

Date: June 20, 2023

Case No. 230067
Address: 3 Pearl St.

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for work at 3 Pearl St., a contributing structure located in the Highland Park Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Bonita & Robert Goode
Owner: GOODE, BONITA K
Constructed: c 1890

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A PROJECT APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

General Factors:

1. Historic significance of the resource:

This resource was moved from 384 Main Street to 3 Pearl Street on July 10, 2003. Due to its historic and architectural significance, according to the South Dakota State Historic Preservation Office this building remains a contributing resource in the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District despite its relocation.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:

The applicant requests permission to construct a car port in the southwest corner of the lot. Currently this location is a graveled parking area. The car port will be of wood construction.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: Yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion:

As per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, new additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. [In this case, the district itself.] The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

24:52:07:04. Standards for new construction and additions in historic districts. New construction or additions within a historic district must comply with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties as incorporated by reference in § 24:52:07:02. In addition the following standards apply:

(1) Compatibility of design. Massing, size, and scale of new construction must be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Overall architectural features of new construction must be of contemporary design which does not directly mimic historic buildings. Architectural elements such as windows, doors, and cornices must be similar in rhythm, pattern, and scale to comparable elements in adjacent historic buildings. The overall visual appearance of new construction may not dominate or be distracting to the surrounding historic landscape;

(2) Height. The height of new buildings or additions to existing buildings may not exceed a standard variance of ten percent of the average height of historic buildings on both sides of the street where proposed new construction is to be located;

(3) Width. The width of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be similar to adjacent historic buildings;

(4) Proportion. The relationship between the height and width of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be similar in proportion to existing historic buildings. The proportion of openings in the facades of new construction or additions must be compatible with similar openings in adjacent historic buildings;

(5) Rhythm and scale. The rhythm, placement, and scale of openings, prominent vertical and horizontal members, and separation of buildings which are present in adjacent historic buildings must be incorporated into the design of new buildings or additions to existing buildings;

(6) Materials. Materials which make up new buildings or additions to existing buildings must complement materials present in nearby historic properties. New materials must be of similar color, texture, reflective qualities, and scale as historical materials present in the historic district;

(7) Color. The colors of materials, trim, ornament, and details used in new construction must be similar to those colors on existing historic buildings or must match colors used in previous historical periods for identical features within the historic district;

(8) Details and ornament. The details and ornament on new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be of contemporary design that is complementary to those features of similar physical or decorative function on adjacent historic buildings;

(9) Roof shape and skyline. The roof shape and skyline of new construction must be similar to that of existing historic buildings;

(10) Setting. The relationship of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must maintain the traditional placement of historic buildings in relation to streets, sidewalks, natural topography, and lot lines; and

(11) Landscaping and ground cover. Retaining walls, fences, plants, and other landscaping elements that are part of new construction may not introduce elements which are out of character with the setting of the historic district.

Any approvals would also be contingent upon acceptance and action from the Deadwood Planning & Zoning Commission for variances required for this project.

The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.

Motions available for commission action:

A: If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project DOES NOT Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project **DOES NOT** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval.

If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project will Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

B: First Motion:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I move to make a finding that this project **DOES** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places. [If this, move on to 2nd Motion and choose an option.]

C: Second Motion:

Option 1: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **NOT ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.

OR

Option 2: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **DENY** the project as presented.

OR

Option 3: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood, but the applicant has explored **ALL REASONABLE AND PRUDENT ALTERNATIVES**, and so I move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.