3.9-1d**: Develop Transportation Demand Management Programs In coordination with the City, Subsequent development projects within the Southern SOI Amendment project site shall develop and/or contribute towards alternative transportation programs and TDM programs undertaken by the City and/or regional partners such as NCTC and the Northern Sierra Air Quality Management District. TDM programs may include the following element measures:

- Car-sharing and/or ride-sharing programs;
- Employer-sponsored vanpool/shuttle;
- Subsidized demand-responsive trips provided by contracting with private TNCs or taxi companies; and
- Actions that encourage telecommuting and alternative work schedules.

## **ATTACHMENTS**:

- 1. Draft IS/MND
- 2. Mitigation Measure Monitoring Report Table
- 3. Vicinity/Aerial Map
- 4. Applications
- 5. Applicant Project Description
- 6. Proposed Improvement Plans
- 7. Technical Memorandum by Project Biologist