

Date: December 7, 2023

Case No. 230140
Address: 9 SHINE ST

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 9 Shine Street, a contributing structure located in Deadwood City Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Cody Emrick
Owner: Emrick Real Estate Group LLC
Constructed: c. 1900

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Historic District Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Certificate of Appropriateness:

General Factors:

1. Historic significance of the resource: This building is a contributing resource in the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. It is significant for its historic association with the founding and initial period of growth of the town of Deadwood. Spurred by the tremendous mining boom of 1876, Deadwood grew quickly and became the first major urban center of western South Dakota. Deadwood's economic prominence during the late 1800s and early 1900s was reflected by the construction of a number of large residences such as this one. These houses displayed a variety of architectural styles: Queen Anne, Second Empire, Colonial, and even Gothic variants are found locally. Together, these houses are among the strongest reminders of Deadwood's nineteenth-century boom.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations: The applicant is requesting permission to add an additional window on the north (front) side gable area of the house, directly above the second story window in order to make the 3rd level of the home a livable space. Replace/repair fascia, soffit and gutters as needed. Fascia and soffit to be white, gutters to be black. Replace all windows and doors. Windows to be white, doors will be colored. One window on the second floor will be turned into an egress window. One small, non-historic, window on the main floor rear of structure will be removed and bricked in. Add wood storm doors to both doors on the north side. Storm doors will be black. Exterior brick walls to be repaired where needed.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: No

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion:

Staff conducted a site visit with the contractor to review the proposed project. The slider windows on the main floor front and right sides will be replaced with two double hung windows within the original openings. The storm windows will have an arched top to match the window design. The proposed window in the third-floor gable would have an adverse effect on the historic character of the structure. Staff's recommendation would be to approve the project without the additional third floor window. The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Motions available for commission action:

A: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

OR

B: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.