

# **Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes**

Wednesday, June 14, 2023 at 4:00 PM

City Hall, 102 Sherman Street, Deadwood, SD 57732

# 1. Call Meeting to Order

- Welcome Molly Brown Historic Preservation Commissioner
   Commission Chair Posey welcomed Molly Brown to the Historic Preservation Commission.
- Oath of Office for Molly Brown, Historic Preservation Commissioner
   City Commissioner Charlie Struble-Mook swore in Commissioner Brown.
- c. Election of Historic Preservation Commission Officers for the term of June 2023 to May 2024
  - a. Chair
  - b. Vice Chair
  - c. 2nd Vice Chair

It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Dar to keep Beverly Posey as Chairman, Leo Diede as Vice Chairman and Robin Carmody as Second Vice Chair. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

#### 2. Roll Call

#### **PRESENT**

**HP Commission Chair Bev Posey** 

HP Commission Vice Chair Leo Diede

HP Commission 2nd Vice Chair Robin Carmody

**HP Commissioner Trevor Santochi** 

**HP Commissioner Tony Williams** 

HP Commissioner Vicki Dar

**HP Commissioner Molly Brown** 

City Commissioner Charlie Struble-Mook

#### STAFF PRESENT

Kevin Kuchenbecker, Historic Preservation Officer

Bonny Anfinson, Program Coordinator

Mike Walker, Director, Neighborworks

# 3. Approval of Minutes

a. Minutes of May 24, 2023 Meeting

Commissioner Santochi stated under PA 230047 to add: "The Commission expressed negative concerns regarding demolishing the structure and replacing with new, much larger garage." *It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commission Dar to approve the amended minutes for May 24, 2023. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.* 

# 4. Voucher Approvals

a. HP Operating Vouchers

It was moved by Commissioner Williams and seconded by Commissioner Diede to approve the HP Operating Vouchers in the amount of \$41,066.04. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

b. HP Grant Vouchers

It was moved by Commissioner Williams and seconded by Commissioner Carmody to approve the HP Grant Vouchers in the amount of \$3,750.98. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

c. HP Revolving Vouchers

It was moved by Commissioner Dar and seconded by Commissioner Santochi to approve the HP Revolving Vouchers in the amount of \$42,546.95. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

# 5. HP Programs and Revolving Loan Program

a. Historic Preservation loan Requests

Lee Thompson - 47 Forest Ave. - Loan Refinance Request Steve & Jill Olson - 53 Lincoln - Extension Request

It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Williams to approve both items at the same time for Lee Thompson, 47 Forest, Loan Refinance Request and Steve and Jill Olson, 53 Lincoln, Extension Request. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

b. Historic Preservation Grant Program Applications

Raul Ponce de Leon - 10 Denver - Foundation Program
Tessa and Jesse Allen - 160 Charles Street - Wood Windows and Doors Program
Eugene Hunter - 38 Van Buren - Elderly Resident Program
Larry Shama - 51 Van Buren - Elderly Resident Program

It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Diede to accept Raul Ponce de Leon, 10 Denver, into the Foundation Program; Tessa and Jesse Allen, 160 Charles Street, Wood Windows and Doors Program; Eugene Hunter, 38 Van Buren, Elderly Resident Program,

# Larry Shama, 51 Van Buren, Elderly Resident Program. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

#### 6. Old or General Business

- a. Deadwood Chamber of Commerce Yearly Report Dory Hanson, Interim Executive Director
  - Dory Hanson, Interim Executive Director and Amanda Kille, Marketing Director with the Deadwood Chamber presented the January 2022 to April 2023 report to the Historic Preservation Commission.
- 2023-2024 Historic Preservation Commission and Committee Assignments
   The Commission reviewed the 2023-2024 Historic Preservation Commission and Committee Assignments and selected commissioners to committees.
- c. Approve request for sponsorship in the amount of \$10,000.00 for the South Dakota Festival of Books to be held in Deadwood September 22-24, 2023 to be paid from the HP Public Education line item as budgeted.
  - Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the South Dakota Humanities Council is requesting sponsorship funds of \$10,000 for the 2023 Festival of Books. This year's festival is scheduled for September 22-24, 2023 in Deadwood. This will be a great opportunity for readers to meet their favorite writers as well as welcome authors and booklovers alike to our unique town. The festival, held mainly within downtown Deadwood, is family-friendly, and sure to appeal to a wide range of interests and ages. Staff recommends approval of this request. The Historic Preservation Commission did include this item as a budgeted item to come out of Public Education/Advocacy. *It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Dar to recommend to the City Commission to approve the sponsorship request of \$10,000 to the South Dakota Humanities Council for the 2023 Festival of Books to be paid out of Public Education/Advocacy. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.*
- d. Permission to pay Black Hills Pioneer invoice in the amount of \$20,250.00 for annual renewal of Welcome Center kiosks and mobile app content management to be paid from HP Public Education line item.
  - Mr. Kuchenbecker stated staff is requesting permission to pay Black Hills Pioneer (Seaton Publishing) in the amount of \$20,250.00 for the annual renewal fee for the Deadwood Welcome Center kiosks and mobile app content management to be paid from the HP Public Education line item. During the April 19, 2021, the City Commission approved to renew the four-year contract with Seaton Publishing for maintaining kiosks at the Deadwood Welcome Center, History and Information Center, South Gateway, and the Deadwood portion of the Explore Black Hills mobile app at a cost of \$20,250.00 annually from 2021-2024. *It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commissioner Williams to recommend the City Commission to approve permission to pay Black Hills Pioneer in the amount of \$20,250.00 for the annual renewal fee for the Deadwood Welcome Center kiosks and mobile app content management*

# to be paid from the HP Public Education line item. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

#### 7. New Matters Before the Deadwood Historic District Commission

a. COA 230063 Joel Livengood and Kristine Villafuerte - 732 Main - Construct deck on back side of structure

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the applicant has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for work at 732 Main Street, a contributing structure located in the Deadwood City Planning Unit. The applicant is requesting permission to reconstruct the deck on the back side of the structure. The applicant applied and was approved in May of 2017 to replace/alter the entrance of the deck at the rear of the structure. The applicant did not complete this project and is reapplying for a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commissioner Santochi based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, I find that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and move to grant Certification of Appropriateness. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

### 8. New Matters Before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission

a. PA 230047 - Dale Berg - 874 Main - Demolish garage and construct new garage - continued from 5/24/23 Meeting

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the applicant has submitted an application for work at 874 Main, a contributing structure located in the Upper Main Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood. This application was continued from our May 24, 2023 meeting. The applicant has submitted revised plans which are a 24 x 30, one story, garage which will look similar to what is currently there. The proposed work and changes does destroy a historic resource and will have an adverse effect on the character of the building and may also have an adverse effect on the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. Commissioner Posey asked what the height of the proposed structure would be. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated 8' sidewalls, 6 12 pitch, 14' high to peak. Mr. Diede asked what doors he would use. Mr. Berg stated they would have the same appearance. Commissioner Santochi asked staff's opinion on whether or not it is feasible to restore the existing structure. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated anything is feasible. Is it beyond repair? In staff's opinion I would say no. It will take a lot of work. Mr. Berg stated he is willing to give the garage to Historic Preservation. Commissioner Santochi stated everything listed on here does not constitute a demolition. We have foundation grants on three homes on Denver. Broken windows, missing doors, dry rot, I have dry rot in my garage. There is a history of these small garages and I don't want to get into a situation where it appears that we are demolishing something we are not satisfied with in order to build something

bigger. This is my concern of approving this. Mr. Berg stated when he bought the property the side walls were sagging and a center beam was installed. I can not get a standard vehicle in the garage because of the height and the accordion doors. Commissioner Diede stated he has the same concerns as Commissioner Santochi. It is understandable. However, this is a historic structure. Commissioner Dar asked what the foundation situation was. Mr. Berg stated it is off the foundation and it needs to be raised. There needs to be a concrete pad. It currently has a wood floor. Commissioner Posey stated last year when we conducted a site visit on this property you stated you had plans on what you were going to do to maintain this garage. Mr. Berg asked if he could move it back and build onto the back. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated it is something we could look at. Commissioner Diede asked, what would it take to actually restore this structure and do what Mr. Berg needs on this structure. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated he understands Mr. Bergs challenges. The foundation is probably the biggest issue. If you change the garage doors to what was submitted, a modern vehicle would fit. Have the garage doors on the front and add onto the back with the same roof pitch is an option. You could restore the garage and construct a new garage in the back. This structure would fall under the grant programs. Commissioner Diede stated he would like to see additional efforts to make this project happen. *It was moved by Commissioner Diede and* seconded by Commissioner Santochi based on all the evidence presented, I move to make a finding that this project does encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

It was moved by Commissioner Diede and seconded by Commissioner Brown based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, et seq, I find that the project is adverse to Deadwood and move to deny the project as presented. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

b. PA 230058 - Jackie Fisher/Bryan Duffy - 53 Washington(Officially 22 Washington) - Construct structure on empty lot

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 53 Washington (22 Washington), an open lot located in the Ingleside Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood. The applicant is requesting permission to construct a three-story house per the submitted plans and specifications. The applicant and the design team has worked closely with our office in preparing the submittal in front of the Historic Preservation Commission. The plans, elevations and site plan appear to be compatible with the historic districts. As per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, new additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. [In this case, the district itself.] The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its

environment. Any approvals would also be contingent upon acceptance and action from the Deadwood Planning & Zoning Commission for variances required for this project. This neighborhood has a few large Victorian style residential structures. This project would be reminiscent of these types of homes. Staff's only concern is the overall massing in comparison to the adjacent property uphill on Washington. It is staff's opinion, the proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. There is a concern of the height of the building. Commissioner Posey asked if a notice has to be posted. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated it was posted today. All that is required is to post sign and list in the local Newspaper. Commissioner Posey asked if archeology will be required on this project. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated yes. *It was moved by Commissioner Dar* and seconded by Commissioner Williams based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

c. PA 230060 - Rick Ensminger - 130 Charles - Replace rear deck

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 130 Charles St., a contributing structure located in the Cleveland Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood. The applicant is requesting permission to remove the existing deck on the back of the structure. Replace with new deck of same dimensions and design. Plan to use a composite material of matching color of house. The proposed changes are a replacement of deteriorated materials on the existing deck on the rear of the resource, the deck was approved previously by the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission. The proposed work and changes does not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource nor does it have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. *It was moved by Commissioner Santochi* and seconded by Commissioners Dar based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval. Voting Yea: Carmody, Williams, Santochi, Posey, Brown, Diede, Dar.

# 9. Items from Citizens not on Agenda

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

#### 10. Staff Report

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated lots going on in town and lots of visitors. We lost cell service in town today. They are doing maintenance. It could be up to 24 hours.

# **11. Committee Reports**

(Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.)

# 12. Adjournment

a. Executive Session for Legal Matters per SDCL1-25-2 (3) w/ possible action

It was moved by Commissioner Santochi and seconded by Commissioner Diede to adjourn into executive session for Legal Matters per SDCL1-25-2 (3) with possible action at 5:46 p.m.

The Commission came out of executive session at 6:03 p.m.

The Historic Preservation Commission Meeting adjourned at 6:06 p.m.

ATTEST:

Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes by Bonny Anfinson, Program Coordinator