

Date: January 19, 2023

Case No. 230008

Address: 51 Sherman Street

### Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 51 Sherman Street, a contributing structure located in the Deadwood Historic Overlay Zone in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Keating Resources

Owner:

Constructed: 1894/95/1897/1898-99/1903/1909/1916/1933

#### CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

**The Historic District Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Certificate of Appropriateness:**

##### General Factors:

**1. Historic significance of the resource:** It is impossible to talk about this block one building at a time. The entire complex was the handiwork of W.E. Adams, mentioned previously with respect to his grocery store on Main Street. In 1894, Adams built the middle 25 feet of what is now the four-story building on this site. It started as a two-story building which housed Adams' grocery store, with its grand opening January 21, 1895. In 1897, Adams decided to build again, and constructed another 25-foot-wide building to the right of his store, three stories tall. At the same time, he added a third story to his first building. Griffith's Red Anvil Hardware Store was the first floor tenant in the new building. DeMouth's Ark occupied that storefront. In 1909, the fourth floors were added to the other two buildings, and they assumed their current appearance.

Adams turned exclusively to wholesale trade in 1901, and his storefront was occupied by Arnold Brother's Grocery Store. Adams continued to do business from the back rooms of his buildings, but required a more visible presence for his offices. In 1903 he built a tall one-story office building to the right of his three four-story buildings. That building has since been remodeled into what appears to be a two-story building. Notice the iron column on the 1903 building. Although it closely resembles the columns on the adjacent building, the flower is turned upside down. This column was manufactured in Deadwood by the Black Hills Foundry to match the other columns, which were manufactured out of state. The turned flower may have been done intentionally to differentiate the work, or to avoid potential problems. A one-story brick building was built to the right in 1916 to house Adams' delivery trucks. The final portion of the building was an extension of the garage built in 1933. The bricks used in those buildings are actually street pavers. How Adams obtained street paving brick is a mystery, but he may have purchased them when the streets were paved in 1907, while he was the city's mayor.

In 1941, Adams' company was purchased by Paxton-Gallagher of Omaha, and in 1949 the company announced that they were withdrawing from business in Deadwood and moving their base of operations to Rapid City. These buildings were sold to the Black Hills Mercantile Co. which had been operating out of the Cudahy Packing Co. Building since 1919 (#82). They constructed the loading dock entrance on the left side of the building in 1951. The upper stories have been occupied as professional offices and residential apartments.

**2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:** The Applicant is requesting permission to remove one second story window and a portion of wall below window to install a new wood/glass door. Construct new patio/deck above existing roof.

Extend brick parapet vertically approximately three feet. Install new steel, 42" high guardrail. Anticipated guardrail construction to be three-inch square posts with one inch diameter horizontal steel rods.

**Attachments:** Yes

**Plans:** Yes

**Photos:** Yes

**Staff Opinion:** Staff's opinion based on consultation and concurrence with the State Historic Preservation Office that the project meets the Standards, contingent upon the 3-foot brick parapet is blending with the existing brick (i.e. the bricks are of similar size, color, and finish). In addition, a course of bricks of slightly lighter bricks between the current addition and the proposed new parapet wall to better distinguish the new from the old is desired. The modern-looking, plain metal balustrade is appropriate because its simplicity does not compete with the historic architecture of the surrounding buildings along this highly traveled location.

Based on this information, it is also staff's opinion, the proposed work and changes does not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource nor does it have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the local historic district, the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.



**Motions available for commission action:**

**A:** Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

**OR**

**B:** Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.