



Effingham County

Purchasing

Danielle Carver, Procurement & Capital Projects Manager

804 S Laurel Street, Springfield, GA 31329

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. 26-RFP-126

Benefits Brokerage & Consulting Services

RESPONSE DEADLINE: August 5, 2026 at 2:00 pm

Report Generated: Tuesday, August 11, 2026

PHASE 1

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Experience and Public-Sector Capability	Points Based	25 (25% of Total)

Description:

Relevant experience with public-sector employers, self-funded plans, similar workforce size, stop-loss, compliance support, and references demonstrating successful service.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Technical Approach and Scope Understanding	Points Based	30 (30% of Total)

Description:

Quality, practicality, and depth of the proposed approach to strategy, renewals, claims analytics, vendor management, compliance, communication, enrollment, transition, and ongoing support.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Service Team and Account Management	Points Based	15 (15% of Total)

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. 26-RFP-126

Benefits Brokerage & Consulting Services

Description:

Qualifications, licensing, depth, availability, backup coverage, response standards, workload, and accountability of the proposed team.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Fee Proposal and Compensation Transparency	Points Based	20 (20% of Total)

Description:

Competitiveness, clarity, completeness, and transparency of all fees and direct or indirect compensation sources.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Proposal Quality and Compliance	Points Based	10 (10% of Total)

Description:

Completeness, organization, responsiveness to the RFP, required forms, sample materials, and clarity of exceptions or assumptions

AGGREGATE SCORES SUMMARY

Vendor	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 3	Evaluator 4	Total Score (Max Score 100)
OneDigital Georgia	88	86	98	86	89.5
Mark III Brokerage, Inc.	79	79	97	79	83.5
NFP, an Aon Company	79	79	96	79	83.25
MSI Benefits Group	79	79	94	79	82.75
Alliant Insurance Services	78	78	96	78	82.5
Totem Solutions	82	77	85	82	81.5

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Proposal - Benefits Brokerage & Consulting Services

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. 26-RFP-126

Benefits Brokerage & Consulting Services

Vendor	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 3	Evaluator 4	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Gallagher	73	73	96	73	78.75
Kennedy & Rand Consulting, Inc.	74	74	89	74	77.75
HUB International	72	72	93	72	77.25
Oakbridge Insurance Agency LLC	73	73	77	73	74
USI Insurance Services	68	65	93	68	73.5

VENDOR SCORES BY EVALUATION CRITERIA

Vendor	Experience and Public-Sector Capability Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Technical Approach and Scope Understanding Points Based 30 Points (30%)	Service Team and Account Management Points Based 15 Points (15%)	Fee Proposal and Compensation Transparency Points Based 20 Points (20%)	Proposal Quality and Compliance Points Based 10 Points (10%)	Total Score (Max Score 100)
OneDigital Georgia	24	27.5	12.8	16.8	8.5	89.5
Mark III Brokerage, Inc.	23.5	27.5	11.3	13.5	7.8	83.5
NFP, an Aon Company	23.3	27.5	12.8	12	7.8	83.25
MSI Benefits Group	23.3	27	11	14.5	7	82.75
Alliant Insurance Services	22.5	27.5	12	13.5	7	82.5
Totem Solutions	22.3	27.5	12	12.3	7.5	81.5
Gallagher	22	26	11.3	12.8	6.8	78.75
Kennedy & Rand Consulting, Inc.	21.3	25.5	11	13.3	6.8	77.75

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Proposal - Benefits Brokerage & Consulting Services

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFP No. 26-RFP-126

Benefits Brokerage & Consulting Services

Vendor	Experience and Public-Sector Capability Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Technical Approach and Scope Understanding Points Based 30 Points (30%)	Service Team and Account Management Points Based 15 Points (15%)	Fee Proposal and Compensation Transparency Points Based 20 Points (20%)	Proposal Quality and Compliance Points Based 10 Points (10%)	Total Score (Max Score 100)
HUB International	20.3	26.5	11.8	13.5	5.3	77.25
Oakbridge Insurance Agency LLC	21.3	24.3	10.5	11.3	6.8	74
USI Insurance Services	19.5	25.8	10.3	11.3	6.8	73.5