

Date: March 3, 2023

Case No. 230018

Address: 51 Sherman Street

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 51 Sherman Street, a contributing structure located in the Deadwood Historic Overlay Zone in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: KR Deadwood Sherman Street 2020 LLC

Owner:

Constructed: 1894/95/1897/1898-99/1903/1909/1916/1933

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Historic District Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Certificate of Appropriateness:

General Factors:

Historic significance of the resource: It is impossible to talk about this block one building at a time. The entire complex was the handiwork of W.E. Adams, mentioned previously with respect to his grocery store on Main Street. In 1894, Adams built the middle 25 feet of what is now the four-story building on this site. It started as a two-story building which housed Adams' grocery store, with its grand opening January 21, 1895. In 1897, Adams decided to build again, and constructed another 25-foot-wide building to the right of his store, three stories tall. At the same time, he added a third story to his first building. Griffith's Red Anvil Hardware Store was the first floor tenant in the new building. DeMouth's Ark occupied that storefront. In 1909, the fourth floors were added to the other two buildings, and they assumed their current appearance.

Adams turned exclusively to wholesale trade in 1901, and his storefront was occupied by Arnold Brother's Grocery Store. Adams continued to do business from the back rooms of his buildings, but required a more visible presence for his offices. In 1903 he built a tall one-story office building to the right of his three four-story buildings. That building has since been remodeled into what appears to be a two-story building. Notice the iron column on the 1903 building. Although it closely resembles the columns on the adjacent building, the flower is turned upside down. This column was manufactured in Deadwood by the Black Hills Foundry to match the other columns, which were manufactured out of state. The turned flower may have been done intentionally to differentiate the work, or to avoid potential problems. A one-story brick building was built to the right in 1916 to house Adams' delivery trucks. The final portion of the building was an extension of the garage built in 1933. The bricks used in those buildings are actually street pavers. How Adams obtained street paving brick is a mystery, but he may have purchased them when the streets were paved in 1907, while he was the city's mayor.

In 1941, Adams' company was purchased by Paxton-Gallagher of Omaha, and in 1949 the company announced that they were withdrawing from business in Deadwood and moving their base of operations to Rapid City. These buildings were sold to the Black Hills Mercantile Co. which had been operating out of the Cudahy Packing Co. Building since 1919 (#82). They constructed the loading dock entrance on the left side of the building in 1951. The upper stories have been occupied as professional offices and residential apartments.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations: The Applicant is requesting permission to install light fixtures on the exterior of the building per the attached scope of work.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: Yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion: The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed this request at their February 22, 2023 meeting and unanimously denied the application for Certificate of Appropriateness based on the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, and cultural aspects of the district primarily due to size, locations, and number of colored lighting options. Some suggestions were proposing downlighting only in front of the building with a soft white light that limits illumination to the building. The rear of the building could have lights near the doors and the side of the building only lighting the proposed and approved outdoor patio rather than the entire side of the building.

The applicant has made proposed changes per the Historic Preservation Commission's request and have submitted a new application per the attached scope of work. Staff has also discovered this chapter in the zoning code which addresses exterior illumination.

[17.60.060 Illumination](#)

1. All outdoor illumination shall meet the following conditions:
 1. All roadway, parking lot and walkway luminaries shall be shielded so that substantially all the directly emitted luminous flux falls within the property line. Lamps must be in an I.E.S. certified cut-off luminaire if the output is above that of a sixty (60) watt incandescent.
 2. All exterior building floodlights are designed or retrofitted with shielding in such a manner that all the luminous flux falls upon either the surface of the structure to be illuminated or on the ground, never up into the air. Lamps must be in an I.E.S. certified cut-off luminaries if above the output of a sixty (60) watt incandescent.
 3. All stadium and all other exterior sport arena luminaries used for the purpose of illumination of the playing area are extinguished by ten p.m. or immediately after the conclusion of the final event of the day. The remainder of the facility lighting, except for reasons of security, is extinguished at ten p.m. or within one hour after the event, whichever is later, and remains extinguished until one hour prior to the commencement of the next event. For reasons of security, however, a maximum average level of five footcandles at an entrance and one footcandle on the rest of the structure is permitted.
 4. No outdoor illumination is used in any manner that could interfere with the safe movement of motor vehicles on public thoroughfares, including:
 1. Any fixed luminaire not designed for roadway illumination that produces incident or reflected luminous flux that could be disturbing to the operator of a motor vehicle;
 2. Any luminaire that may be confused with or construed as a traffic control device; or
 3. Any blinking, flashing or changing intensity lights, except for temporary holiday displays.

2. No person shall install, illuminate or maintain any beacon or search light.
3. Light trespassing from a property should be minimal.

In discussions with the lighting engineer, there are options where uplighting may be more effective and less intrusive. Between this discussion and the recently discovered ordinance, along with the recent applications and associated debates, it does make sense to develop standards and guidelines associated with lighting of exterior buildings.

With that said, it is still a case-by-case basis, until such standards are developed. The applicant has taken the feedback from the last meeting and brought back an application which addresses most of the concerns vocalized by the staff and commissioners, although, there is still some washing of the façade on the side of the building. [on the façade with the approved restoration of the ghost murals.]

The proposed work and changes does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy a historic resource but may have an adverse effect on the character of the building and the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Motions available for commission action:

A: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to grant Certification of Appropriateness.

OR

B: Based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and MOVE to deny Certification of Appropriateness.