



Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, February 22, 2023 at 4:00 PM

City Hall, 102 Sherman Street, Deadwood, SD 57732

1. Call Meeting to Order

A quorum present, Commission Chair Posey called the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order on February 22, 2023 at 4:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call

PRESENT

HP Commission Chair Bev Posey

HP Commission Vice Chair Leo Diede

HP Commissioner Trevor Santochi

HP Commissioner Vicki Dar

City Commissioner Charlie Struble

ABSENT

HP Commissioner 2nd Vice Chair Robin Carmody

HP Commissioner Jill Weber

HP Commissioner Tony Williams

STAFF PRESENT

Kevin Kuchenbecker, Historic Preservation Officer

Bonny Anfinson, Program Coordinator

3. Approval of Minutes

- a. Approve Minutes of February 8, 2023, Meeting

It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commissioner Santochi to approve the minutes of the February 8, 2023 meeting. Voting Yea: Posey, Diede, Santochi, Dar.

4. Voucher Approvals

- a. HP Operating Vouchers

It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commissioner Santochi to approve the HP Operating Vouchers in the amount of \$14,685.85. Voting Yea: Posey, Diede, Santochi, Dar.

- b. HP Revolving Vouchers

It was moved by Commissioner Dar and seconded by Commissioner Santochi to approve the HP Revolving Vouchers in the amount of \$1,231.18. Voting Yea: Posey, Diede, Santochi, Dar.

5. HP Programs and Revolving Loan Program

- a. HP Revolving Loan Requests
 - Joette Johnson - 78 Williams - Deferment Request
 - Lance Bobolz - 57 Van Buren - Extension Request
 - Lance Bobolz - 7 Emery - Extension Request
 - Sylvia Trentz - 57 Lincoln - Extension Request

It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Dar to approve the Deferment Request for Joette Johnson, 78 Williams; Lance Bobolz, 57 Van Buren, Extension Request; Lance Bobolz, 7 Emery, Extension Request; Sylvia Trentz, 57 Lincoln, Extension Request. Yea: Posey, Diede, Santochi, Dar.

6. Old or General Business

- a. South Dakota State Historic Preservation Office staff visit
 - Duncan Trau, Historic Preservation Restoration Specialist
 - Jozef Lamfers, Review and Compliance Archeologist
 - Jenna Carlson Dietmeier, PhD, Review & Compliance Coordinator

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated due to inclement weather SHPO Staff was unable to attend this meeting and will reschedule some time in March.

- b. Recommend hiring Erica Merchant to restore interior ghost mural at 51, 53, 55 Sherman Street for a cost not to exceed \$15,868.38.

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the Historic Preservation Commission entered 51, 53, 55 Sherman Street into the Ghost Mural Program at the February 8, 2023 meeting. A quote has been submitted from Erica Merchant to restore the ghost mural. Staff is recommending hiring Erica Merchant to restore the ghost mural for a cost not to exceed \$15,868.38. The exterior ghost murals will be quoted and completed when weather permits. ***It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commissioner Dar to recommend to the City Commission to hire Erica Merchant to restore the ghost mural of the Adams Block building located at 51, 53, 55 Sherman Street for a cost not to exceed \$15,868.38. Yea: Posey, Diede, Santochi, Dar.***

7. New Matters Before the Deadwood Historic District Commission

- a. COA 230015 - KR Deadwood Sherman Street 2020 LLC - 51, 53, 55 Sherman Street
 - Install Exterior Lighting

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the applicant is requesting permission to install light fixtures on the exterior of the building per the attached scope of work. There is a very detailed application with location, size of fixtures and spec sheets for the fixtures. Staff has reviewed this application thoroughly due to the recent request from Midnight Star. As we look at these types of projects it is going to be very important for the Commission to interpret this type of request consistently while consider the potential cumulative impacts of important views and relationships within the historic districts. Staff has concerns in the number, size, location, and variety of electrical lighting fixtures in relation the overall façade and the impact to the historic character. Historically, these historic buildings were not washed with artificial lighting. Staff is still concerned with impact to residents and the eventual

impact on the night skies. The proposed lighting system has both up lighting and downlighting along with being RGB led allowing the changing of colors. Downlighting and a soft white would be preferred. Staff is concerned with the overall effect of lighting that has been allowed to be installed on the historic buildings and cumulative effect on the site and setting of the district along with the light pollution to other parts of our residential areas above the commercial district. With this information, it is staff's opinion, as submitted, the size and variety of colored lighting options does encroach upon the historic resource and will have an adverse effect on the character of the building at night; additionally, it continues to add to the cumulative adverse effect on the historic character of the local historic district, the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District as well as the continued effect on light pollution.

An option for the applicant to consider is resubmitting downlighting only in front of the building with a soft white light that limits illumination to the building only. The rear of the building could have lights near the doors and the side of the building should only be lit in the area of the proposed and approved outdoor patio rather than the entire side of the building.

We do have the applicant's representatives on zoom, Brad Burns and James Stampe. Any action today would have to be a unanimous vote as there are only four Commissioners present.

Brad Burns stated the intent is to not necessarily blow the building up with light. It is only accent. I did read the minutes of the Midnight Star approval and those conditions and concerns. Even though the lights are capable of changing color, that is not to say that would be the deal breaker if they do need to be white. There are some other buildings around town that do have lighting. The Iron Horse and Martin Mason has lighting also. Our hope is that we would still be able to follow suit.

James Stampe stated he also emphasizes that the color changing lights can be changed to an all-white pretty easily. The lights that have been selected are controlled by DMX and the intensity can be turned way down. The example could be a little more on the robust side because we wanted to represent the reasons for the lighting to allow the building's character to come out at night. I think the owner is willing to take those levels to what is acceptable to the HP Commission. I would also note that lighting levels that are being proposed are not going to blow this building up. It's going to be fairly subdued. Not much different from the visitor center. There will be control of the up lighting. We would like to light the exterior signage on the building. Up lighting would do that well. The lights that are being selected are lights that can be amiable. We can make the light end at the top of the building. That would eliminate light escaping into the atmosphere which is a concern that we had. Just take that into consideration.

Commissioner Santochi stated he concurs with staff completely and plans to make a motion to that effect. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the Commission will need to state the reasoning for approving or denying the application. The Commission concurs with the staff and believes the lighting on the side and the rear of the building is an overkill and not necessary keeping in mind the other buildings that have been mentioned or approved are historic in nature is just the front facade. The side and

the back are a concern and ensuring that the lighting is a soft white. Commissioner Dar stated this is on the current proposal and based on what we see here I would have to deny. Commissioner Diede stated one of his concerns is that the lights could be toned down and you can make it whatever color you want. That in itself is questionable because you can make it color if you want, any time you want. We would have to police that somehow. I do not know if this is appropriate for this commission to address that. Brad Burns said if we wanted to get rid of the option of the colors, we can do two different things. Shift away from RGB, red, green, blue lights, and go to a similar smaller soft white fixture as well as limit the light from being turned up too much.

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated, based on this discussion, what would be appropriate for the Commission is either deny this or continue it with an alteration to the submittal that comes to a consensus between the owner and the Commission. This would show just the facade and just the white. They would more than likely approve an application that fits more of the staff report, SHPO and previous applicants have been approved by with the specifics. ***It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Dar based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and move to deny Certification of Appropriateness based on staff's and HP Commission's recommendation to resubmit an application for downlighting only in front of the building with a soft white light that limits illumination to the building only. The rear of the building could have lights near the doors and the side of the building should only be lit in the area of the proposed and approved outdoor patio rather than the entire side of the building. Yea: Posey, Diede, Santochi, Dar.***

8. New Matters Before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission

9. Items from Citizens not on Agenda

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

10. Staff Report

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

a. Update - Midnight Star Accent Lighting

Staff met with the General Manager, Ken Owens, and he stated he received the letter and will address the lighting issue.

b. Update on Short-Term Rental Task Force

The Short-Term Rental Task Force has met three times and there will be a fourth one. They have been working on policy goals, putting together action items and mapping what we have now.

c. We were authorized at last night's City Commission meeting to purchase the Shane Pollreis Archival collection.

d. We will be closing on the Fuller property purchase on March 16, 2023.

11. Committee Reports

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

Commissioner Dar stated the Wine and Chocolate Stroll sold out. They are working on a plant swap and farmer's market. Sports betting bill did not pass.

Commissioner Santochi stated he is working with Mike Runge. They are getting into the core of the neighborhood boxes and there are more toys, porcelain and bottles.

12. Adjournment

Adjournment

The Historic Preservation Commission Meeting adjourned at 4:42 p.m.

ATTEST:

Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes by Bonny Anfinson, Program Coordinator