

Case No. 210145
Address: 227 Williams

Staff Report

The applicant has submitted an application for Project Approval for work at 227 Williams, a Contributing structure located in the Forest Hill Planning Unit in the City of Deadwood.

Applicant: Michael Johnson
Owner: Michael Johnson
Constructed: c 1890

CRITERIA FOR THE ISSUANCE OF A PROJECT APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Commission shall use the following criteria in granting or denying the Project Approval:

General Factors:

1. Historic significance of the resource:

This building is a contributing resource in the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. This is an early Deadwood house which was remodeled during the pre-World War II years; consequently, it has historic associations with both Deadwood's nineteenth-century mining boom and the region's mining revival of the late 1920s and 1930s. This house displays architectural elements which were popular during the latter period. In Deadwood, as elsewhere in the United States, residential remodels commonly borrowed from the then popular Craftsman Style. Other remodels copy traditional forms seen in the Picturesque Revival styles.

2. Architectural design of the resource and proposed alterations:

The applicant has recently acquired the property and plans to restore the structure. The foundation will be repaired to include drain tile. Stairs will be constructed off the retaining wall. A septic system will be installed. The right wing will be the same 12' size, plans are to eliminate the 12' section with the flat roof. The left wing was previously 10' and plans are to make that 12' to craft the house symmetrical. Adding 12' to the front (south) of the house to allow just enough room for a proper staircase. The upstairs will be the entryway off Williams Street driveway with access to the balcony and stairs down. Also, by adding the 12' to the front will allow for a small section of basement for the utility room and a washer and dryer and storage. Old stucco and siding will be removed and replaced, and stone will be re-tuck pointed. The roof currently has asphalt shingles which will be replaced. All windows and doors are beyond repair and will be replaced. The interior will be remodeled to include new plumbing and electrical.

Attachments: Yes

Plans: Yes

Photos: Yes

Staff Opinion:

The Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission and staff conducted a on-site visit on August 19, 2021 to review the proposed Project Approval and search for possible design alternatives which retain the historic integrity of the resource. The wings of the resource were declared unsafe and allowed to be removed upon the transfer of property to the new owners.

The applicant desires to rebuild the wings of the house as submitted and add a 12' addition to the middle portion of the resource. While this design basically encapsulates the original stone portion of this structure, the use of the structure is hindered by the size of the remaining stone structure. Normally an addition would be possible at the rear of the resource; however, the setting of the resource does not allow for an addition without removing part of the toe of the hill which holds up Williams Street. The house does not face Williams Street but rather the "Front" faces Main Street on the hill above. The Williams Street side will remain the same and the Main Street side will look the same but will be enlarged.

Upon further review and based upon the standards and guidelines set forth under local, state and federal regulations adopted by the commission, it is staff's opinion the proposed work and changes does encroach upon the original structure but will not damage or destroy the historic resource and as designed will have an adverse effect on the character of the building but will not have an adverse affect on the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District.



Motions available for commission action:

A: If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project DOES NOT Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I find that this project **DOES NOT** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval.

If you, as a commissioner, have determined the Project will Encroach Upon, Damage or Destroy a historic property then:

B: First Motion:

Based upon all the evidence presented, I move to make a finding that this project **DOES** encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places. [If this, move on to 2nd Motion and choose an option.]

C: Second Motion:

Option 1: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **NOT ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.

OR

Option 2: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood and move to **DENY** the project as presented.

OR

Option 3: Based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation, restoration, and rehabilitation projects adopted by rules promulgated pursuant to SDCL 1-19A & 1-19B, *et seq*, I find that the project is **ADVERSE** to Deadwood, but the applicant has explored **ALL REASONABLE AND PRUDENT ALTERNATIVES**, and so I move to **APPROVE** the project as presented.