

Date: June 06, 2024

Case No. 240090  
Address: 52 Van Buren

### **Staff Report**

The applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 52 Van Buren, a Contributing structure located in the Ingleside Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Ben & Sheri Greenlee  
Owner: GREENLEE, BENJAMIN B TRUSTEE GREENLEE, SHERI L TRUSTEE  
Constructed: 1935

### **CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A PROJECT APPROVAL**

The Historic Preservation Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

#### **General Factors:**

##### **1. Historic significance of the resource:**

This building is a contributing resource in the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. It is significant for its historic association with early twentieth-century economic activity in the town of Deadwood. In general, this was a period of economic stagnation for the Deadwood region, and relatively few new buildings were constructed in the town. Of the houses which were constructed, however, nearly all displayed elements of the Craftsman architectural style. This mirrored national architectural trends of the period.

##### **2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:**

The applicant is remodeling the interior and is requesting permission to replace the windows of the structure. The two front windows and right back side windows will be replaced with wood double hung windows to match the current windows. On the right side of the structure the first window will be replaced with a patio door, the 2nd window will be replaced with a Minnkota Awning window, the 3rd window will be removed and covered. The 4<sup>th</sup> window will be replaced with a wood window to match the front windows. On the rear of the structure, the bedroom window will be replaced with a picture type window and the bathroom window will be replaced. Both windows will be Minnekota windows.

**Attachments:** Yes

**Plans:** Yes

**Photos:** Yes

#### **Staff Opinion:**

The Marvin wood double hung windows are appropriate to the resource; however, the Minnkota vinyl clad windows are inappropriate materials and do not meet the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. It is staff's opinion the vinyl windows does damage a historic property and therefore will have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

**Motions available for commission action:**

**A: If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project DOES NOT Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:**

Based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project **DOES NOT** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval.

---

**If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project will Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:**

**B: First Motion:**

Based upon all the evidence presented, I move to make a finding that this project **DOES** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places. [If this, move on to 2nd Motion and choose an option.]

**C: Second Motion:**

Option 1: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **NOT ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.

OR

Option 2: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **DENY** the project as presented.

OR

Option 3: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood, but the applicant has explored **ALL REASONABLE AND PRUDENT ALTERNATIVES**, and so I move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.