

Date: October 17, 2024

Case No. 240221
Address: 20 Denver
Ave.

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 20 Denver Ave., a contributing structure located in the City Creek Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Sean & Tiffany Byrne
Owner: BYRNE, SEAN & TIFFANYO
Constructed: c 1895

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A PROJECT APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

General Factors:

1. Historic significance of the resource:

This building is a contributing resource in the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. It is significant for its historic association with the founding and initial period of growth of the town of Deadwood. Spurred by the tremendous mining boom of 1876, Deadwood grew quickly and became the first major urban center of western South Dakota. This house displays the architectural characteristics common to working-class housing in pre World War I Deadwood. These small, vernacular cottages, typically of foursquare or T-gable plan, occasionally featured limited Queen Anne detailing. A number of these houses survive today, scattered throughout Deadwood's neighborhoods.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:

The applicant is requesting permission to replace the front picture window (right front - not original), right side window, front bedroom window 2nd story and kitchen windows. The windows will be Marvin wood windows. Replace siding on front of structure to match original siding with LP Smart Siding with scalloped siding in the gable (white). The sides and rear siding will be restored.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: No

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion:

This structure was entered into our programs with project approval in November of 2021. The original approval was to replace the gutters and down spouts, restore the wood windows that have been painted shut, install glass windows to the exterior porch, replace front door with wood Dutch doors and a wood storm door. Replace current metal storm windows with wood storms. Repair and mitigate the foundation and repair siding and paint. Enlarge the front stoop to accommodate the ability to open the door without having to step back down the stairs to open the door. The size will be no larger than 3' x 4' with two steps on either side.

The applicant does want to modify the previous project approval as stated in this application. Staff has reviewed the request and recommend approval of the submitted changes to the original project approval with the exception of not installing the proposed scallops in the gable and keeping the

freeze boards. The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage, or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Motions available for commission action:

A: If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project DOES NOT Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project **DOES NOT** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval.

If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project will Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

B: First Motion:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I move to make a finding that this project **DOES** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places. [If this, move on to 2nd Motion and choose an option.]

C: Second Motion:

Option 1: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **NOT ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.

OR

Option 2: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **DENY** the project as presented.

OR

Option 3: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood, but the applicant has explored **ALL REASONABLE AND PRUDENT ALTERNATIVES**, and so I move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.