



Historic Preservation Commission Minutes

Wednesday, August 28, 2024 at 4:00 PM

City Hall, 102 Sherman Street, Deadwood, SD 57732

1. Call Meeting to Order

A quorum present, Commission Chair Diede called the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order on August 28, 2024, at 4:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call

PRESENT

HP Commission Chair Leo Diede
HP Commission Vice Chair Vicki Dar
HP Commissioner 2nd Vice Chair Trevor Santochi
HP Commissioner Tony Williams
HP Commissioner Anita Knipper
HP Commissioner Jesse Allen
HP Commissioner Molly Brown

City Commissioner Blake Joseph

STAFF PRESENT

Kevin Kuchenbecker, Historic Preservation Officer
Bonny Anfinson, Historic Preservation Coordinator
Amy Greba, Administrative Assistant
Susan Trucano, Neighborworks

3. Approval of Minutes

a. Minutes from 8/14/24

It was motioned by Commissioner Williams and seconded by Commissioner Brown to approve minutes of the August 14, 2024, meeting. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

b. Minutes from 8/20/24 Budget meeting

It was motioned by Commissioner Knipper and seconded by Commissioner Brown to approve minutes of the August 20, 2024, Budget meeting. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

4. Voucher Approvals

a. Hp Operating Vouchers

It was motioned by Commissioner Williams and seconded by Commissioner Santochi to approve HP Operating Vouchers in the amount of \$129,952.30. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

- b. HP Grant Vouchers

It was motioned by Commissioner Brown and seconded by Commissioner Williams to approve HP Grant Vouchers in the amount of \$2,965.00. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

- c. HP Revolving Vouchers

It was motioned by Commissioner Williams and seconded by Commissioner Dar to approve HP Revolving Vouchers in the amount of \$54,945.53. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

5. HP Programs and Revolving Loan Program

Ms. Trucano did not have any Revolving Loans for approval but stated that the HP Commission Packet contains Neighborworks Financials, as of July 31, 2024.

6. Old or General Business

- a. Lee Thompson - 47 Forest Retaining Wall discussion with possible action

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated in 2007 and 2009 retaining walls were constructed in the back and front locations of 45 and 47 Forest Avenue. The owner has expressed concerns regarding the retaining walls over the past 15 years. Recently, the owner requested a site visit by staff and the Historic Preservation Commission.

Staff, along with Historic Preservation Commissioners, Leo Diede, Trevor Santochi, and Vicki Dar, conducted a site visit on August 22, 2024. The retaining wall in the back of the structure was constructed and the hillside above the back retaining wall has been coated with shotcrete to address the erosion from a storm water drain on Selbie Street. Upon review it does appear there has been some fracturing of the shotcrete and minor under mining of the lower portions but could be considered maintenance and normal changes.

The owner feels the front retaining wall was not constructed properly as it does not look like the retaining wall right next to it, rocks have come loose and there is no concrete cap. As per the design specifications this project did not call for a concrete cap. It does appear some of the cap stones may be missing.

Members of the Commission in attendance felt it should report back to the full commission and take possible action.

It was the unanimous consensus of the Commission the retaining walls are not failing but do need maintenance. These retaining walls are the property of the owner. The Historic Preservation Commission provided funds for the repair and restoration but does not own the walls. If you wish to have a new cap constructed or repairs to the current stone cap you can submit a project approval. Mrs. Anfinson will prepare a letter for the homeowner based on the discussion of the Commissioners.

7. New Matters Before the Deadwood Historic District Commission

8. New Matters Before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission

- a. PA 240142 - Brian Kinkler - 288 Williams - Construct second story on existing garage and add two story addition to garage

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated that the applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 288 Williams St., a noncontributing structure located in the Forest Hill Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

The applicant is requesting permission to construct a second story on the current garage behind the structure with a walkway to the existing structure. Then construct a two story 35'-25' garage addition to the right side of the current garage.

This project has gone before Planning and Zoning for a variance to meet setback requirements and it has been approved. The siding on the new construction will be smooth LP Smartsiding with the same reveal as the current garage. The overall height of the new construction will be around 25 feet, and the height of the current house is 28.8 feet. The location of the proposed structure is at the rear of the resource and is partially hidden by the existing residential structure.

The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage, or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Commissioner Dar asked about the entrance to the new area. The homeowner responded that there will be a skywalk from house to loft, about 3' in length.

Commissioner Williams asked if the skywalk would be behind the house. Mr. Kuchenbecker agreed and said it would not be visible from the street.

Commissioner Diede asked the intention of the loft. The homeowner responded it is for storage and workshop space.

It was motioned by Commissioner Allen and seconded by Commissioner Santochi, based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project DOES NOT encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

- b. PA240141 - Lori & Dave Wilkinson - 67 Terrace St. - Replace Siding, Windows, Maintenance to Porch

The applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 67 Terrace Street, a contributing structure located in the Cleveland Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

The applicant is requesting permission to replace the siding with LP Smartside, replace the windows with Marvin wood windows, and conduct maintenance to the screened in porch.

On June 2, 2024, the contractor and staff met at the property and conducted a walk around the structure and discussed proposed ideas. Staff reviewed the project approval process, grant/loan programs and building permit requirements with the Contractor and handed out a packet of program information.

On August 7, 2024, a Project Approval was submitted for replacement of siding, windows and maintenance to the screened in porch. The quotes included with the application were dated in June 2024. In preparing the Project Approval and

reviewing the history of the structure, staff discovered the applicant was entered into the windows and doors program in 2011. This prompted a site visit to determine what had changed since then and what had been done previously to the windows.

In 2001, the previous owners applied for project approval to replace the siding with steel siding. This request was denied by the Historic Preservation Commission. Meeting packet information is attached for review.

In 2011, the owner applied for and was accepted into the Wood Windows and Doors program for repair to the windows and installation of wood storm windows. The staff report and program approval from the meeting are attached. The owner did not follow through with the grant program. New wood storms were never installed but three windows were replaced without approval and a building permit was not issued.

Staff conducted a site visit and met with the owners and contractor on August 16, 2024. Upon review, it appeared the siding is in good condition with some peeling paint apparent on the street sides of the structure along with a limited quantity of wood siding needing replaced due to cracking or deterioration. The windows are in very good condition but there are issues with them being very difficult to open or cannot open and stay open which the applicant has expressed concerns as this may be a safety issue for fire exit and the fear of the window slamming shut and breaking or hurting someone. It appears the windows have not been properly maintained to allow for opening and closing and there were no signs of rot in the framing, sills or sashes. These issues can be corrected with proper maintenance and repairs.

During the walk through it was witnessed that construction of a knee wall and a laundry room on the porch had begun without Historic Preservation approval or a building permit.

The proposed work and changes do encroach upon, damage, or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Commissioner Brown asked Mr. Kuchenbecker if the windows were updated in 2011. Mr. Kuchenbecker said the owners did not utilize the program at that time.

Commissioner Knipper asked how many windows are inoperable at this time and is there the ability to make them operable. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated that the challenge is finding a contractor that can do the restoration work on the existing windows. He stated that the windows are repairable, but it's a lot of labor. The owners have been able to open them with some effort, but it is hard to keep them open as they do not have the counterweights but the small wooden peg stopper which holds them open.

Commissioner Santochi asked if there is a lot of rot in the siding, because it looks pretty good in the photos. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated there are a few cracks in the siding but can be repaired. Commissioner Santochi asked if the owners are new owners of the house. Homeowners stated that her family has owned the house since World War II. Commissioner Santochi shared that he would hate to see

Smartsiding replace the original cedar siding if it can be salvaged. The homeowners' contractor added that he had a couple additional contractors come take a look and they agreed that with the work being done on the windows, the siding needed replaced to make the entire project look its best. The windows are a big safety issue if there would be a fire. The contractors identified a decent amount of rot regarding the siding. He also stated that there's no way to truly know the condition of the cedar planks without removing the layers of paint to see what's underneath. Commissioner Santochi shared his concern is that it's easier to just put the Smartsiding up without seeing what condition the cedar is in underneath the paint. He added that the existing siding is really nice and adds a lot of value to the house, if the homeowners could replace what's bad and paint it.

Commissioner Santochi also asked if they were prepared to put in new wood windows, because that's the only option that would be allowed. The homeowner stated that wooden windows are what is included in their current bid. They are following the guidelines of preservation. She added that they also wish to include better insulation, for many reasons. The contractor stated that he would like to see the removal of all siding. He shared that the homeowners have had several instances of interior plumbing freezing because "the building is very porous" because "it's an old building". Commissioner Santochi shared that he has a building as old, if not older, with cedar siding that's had a lot of work done on it. And he's happy he did it, because he feels it adds a lot of value, rather than having a house with the Smartsiding on it. The contractor continued that they would use the smooth Smartsiding that would be appropriate looking.

Commissioner Brown asked if the Commission could split the windows and the siding motions. Commissioner Santochi stated he would be in favor of the replacement of the non-working windows with the wood windows, but that he's not in favor of the removal of the siding. The contractor stated that once the bad siding was removed, the windows replaced, and the new cedar siding spliced together, he believes that 75% of the siding would be replaced anyways.

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated he thinks they have the wrong contractor if that's the case. As he walked around the house, he saw the siding as being in very good shape. There are a few places where it is rotted around the windows and there are places that would need to be replaced. But again, using the Secretary of Interior Standards; Repair when possible, Replace with in-kind. And if neither can be done, then replace it with something that's allowed. HP has allowed Smartsiding in the past, but it's been when the siding is beyond salvaging.

Commissioner Dar added that in going by the Secretary of Interior's Standards, it would not qualify. The owner added that they don't want to piecemeal the house because it means a lot to the family. They want to make it look nice, but more than anything they want it safe for their kids and grandkids. They don't want it to be a headache for them down the road.

City Commissioner Joseph requested permission from Commissioner Chair Diede to ask the homeowners a question. He asked for an explanation regarding the unapproved work that has been performed on the porch. The homeowner stated that they were unaware they needed approval for improvements in the form of adding a laundry room where the porch is located.

Commissioner Joseph asked if there is an example of the Smartsiding within that neighborhood already. Commissioner Santochi shared that there are quite a few homes with it and stated it is a big difference and that it sticks out and is very noticeable. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated that the city has allowed it in other projects. In reference to those projects, the siding was in much worse condition and not salvageable. He also added that this cedar siding is around 120 years old and as staff noted is still in good condition. Smartsiding comes with a 25-year warranty, so the quality is not comparable.

Commissioner Williams asked Mr. Kuchenbecker for his opinion on the percentage of siding that is not salvageable. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated that he believes it would be around 10%.

Commissioner Santochi asked if there could be a motion for the siding and a motion for the windows. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated that if the homeowners are agreeable to that, it would be fine. If not, they would need to submit a new application.

First Motion: It was motioned by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Williams based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, et seq, I find that the project is ADVERSE to Deadwood and move to DENY the replacement of the existing cedar siding with Smartside. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

Second Motion: It was motioned by Commissioner Brown and seconded by Commissioner Santochi based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, et seq, I find that the project is ADVERSE to Deadwood, but the applicant has explored ALL REASONABLE AND PRUDENT ALTERNATIVES, and so I move to APPROVE the replacement of the existing windows with approved Marvin Wood windows. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

Third Motion: It was motioned by Commissioner Dar and seconded by Commissioner Santochi based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, et seq, I find that the project is ADVERSE to Deadwood and move to DENY improvements to the porch as presented, until new plans are submitted and approved. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

9. Items from Citizens not on Agenda

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

10. Staff Report

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

Mr. Kuchenbecker shared the following updates on City projects:

FEMA Project: Paving continues along Ryan Rd. More work at the area behind Comfort Inn due to damage from rainstorms.

Work continues on burying utilities on properties across the creek. Complete Concrete replacing concrete around utility boxes and along the project where city did not approve the results.

Whitewood Creek Trail opened before Kool Deadwood Nites. Hoping to have a ribbon cutting ceremony soon.

Retaining Walls projects: 10 Denver- complete, Taylor Ave- out to bid

Contract signed on 85 Charles

82 Denver- work on porch & stairs

Mrs. Anfinson shared the Realtor Workshop is set for Oct. 29.

State History Conference coming up. Commissioners can let her know if they want to attend.

11. Committee Reports

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

Commissioner Dar: Farmers Market in Gordon Park on Friday at 4:00pm. Offices of HP and Planning & Zoning will be volunteering.

Commissioner Brown: Since Landmark came to the last meeting to discuss lighting, thoughts about putting together guidelines for lighting. Commissioner Brown will chair the committee and Commissioner Williams will be vice-chair.

Commissioner Williams: Progress continues with Fuller Brothers Trail; Almost up to Broken Boot.

12. Adjournment

It was motioned by Commissioner Dar and seconded by Commissioner Williams to adjourn the Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Voting Yea: Knipper, Williams, Santochi, Diede, Brown, Allen, Dar.

The HP Commission meeting adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

ATTEST:

Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes by Amy Greba, Administrative Assistant